

# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XVIII NUMBER 4 1992

## ARTICLES

MAKING THE WORLD HEALTH  
ORGANIZATION WORK: A LEGAL  
FRAMEWORK FOR UNIVERSAL ACCESS TO  
THE CONDITIONS FOR HEALTH

Allyn Lise Taylor

THE *ESTELLE* MEDICAL PROFESSIONAL  
JUDGMENT STANDARD: THE RIGHT OF  
THOSE IN STATE CUSTODY TO RECEIVE  
HIGH-COST MEDICAL TREATMENTS

Marc J. Posner

## NOTES AND COMMENTS

AID-IN-DYING: SHOULD WE  
DECRIMINALIZE PHYSICIAN-ASSISTED SUICIDE  
AND PHYSICIAN-COMMITTED EUTHANASIA?

Maria T. CeloCruz

PUSHING THE ENVIRONMENTAL REGULATORY  
FOCUS A STEP BACK: CONTROLLING THE  
INTRODUCTION OF NEW CHEMICALS UNDER  
THE TOXIC SUBSTANCES CONTROL ACT

Andrew Hanan

PUBLISHED BY THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW, MEDICINE & ETHICS AND THE  
BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW

The AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE is published in the Spring, Summer, Fall, and Winter by the American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics and the Boston University School of Law. All decisions concerning the content of the JOURNAL are made by a joint American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics/Boston University School of Law Editorial Policy Committee. Statements of fact and opinion are the responsibility of the authors alone, and are not necessarily endorsed by the editors, the Society, or the law school.

The Editors invite the submission of manuscripts on medicolegal topics. For details, see inside back cover. Editorial communications, including original manuscripts and requests for permission to reproduce JOURNAL material, should be addressed to Editor-in-Chief, AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE, 765 Commonwealth Ave., Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Editorial phone: (617) 353-2912.

Business correspondence, including subscription correspondence, should be addressed to the Membership Director, American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics, 765 Commonwealth Avenue, 16th Floor, Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Business phone: (617) 262-4990.

Subscriptions: \$70.00 per year for institutions, and \$60 for individuals (payment must be on personal check) who are not members of the American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics. Foreign subscribers should remit, for a year's subscription, an additional \$30.00 for foreign postage.

Missing copies of the JOURNAL will be sent free of charge to subscribers or members of the Society provided that notice of such claim is received at the Society's subscription office within one month of receipt of the next issue published. Requests made after this period will be billed at the regular issue price of \$20 (includes postage and handling).

Members of the American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics receive a free subscription to the JOURNAL as part of their dues (\$120.00 for 1993). Information concerning membership is available from the Membership Director, American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics, 765 Commonwealth Avenue, 16th Floor, Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Society phone: (617) 262-4990.

Articles in the JOURNAL are indexed in *LEXIS*, *WESTLAW*, *Index to Legal Periodicals*, *Legal Contents*, *Index Medicus*, *Social Sciences Citation Index*, *Current Contents: Social and Behavioral Sciences*, and *Biosciences Information Service of Biological Abstracts*.

Library of Congress Catalog Number: 75-645516 (Shelf No. K1.M445). ISSN 0098-8588.

U.S. postage paid at Lincoln, Nebraska, in accordance with Permit No. 264 (Nonprofit Org.).

#### **ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICERS OF BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW**

JOHN R. SILBER, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., LL.D., (hon.), L.H.D., (hon.), *President*,  
*University Professor and Professor of Philosophy and Law*

RONALD A. CASS, B.A., J.D., *Dean and Professor of Law*

JOSEPH BRODLEY, B.A., LL.B., *Senior Associate Dean for Research and Professor of Law*

ROBERT G. BONE, B.A., J.D. *Associate Dean and Professor of Law*

KENNETH W. SIMONS, B.A., J.D., *Associate Dean and Professor of Law*

CHRISTINE A. MARX, B.S., J.D., *Assistant Dean for Student Affairs*

#### **OFFICERS OF THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW, MEDICINE & ETHICS**

RUTH B. PURTILO, Ph.D., *President*

KAREN H. ROTHENBERG, J.D., MPA, *President-Elect*

MARGARET A. SOMERVILLE, AUA, LL.B., DCL, *Secretary*

SANDRA H. JOHNSON, J.D., LL.M., *Treasurer*

ELLIOT L. SAGALL, M.D., *Founder and First President*

CHRISTINE MITCHELL, R.N., M.S., M.T.S., *Immediate Past President*

LAWRENCE O. GOSTIN, J.D., *Executive Director*

# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

## BOARD of EDITORS

### FACULTY EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

**Frances H. Miller, J.D.**  
Boston University School of Law

### FACULTY EDITOR-IN-CHIEF EMERITUS AND FOUNDER

**John A. Norris, J.D., M.B.A.**

### EXECUTIVE EDITOR

**Lawrence O. Gostin, J.D.**

### DIRECTOR OF PUBLICATIONS

**American Society of Law & Medicine**  
**Merrill Kaitz**

### CIRCULATION MANAGER

**Susan Reddy**

## EDITORS

### **Michael Baram, J.D.**

Boston University Schools of Law  
and Public Health

### **Charles H. Baron, LL.B., Ph.D.**

Boston College Law School

### **Henry Beyer, J.D.**

Boston University School of Law

### **William J. Curran, LL.M., S.M. Hyg.**

Harvard University School of  
Public Health

### **Lee J. Dunn, Jr., J.D., LL.M.**

Dunn & Auton  
Boston, Massachusetts

### **Richard F. Gibbs, M.D., J.D.**

Harvard Medical School

### **Jay Alexander Gold, M.D., J.D., M.P.H.**

American College of Legal Medicine

### **Clark C. Havighurst, J.D.**

Duke University School of Law

### **Nathan Hershey, J.D.**

University of Pittsburgh  
Graduate School of Public Health

### **Bernard D. Hirsh, J.D.**

Wildman, Harold Allen & Dickson  
Chicago, Illinois

### **Edward E. Hollowell, J.D.**

Hollowell & Silverstein  
Raleigh, North Carolina

### **Richard G. Huber, J.D.**

Boston College Law School

### **Sheila Jasanoff, J.D., Ph.D.**

Director, Program on Science Technology  
and Society  
Cornell University

### **Jay Katz, M.D.**

Yale University Law School

### **Renée M. Landers, J.D.**

Boston College Law School

### **Sylvia A. Law, J.D.**

New York University School of Law

### **Aubrey Milunsky, MB.B.Ch., D.Sc., F.R.C.P., D.C.H.**

Boston University School of Medicine

### **Irwin N. Perr, M.D., J.D.**

University of Medicine and Dentistry  
of New Jersey

### **Harvey E. Pies, J.D., M.P.H.**

Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Florida  
Jacksonville, Florida

### **Elliot L. Sagall, M.D.**

Founder, American Society of  
Law & Medicine  
Harvard Medical School

### **E. Donald Shapiro, J.D., LL.D.**

New York Law School

### **Sidney Shindell, M.D., LL.B.**

Medical College of Wisconsin

### **Robert B. Shira, D.D.S.**

Special Assistant to the President  
Tufts University

### **Arthur F. Southwick, J.D., M.B.A.**

Grad. Sch. of Business Administration  
University of Michigan

### **Paul R. Tremblay**

Boston College Law School

### **David G. Warren, J.D.**

Duke University

### **Cyril H. Wecht, M.D., J.D.**

Director, Pittsburgh Institute of Legal  
Medicine

### **James G. Zimmerly, M.D., J.D., M.P.H.**

Armed Forces Institute of Pathology  
Washington, D.C.

# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

## **INTERNATIONAL BOARD of EDITORS**

**Dr. M.A.M. Wachter**  
Director  
Institute of Bioethics  
The Netherlands

**Dr. S.S. Fluss**  
Chief, Health Legislation  
World Health Organization  
Switzerland

**Prof. Dr. Erwin Deutsch**  
Institute for Pharmaceutical and  
Medical Law  
University of Gottingen  
Federal Republic of Germany

**Bernard M. Dickens, Ph.D., LL.D.**  
Professor  
Faculty of Law & Faculty of Medicine  
University of Toronto  
Canada

**Prof. Dr. H.J.J. Leenen**  
Instituut voor Sociale Geneeskunde  
Universiteit van Amsterdam  
The Netherlands

**The Honorable Justice  
Michael D. Kirby**  
President, Court of Appeal  
Supreme Court of New South Wales  
Australia

**Koichi Bai**  
Professor of Law  
Director of Institute of Medical  
Humanities  
School of Medicine  
Kitasato University  
Japan

**Professor P D G Skegg**  
Faculty of Law  
University of Otago  
Dunedin  
New Zealand

**Prof. Dr. Iur. Dieter Giesen**  
Institute for International, Foreign  
and Comparative Law  
Director,  
Working Centre for International  
Studies in Medical Malpractice Law  
The Free University of Berlin  
Federal Republic of Germany

**Professor Amos Shapira**  
Lubowski Professor of Law &  
Biomedical Ethics  
Faculty of Law  
Tel Aviv University  
Israel

# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XVIII NUMBER 4 1992

**BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW  
STUDENT BOARD OF EDITORS  
1992-1993**

## **EDITOR-IN-CHIEF**

Suzanne V. Cocca

## **EXECUTIVE EDITOR**

Anne T. Zecha

## **MANAGING EDITORS**

Amy Grossberg  
Michelle E. Maerov

## **PROJECTS EDITOR**

Vickie L. Henry

## **SYMPOSIUM EDITOR**

Michael D. Handler

## **ARTICLES EDITORS**

Matthew H. Bruck  
Maria T. Celoz Cruz  
Simon J.K. Miller  
Ronald L. Wisor, Jr.

## **ASLME DEVELOPMENTS EDITOR**

Jennifer A. Kasmin

## **CASE & NOTE EDITORS**

Richard E. Aubin  
Lisa A. Bail  
Andrew S. Brenner  
Nancy D. Mahler

Matthew A. Miller  
Deborah Schectman  
Sean C. Sheely  
Laurie J. Slosberg

## **THIRD YEAR EDITORS**

Dahlia A. Balsam  
Lincoln D. Bandlow  
Peter M. Dichiaro  
Andrew Hanan  
Deborah T. Hardy  
Mary Beth Hewitt

Jason Kravitz  
Susan Korenberg  
Dominic Massa  
Andrew L. Packard  
Regan P. Remillard

Sarah E. Rosenblatt  
Amy J. Rosengarten  
Melissa L. Roy  
Dolly Vance  
Gabriel Zambrano  
Hal S. Zemel

## **STAFF MEMBERS**

David B. Allswang  
Jeffrey B. Araten  
Robert J. Blanch, Jr.  
Laura C. Boujoff  
Thomas B. Bralliar, Jr.  
Lawrence R. Bressler  
David R. Campbell  
Nikki M. Constantine  
Kathleen M. Crowley  
Cedric DeLaCruz  
William C. Dennis  
Susan L. DiMaggio

Paula Domanski  
David D. Dueno  
Stephen R. Fish, Jr.  
Rick J. Fucci  
Eryn P. Gittleman  
William J. Graham  
Andrew A. Honegger  
Melanie B. Jacobs  
David A. Lane  
Jesse R. Lee  
Stacy B. Margolies  
Julie E. Mathews

Arlene N. Meltzer  
Lisa Paolillo  
Anthony D. Pellegrini  
Cheryl A. Posegay  
Wendy J. Rothstein  
Robert W. Russo  
Brian Schulman  
Jonathan P. Serbin  
Rachel L. Singer  
Stephanie N. Switzer  
Terrence J. Talbot  
Susan H. Upton

# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XVIII NUMBER 4 1992

## ARTICLES

MAKING THE WORLD HEALTH ORGANIZATION WORK: A LEGAL FRAMEWORK FOR UNIVERSAL ACCESS TO THE CONDITIONS FOR HEALTH 301 Allyn Lise Taylor

THE *ESTELLE* MEDICAL PROFESSIONAL JUDGMENT STANDARD: THE RIGHT OF THOSE IN STATE CUSTODY TO RECEIVE HIGH-COST MEDICAL TREATMENTS 347 Marc J. Posner

## NOTES AND COMMENTS

AID-IN-DYING: SHOULD WE DECRIMINALIZE PHYSICIAN-ASSISTED SUICIDE AND PHYSICIAN-COMMITTED EUTHANASIA? 369 Maria T. CeloCruz

PUSHING THE ENVIRONMENTAL REGULATORY FOCUS A STEP BACK: CONTROLLING THE INTRODUCTION OF NEW CHEMICALS UNDER THE TOXIC SUBSTANCES CONTROL ACT 395 Andrew Hanan

## MEDICOLEGAL REFERENCE LIBRARY

SELECTED RECENT COURT DECISIONS 423  
SELECTED BOOK RELEASES 445

Copyright 1992 by the American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics, Inc. and the Boston University School of Law. Unless otherwise noted, the materials appearing herein may be copied for classroom use, provided that (1) the user notify the Editor-in-Chief of *American Journal of Law & Medicine* of having made such copies; (2) the author and *American Journal of Law & Medicine* are identified; and (3) the proper notice of copyright is affixed to each copy.