

INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF

# Cultural Property

VOLUME 22 2015 NUMBERS 2-3



**CAMBRIDGE**

ISSN 0940-7391

**Subscription Information:** *International Journal of Cultural Property* (ISSN 0940-7391) is published quarterly in February, May, August, and November by Cambridge University Press for the International Cultural Property Society. Annual subscription rates for Volume 23 (2016): Institutional subscription rate, print and electronic: US \$503 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; UK £302 elsewhere. Institutional subscription rate, electronic only: US \$384 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; UK £231 elsewhere. Individual subscription rate, print only: US \$79 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; UK £42 elsewhere. Single part rates, print only: US \$145 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; UK £87 elsewhere. Prices include surface postage.

**Publishing, Advertising, and Subscription Offices:** Cambridge University Press, 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013, USA (for USA, Canada, and Mexico); or Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, England (for UK and elsewhere).

**Society Inquiries:** General inquiries concerning the International Cultural Property Society should be directed to Stanley N. Katz, Director, Center for the Arts and Cultural Policy Studies, Woodrow Wilson School, 428 Robertson Hall, Princeton University, Princeton, NJ 08544. Phone: 609-258-5637; fax: 609-258-1235; email: snkatz@princeton.edu.

**Rights and Permissions:** All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopy, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. General enquiries from the USA, Mexico, and Canada should be addressed to the New York office of Cambridge University Press <http://www.cambridge.org/us/information/rights/contacts/newyork.htm>; general enquiries from elsewhere should be addressed to the Cambridge office <http://www.cambridge.org/uk/information/rights/contacts/cambridge.htm>; permission enquiries from Australia and New Zealand should be addressed to the Melbourne office [http://www.cambridge.org/aus/information/contacts\\_melbourne.htm](http://www.cambridge.org/aus/information/contacts_melbourne.htm); enquiries regarding Spanish-language translation rights (only) should be addressed to the Madrid office <http://www.cambridge.org/uk/information/rights/contacts/madrid.htm>.

**Photocopying information for users in the U.S.A.:** The Item-Fee Code for the publication (0940-7391/10 \$15.00 + .10) indicates that copying for internal or personal use beyond that permitted by Sec. 107 or 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law is authorized for users duly registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) Transaction Reporting Service, provided that the appropriate remittance of \$15.00 per article is paid directly to CCC, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. Specific written permission must be obtained for all other copying.

**Abstracting Information:** *International Journal of Cultural Property* is indexed and abstracted in Anthropological Literature; Art and Archaeology Technical Abstracts (Online Edition); ARTbibliographies Modern; Avery Index to Architectural Periodicals; Bibliography of the History of Art (BHA); British & Irish Archaeological Bibliography (Online Edition); IBZ—Internationale Bibliographie der Geistes- und Sozialwissenschaftlichen Zeitschriftenliteratur; Index to Foreign Legal Periodicals; Index to Legal Periodicals & Books; Internationale Bibliographie der Rezensionen Geistes- und Sozialwissenschaftlicher Literatur.

© International Cultural Property Society 2015

**Cover:** This plate was meant as a celebration of the creation of the League of Nations in Geneva on April 28, 1919 and is used here as a modest reminder that on June 13 and 14, 2014, Geneva was briefly “the capital of the (art and cultural heritage law) world” when the All Art and Cultural Heritage Law Conference, whose proceedings are published in this special edition, was taking place.

# INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF Cultural Property

VOLUME 22 (2015) NUMBERS 2-3

## Editor

Alexander A. Bauer,  
*Queens College, CUNY, USA*

## Case Notes Editors

Janet E. Blake, *University of Shahid  
Beheshti, Iran*

Derek Fincham, *South Texas College  
of Law, USA*

## Book Review Editors

Hyung Il Pai, *University of California,  
Santa Barbara, USA*

Patrick J. O'Keefe, *University of  
Queensland, Australia*

## Associate Editors

Haidy Geismar, *University College,  
London, UK*

Sonia Katyal, *Fordham University School  
of Law, USA*

Tom King, *Independent Writer/Consultant, USA*

Lyndel V. Prott, *University of Queensland,  
Australia*

Kurt Siehr, *Universität Zürich, Switzerland  
and Max-Planck-Institut, Germany*

## Editorial Board

Gregory J. Ashworth, *Rijksuniversiteit  
Groningen, Netherlands*

Márcia Bezerra de Almeida, *Universidade  
Federal do Pará, Brasil*

Gregory Borgstede, *University of  
Pennsylvania Museum, USA*

Michael F. Brown, *School of Advanced  
Research, USA*

Mira Burri, *World Trade Institute,  
Switzerland*

Chip Colwell-Chanthaphonh, *Denver  
Museum of Nature and Science, USA*

María Luz Endere, *Conicet and Universidad  
del Centro de la Provincia de Buenos  
Aires, Argentina*

Richard Handler, *University of Virginia,  
USA*

Claire Lyons, *Getty Museum, USA*

Stephanie Moser, *University of  
Southampton, UK*

Elina Moustaira, *Faculty of Law, University  
of Athens, Greece*

Dawson Munjeri, *Delegation of Zimbabwe  
to UNESCO, Zimbabwe  
and France*

Anila Naeem, *NED University of  
Engineering and Technology, Pakistan*

James A. R. Nafziger, *Willamette University  
College of Law, USA*

Patrick J. O'Keefe, *University of Queensland, Australia*

Robert K. Paterson, *Faculty of Law,  
University of British Columbia, Canada*

Jorge Sánchez Cordero, *Mexican Center of  
Uniform Law, Mexico*

Daniel Shapiro, *President Emeritus,  
International Cultural Property Society,  
USA*

Folarin Shyllon, *Faculty of Law, Olabisi  
Onabanjo University, Nigeria*

Samuel Sidibé, *National Museum of Mali,  
Mali*

Neil Asher Silberman, *University of  
Massachusetts, Amherst, USA*

Madhavi Sunder, *UC Davis School of Law,  
USA*

David Throsby, *Macquarie University,  
Australia*

Alison Wylie, *University of Washington,  
USA*

## Board Members Emeritus

Clemency Coggins, *Boston University, USA*

David Lowenthal, *University College  
London, UK*

John Henry Merryman (Founder), *Stanford  
University Law School, USA*

Stephen K. Urice, *University of Miami  
School of Law, USA*

INTERNATIONAL  
**Cultural Property**  
SOCIETY

**BOARD OF DIRECTORS**

**President**

Stephen K. Urice  
*University of Miami School of Law, USA*

**Vice-President**

Marc-André Renold  
*Art-Law Centre, University of Geneva Law School, Switzerland*

**Treasurer**

Stephen W. Clark  
*J. Paul Getty Trust*

**Secretary**

Ana Filipa Vrdoljak  
*Faculty of Law, University of Technology, Sydney, Australia*

Derek Gillman  
*Drexel University, USA*

Stanley N. Katz  
*Center for Arts and Cultural Policy Studies, Princeton University, USA*

Lawrence Rosen  
*Department of Anthropology, Princeton University, USA*

Kurt Siehr, Law School  
*Universität Zurich, Switzerland and Max-Planck-Institut, Germany*

Susan Taylor  
*New Orleans Museum of Art, USA*

**President Emeritus**

Daniel Shapiro

As this special issue was in press, we learned of the death of John Henry Merryman, founder of both the International Cultural Property Society and the *International Journal of Cultural Property*. The Society will comment in a later issue of this journal on John's life and work.

# CONTENTS

## VOLUME 22 (2015) NUMBERS 2-3

### GUEST EDITOR'S NOTE

Marc-André Renold 159

### PART ONE

#### ARTICLES

- Cultural Co-Ownership: Preventing and Solving Cultural Property Claims*  
Marc-André Renold 163
- Dealing with UK Museum Collections: Law, Ethics and the Public/Private Divide*  
Janet Ulph 177
- The Human Dimension of the Protection of the Cultural Heritage from Destruction during Armed Conflicts*  
Berenika Drazewska 205
- The Changing Tide of Title to Cultural Heritage Objects in UK Museums*  
Charlotte Woodhead 229
- Art Law & Balances. Increased Protection of Cultural Heritage Law vs. Private Ownership: Towards Clash or Balance?*  
Marie-Sophie de Clippele and Lucie Lambrecht 259
- State Immunity, Property Rights, and Cultural Objects on Loan*  
Alessandro Chechi 279
- The Rescue, Stewardship, and Return of the Lysi Frescoes by the Menil Foundation*  
Derek Fincham 301

## PART TWO

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| <i>Syria and its Regional Neighbors: A Case of Cultural Property Protection Policy Failure?</i>                  |     |
| Neil Brodie  | 317 |
| <i>Reality and Practicality: Challenges to Effective Cultural Property Policy on the Ground in Latin America</i> |     |
| Donna Yates  | 337 |
| <i>For Better and For Worse: Evolving United States Policy on Cultural Property Litigation and Restitution</i>   |     |
| Patty Gerstenblith   | 357 |
| <i>Fake or Fortune? Art Authentication Rules in the Art Market and at Court</i>                                  |     |
| Anne Laure Bandle  | 379 |
| <i>Art Lawyers' Due Diligence Obligations: A Difficult Equilibrium between Law and Ethics</i>                    |     |
| Sandrine Giroud and Charles Boudry   | 401 |
| <i>Purchasing Art in a Market Full of Forgeries: Risks and Legal Remedies for Buyers</i>                         |     |
| Leila Amineddoleh  | 419 |