

THE
JOURNAL
OF
LAW
AND
RELIGION



Volume VIII

1990

Numbers 1 and 2

Sponsored by:

**Hamline University School of Law
and
The Council on Religion and Law**

Published by:

**Hamline University School of Law
ISSN: 0748-0814**

Biblical Conceptions of the Law

**The Inaugural Lecture
in the
Robert M. Cover
Memorial Lectureship
in
Law and Religion**

**will be delivered by
PROFESSOR MICHAEL WALZER**

November 18, 1991

Yale Law School

This Lectureship is jointly sponsored by Yale Law School and Yale Hillel Foundation. Yale Historian Jaroslav Pelikan will offer the primary response to Professor Walzer's lecture. A Reception and Dinner will follow the lecture.

To receive further information on the Lecture, Reception and Dinner, contact the Yale Hillel Foundation, phone (203) 432-1134 or (203) 772-4747

**Old Problems and New Collaborations:
Critical Perspectives on the Intersection
of Law, Religion and Ethics**

**Fourth Annual Hamline University
Symposium on Law,
Religion and Ethics**

October 24 & 25, 1991

**Hamline University
School of Law
Saint Paul, Minnesota**

This Symposium is dedicated to bringing together lawyers and theologians to engage in dialogue spanning the traditions of law and religion, in an effort to shed light on law as an activity seeking justice, the vocational role of the lawyer in this task, and the relation of law and religion to each other in the context of contemporary experience.

The Opening Plenary features ELIZABETH MENSCH and ALAN FREEMAN, of the law school at SUNY Buffalo in a conversation about their new work, "On the Politics of Virtue," in which they make extensive use of theological resources. The Public Lecture will be delivered by the distinguished theologian DAVID TRACY of the University of Chicago Divinity School.

To receive further information on the Symposium, contact Steve Moss of Hamline University's program consultant, Marecek & Cairns, at (612) 378-0681.

THE JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION

VOLUME VIII

1990

NUMBERS 1 AND 2

EDITORIAL STAFF

<i>Editors</i>	MARIE FAILINGER Hamline University School of Law
	PATRICK KEIFERT Luther-Northwestern Theological Seminary
<i>Book Editor</i>	HOWARD J. VOGEL Hamline University School of Law
<i>Production Manager</i>	PETER J. GROSS
<i>Editorial Assistants</i>	LISA HOVDE ELIZABETH R. MILLER KENNETH MORRIS LYNN PREIS TIMOTHY QUARBERG

EDITORIAL BOARD

THOMAS PORTER, Attorney at Law, Boston, chair
FRANK ALEXANDER, Emory University School of Law
GERARD BRADLEY, University of Illinois College of Law
MARIE FAILINGER, Hamline University School of Law
EDWARD MCGLYNN GAFFNEY, JR., Valparaiso University School of Law
PATRICK KEIFERT, Luther Northwestern Theological Seminary
MILTON KONVITZ, Professor Emeritus, Cornell University
GEORGE LATIMER, Hamline University School of Law
ROBIN LOVIN, University of Chicago Divinity School
MICHAEL SCHERSCHLIGT, Hamline University School of Law
DOUGLAS STURM, Bucknell University
HOWARD J. VOGEL, Hamline University School of Law
WILSON YATES, United Theological Seminary of the Twin Cities

ADVISORY COMMITTEE

JAMES LUTHER ADAMS, Professor Emeritus, Harvard University
RICHARD BAEPLER, Valparaiso University
HAROLD BERMAN, Emory University School of Law
JAMES BRESNAHAN, Jesuit Residence, Chicago
LYNN BUZZARD, Campbell University School of Law
LISA CAHILL, Boston College
FRED CARNEY, Southern Methodist University
ROGER CRAMTON, Cornell University School of Law
LEIGH LERNER, Rabbi, St. Paul
DAVID LITTLE, University of Virginia
MARTIN MARTY, University of Chicago Divinity School
NOOR MOHAMMAD, University of Baltimore School of Law
ELIZABETH SCHUESSLER-FIORENZA, Notre Dame University
THOMAS SHAFFER, Notre Dame University Law School
ROSALIE WAHL, Associate Justice, Minnesota Supreme Court
STEPHEN B. YOUNG, Attorney at Law, St. Paul

The Journal of Law and Religion is sponsored by the Hamline University School of Law and the Council on Religion and Law, and is a nonprofit, nonpartisan publication devoted to investigating the interaction of religion and law.

Subscriptions to *The Journal of Law and Religion*, which is published twice annually, are \$15 per two-issue volume for individuals, \$25 for institutions and \$10 for students. Subscription requests, manuscripts and general correspondence should be addressed to:

Production Manager
The Journal of Law and Religion
1536 Hewitt Avenue
St. Paul, MN 55104

Book review manuscripts and books to be reviewed should be sent to:

Howard J. Vogel
Book Review Editor
Hamline University School of Law
1536 Hewitt Avenue
St. Paul, MN 55104

Citations in *The Journal of Law and Religion* conform to *A Uniform System of Citation* (14th ed. 1986), copyright by the *Columbia Law Review*, the *Harvard Law Review Association*, the *University of Pennsylvania Law Review* and the *Yale Law Journal*. Unsolicited manuscripts will be returned only upon request.

Individual back issues and complete sets of *The Journal of Law and Religion* may be ordered directly from William S. Hein & Co., 1285 Main St., Buffalo, NY 14209.

The views and opinions expressed in *The Journal of Law and Religion* are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the editorial staff, the editorial board, the advisory board, or the sponsors of *The Journal of Law and Religion*.

Articles are indexed in the *Index to Legal Periodicals* published by The H.W. Wilson Co. (Bronx, New York), and in the *Legal Resource Index* available on line on a variety of computer data base services.

Articles are also indexed in *Religion Index One: Periodicals*; book reviews are indexed in *Index to Book Reviews in Religion*. Both indexes are published by the American Theological Library Association, Chicago, and are available on-line through BRS Information Technologies (Latham, New York) and *DIALOG Information Services* (Palo Alto, California).

All copyrights are reserved.

Cite as: 8 J. LAW & RELIG.

A Subscription to the
JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION

Cost per volume (two issues):

\$15.00 individual (USA & foreign surface mail)
\$25.00 individual (foreign air mail)
\$25.00 institution (USA & foreign surface mail)
\$35.00 institution (foreign air mail)
\$10.00 student

Production Manager
Journal of Law and Religion
Hamline University School of Law
1536 Hewitt Avenue
St. Paul, Minnesota 55104

- Payment enclosed.
- Please bill me.
- Begin my subscription with vol. _____, number _____.

Name: _____

Street Address: _____

City & State: _____ Zip code: _____

THE JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION

VOLUME VIII

1990

NUMBERS 1&2

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Editors' Preface	xvii
Guest Editor's Preface	xix
Hon. Sandra Day O'Connor Foreword: The Establishment Clause and Endorsement of Religion	1
Symposium on The Williamsburg Charter	
The Williamsburg Charter	5
Signers of The Williamsburg Charter	23
I. Commentary on The Williamsburg Charter	
Os Guinness Tribespeople, Idiots or Citizens?: Religious Liberty and the Reforging of the American Public Philosophy	33
Arlin M. Adams and Charles J. Emmerich William Penn and the American Heritage of Religious Liberty	57
J. Bryan Hehir Responsibilities and Temptations of Power: A Catholic View	71
Dean M. Kelley The Intermeddling Manifesto, or the Role of Religious Bodies in Affecting Public Policy in the United States	85
Douglas Laycock The Supreme Court's Assault on Free Exercise, and the Amicus Brief That Was Never Filed	99
Richard John Neuhaus Contending for the Future: Overcoming the Pfefferian Inversion	115

Samuel Rabinove	How—and Why—American Jews Have Contended for Religious Freedom: The Requirements and Limits of Civility	131
William Bentley Ball	What's Not Wrong With the Williamsburg Charter	153
John M. Swomley	What's Wrong with the Williamsburg Charter	161
George Weigel	Achieving Disagreement: From Indifference to Pluralism	175
 II. The First Liberty Summit		
Eric Sevareid	Signing Ceremony: Remarks of Master of Ceremonies	189
Irina Ratushinskaya	Poems of a Prisoner of Conscience	191
Dr. Benjamin L. Hooks Sen. Mark O. Hatfield Dr. Robert P. Dugan Dr. Arie Brouwer Dr. James Dunn Rev. Thomas Gallagher Very Rev. Leonid Kishkovsky Mr. Samuel Rabinove Elder Dallin H. Oaks Imam Wareeth Deen Muhammad Hon. Alonzo L. McDonald Mr. William J. Flynn	Remarks of Signers of the Williamsburg Charter	193
Dr. Billy Graham	The Political and Moral Threat to Religious Liberty	205
 III. The First Liberty Forums		
The Williamsburg Charter Summary of Principles		213
Hon. John H. Buchanan	The Williamsburg Charter: A Response to History, Distant and Recent	215
Dr. Robert P. Dugan, Jr.	The Williamsburg Charter: A Guideline for Democratic and Civil Debate About Religion	217

William J. Flynn	The Williamsburg Charter: A Golden Rule for Preserving Religious Freedom	221
Edward McGlynn Gaffney, Jr.	The Williamsburg Charter: A Compact for Peace with Diversity .	223
Most Rev. John L. May	A Catholic Understanding of Religious Liberty and Its Role in Domestic and Foreign Policy	231
Hon. Alonzo L. McDonald	Living with Our Deepest Differences	237
Tom Neumann	Religious Liberty: An Inalienable Right	241
Samuel Rabinove	The Right of Religious Liberty for One Is a Right for Others and a Responsibility for All	243
Kathleen Kennedy Townsend	Religious Liberty: The Heart of the American Experiment	247
Elie Wiesel	The Williamsburg Charter and Freedom of Conscience	253
IV. The Williamsburg Charter Survey on Religion and Public Life		
James Davison Hunter	The Williamsburg Charter Survey: Methodology and Findings	257
James Davison Hunter	Pluralism: Past and Present	273
Edward McGlynn Gaffney, Jr.	Religion and Public Life: Comments on the Williamsburg Charter Survey	279
Os Guinness	The Williamsburg Charter Survey: Bicentennial Reflections	287
Alan Mittleman	Jews and Separationism	291
V. "Living with Our Deepest Differences": The Williamsburg Charter Foundation Project on Education About Religion in a Pluralistic Society		
Charles C. Haynes	A Teacher's Guide to Study About Religion in Public Schools	297
	Religion in the Public School Curriculum: Questions and Answers .	309
	Religious Holidays in the Public Schools: Questions and Answers..	313

VI. Documents on Religious Freedom

Religious Freedom in America: Reflections by Muslims and Roman Catholics	319
“God Alone Is Lord of the Conscience” Policy Statement and Recommendations Regarding Religious Liberty Adopted by the 200th General Assembly (1988) of the Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.)	331
The Law of the Union of Soviet Socialist Republics on Freedom of Conscience and Religious Organizations.....	385

VII. Review Essays and Book Reviews

Michael W. McConnell	<i>A Nation Dedicated to Religious Liberty</i> by Arlin M. Adams and Charles J. Emmerich	397
Edward McGlynn Gaffney, Jr.	<i>The Supreme Court on Church and State</i> edited by Robert S. Alley. <i>Towards Benevolent Neutrality: Cases on Church and State</i> edited by Robert T. Miller and Ronald B. Flowers	403
Timothy Miller	<i>Uncivil Religion: Interreligious Hostility in America</i> edited by Robert N. Bellah and Frederick E. Greenspahn	411
Dee E. Andrews	<i>Under the Cope of Heaven: Religion, Society and Politics in Colonial America</i> by Patricia U. Bonomi	415
Leo Pfeffer	<i>Jews, Turks, and Infidels</i> by Morton Borden	419
Russell Hittinger	<i>Church-State Relationships in America</i> by Gerard V. Bradley	423
Dorothee Soelle	<i>Saying Yes and Saying No: On Rendering to God and Caesar</i> by Robert McAfee Brown	433
Yvonne Brathwaite Burke	<i>A Plea for Common Sense: Resolving the Clash Between Religion and Politics</i> by Jim Castelli	437
Albert J. Menendez	<i>Religious Liberty in Crisis</i> by Edd Doerr	441

Angela C. Carmella	<i>Real Threat and Mere Shadow: Religious Liberty and the First Amendment</i> by Daniel L. Dreisbach	443
Mark Noll	<i>Religion in American Politics</i> edited by Charles Dunn	449
David Little	<i>Christianity and the Constitution: The Faith of Our Founding Fathers</i> by John Eidsmoe. <i>Faith of Our Fathers: Religion and the New Nation</i> by Edwin S. Gaustad	453
Franklin I. Gamwell	<i>Religious Convictions and Political Choice</i> by Kent Greenawalt	461
Randall Balmer	<i>The Democratization of American Christianity</i> by Nathan O. Hatch . .	475
Paul J. Weber	<i>Representing God in Washington: The Role of Religious Lobbies in the American Polity</i> by Allen D. Hertzke	479
Robert P. Hunt	<i>The Ethics of Discourse: The Social Philosophy of John Courtney Murray</i> by J. Leon Hooper. <i>The Search for an American Public Theology: The Contribution of John Courtney Murray</i> by Robert W. McElroy	485
Robert A. Destro	<i>Articles of Faith, Articles of Peace: The Religious Liberty Clauses and the American Public Philosophy</i> edited by James Davison Hunter and Os Guinness	491
Steven H. Hochman	<i>God in the White House: How Religion Has Changed the Modern Presidency</i> by Richard G. Hitchenson, Jr.	503
Stephanie L. Phillips	<i>Straight from the Heart</i> by Jesse L. Jackson	509
Robert Booth Fowler	<i>The Political Role of Religion in the United States</i> edited by Stephen D. Johnson and Joseph B. Tamney . .	511

Mark E. Chopko	<i>Government Intervention in Religious Affairs II</i> edited by Dean M. Kelley	515
Dr. Franklin Sherman	<i>Politics and Policy: The Genesis and Theology of Social Statements in the Lutheran Church in America</i> by Christa R. Klein with Christian D. von Dehsen	521
John Pawlikowski	<i>Religion and American Public Life</i> edited by Robin Lovin	525
Dr. Gary M. Ross	<i>Separation of Church and State: Guarantor of Religious Freedom</i> by Robert L. Maddox	529
Donald E. King	<i>Thine Is the Kingdom: A Biblical Perspective on the Nature of Government and Politics Today</i> by Paul Marshall	533
Jon Pahl	<i>Religion and Republic: The American Circumstance</i> by Martin Marty	537
Dennis P. McCann	<i>Caesar's Coin: Religion and Politics in America</i> by Richard P. McBrien	541
Michael J. Woodruff	<i>The First Liberty: Religion and the American Republic</i> by William Lee Miller. <i>Religion in American Public Life</i> by A. James Reichley	545
Robert F. Drinan S.J.	<i>Boundaries Dimly Perceived: Law, Religion, Education, and the Common Good</i> by Christopher F. Mooney	553
Leslie Griffin	<i>Public Virtue: Law and the Social Character of Religion</i> by Christopher F. Mooney	557
Rev. Thomas J. Curry	<i>Religious Outsiders and the Making of Americans</i> by R. Laurence Moore	561
James W. Skillen	<i>The Naked Public Square: Religion and American Democracy</i> by Richard John Neuhaus	563

J. Brent Walker	<i>Piety and Politics: Evangelicals and Fundamentalists Confront the World</i> edited by Richard John Neuhaus and Michael Cromartie . . .	575
Robert Royal	<i>The Uneasy Alliance: Religion, Refugee Work and U.S. Foreign Policy</i> by J. Bruce Nichols	579
Timothy Sherratt	<i>One Nation Under God?—Christian Faith and Political Action in America</i> by Mark Noll. <i>Religion and American Politics</i> edited by Mark Noll	585
John A. Coleman S.J.	<i>Morality, Politics and Law: A Bicentennial Essay</i> by Michael John Perry	597
John F. Wilson	<i>The Virginia Statute for Religious Freedom: Its Evolution and Consequences in American History</i> edited by Merrill D. Peterson and Robert C. Vaughan	601
Joseph Richard Preville	<i>Religion, State and the Burger Court</i> by Leo Pfeffer	603
Judith A. Dwyer	<i>The Window of Vulnerability: A Political Spirituality</i> by Dorothee Soelle	609
Edward J. Larson	<i>Public Prayer and the Constitution: A Case Study in Constitutional Interpretation</i> by Rodney K. Smith	611
Edd Doerr	<i>Religious Liberty and the Secular State: The Constitutional Context</i> by John M. Swomley	615
Thomas D. Kennedy	<i>The Political Meaning of Christianity: An Interpretation</i> by Glenn Tinder	617
Stephen V. Monsma	<i>Religion and Politics in the United States</i> by Kenneth D. Wald	623

Donald P. Kommers	<i>Liberty and Law: Reflections on the Constitution in American Life and Thought</i> edited by Ronald A. Wells and Thomas A. Askew	627
Edwin S. Gaustad	<i>Church and State in American History: The Burden of Religious Pluralism</i> edited by John F. Wilson and Donald L. Drakeman. <i>Church and State in America: A Bibliographical Guide. Vol. One: The Colonial and Early National Periods; Vol. Two: The Civil War to the Present Day</i> edited by John F. Wilson	631
Quentin Ogren	<i>An Unsettled Arena: Religion and the Bill of Rights</i> edited by Ronald G. White, Jr., and Albright G. Zimmerman	639
Robert McAfee Brown	<i>Christian Perspectives on Politics</i> by J. Philip Wogaman	643
Robert W. Nixon	<i>Ecumenical Perspectives on Church and State: Protestant, Catholic and Jewish</i> edited by James E. Wood, Jr.	647
Carl H. Esbeck	<i>The First Freedom: Religion & the Bill of Rights</i> edited by James E. Wood, Jr.	651
Marc D. Stern	<i>Readings on Church and State: Selections from the Journal of Church and State</i> edited by James E. Wood, Jr.	657
Oliver S. Thomas	<i>Religion and Politics</i> edited by James E. Wood, Jr.	659
Ruti G. Teitel	<i>Religion and the State: Essays in Honor of Leo Pfeffer</i> edited by James E. Wood, Jr.	663

John Seel

The Restructuring of American Religion by Robert Wuthnow.
The Struggle for America's Soul: Evangelicals, Liberals & Secularism by Robert Wuthnow 671