

VOLUME 18

NUMBER 2

APRIL 2009

CQ

---

*Cambridge*

---

*Quarterly of*

---

*Healthcare*

---

*Ethics*

---

*A Quarterly Journal Devoted to  
Engaging a World Community  
of Bioethicists*

**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS



**Cambridge**  
**Quarterly of**  
**Healthcare**  
**Ethics**

**A Quarterly**  
**Journal Devoted**  
**to Engaging a**  
**World Community**  
**of Bioethicists**

EDITORS

Thomasine Kushner, PhD, *University of California, Berkeley*  
Steve Heilig, MPH, *San Francisco Medical Society*

ASSOCIATE EDITORS

Matti Häyry, *School of Law, University of Manchester, England*  
Tuija Takala, *University of Helsinki, Finland*

David C. Thomasma, PhD, Co-Editor, 1992–2002

THE DAVID C. THOMASMA INTERNATIONAL BIOETHICS RETREAT,

<http://www.library.berkeley.edu/~bantton/IBRetreat.html>

EDITORIAL BOARD

Akira Akabayashi, *Kyoto University, Japan*  
William Andereck, *Medicine and Human Values, California Pacific Medical Center, San Francisco*  
Daniel Callahan, *The Hastings Center, Garrison, New York*  
Arthur Caplan, *University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia*  
Andrew Dobson, *Keele University, England*  
Joseph J. Fins, *Division of Medical Ethics, Weill Medical College of Cornell University, New York*  
Veronique Fournier, *Center for Clinical Ethics, Cochin Hospital, Paris, France*  
Amnon Goldworth, *Stanford University School of Medicine*  
Chris Hackler, *Division of Medical Humanities, University of Arkansas Medical School*  
John Harris, *University of Manchester, England*  
Paul Hofmann, *Hofmann Healthcare Group, Moraga, California*  
Albert Jonsen, *Medicine and Human Values, California Pacific Medical Center, San Francisco*  
Gerrit K. Kimsma, *Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam*  
Glenn McGee, *Rockefeller Institute of Government, Albany, New York*  
Eric M. Meslin, *Indiana University Center for Bioethics, Indianapolis*  
Jonathan D. Moreno, *Center for Biomedical Ethics, University of Virginia*  
Edmund D. Pellegrino, *Georgetown Center for the Advanced Study of Ethics, Georgetown University*  
Sammond Rhodes, *Mount Sinai School of Medicine, New York*  
Gerd Richter, *Philipps University, Marburg, Germany*  
Pablo Rodriguez del Pozo, *Weill Medical College of Cornell University in Qatar*  
Richard Selzer, *Yale University*  
Robyn Shapiro, *Center for the Study of Bioethics, Medical College of Wisconsin*  
Pavel Tichtchenko, *Institute of Philosophy, Academy of Science, Moscow, Russia*  
Griffin Trotter, *Center for Health Care Ethics, Saint Louis University*  
Evert van Leeuwen, *Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam*  
Baroness Mary Warnock, *Girton College, Cambridge University, England*  
Mark R. Wicclair, *West Virginia University & University of Pittsburgh*

EDITORIAL OFFICE: Editorial correspondence, including manuscript submission, should be addressed to Thomasine Kushner, PhD. To facilitate review, please submit manuscripts as electronic copy, preferably in MS Word, to [TKushner@aol.com](mailto:TKushner@aol.com). Books for review should be sent to Greg Loeben, Midwestern University, Glendale Campus, Bioethics Program, 19555 N. 59th Ave., Glendale, AZ 85308.

SUBSCRIPTION INFORMATION: *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* (ISSN 0963-1801) is published quarterly, in January, April, July, and October by Cambridge University Press, 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473/Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK. Annual subscription rates for volume 18 (2009) USA, Canada, and Mexico/Elsewhere: Institutional rates, print and online: \$300/£175; online only: \$250/£149; print only: \$287/£166. Individual rates, print only: \$94/£46. Single part: \$79/£46. Students and retirees: \$82/£41. American Society for Bioethics and Humanities members: Regular: \$70/£35. Student and retiree: \$82/£60. Prices include postage. Subscription offices: Cambridge University Press, 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994-2133, USA; outside the USA, Canada, and Mexico: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK. Claims for missing issues should be made immediately after receipt of the next issue. *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* and other Cambridge journals can be found at <http://journals.cambridge.org>.

*Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* is a partner journal of the American Society for Bioethics and Humanities.

Periodicals postage paid at New York, NY and additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER: Send address changes in the USA, Canada, and Mexico to *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics*, Cambridge University Press, 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994-2133, USA. Send address changes elsewhere to *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics*, Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK.

Copyright © 2009 Cambridge University Press. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopy, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. General enquiries from the USA, Mexico, and Canada should be addressed to the New York office of Cambridge University Press <http://www.cambridge.org/us/information/rights/contacts/newyork.htm>; general enquiries from elsewhere should be addressed to the Cambridge office <http://www.cambridge.org/uk/information/rights/contacts/cambridge.htm>; permission enquiries from Australia and New Zealand should be addressed to the Melbourne office [http://www.cambridge.org/aus/information/contacts\\_melbourne.htm](http://www.cambridge.org/aus/information/contacts_melbourne.htm); enquiries regarding Spanish-language translation rights (only) should be addressed to the Madrid office <http://www.cambridge.org/uk/information/rights/contacts/madrid.htm>.

*Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* is indexed in Index Medicus and in the ASSIA, ISI, MEDLINE, Philosopher's Index, and Proquest databases.

Photocopying information for users in the USA: Notwithstanding the above, the Item-Fee Code for this publication indicates that copying for internal or personal use beyond that permitted by Section 107 or 108 of the US Copyright Law is authorized for users duly registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC), provided that the appropriate remittance is paid directly to: CCC, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. Specific written permission must be obtained for all other copying. Contact the nearest Cambridge University Press office. The Item-Fee Code for this journal is 0963-1801/09.

ISI Tearsheet Service, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104, USA is authorized to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only. Article reprints are available from the authors. For orders of 50 or more reprints, contact Cambridge University Press.

# Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics

Volume 18, Number 2, April 2009

## CONTENTS

Contributors 107

### *Special Section: Vulnerability Revisited*

Guest Editorial: Vulnerability Revisited  
DORIS SCHROEDER AND GARDAR ARNASON 110

Vulnerability: Too Vague and Too Broad?  
DORIS SCHROEDER AND EUGENIJUS GEFENAS 113

Undue Fear of Inducements in Research in  
Developing Countries  
GARDAR ARNASON AND ANTON VAN NIEKERK 122

Gender and Vulnerable Populations in Benefit Sharing:  
An Exploration of Conceptual and Contextual Points  
FATIMA ALVAREZ-CASTILLO, JULIE COOK LUCAS, AND  
ROSA CORDILLERA CASTILLO 130

Vulnerability: Sex Workers in Nairobi's Majengo Slum  
PAMELA ANDANDA 138

Vulnerability and Indigenous Communities: Are the  
San of South Africa a Vulnerable People?  
ROGER CHENNELLS 147

*CQ Sources/Bibliography*  
BETTE ANTON 155

### *Departments and Columns*

#### *Responses and Dialogue*

Opting-Out: The Relationship between Moral Arguments  
and Public Policy in Organ Procurement  
D. MICAH HESTER 159

A response to "The Case against Conscription of Organs for  
Transplantation" by Walter Glannon (CQ 17(3)),  
and "In Defense of Routine Recovery of Cadaveric  
Organs: A Response to Walter Glannon" by Aaron Spital  
and James S. Taylor (CQ 17(3))

Reconsidering the Impact of Affective Forecasting  
NADA GLIGOROV 166

A response to "Affective Forecasting and Its Implication  
for Medical Ethics" by Rosamond Rhodes and  
James J. Strain (CQ 17(1))

*Contents continued*

*Contents continued*

Further Thoughts about Affective Forecasting Biases in  
Medicine: A Response to Nada Gligorov  
ROSAMOND RHODES AND JAMES J. STRAIN 174

*Dissecting Bioethics*  
TUIJA TAKALA AND MATTI HÄYRY  
Making Sense of the Immorality of Unnaturalness  
MARK SHEEHAN 177

*CQ Review*  
GREG LOEBEN  
*The Ethics of Bioethics*, edited by Lisa A. Eckenwiler and  
Felicia G. Cohn  
REVIEWED BY KAYHAN PARSI 189

*Perspectives*  
Commercial Organ Transplantation in the Philippines  
LEIGH TURNER 192

*Bioethics Education*  
Developing “Ethical Mindfulness” in Continuing  
Professional Development in Healthcare: Use of  
a Personal Narrative Approach  
MARILYS GUILLEMIN, ROSALIND MCDUGALL, AND  
LYNN GILLAM 197

*Abstracts of Note: The Bioethics Literature*  
KENNETH V. ISERSON 209