

# ISRAEL LAW REVIEW

מרכז מינרבה לזכויות האדם  
The Minerva Center for Human Rights  
مركز مينربا لحقوق الانسان  
Faculty of Law, The Hebrew University of Jerusalem

Volume 44

Number 3

2011

## UNCONSTITUTIONAL CONSTITUTIONAL AMENDMENTS

- Introduction *Claude Klein*
- Unconstitutional Constitutional Amendments *Aharon Barak*
- External Review of Constitutional Amendments?  
International Law as a Norm of Reference *Lech Garlicki and Zofia A. Garlicki*
- Old and Protected? On the "Supra-Constitutional"  
Clause in the Constitution of Norway *Eivind Smith*
- The Language of Eternity: Judicial Review of the  
Amending Power in France (or the Absence Thereof) *Denis Baranger*
- The Implications of "Eternity Clauses":  
The German Experience *Ulrich K. Preuss*
- The Challenge of Reconciling Constitutional Eternity Clauses  
with Popular Sovereignty: Toward Three-Track Democracy in  
Israel as a Universal Holistic Constitutional System and Theory *Sharon Weintal*

## THE LIONEL COHEN LECTURE

- The Judiciary and the Media *The Rt Hon The Lord Judge*

# ISRAEL LAW REVIEW

---

Volume 44

Number 3

2011

---

## UNCONSTITUTIONAL CONSTITUTIONAL AMENDMENTS

### Introduction

*Claude Klein*..... 318

### Unconstitutional Constitutional Amendments

*Aharon Barak*..... 321

### External Review of Constitutional Amendments?

#### International Law as a Norm of Reference

*Lech Garlicki and Zofia A. Garlicki*..... 343

#### Old and Protected? On the “Supra-Constitutional” Clause in the Constitution of Norway

*Eivind Smith*..... 369

#### The Language of Eternity: Judicial Review of the Amending Power in France (or the Absence Thereof)

*Denis Baranger*..... 389

#### The Implications of “Eternity Clauses”: The German Experience

*Ulrich K. Preuss*..... 429

#### The Challenge of Reconciling Constitutional Eternity Clauses with Popular Sovereignty: Toward Three-Track Democracy in Israel as a Universal Holistic Constitutional System and Theory

*Sharon Weintal*..... 449

## THE LIONEL COHEN LECTURE

### The Judiciary and the Media

*The Rt Hon The Lord Judge*..... 499

# ISRAEL LAW REVIEW

---

Volume 44

Number 3

2011

---

## BOARD OF EDITORS

SIR NIGEL RODLEY      YUVAL SHANY  
*Editors-in-Chief*

CLAUDE KLEIN  
*Guest Editor*

DANNY EVRON  
*Executive Editor*

YAËL RONEN  
*Academic Editor*

DANIEL STEPHENS  
*Production Editor*

## STUDENT EDITORS

HAIM ABRAHAM  
MORAN ALRIAMI  
JOSH HERSCH

LITAL CASPER  
GALIT HELLER

Yael NAGGAN  
RIMONE RABINOVITCH  
ASAF LUBIN

## INTERNATIONAL ADVISORY BOARD

- PROF. AHARON BARAK (*Former President of the Israeli Supreme Court*)  
PROF. DAPHNE BARAK-EREZ (*Tel Aviv University*)  
PROF. ANTONIO CASSESE† (*Florence University*)  
PROF. MALCOLM FEELEY (*University of California, Berkeley*)  
PROF. JOCHEN FROWEIN (*Max Planck Institute for Comparative Public Law  
and International Law, Heidelberg*)  
PROF. FRANÇOISE HAMPSON (*University of Essex*)  
PROF. VICKI JACKSON (*Harvard University*)  
PROF. MICHAEL KARAYANNI (*Hebrew University of Jerusalem*)  
PROF. ECKART KLEIN (*Potsdam University*)  
PROF. MORDECHAI KREMNITZER (*Hebrew University of Jerusalem*)  
PROF. DAVID KRETZMER (*Hebrew University of Jerusalem*)  
PROF. FIONNUALA NÍ-AOLÁIN (*University of Minnesota and University of Ulster*)  
PROF. FRANCES RADAY (*College of Management Academic Studies, Rishon leZion*)  
PROF. WILLIAM SCHABAS (*Middlesex University, London;  
National University, Ireland*)  
PROF. MALCOLM SHAW (*Leicester University*)  
PROF. HENRY STEINER (*Harvard University*)

## ISRAEL LAW REVIEW

The *Israel Law Review* is the oldest and most acclaimed Israeli law journal published in English. Since its establishment in 1966 by the Law Faculty at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem, the *Israel Law Review* has served as a leading source of legal scholarship on Israeli law and on issues relevant to Israeli society.

As of 2009, the *Israel Law Review* is published under the auspices and management of the Hebrew University of Jerusalem's Minerva Center for Human Rights. Under this new stewardship, it focuses on scholarship in the fields of human rights, public law and international law and examines the application of legal norms under conditions of conflict and political uncertainty, highlighting the relevance of the Israeli experience in these fields to other parts of the world and that of other societies to Israel. The *Israel Law Review* is peer-reviewed and presently indexed in major databases and abstracting services including Lexis, Hein, and EBSCO.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The *Israel Law Review* gratefully acknowledges the very generous financial assistance provided by the P.E.F. Israel Endowment Funds, in memory of the funds' founder and first president, Judge Julian W. Mack and by the permanent endowment fund established by Abraham D. Slavitt of Norwalk, Connecticut, U.S.A., in memory of his beloved wife, Jennie A. Slavitt. The *Israel Law Review* gratefully acknowledges the financial assistance of the Faculty of Law, the Hebrew University of Jerusalem. The Minerva Center for Human Rights at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem gratefully acknowledges the financial assistance provided by the Minerva Foundation for the publication of the *Israel Law Review*.

This issue contains articles presented at the International Association of Constitutional Law (IACL) Round Table on "Unconstitutional Constitutional Amendments," which took place at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem on April 25-26, 2010.

## SUBMISSIONS

The *Israel Law Review* accepts unsolicited articles for submission. Please follow the submission guidelines available at <http://law.huji.ac.il/eng/pirsumim.asp?cat=741&in=735>.

## SUBSCRIPTION

The *Israel Law Review* is issued three times annually. From Volume 45 onwards, it will be published by Cambridge University Press. Please address subscription enquiries to [journals@cambridge.org](mailto:journals@cambridge.org) (U.K., Europe, and Rest of the World) or [subscriptions\\_newyork@cambridge.org](mailto:subscriptions_newyork@cambridge.org) (U.S., Canada, and Mexico).

## DISCLAIMER

The opinions expressed in articles are those of the signed authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the Hebrew University of Jerusalem or of the *Israel Law Review*.

## COPYRIGHT

All rights reserved. Permission to reproduce articles should be obtained through the *Israel Law Review*.

## CONTACT

*Israel Law Review*  
The Minerva Center for Human Rights  
Faculty of Law, Hebrew University of Jerusalem  
Mount Scopus, Jerusalem 91905, Israel  
Tel: +972-2-5881156  
Fax: +972-2-5819371  
[ilr@savion.huji.ac.il](mailto:ilr@savion.huji.ac.il)  
<http://law.huji.ac.il/eng/pirsumim.asp?cat=735>  
ISSN 0021-2237