

# SLAVIC REVIEW

SPRING 2003

American Quarterly of Russian, Eurasian, and East European Studies

## DISCUSSION

- Anna Krylova** *Beyond the Spontaneity-Consciousness Paradigm: "Class Instinct" as a Promising Category of Historical Analysis*
- Reginald E. Zelnik** *A Paradigm Lost? Response to Anna Krylova*
- Igal Halfin** *Between Instinct and Mind: The Bolshevik View of the Proletarian Self*

## ARTICLES

- Sona Stephan Hoisington** *"Ever Higher": The Evolution of the Project for the Palace of Soviets*
- Aaron J. Cohen** *Oh, That! Myth, Memory, and World War I in the Russian Emigration and the Soviet Union*
- Jeffrey S. Kopstein and Jason Wittenberg** *Who Voted Communist? Reconsidering the Social Bases of Radicalism in Interwar Poland*
- Patrick Hyder Patterson** *On the Edge of Reason: The Boundaries of Balkanism in Slovenian, Austrian, and Italian Discourse*

## EDITOR

DIANE P. KOENKER

ASSOCIATE EDITOR, JANE T. HEDGES

EDITORIAL ASSISTANTS

IRINA GIGOVA

GREGORY STROUD

CHRISTINE G. VARGA-HARRIS

## EDITORIAL BOARD

### *History*

Padraic Kenney, *University of Colorado* • Valerie Kivelson, *University of Michigan* • David R. Marples, *University of Alberta* • Louise McReynolds, *University of Hawai'i* • Donald J. Raleigh, *University of North Carolina* • Elise Kimerling Wirtschafter, *California State Polytechnic University, Pomona*

### *Literature*

Eliot Borenstein, *New York University* • Edith W. Clowes, *University of Kansas* • Susanne Fusso, *Wesleyan University* • Marcus C. Levitt, *University of Southern California* • Harriet Murav, *University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign* • Andrew Baruch Wachtel, *Northwestern University*

### *Social Sciences*

Cynthia Buckley, *University of Texas* • Valerie Bunce, *Cornell University* • Gerald Creed, *Hunter College and the Graduate Center, CUNY* • Stephen E. Hanson, *University of Washington* • Barry Ickes, *Pennsylvania State University* • Nancy Ries, *Colgate University*

The editors assume no responsibility for statements of fact or opinion made by contributors.

*Slavic Review* (formerly *The American Slavic and East European Review*) is published quarterly by the American Association for the Advancement of Slavic Studies, Inc., and is sent to all association members. Members also receive *NewsNet*, the AAASS newsletter. Membership is open to individuals interested in Slavic studies and the study of the non-Slavic peoples of eastern Europe and Eurasia. Applications for membership are accepted by the AAASS, 8 Story Street, Cambridge, MA 02138; (617) 495-0677.

Membership Dues: students or those with salaries under \$20,000—\$30.00; those with salaries \$20,000–\$29,999—\$45.00; \$30,000–\$39,999—\$65.00; \$40,000–\$49,999—\$75.00; \$50,000–\$59,999—\$90.00; \$60,000–\$69,999—\$105.00; \$70,000–\$99,999—\$125.00; \$100,000 and over—\$150.00. Joint members with one subscription to *Slavic Review*, add \$30.00 to dues of higher paid member. Subscriptions without membership are \$65.00. Single current issues and back issues to subscribers are \$25.00; for members, \$20.00 each. For members living in Canada or Mexico, please add \$20.00 for shipping; for members living overseas, please add \$35.00. Correspondence regarding membership, subscriptions, changes of address, or items for *NewsNet* should be sent to the AAASS headquarters at Cambridge.

Published by the American Association for the Advancement of Slavic Studies, Inc. Cover design by B. Williams & Associates, Durham, North Carolina; the typeface Mason is from Emigre Fonts. Text set in Baskerville by G&S Typesetters, Inc., Austin, Texas. Printed by Science Press, Ephrata, Pennsylvania. Periodicals postage paid at Boston, Massachusetts, and additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to AAASS, 8 Story Street, Cambridge, MA 02138.

Copyright © 2003 *Slavic Review* ISSN 0037-6779 by the American Association for the Advancement of Slavic Studies, Inc. Permission to reprint must generally be obtained from the association's office. Copying is permitted in accordance with the fair use guidelines of the US Copyright act of 1976. The association permits the following additional educational uses without permission or payment of fees: academic libraries may place materials from *Slavic Review* on reserve (in multiple photocopied or electronically retrievable form) for students enrolled in specific courses; teachers may reproduce or have reproduced multiple copies (in photocopied or electronic form) for students in their courses. Those wishing to reproduce material from *Slavic Review* for any other purpose (general distribution, advertising or promotion, creating new collective works, resale, etc.) must obtain permission from the association.

(continued on inside back cover)

# SLAVIC REVIEW

AMERICAN QUARTERLY OF RUSSIAN, EURASIAN, AND EAST EUROPEAN STUDIES

---

VOLUME 62 NUMBER 1 • SPRING 2003

<b>CONTRIBUTORS</b>	vii
<b>ABSTRACTS</b>	ix
<b>DISCUSSION</b>	
Beyond the Spontaneity-Consciousness Paradigm: “Class Instinct” as a Promising Category of Historical Analysis ANNA KRYLOVA	1
A Paradigm Lost? Response to Anna Krylova REGINALD E. ZELNIK	24
Between Instinct and Mind: The Bolshevik View of the Proletarian Self IGAL HALFIN	34
<b>ARTICLES</b>	
“Ever Higher”: The Evolution of the Project for the Palace of Soviets SONA STEPHAN HOISINGTON	41
Oh, That! Myth, Memory, and World War I in the Russian Emigration and the Soviet Union AARON J. COHEN	69
Who Voted Communist? Reconsidering the Social Bases of Radicalism in Interwar Poland JEFFREY S. KOPSTEIN and JASON WITTENBERG	87

On the Edge of Reason: The Boundaries of Balkanism in Slovenian, Austrian, and Italian Discourse PATRICK HYDER PATTERSON	110
-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----

## BOOK REVIEWS

Richard A. Anderson, Jr., M. Steven Fish, Stephen E. Hanson, and Philip G. Roeder, <i>Postcommunism and the Theory of Democracy</i> , introduction, George W. Breslauer (Richard Sakwa)	142
Ben Fowkes, <i>Ethnicity and Ethnic Conflict in the Post-Communist World</i> (Janusz Bugajski)	143
Jean Blondel and Ferdinand Müller-Rommel, <i>Cabinets in Eastern Europe</i> (Petr Kopecky)	144
Andrew Cottey, Timothy Edmunds, and Anthony Forster, eds., <i>Democratic Control of the Military in Postcommunist Europe: Guarding the Guards</i> (Gerhard Kümmel)	145
Stephen Crowley and David Ost, eds., <i>Workers after Workers' States: Labor and Politics in Postcommunist Eastern Europe</i> (Sarah A. Vickerstaff)	146
Anders Åslund, <i>Building Capitalism: The Transformation of the Former Soviet Bloc</i> (David M. Kotz)	147
Victoria E. Bonnell and Thomas B. Gold, eds., <i>The New Entrepreneurs of Europe and Asia: Patterns of Business Development in Russia, Eastern Europe, and China</i> (Jacek Kochanowicz)	148
János Kornai and Karen Eggleston, <i>Welfare, Choice, and Solidarity in Transition: Reforming the Health Sector in Eastern Europe</i> (William C. Cockerham)	149
Daphne Berdahl, Matti Bunzl, and Martha Lampland, eds., <i>Altering States: Ethnographies of Transition in Eastern Europe and the Former Soviet Union</i> (Gerald W. Creed)	150
Will Guy, ed., <i>Between Past and Future: The Roma of Central and Eastern Europe</i> (Arista Maria Cirtautas)	152
Jörg K. Hoensch and Hans Lemberg, eds., <i>Begegnung und Konflikt: Schlaglichter auf das Verhältnis von Tschechen, Slowaken und Deutschen 1815–1989</i> (Scott Spector)	153
Marsha L. Rozenblit, <i>Reconstructing a National Identity: The Jews of Habsburg Austria during World War I</i> (Albert S. Lindemann)	154
Robert Porter, <i>An Introduction to Twentieth-Century Czech Fiction: Comedies of Defiance</i> (Martin Pilař)	155

Abby Innes, <i>Czechoslovakia: The Short Goodbye</i> (Steven Saxonberg)	156
Jerzy Lukowski and Hubert Zawadzki, <i>A Concise History of Poland</i> (Brian Porter)	157
Keely Stauter-Halsted, <i>The Nation in the Village: The Genesis of Peasant National Identity in Austrian Poland, 1848–1914</i> (Melissa K. Bokovoy)	159
Krystyna Iglicka, <i>Poland's Post-War Dynamic of Migration</i> (Claire Wallace)	160
George Blazycy and Ryszard Rapacki, eds., <i>Poland into the New Millennium</i> (Elizabeth Deboer-Ashworth)	161
Marida Hollos, <i>Scandal in a Small Town: Understanding Modern Hungary through the Stories of Three Families</i> (György Csepeli)	161
Mieke Meurs, <i>The Evolution of Agrarian Institutions: A Comparative Study of Post-Socialist Hungary and Bulgaria</i> (Martha Lampland)	162
Dennis P. Hupchick, <i>The Balkans: From Constantinople to Communism</i> (Traian Stoianovich)	163
M. Şükrü Hanioglu, <i>Preparation for a Revolution: The Young Turks, 1902–1908</i> (Selçuk Akşin Somel)	164
Stevan K. Pavlowitch, <i>Serbia: The History of an Idea</i> (David MacKenzie)	165
Carol S. Lilly, <i>Power and Persuasion: Ideology and Rhetoric in Communist Yugoslavia, 1944–1953</i> (Andrew Wachtel)	166
Saadia Touval, <i>Mediation in the Yugoslav Wars: The Critical Years, 1990–95</i> (Peter Radan)	167
Keith Doubt, <i>Sociology after Bosnia and Kosovo: Recovering Justice</i> (Tone Bringa)	168
Džemal Sokolović and Florian Bieber, eds., <i>Reconstructing Multiethnic Societies: The Case of Bosnia-Herzegovina</i> (Stefan Troebst)	170
Zlatko Isakovic, <i>Identity and Security in Former Yugoslavia</i> (Stefano Bianchini)	171
Zoriana Lanovyk, <i>Ostap Tarnavs'kii</i> (Leonid Rudnytzky)	172
Hans van Zon, <i>The Political Economy of Independent Ukraine</i> (Yaroslav Bilinsky)	173
Robert H. Hewsen, <i>Armenia: A Historical Atlas</i> (Michael E. Stone)	174

Erika Weinthal, <i>State Making and Environmental Cooperation: Linking Domestic and International Politics in Central Asia</i> (Anatoly M. Khazanov)	175
Martha Brill Olcott, <i>Kazakhstan: Unfulfilled Promise</i> (John Glenn)	176
A. Iu. Minakov, <i>Konservatizm v Rossii i mire: Proshloe i nastoiashchee. Sbornik nauchnykh trudov. Vypusk 1</i> (G. M. Hamburg)	177
ChaeRan Y. Freeze, <i>Jewish Marriage and Divorce in Imperial Russia</i> (Michael Stanislawski)	179
Paul W. Werth, <i>At the Margins of Orthodoxy: Mission, Governance, and Confessional Politics in Russia's Volga-Kama Region, 1827–1905</i> (Nikolas K. Gvosdev)	180
Patricia Herlihy, <i>The Alcoholic Empire: Vodka and Politics in Late Imperial Russia</i> (Laurie Bernstein)	181
Kristina Küntzel, <i>Von Nižnij Novgorod zu Gor'kii—Metamorphosen einer russischen Provinzstadt: Die Entwicklung der Stadt von den 1890er bis zu den 1930er Jahren</i> (James H. Bater)	182
A. V. Makushin and P. A. Tribunskii, <i>Pavel Nikolaevich Miliukov: Trudy i dni (1859–1904)</i> (Melissa K. Stockdale)	183
Israel Getzler, <i>Nikolai Sukhanov: Chronicler of the Russian Revolution</i> (James D. White)	184
Mark D. Steinberg, <i>Voices of Revolution, 1917</i> , afterword, Ekaterina Betekhtina, documents translated by Marian Schwartz, documents compiled by Mark D. Steinberg, Zinaida Peregudova, and Liubov Tiutiunnik (Rex A. Wade)	185
Dan Healey, <i>Homosexual Desire in Revolutionary Russia: The Regulation of Sexual and Gender Dissent</i> (Laura L. Phillips)	187
Jeffrey Veidlinger, <i>The Moscow State Yiddish Theater: Jewish Culture on the Soviet Stage</i> (Jonathan Frankel)	188
Terry Martin, <i>The Affirmative Action Empire: Nations and Nationalism in the Soviet Union, 1923–1939</i> (Michael G. Smith)	189
Maureen Perrie, <i>The Cult of Ivan the Terrible in Stalin's Russia</i> (Joan Neuberger)	190
Matthew Payne, <i>Stalin's Railroad: Turksib and the Building of Socialism</i> (Peter Konecny)	191
Reina Pennington, <i>Wings, Women, and War: Soviet Airwomen in World War II Combat</i> , foreword, John Erickson (Sally W. Stoecker)	192
Russian General Staff, <i>The Soviet-Afghan War: How a Superpower Fought and Lost</i> , trans. and ed., Lester W. Grau and Michael A. Gress, foreword, Theodore C. Mataxis (Robert V. Baryl'ski)	193

John Murray, <i>Politics and Place-Names: Changing Names in the Late Soviet Period</i> (David B. Knight)	195
Mark R. Beissinger, <i>Nationalist Mobilization and the Collapse of the Soviet State</i> (Ben Fowkes)	196
Vladimir Shlapentokh, <i>A Normal Totalitarian Society: How the Soviet Union Functioned and How It Collapsed</i> (Stephen Crowley)	197
Michael McFaul, <i>Russia's Unfinished Revolution: Political Change from Gorbachev to Putin</i> (Jerry F. Hough)	198
Gordon M. Hahn, <i>Russia's Revolution from Above, 1985–2000: Reform, Transition, and Revolution in the Fall of the Soviet Communist Regime</i> (Donald Barry)	199
Vladimir Mau and Irina Starodubrovskaya, <i>The Challenge of Revolution: Contemporary Russia in Historical Perspective</i> (Peter J. S. Duncan)	200
Neil Robinson, <i>Russia: A State of Uncertainty</i> (Richard D. Anderson)	201
Kaarle Nordenstreng, Elena Vartanova and Yassen Zassoursky, eds., <i>Russian Media Challenge</i> (Jonathan Becker)	202
Jeffrey W. Hahn, ed., <i>Regional Russia in Transition: Studies from Yaroslavl'</i> (Cameron Ross)	204
Susanne Michele Birgerson, <i>After the Breakup of a Multi-Ethnic Empire: Russia, Successor States, and Eurasian Security</i> (Andrew Williams)	205
Deborah Sanders, <i>Security Co-Operation between Russia and Ukraine in the Post-Soviet Era</i> (Sherman W. Garnett)	206
Daniel R. Kempton and Terry D. Clark, eds., <i>Unity or Separation: Center-Periphery Relations in the Former Soviet Union</i> (Mikhail A. Alexseev)	207
Klaus Segbers, ed., <i>Explaining Post-Soviet Patchworks. Volume 2, Pathways from the Past to the Global</i> (Steven S. Rosefielde)	208
Chris J. Chulos and Johannes Remy, eds., <i>Imperial and National Identities in Pre-Revolutionary, Soviet, and Post-Soviet Russia</i> (Edward C. Thaden)	210
Linda Edmondson, ed., <i>Gender in Russian History and Culture</i> (Martha Bohachevsky Chomiak)	211
Catriona Kelly, <i>Refining Russia: Advice Literature, Polite Culture, and Gender from Catherine to Yeltsin</i> (Lynn Mally)	212
Julian W. Connolly, <i>The Intimate Stranger: Meetings with the Devil in Nineteenth-Century Russian Literature</i> (William J. Leatherbarrow)	213

George Pattison and Diane Oenning Thompson, eds., <i>Dostoevsky and the Christian Tradition</i> (Jonathan Sutton)	214
David Shepherd, <i>The Contexts of Bakhtin: Philosophy, Authorship, Aesthetics</i> (Jørgen Bruhn)	215
Susan M. Felch and Paul J. Contino, eds., <i>Bakhtin and Religion: A Feeling for Faith</i> (Anthony Anemone)	216
Mikhail Krutikov, <i>Yiddish Fiction and the Crisis of Modernity, 1905–1914</i> (Ken Frieden)	217
Robert Hodel, <i>Erlebte Rede bei Andrei Platonov: Von V zvezdnoj pustyne bis Čevengur</i> (Thomas Seifrid)	218
Hana Píchová, <i>The Art of Memory in Exile: Vladimir Nabokov and Milan Kundera</i> (Peter Petro)	219
Boris Thomson, <i>The Art of Compromise: The Life and Work of Leonid Leonov</i> (John Givens)	220
Vreneli Farber, <i>The Playwright Aleksandr Vampilov: An Ironic Observer</i> (Nick Worrall)	221
N. L. Leiderman and M. N. Lipovetskii, <i>Sovremennaia russkaia literatura: Kniga 1, Literatura "Ottepeli" (1953–1968); Sovremennaia russkaia literatura: Kniga 2, Semidesiatye gody (1968–1986); Sovremennaia russkaia literatura: Kniga 3, V kontse veka (1986–1990-e gody)</i> (N. N. Shneidman)	223
Anthony Olcott, <i>Russian Pulp: The Detektiv and the Way of Russian Crime</i> (Eliot Borenstein)	224
<b>COLLECTED ESSAYS</b>	226
<b>BOOKS RECEIVED</b>	228
<b>LETTERS</b>	233