

Book Reviews

1970s, too, there has been a shift towards greater public involvement in health care, giving India, at least on paper, an impressive infrastructure of rural health centres. By the standards of neighbouring Pakistan, India seems relatively well provided with health-care resources.

There is much to be commended in Dr Jeffery's book. While it is less comprehensive in its discussion of the colonial than the post-colonial period and while it does not attempt to give a full account of the nature of the health problems confronted, it usefully brings together, within a critical and analytical framework, disparate material and conflicting lines of argument. In relating health provisioning to wider economic and political changes, it manages to avoid an unqualified "political economy" approach. A welcome addition in itself, this book will surely be a stimulus to further research and controversy.

David Arnold

School of Oriental and African Studies, University of London

LINDA BRYDER, *Below the magic mountain: a social history of tuberculosis in twentieth-century Britain*, Oxford Historical Monographs, Oxford, Clarendon Press, 1988, 8vo, pp. xiv, 298, illus., £30.00.

It is odd that historians have disregarded tuberculosis. More than other maladies which have preoccupied them, it was a leading cause of mortality, morbidity, and wretchedness. In this century, pulmonary TB has crucially provoked administrative interventions and policies aimed at financially and socially supporting sufferers.

Linda Bryder has now provided us with a thoroughly researched, accurate, and carefully considered survey of TB and its consequences in Britain between 1900 and 1960. Her book should be widely read, not least because it gently but persuasively corrects celebratory medical reminiscences, folk memories, and historians' assertions founded on them.

It is a melancholy story. TB management consumed almost as much money as maternal and child welfare in the early 1920s but produced little prevention or cure. Sanatoria, which swallowed much of the resources, housed a tiny proportion of the active cases and despite their directors' pretensions and dodgy statistics, lost up to 80 per cent of their allegedly restored patients within five years of discharge. This rate was probably worse than that for consumptives who never entered a sanatorium, especially when we consider the sanatoria promoters' claims to admit only "early" cases with good prognoses. Similar conclusions emerge from Dr Bryder's review of chest surgery. I would have like her to have pursued the problem of how such a futile system retained the esteem of politicians, local government officers, the general public, and many consumptives.

As with other intractable illnesses, medical practitioners, philanthropists, bureaucrats, and the consumptives themselves tended to blame the victim. There was a concomitant loss of citizenship. Sanatoria or Poor Law cases, and attenders at dispensaries, were subject to invasions of privacy, pointless controls and dangerous procedures, the outcomes of which were untried. Some of the procedures, complete rest and overfeeding, for example, are now regarded as useless or even damaging. Dr Bryder has drawn on the Frimley Sanatorium follow-up records to build a memorable picture of private anguish, stigmatization, and domestic and neighbourhood disruption. The Frimley authorities' relentless pursuit of their inmates up to 35 years after discharge becomes nightmarish when we realize that these records apparently were never used for any worthwhile epidemiological purpose. Dr Bryder's account of the professional opposition to introducing BCG to Britain reveals similar abuses of power and parochialism.

The only comfort conveyed by this monitory book is the fairly steady decline of TB mortality throughout the period, within a context of improving living standards, despite the misallocation of resources.

F. B. Smith

Australian National University

HAROLD ATTWOOD and GEOFFREY KENNY (editors), *Reflections on medical history and health in Australia*, Third National Conference on Medical History and Health in Australia 1986, Parkville, Medical History Unit, University of Melbourne, 1987, 8vo, pp. viii, 278, illus., A\$20.00 (paperback).

Book Reviews

This collection of papers, like the previous two publications in the series, covers a wide and eclectic range of topics documenting aspects of the development of western medicine in Australia. Such diversity, in methodology as well as content, is not surprising given the open-ended theme and the fact that the conference at which these papers were presented provided a forum for anyone "interested in the history of medicine". While this attracted a fairly representative, Australia-wide selection there is no reference to Aboriginal medicine, and contributions tend to cluster between 1850 and 1950, a period when the plant of British medicine was being assiduously nurtured in an unfamiliar environment. Yet there is little hint of re-rooting difficulties or growth differences. Indeed, the theme notwithstanding, many of the papers are descriptive rather than reflective and, although well informed and often full of interest, generally lack a critical dimension. There are exceptions, but the tendency among medical practitioners, (i.e., most of the 24 contributors) to interpret developments largely within the circumscribed parameters of medicine, and to identify with those who have "laboured in the field" is apparent in the several accounts of clinical entities and the marked preference for biography.

Clinical subjects include the relationship between sunstroke and insanity, treatment of head injuries, the nosology of trophoblastic tumours, chronic skin ulcers, changing disease patterns in colonial South Australia, and a careful evaluation of cold bath therapy for typhoid fever. Of the medical personalities (only one is a woman—a nurse), several gained distinction through their war-time efforts or an unorthodox clinical approach, and others represent sectors of the profession. Papers dealing with institutions, issues, and ideas, by and large, push beyond descriptive boundaries to explore the interface of medicine and society. The Adelaide Children's Hospital and the Queen Victoria Homes for Consumptives reflect typical institutional developments, and discussion of a compensation case at the turn of the century demonstrates a growing medical dominance and paternalism, both of which are evident in the article on early nursing training in South Australia. Policies excluding mental and contagious diseases from the Ballarat District Hospital in the last century highlight contemporary attitudes and medical knowledge against a background of political and economic expediency, issues which are also raised in relation to the federal government's occupational health initiatives this century. Only one paper probes—most skilfully—the implications of adapting Western medicine to Australian conditions and, apart from an abstract referring to mortality trends in Australia and other Western countries, comparative evaluation is noticeably absent.

Considered as a whole, the volume suggests that medical history in Australia continues to be a parochial discipline, a dilettante's pursuit, largely ignored by academic historians as too specialized or of limited consequence in the broader movements of history. There is, however, an encouraging note: the 'Foreword' informs us that the Australian Society of the History of Medicine, inaugurated in November 1986, seeks to develop "critical standards in the field".

Helen Woolcock
University of New South Wales

PETER CLARK and CRISPIN WRIGHT (editors), *Mind, psychoanalysis and science*, Oxford, Basil Blackwell, 1988, 8vo, pp. xiv, 370, £27.50.

Clark and Wright's collection of papers on the philosophy of psychoanalysis—drawn from a conference at St Andrew's—contains a good deal of fresh material. As the title implies, the accent is on the interpretation of Freudian theory in terms of contemporary analytic philosophy of mind and of science. Since it would be hard to find an interesting question about psychoanalysis that could not be raised in that context, this is not a restrictive brief. Later parts of the book take account of recent work on Freud in other disciplines, and confront psychoanalytic theory with contemporary developments in psychological research. A wide range of attitudes towards Freud is displayed, whilst a high level of intellectual sophistication is maintained throughout.

The immediate stimulus to discussion is Grünbaum's *The foundations of psychoanalysis* which, since its appearance four years ago, has received much attention, well-earned by the seriousness