

PMILA



SPECIAL TOPIC
The Status of Evidence

Publications of the
■
Modern Language
■
Association
■
of America
■

1 9 9 6

JANUARY

VOLUME 111 ■ NUMBER 1

LITERATURE & CRITICISM



WENDY STEINER

The Scandal of Pleasure

Art in an Age of Fundamentalism

WENDY STEINER

"Sanity, sanity, sanity, as Steiner squarely addresses a number of contemporary cultural conflicts and teases out their subtler meanings.

... This is one of the few works of cultural criticism that is actually intelligible to the nonspecialized reader. Ranging from the S & M photos of Robert Mapplethorpe to the *fatwa* against Salman Rushdie to that discredited doyen of deconstructionism, Paul de Man, Steiner argues for a conception of art that cuts between aestheticism and literalism. . . . A welcome association of sense and sensibility."—*Kirkus Reviews*

Cloth \$24.95 264 pages 30 halftones

Literary Intellectuals and the Dissolution of the State

Professionalism and Conformity in the GDR

EDITED BY ROBERT VON HALLBERG

This collection of interviews with more than two dozen East German writers and literary scholars, including several Stasi informants, provides a gripping, often dismaying picture of the motivations, compromises, and illusions of East German intellectual life.

*Paper \$16.95 384 pages

The Wounded Storyteller

Body, Illness, and Ethics

ARTHUR W. FRANK

"The topic of *The Wounded Storyteller* is, of course, of perennial significance. Arthur Frank, author of a celebrated account of his own experience with cancer and heart attack, is a master of works on illness experience and embodiment, and he writes about them with impressive clarity."

—Arthur Kleinman, author of *The Illness*

Narratives

Cloth \$19.95 238 pages

Sappho Is Burning

PAGE DuBOIS

"In a sequence of wonderfully subtle readings, duBois explains how Sappho became the 'symptom' or 'other' of later masculinist philosophy, history, physical discipline, and national rhetoric, because she offered such clear aesthetic, epistemological, and ideological alternatives to the Eurocentric notions that Western humanism has so long revered."—Nancy Armstrong,

Brown University

Cloth \$24.95 224 pages

Bound and Determined

Captivity, Culture-Crossing, and White Womanhood from Mary Rowlandson to Patty Hearst

CHRISTOPHER CASTIGLIA

Christopher Castiglia gives shape for the first time to a tradition of American women's captivity narrative that ranges across three centuries, from Puritan colonist Mary Rowlandson's abduction by Narragansett Indians to Patty Hearst's kidnapping by the Symbionese Liberation Army.

*Paper \$13.95 216 pages 6 halftones

Women in Culture and Society Series

THE UNIVERSITY OF CHICAGO PRESS

5801 South Ellis Avenue, Chicago, Illinois 60637

January 1996

PMILA

Publications of the
Modern Language Association
of America

Volume 111, Number 1

Published six times a year by the association

The Modern Language Association of America

Officers for the Year 1996

President: SANDRA M. GILBERT, *University of California, Davis*
First Vice President: HERBERT LINDENBERGER, *Stanford University*
Executive Director: PHYLLIS FRANKLIN

Executive Council

For the term ending 31 December 1996

LINDA HUTCHEON, *University of Toronto, Saint George Campus*
SUSAN KIRKPATRICK, *University of California, San Diego*
SUSAN RUBIN SULEIMAN, *Harvard University*

For the term ending 31 December 1997

PETER BROOKS, *Yale University*
ANDREA A. LUNSFORD, *Ohio State University, Columbus*
SYLVIA MOLLOY, *New York University*
SUSAN NOAKES, *University of Minnesota, Twin Cities*

For the term ending 31 December 1998

FRANCES SMITH FOSTER, *Emory University*
PETER UWE HOHENDAHL, *Cornell University*
FRANK TROMMLER, *University of Pennsylvania*

Trustees of Invested Funds

CAROLYN G. HEILBRUN, *New York, New York*
HUGH O'NEILL, *New York, New York*
MALCOLM B. SMITH (Managing Trustee), *New York, New York*

PMLA (ISSN 0030-8129) is published six times a year, in January, March, May, September, October, and November, by the Modern Language Association of America. Membership in the association is open to persons who are professionally interested in the modern languages and literatures. Annual dues, which include subscription to *PMLA*, are based on members' incomes and are graduated as follows: student members (seven years maximum), \$20; new regular members (first year), \$35; regular members (income under \$15,000), \$25; regular members (income \$15,000–\$20,000), \$40; regular members (income \$20,000–\$30,000), \$50; regular members (income \$30,000–\$40,000), \$65; regular members (income \$40,000–\$50,000), \$75; regular members (income \$50,000–\$60,000), \$85; regular members (income \$60,000–\$70,000), \$95; regular members (income \$70,000–\$80,000), \$105; regular members (income over \$80,000), \$125; joint members (two individuals sharing the same household, who receive one subscription to *PMLA* but two copies of all other publications), add \$20 to dues category of higher-income member; foreign members, same as regular members (use the American-dollar equivalent to ascertain the dues category). Membership applications are available on request.

The subscription price of *PMLA* for libraries and other institutions is \$108. A subscription including a bound volume at the end of the year is \$243, domestic and foreign. Agents deduct 4% as their fee. Single copies of the January, March, May, and October issues may be obtained for \$12 each; the September (Directory) issue for \$50; the November (Program) issue for \$35.

Issues for the current year are available from the Member and Customer Services Office of the association (212 614-6381; membership@mla.org). Claims for undelivered issues will be honored if they are received within one year of the publication date; thereafter the single-issue price will be charged.

For information about the availability of back issues, inquire of Periodical Service Company, Germantown, NY 12526; 914 941-4404. Early and current volumes may be obtained on microfilm from University Microfilms, Ann Arbor, MI 48106. Purchase of current volumes on film is restricted to subscribers of the journal.

The office of publication and editorial offices are located at 10 Astor Place, New York, NY 10003-6981; 212 475-9500; pmla@mla.org.

All communications including notices of changes of address should be sent to the Member and Customer Services Office of the association. If a change of address also involves a change of institutional affiliation, that office should be informed of this fact at the same time. Second-class postage paid at New York, NY, and at additional mailing offices.

©1996 by The Modern Language Association of America. All rights reserved. Printed in the United States of America.

Library of Congress Catalog Card Number 12-32040. United States Postal Service Number 449-660.

POSTMASTER: Send address changes to *PMLA*, Member and Customer Services Office, Modern Language Association of America, 10 Astor Place, New York, NY 10003-6981.

Publications of the Modern Language Association

Published six times a year Indexes: Vols. 1–50, 1935; 51–60, 1945; 51–79, 1964

Editor: DOMNA C. STANTON, *University of Michigan, Ann Arbor*

Managing Editor: JUDY GOULDING

Assistant Editors: ERIN TROSTLE and ERIC WIRTH

Editorial Assistants: JOHN D. GOLBACH and JAMES PONIEWOZIK

Advertising Manager and Submissions Associate: CYNTHIA R. PORT

Administrative Assistant: XENI FRAGAKIS

Editorial Board

CARLOS J. ALONSO, 1996, *Emory University*

RUSSELL BERMAN, 1997, *Stanford University*

LAWRENCE BUELL, 1996, *Harvard University*

MICHAEL HOLQUIST, 1997, *Yale University*

COPPELIA KAHN, 1996, *Brown University*

CORA KAPLAN, 1997, *Rutgers University, New Brunswick*

Advisory Committee

LESLIE A. ADELSON, 1998, *Ohio State University, Columbus*

KWAME ANTHONY APPIAH, 1997, *Harvard University*

TEOLINDA BAROLINI, 1998, *Columbia University*

CHARLES BERNHEIMER, 1997, *University of Pennsylvania*

JOHN BEVERLEY, 1996, *University of Pittsburgh, Pittsburgh*

JOSEPH BOONE, 1997, *University of Southern California*

LAURA S. BROWN, 1998, *Cornell University*

ROBERT CASERIO, 1998, *Temple University*

ELIN DIAMOND, 1997, *Rutgers University, New Brunswick*

JOANNE F. DIEHL, 1997, *University of California, Davis*

LAURIE EDSON, 1996, *San Diego State University*

STEVEN FINK, 1998, *Ohio State University, Columbus*

SUSAN GUBAR, 1997, *Indiana University, Bloomington*

ALICE C. HARRIS, 1998, *Vanderbilt University*

N. KATHERINE HAYLES, 1998, *University of California, Los Angeles*

JEAN E. HOWARD, 1997, *Columbia University*

KATHRYN HUME, 1997, *Penn State University, University Park*

LAWRENCE D. KRITZMAN, 1996, *Dartmouth College*

H. MARSHALL LEICESTER, JR., 1997, *University of California, Santa Cruz*

JOSEPH F. LOEWENSTEIN, 1996, *Washington University*

STEVEN MAILLOUX, 1996, *University of California, Irvine*

RICHARD MARIUS, 1996, *Harvard University*

JUDITH MAYNE, 1998, *Ohio State University, Columbus*

MICHAEL McKEON, 1997, *Rutgers University, New Brunswick*

ANNE MELLOR, 1997, *University of California, Los Angeles*

ADRIENNE MUNICH, 1996, *State University of New York, Stony Brook*

SANDY PETREY, 1996, *State University of New York, Stony Brook*

DEBORA SHUGER, 1996, *University of California, Los Angeles*

WILLIAM MILLS TODD III, 1998, *Harvard University*

PATRICIA YAEGER, 1996, *University of Michigan, Ann Arbor*

MARGARITA ZAMORA, 1996, *University of Wisconsin, Madison*

JACK ZIPES, 1998, *University of Minnesota, Twin Cities*

A Statement of Editorial Policy

PMLA welcomes essays of interest to those concerned with the study of language and literature. As the publication of a large and heterogeneous association, the journal is receptive to a variety of topics, whether general or specific, and to all scholarly methods and theoretical perspectives. The ideal *PMLA* essay exemplifies the best of its kind, whatever the kind; addresses a significant problem; draws out clearly the implications of its findings; and engages the attention of its audience through a concise, readable presentation. Manuscripts in languages other than English are accepted for review but must be accompanied by a detailed summary in English (generally of 1,000–1,500 words) and must be translated into English if they are recommended to the Editorial Board. Articles of fewer than 2,500 words or more than 9,000 words are not considered for publication. The word count includes notes but excludes works-cited lists and translations, which should accompany foreign language quotations. The MLA urges its contributors to be sensitive to the social implications of language and to seek wording free of discriminatory overtones.

Only members of the association may submit articles to *PMLA*. Each article submitted is sent to at least one consultant reader and one member of the Advisory Committee. Articles recommended by these readers are then sent to the members of the Editorial Board, who meet periodically with the editor to make final decisions. Until a final decision is reached, the author's name is not made known to consultant readers, to members of the Advisory Committee and the Editorial Board, or to the editor. Because the submission of an article simultaneously to more than one refereed journal can result in duplication of the demanding task of reviewing the manuscript, it is *PMLA*'s policy not to review articles that are under consideration by other journals. An article found to have been submitted elsewhere will not be published in *PMLA* even if it has already been accepted for publication by the Editorial Board.

Submissions, prepared according to *The MLA Style Manual*, should be sent in duplicate and addressed to the Managing Editor, *PMLA*, Modern Language Association, 10 Astor Place, New York, NY 10003-6981. With each submission please include a self-addressed envelope and enough postage for both copies to be returned. Authors' names should not appear on manuscripts; instead, a cover sheet, with the author's name and address and the title of the article, should accompany each manuscript. Authors should not refer to themselves in the first person in the submitted text or notes if such references would identify them; any necessary references to the author's previous work, for example, should be in the third person.

Criticism in Translation

MLA members are invited to submit to the *PMLA* Editorial Board proposals for translations. Articles, as well as chapters or sections of books that can function as independent units, will be considered. The originals may be in any language. Two types of proposals are welcome: (1) significant scholarship from earlier periods that has not lost its forcefulness and whose retrieval in English in *PMLA* would be a noteworthy event for a broad body of readers or (2) contemporary work of sufficient weight and potential influence to merit the attention of the field as a whole.

A member who wishes to make a proposal should first ascertain that no previous English translation exists. The proposer should then provide the managing editor with the following materials: (1) a photocopy of the original essay, (2) an extended summary of the entire essay in English, (3) an introductory statement of approximately 1,000 words, prepared in accordance with MLA style, that will be published with the essay if the essay is accepted, (4) information on the copyright status of the original (if the translation is accepted for publication, the proposer will be responsible for obtaining permission to print it). In addition, if the proposer wishes to serve as translator of the essay or to designate a translator (who must also be an MLA member), a 1,000-word sample of the translation should be submitted; otherwise the Editorial Board will select a translator.

The translated essays should normally not exceed *PMLA*'s 9,000-word limit. The Editorial Board will approve or decline the proposals, evaluate the quality of the translations, and cooperate with the proposers and translators.

Contents

Special Topic	6
Forthcoming in <i>PMLA</i>	6
Special Topic: The Status of Evidence	
Introduction	
<i>Heather Dubrow</i>	7
The Status of Evidence: A Roundtable	21
Textual Forensics	
<i>D. C. Greetham</i>	32
“But One Expects That”: Charlotte Perkins Gilman’s “The Yellow Wallpaper” and the Shifting Light of Scholarship <i>Julie Bates Dock, with Daphne Ryan Allen, Jennifer Palais, and Kristen Tracy</i>	52
Imaging the Human Body: Quasi Objects, Quasi Texts, and the Theater of Proof <i>T. Hugh Crawford</i>	66
A Choice of Fictions: Historians, Memory, and Evidence <i>James Wilkinson</i>	80
Awful Disclosures: Women’s Evidence in the Escaped Nun’s Tale <i>Susan M. Griffin</i>	93
Tracing <i>Shoah</i> <i>Robert Brinkley and Steven Youra</i>	108
Forum	
<i>Contributions by Marshall Brown, Keith Fynaardt, Lila M. Harper, William B. Hunter, Helen M. Kim, Donald Morton, Tim Prior, Dennis Ryan, Patricia Meyer Spacks, and Arvid Sponberg</i>	128
Forthcoming Meetings and Conferences of General Interest	135
Index of Advertisers	137
Professional Notes and Comment	158
Announcements 158	
Journal Notes 164	
In Memoriam 168	
Abstracts	191

*The cover photograph is from the
Bettmann Archive.*