

# PSA 1982

Volume Two

Edited by P.D. Asquith and T. Nickles

**PSA 1982**  
**VOLUME TWO**

# **PSA 1982**

PROCEEDINGS OF THE 1982  
BIENNIAL MEETING  
OF THE  
PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE  
ASSOCIATION

## **volume two**

Symposia

edited by

**PETER D. ASQUITH  
&  
THOMAS NICKLES**

1983

Philosophy of Science Association  
East Lansing, Michigan

Copyright © 1983 by the  
Philosophy of Science Association

All Rights Reserved

No part of this book may be utilized, or reproduced in any form or by any means electronic or mechanical, without written permission from the publishers except in the case of brief quotations embodied in critical articles and reviews.

Library of Congress Catalog Card Number 72-624169

Cloth Edition: ISBN 0-917586-19-0

ISSN: 0270-8647

Manufactured in the United States of America  
by Edwards Brothers, Ann Arbor, Michigan

# CONTENTS

|          |      |
|----------|------|
| Preface  | xi   |
| Synopsis | xiii |

## PRESIDENTIAL ADDRESS

|   |   |
|---|---|
| 1. <i>Values In Science</i><br>Ernan McMullin | 3 |
|---|---|

## PART I. HIGH-ENERGY PHYSICS

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| 2. <i>Models, High-Energy Theoretical Physics and Realism</i><br>James T. Cushing   | 31  |
| 3. <i>Quantum Field Theory for Philosophers</i><br>Michael L.G. Redhead   | 57  |
| 4. <i>Comments on the Papers of Cushing and Redhead: "Models, High-Energy Theoretical Physics and Realism" and "Quantum Field Theory for Philosophers"</i><br>Paul Teller | 100 |
| 5. <i>A Response to Paul Teller</i><br>James T. Cushing   | 112 |

## PART II. ECONOMICS AS A SCIENCE

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| 6. <i>The Incredibility of Rejecting Belief-Desire-Action Explanations</i><br>Alfred F. MacKay | 117 |
|--|-----|

### PART III. DISCOVERY, HEURISTICS, AND ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE

- |    |   |     |
|----|---|-----|
| 7. | <i>Mechanizing the Search for Explanatory Hypotheses</i><br>Bruce G. Buchanan   | 129 |
| 8. | <i>Artificial Intelligence and Philosophy of Science: Reasoning by Analogy in Theory Construction</i><br>Lindley Darden | 147 |
| 9. | <i>Artificial Intelligence, Psychology, and the Philosophy of Discovery</i><br>Paul Thagard                             | 166 |

### PART IV. PROBABILISTIC EXPLANATION

- |     |   |     |
|-----|---|-----|
| 10. | <i>Probabilistic Explanation: Introduction</i><br>Wesley C. Salmon              | 179 |
| 11. | <i>Probabilistic Explanation and Probabilistic Causality</i><br>Joseph F. Hanna | 181 |
| 12. | <i>Probabilistic Explanations</i><br>James H. Fetzer                            | 194 |
| 13. | <i>Aleatory Explanations Expanded</i><br>Paul Humphreys                         | 208 |

### PART V. TECHNOLOGY AND RISK ASSESSMENT

- |     |  |     |
|-----|--|-----|
| 14. | <i>The Philosophical Basis of Cost-Risk-Benefit Analyses</i><br>David A. Bantz                       | 227 |
| 15. | <i>Quantification, Regulation, and Risk Assessment</i><br>Douglas MacLean                            | 243 |
| 16. | <i>Costs and Benefits of Cost-Benefit Analysis: A Response to Bantz and MacLean</i><br>Peter Railton | 261 |

## PART VI. RECENT DEVELOPMENTS IN BIOLOGY

- |     |  |     |
|-----|--|-----|
| 17. | <i>Beyond Darwinism? The Challenge of Macro-evolution to the Synthetic Theory of Evolution</i><br>Francisco J. Ayala   | 275 |
| 18. | <i>Filling Some Epistemological Gaps: New Patterns of Inference in Evolutionary Theory</i><br>Stuart A. Kauffman   | 292 |
| 19. | <i>The Modern Synthesis: Its Scope and Limits</i><br>Elliott R. Sober  | 314 |
| 20. | <i>Is the Neo-Darwinian Synthesis Robust Enough to Withstand the Challenge of Recent Discoveries in Molecular Biology and Molecular Evolution?</i><br>John R. Jungck | 322 |

## PART VII. RECENT AMERICAN AND CONTINENTAL DEVELOPMENTS

- |     |   |     |
|-----|---|-----|
| 21. | <i>What is the Difference that Makes a Difference?</i><br><i>Gadamer, Habermas, and Rorty</i><br>Richard J. Bernstein | 331 |
| 22. | <i>Saving the Differences: Gadamer and Rorty</i><br>Charles B. Guignon  | 360 |
| 23. | <i>The Differences That Make a Difference:</i><br><i>A Comment on Richard Bernstein</i><br>Thomas McCarthy            | 368 |

## PART VIII. EINSTEIN'S DISCOVERY/INVENTION OF SPECIAL RELATIVITY

- |     |   |     |
|-----|---|-----|
| 24. | <i>On Einstein's Invention of Special Relativity</i><br>Arthur I. Miller                              | 377 |
| 25. | <i>On Writing the History of Special Relativity</i><br>John Earman, Clark Glymour, Robert Rynasiewicz | 403 |

26. *The Historiography of Special Relativity: Comments on the Papers by John Earman, Clark Glymour, and Robert Rynasiewicz and by Arthur Miller* 417  
Kenneth F. Schaffner

## PART IX. RANDOMIZATION IN STATISTICAL INFERENCE AND EXPERIMENTAL DESIGN

27. *The Role of Randomization in Inference* 431  
Dennis V. Lindley
28. *Direct Inference and Randomization* 447  
Isaac Levi
29. *Arguments for Randomizing* 464  
Patrick Suppes

## PART X. SCIENTIFIC CHANGE AND EVOLUTIONARY BIOLOGY

30. *Exemplars and Scientific Change* 479  
David L. Hull
31. *Comments on David Hull's Paper on Exemplars and Type Specimens* 504  
Ernst Mayr
32. *Taxonomy and Theory* 512  
A. Aaron Snyder

## PART XI. INFERENCE IN PERCEPTION

33. *Inference in Perception* 525  
Irvin Rock
34. *Is The Visual System As Smart As It Looks?* 541  
Patricia Smith Churchland
35. *Beyond Inference In Perception* 553  
Stephen P. Stich



## PART XII. PHILOSOPHY OF QUANTUM MECHANICS TODAY

36. *On the Present State of the Philosophy  
of Quantum Mathematics* 563  
Howard Stein

## PART XIII. TECHNOLOGY AND SCIENTIFIC CHANGE

37. *How Technology Aids and Impedes the  
Growth of Science* 585  
Joseph Agassi

## PART XIV. QUANTUM MECHANICS AND LOCALITY

38. *Stochastic Locality and the Bell Theorems* 601  
Geoffrey Hellman
39. *Where the Theory of Probability Fails* 616  
Itamar Pitowsky

## PART XV. LANGUAGE AND THOUGHT

40. *Must Beliefs Be Sentences?* 627  
Brian Loar
41. *A Reply to Brian Loar's "Must Beliefs  
Be Sentences?"* 644  
Jerry Fodor
42. *Beliefs and Concepts: Comments on Brian  
Loar "Must Beliefs Be Sentences?"* 654  
Gilbert Harman
43. *Reply to Fodor and Harman* 662  
Brian Loar

PART XVI. COMMENSURABILITY, COMPARABILITY,  
COMMUNICABILITY

- |     |   |     |
|-----|---|-----|
| 44. | <i>Commensurability, Comparability,<br/>Communicability</i><br>Thomas S. Kuhn                 | 669 |
| 45. | <i>Implications of Incommensurability</i><br>Philip Kitcher                                   | 689 |
| 46. | <i>Comment on Kuhn's "Commensurability,<br/>Comparability, Communicability"</i><br>Mary Hesse | 704 |
| 47. | <i>Response to Commentaries</i><br>Thomas S. Kuhn   | 712 |

PART XVII. THE SURE-THING PRINCIPLE

- |     |  |     |
|-----|--|-----|
| 48. | <i>The Sure Thing Principle</i><br>Richard Jeffrey | 719 |
|-----|--|-----|