

VOLUME 18
NUMBER 4
DECEMBER 1995

An International Journal of Current Research
and Theory with Open Peer Commentary

Behavioral and Brain Sciences

Appearing in this issue, with Commentary . . .

The Hebbian paradigm reintegrated: Local reverberations as internal representations Daniel J. Amit

The contents of consciousness: A neuropsychological conjecture
Jeffrey A. Gray

The origin and use of positional frames of reference in motor control
Anatol G. Feldman & Mindy F. Levin

Also, Continuing Commentary on
"Time and the observer: The where and when of consciousness in the brain"
(Dennett & Kinsbourne)

CAMBRIDGE

Behavioral and Brain Sciences

Editor

Stevan Harnad

E-mail: bbs@ecs.soton.ac.uk
Behavioral and Brain Sciences
Department of Psychology
University of Southampton
Highfield, Southampton SO17 1BJ
United Kingdom

Managing Editor

Henriette Korthals Altes

Production Coordinator

Edward D. Miller

Chief Copy Editor

Erika Kors

Associate Editors

Behavioral Biology

Jack P. Hailman/U. Wisconsin
Hubert Markl/U. Konstanz

Biosocial Behavior

Glendon Schubert/U. Hawaii, Manoa

Cognition and Artificial Intelligence

Zenon Pylyshyn/U. Western Ontario

Cognitive Development

Annette Karmiloff-Smith/MRC, London

Computational Neuroscience

Stephen Grossberg/Boston U.

Evolutionary Biology

Michael T. Ghiselin/California Academy of Sciences

Experimental Analysis of Behavior

A. Charles Catania/U. Maryland, Baltimore County

History and Systems

Julian Jaynes/Princeton

Language and Cognition

Philip Johnson-Laird/Princeton

Language and Language Disorders

Max Coltheart/Macquarie U.

Linguistics

Robert Freidin/Princeton

Neurobiology

Irving Kupfermann/Columbia

Neurobehavioral Genetics

Wim E. Crusio/Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique

Neuropsychology

Jeffrey A. Gray/Inst. Psychiatry, London
John C. Marshall/Radcliffe Infirmary, Oxford

Neurophysiology

Sten Grillner/Karolinska Institutet

Paleoneurology

Stephen Jay Gould/Harvard

Perception

Bruce Bridgeman/U. California
Richard Gregory/U. Bristol

Philosophy

Daniel C. Dennett/Tufts
Gilbert Harman/Princeton

Philosophy of Science

Adolf Grünbaum/U. Pittsburgh
Massimo Piatelli-Palmarini/MIT

Primatology

Horst D. Steklis/Rutgers

Psychobiology

Victor H. Denenberg/U. Connecticut

Vision and Artificial Intelligence

Stuart Sutherland/U. Sussex

Editorial Policy *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (BBS) is an international journal providing a special service called Open Peer Commentary* to researchers in any area of psychology, neuroscience, behavioral biology, or cognitive science who wish to solicit, from fellow specialists within and across these BBS disciplines, multiple responses to a particularly significant and controversial piece of work. (See *Instructions for Authors and Commentators*, inside back cover.) The purpose of this service is to contribute to the communication, criticism, stimulation, and particularly the unification of research in the behavioral and brain sciences, from molecular neurobiology to artificial intelligence and the philosophy of mind.

Papers judged by the editors and referees to be appropriate for Commentary are circulated to a large number of commentators selected by the editors, referees, and author to provide substantive criticism, interpretation, elaboration, and pertinent complementary and supplementary material from a full cross-disciplinary perspective. The article, accepted commentaries, and the author's response then appear simultaneously in BBS.

Commentary on BBS articles may be provided by any qualified professional in the behavioral and brain sciences, but much of it is drawn from a large body of BBS Associates who have become formally affiliated with the project.

Qualified professionals are eligible to become BBS Associates if they have (1) been nominated by a current BBS Associate, (2) refereed for BBS, or (3) had a commentary or article accepted for publication. A special subscription rate is available to Associates. Individuals interested in serving as BBS Associates are asked to write the editor.

Copying This journal is registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (222 Rosewood Dr., Danvers, MA 01923). Organizations in the U.S.A. who are also registered with the CCC may therefore copy material (beyond the limits permitted by sections 107 and 108 of U.S. Copyright Law) subject to payment to the CCC of the per-copy fee indicated in the code on the first page of the article. This consent does not extend to multiple copying for promotional or commercial purposes. ISI Genuine Article Service, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104, is authorized to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only. For all other use, permission should be sought from the Cambridge or New York offices of the Press.

Subscriptions *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (ISSN 0140-525X) is published quarterly in March, June, September, and December. The subscription price for *institutions* of Volume 18 (1995) is US \$222.00 net in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; UK £150.00 in the rest of the world; for *individuals* US \$90.00 net (£59.00); for *BBS Associates and for students* (in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico only) with proof of eligibility with order US \$50.00 net (£37.00). Subscription price includes surface postage.

Single parts cost US \$57.00 net (£36.00) plus postage. *Institutional* orders may be sent to a bookseller, or, in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico direct to: Cambridge University Press, 40 West 20 Street, New York, NY 10011-4211; in the U.K. and rest of the world to: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 2RU, England. *Individuals* must order direct from the Press. Second class postage paid at New York, N.Y., and at additional mailing offices. **Postmaster:** Send address changes in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico to *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, Cambridge University Press, Journals Dept., 110 Midland Ave., Port Chester, NY 10573.

Advertising Inquiries about advertising should be sent to the Journals Advertising Department of the Cambridge or New York Office of Cambridge University Press.

*Modelled on the 'CA Comment' service of the journal *Current Anthropology*.

Contents Volume 18:4 December 1995

Amit, D. J. The Hebbian paradigm reintegrated: Local reverberations as internal representations **617**

Open Peer Commentary

Ahissar, E. Are single-cell data sufficient for testing neural network models? 626	Lansner, A. & Fransén, E. Distributed cell assemblies and detailed cell models 637
Bienenstock, E. & Geman, S. Where the adventure is 627	Milner, P. M. Attractors—Don't get sucked in 638
Chown, E. Reverberation reconsidered: On the path to cognitive theory 628	Morita, M. Another ANN model for the Miyashita experiments 639
Dalenoort, G. J. & de Vries, P. H. What's in a cell assembly? 629	Petitot, J. The problems of cognitive dynamical models 640
Edelman, S. How representation works is more important than what representations are 630	Pulvermüller, F. & Preissl, H. Local or transcortical assemblies? Some evidence from cognitive neuroscience 640
Freeman, W. J. The Hebbian paradigm reintegrated: Local reverberations as internal representations 631	Raijmakers, M. E. J. & Molenaar, P. C. M. How to decide whether a neural representation is a cognitive concept? 641
Fuster, J. M. Not the module does memory make—but the network 631	Rauschecker, J. P. Reverberations of Hebbian thinking 642
Hirsch, M. W. Mathematics of Hebbian attractors 633	van der Velde, F. Association and computation with cell assemblies 643
Hoffman, R. E. Additional tests of Amit's attractor neural networks 634	Wright, J. J. How do local reverberations achieve global integration? 644
Hucka, M., Weaver, M. & Kaplan, S. Hebb's accomplishments misunderstood 635	Author's Response
Klimesch, W. The functional meaning of reverberations for sensoric and contextual encoding 636	Amit, D. J. Empirical and theoretical active memory: The proper context 645
Krakauer, D. C. & Houston, A. I. An evolutionary perspective on Hebb's reverberatory representations 636	

Gray, J. A. The contents of consciousness: A neuropsychological conjecture **659**

Open Peer Commentary

Crider, A. Segmentalized consciousness in schizophrenia 676	Merskey, H. Comparators, functions, and experiences 689
Dennett, D. C. Overworking the hippocampus 677	Nelson, T. D. The control of consciousness via a neuropsychological feedback loop 690
Dennis, S. & Humphreys, M. Possible roles for a predictor plus comparator mechanism in human episodic recognition memory and imitative learning 678	Newman, J. Reticular-thalamic activation of the cortex generates conscious contents 691
Díaz, J.-L. Hunting for consciousness in the brain: What is (the name of) the game? 679	Rachlin, H. The elusive quale 692
Eichenbaum, H. & Cohen, N. J. Consciousness, memory, and the hippocampal system: What kind of connections can we make? 680	Reeke, G. N., Jr. Unitary consciousness requires distributed comparators and global mappings 693
Ellard, C. G. Context and consciousness 681	Revonsuo, A. Prospects for a cognitive neuroscience of consciousness 694
Foss, J. On seeking the mythical fountain of consciousness 682	Schmajuk, N. A. & Axelrad, E. Communication and consciousness: A neural network conjecture 695
Frith, C. Consciousness is for other people 682	Shames, V. A. & Hubbard, T. L. Consciousness beyond the comparator 697
Hemsley, D. R. Psychopathology and the discontinuity of conscious experience 683	Smith, J. D. The homunculus at home 697
Hurley, S. L. Perspective, reflection, transparent explanation, and other minds 684	Stephens, G. L. & Graham, G. Ultimate differences 698
Ingvaldsen, R. & Whiting, H. T. A. Mind—your head! 685	Swerdlow, N. R. Don't leave the "un" off "consciousness" 699
Ivanitsky, A. M. Information synthesis in cortical areas as an important link in brain mechanisms of mind 686	Toates, F. On giving a more active and selective role to consciousness 700
Kinsbourne, M. Septohippocampal comparator: Consciousness generator or attention feedback loop? 687	Umiltà, C. & Zorzi, M. Consciousness does not seem to be linked to a single neural mechanism 701
Lloyd-Jones, T. J., Donnelly, N. & Weekes, B. Correlating mind and body 688	Velmans, M. The limits of neurophysiological models of consciousness 702
Lubow, R. E. Human consciousness: One of a kind 689	Author's Response
	Gray, J. A. Consciousness and its (dis)contents 703

Feldman, A. G. & Levin, M. F. The origin and use of positional frames of reference in motor control **723**

Open Peer Commentary

Alexander, R. McN. Tendon elasticity and positional control 745	Bonnard, M. & Pailhous, J. A few reasons why psychologists can adhere to Feldman and Levin's model 746
Alexandrov, A., Frolov, A. & Massion, J. Is the multi-joint pointing movement model applicable to equilibrium control during upper trunk movements? 745	Corcos, D. M. & Pfann, K. Conservative or nonconservative control schemes 747

Dean, J. The lambda model is only one piece in the motor control puzzle	749	Loeb, G. E. What can we expect from models of motor control?	767
Desmurget, M., Rosetti, Y. & Prablanc, C. Natural unconstrained movements obey rules different from constrained elementary movements	750	McDonald, P. V. Can the λ model benefit from understanding human adaptation in weightlessness (and vice versa)?	768
Fidelman, U. The lambda model and a hemispheric motor model of intentional hand movements	750	Morasso, P. & Sanguineti, V. Kinematic invariances and body schema	769
Fikes, T. C. & Townsend, J. T. Moving models of motion forward: Explication and a new concept	751	Ostry, D. J., Laboissière, R. & Gribble, P. L. Command invariants and the frame of reference for human movement	770
Flanagan, J. R., Tresilian, J. R. & Wing, A. M. Grip force adjustments during rapid hand movements suggest that detailed movement kinematics are predicted	753	Nichols, T. N. Interneurons as backseat drivers and the elusive control variable	772
Gielen, C. C. A. M. & van Bolhuis, B. Reciprocal and coactivation commands are not sufficient to describe muscle activation patterns	754	Pagano, C. C. & Bingham, G. P. Spatial frames for motor control would be commensurate with spatial frames for vision and proprioception, but what about control of energy flows?	773
Giszter, S. The case of the missing CVs: Multi-joint primitives	755	Partridge, L. D. Let us accept a “controlled trade-off” model of motor control	773
Goodman, S. R. Inverse kinematic problem: Solutions by pseudoinversion, inversion and no-inversion	756	Patla, A. E. The λ model: Can it walk?	775
Gottlieb, G. L. Shifting frames of reference but the same old point of view	758	Pribram, K. H. Position is everything?	776
Haggard, P., Miall, C. & Stein, J. Twisted pairs: Does the motor system really care about joint configurations?	759	Scott, S. H. Can the λ model be used to interpret the activity of single neurons?	778
Hamm, T. M. & Han, Z.-S. Is λ an appropriate control variable for locomotion?	761	Smeets, J. B. J. Two joints are more than twice one joint	779
Hatsopoulos, N. G. & Warren, W. H., Jr. Do control variables exist?	762	Sternad, D. & Turvey, M. T. Control parameters, equilibria, and coordination dynamics	780
Hodgson, A. The unobservability of central commands: Why testing hypotheses is so difficult	763	Thelen, E. Origins of origins of motor control	780
Ingvaldsen, R. & Whiting, H. T. A. Frameworks on shifting sands	764	van Emmerik, R. E. A. & Wagenaar, R. C. Equifinality and phase-resetting: The role of control parameter manipulations	783
Kay, B. A. Frames of reference interact and are task-dependent	765	Windhorst, U. Levers to generate movement	784
Latash, M. L. Equilibrium-point control? Yes! Deterministic mechanisms of control? No!	765	Winters, J. M. How far should we extend the equilibrium point (lambda) hypothesis?	785
Lestienne, F., Ghafouri, M. & Thullier, F. What does body configuration in microgravity tell us about the contribution of intra- and extrapersonal frames of reference for motor control?	766	Wright, C. E. & States, R. A. Biological variability and control of movements via $\delta\lambda$	786
		Authors' Response	
	766	Levin, M. F. & Feldman, A. G. The λ model for motor control: More than meets the eye	786

Continuing Commentary

On Dennett, D. C. & Kinsbourne, M. (1992) Time and the observer: The where and when of consciousness in the brain. <i>BBS</i> 15:183–247.			807
Glicksohn, J. “Multiple Drafts” of subjective experience viewed within a microgenetic framework for cognition and consciousness	807	Authors' Response	
Salter, D. Consciousness and timing	808	Dennett, D. C. & Kinsbourne, M. Multiple Drafts: An eternal golden braid?	810