

# CHURCH HISTORY

AMERICAN SOCIETY OF CHURCH HISTORY, JUNE, 1997

# THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF CHURCH HISTORY

## *PRESIDENT*

RICHARD KIECKHEFER, Northwestern University

## *PRESIDENT-ELECT*

PETER W. WILLIAMS, Miami University

## *SECRETARY-TREASURER*

HENRY W. BOWDEN, Rutgers University

## *ASSISTANT SECRETARY*

MELISSA B. KIRKPATRICK, The American University

## *EDITORS*

JERALD C. BRAUER  
MARTIN E. MARTY

The Divinity School, University of Chicago

## *MEMBERS OF THE COUNCIL*

### *Class of 1997*

ROBERT GREGG  
CHARLES H. LIPPY  
LAURIE MAFFLY-KIPP  
RUSSELL RICHEY  
GROVER ZINN

### *Class of 1998*

LEWIS V. BALDWIN  
MARY F. BEDNAROWSKI  
RALPH KEEN  
MARK R. VALERI  
REBECCA H. WEAVER

### *Class of 1999*

YVONNE CHIREAU  
PHILIP KREY  
AMANDA PORTERFIELD  
MARK G. TOULOUSE  
CHARLES I. WALLACE

The Society was founded in 1888 by Philip Schaff, was reorganized in 1906, and was incorporated by act of the Legislature of the State of New York in 1916.

Vol. 66    June 1997    No. 2

# CHURCH HISTORY

Published quarterly by  
THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF CHURCH HISTORY

© 1997, The American Society of Church History

## CHURCH HISTORY EDITORS

JERALD C. BRAUER  
MARTIN E. MARTY

The Divinity School, University of Chicago

*with the cooperation of*

JON BUTLER (1997), Yale University  
ELIZABETH CLARK (1997), Duke University  
E. BROOKS HOLIFIELD (1998), Emory University  
BERNARD MCGINN (1998), The Divinity School, University of Chicago  
LEIGH E. SCHMIDT (1997), Princeton University

*assistants to the editors*

R. JONATHAN MOORE  
SARAH J. SADOWSKI

*Church History* is published quarterly in March, June, September, and December by the American Society of Church History. Membership prices are \$40.00 a year (persons having been society members for five years and now retired from professional life—\$20.00; dues free for graduate students with the approval of a professor who is a member of the Society). Subscriptions are \$50.00; \$10.00 for single issues; \$10.00 per year extra should be added for foreign countries. Please make all remittances payable to the American Society of Church History. Subscription applications, renewals, changes of address, claims for missing numbers, and orders for single copies of current or back issues should be sent to Henry W. Bowden, P.O. Box 8517, Red Bank, NJ 07701. Claims for missing numbers will be honored without charge if made within two months following the regular month of publication.

Microfilm reproductions of *The American Society of Church History Papers*, series I and II, and of *Church History*, vols. 1–17 (1932–48), are available from the ATLA Preservation Board. Orders for these reproductions as well as inquiries about microfilm portions and xerox copies should be sent to 1118 East 54th Place, Chicago, Illinois 60615.

Microfilm reproductions of *Church History* starting with vol. 18 (1949) are available to subscribers and members of the society from University Microfilms, 300 N. Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor, Michigan 48106. The full text of *Church History* is also available in the electronic versions of the *Humanities Index*. *Church History* is indexed in *Religion Index One: Periodicals*, *Index to Book Reviews in Religion*, *Religion Indexes: RIO/RIT/IBRR 1975– on CD-ROM*, and *ATLA Religion Database on CD-ROM*, all published by the American Theological Association, 820 Church St., Evanston, IL 60201-5613; e-mail [atla@atla.com](mailto:atla@atla.com); www:<http://atla.library.vanderbilt.edu/atla/home.html>.

The following indexes are available from the treasurer, Henry W. Bowden, at the address given above: *Papers* and vols. 31–39 (1962–1970), \$10.00; vols. 40–49 (1971–1980), \$10.00 (\$8.00 for active, individual members of the Society). Add \$2.00 postage charges. Book reviews are indexed or abstracted in *Book Review Index*, *Historical Abstracts*, and *America: History and Life*.

Manuscripts and books for review should be sent to *Church History*, The Divinity School, Duke University, Box 90975, Durham, NC 27708-0975. Manuscripts submitted for consideration must be typed double-spaced in 12-point font on sturdy paper; *footnotes must be typed double-spaced* on separate pages following the text. Please submit three copies of the manuscript, a 200-word abstract, a diskette, and include correct return postage.

Advertising orders and requests for permission to quote should be addressed to the editorial office in Chicago.

*Church History* is printed by Science Press, Ephrata, Pennsylvania. Periodicals postage paid at Red Bank, New Jersey and additional mailing offices. Postmaster: Send Address Changes to: Church History, American Society of Church History, Henry W. Bowden, P.O. Box 8517, Red Bank, NJ 07701.

CHURCH HISTORY (ISSN 0009-6407)

# CONTENTS

- 221 The Shifting Tones of Pope Leo the Great's Christological Vocabulary  
PHILIP L. BARCLIFT
- 240 "Touch No Unclean Thing": Apocalyptic Expressions of Ascetic Spirituality in the Early Middle Ages  
DOUGLAS W. LUMSDEN
- 252 Dominican Friar, Lay Saint: The Case of Marcolino of Forlì  
DANIEL BORNSTEIN
- 268 A Conflict of Associations: The National Camp-Meeting Association for the Promotion of Holiness Versus the Methodist Episcopal Church  
A. GREGORY SCHNEIDER
- 284 Faith and History: Reflections on the Work of the ASCH  
BARBARA BROWN ZIKMUND
- 303 **Book Reviews**
- Schottroff, Luise, *Lydia's Impatient Sisters: A Feminist Social History of Early Christianity* ..... Elizabeth A. Clark
- Taylor, Miriam S., *Anti-Judaism and Early Christian Identity: A Critique of the Scholarly Consensus* ..... Joel S. Kaminsky
- Simmons, Michael Bland, *Arnobius of Sicca: Religious Conflict and Competition in the Age of Diocletian* ..... H. A. Drake
- Bowersock, G. W., *Fiction as History: Nero to Julian* ..... Robert M. Grant
- Brakke, David, *Athanasius and the Politics of Asceticism* ..... Joseph W. Trigg
- Williams, Daniel H., *Ambrose of Milan and the End of the Nicene-Arian Conflicts* ..... Charles M. Odahl
- Doran, Robert, *Birth of a Worldview: Early Christianity in Its Jewish and Pagan Context* ..... Robert M. Grant
- Arnold, Duane W. H., and Pamela Bright, eds., *De doctrina christiana: A Classic of Western Culture* ..... Thomas Renna
- Scott, T. Kermit, *Augustine: His Thought in Context* ..... Eugene TeSelle
- Harmless, William, S. J., *Augustine and the Catechuminate* ..... Thomas Renna
- Benericetti, Ruggero, *Il Cristo nei Sermoni di S. Pier Crisologo* ..... David Paul Hester
- Dovere, Elio, "Ius Principale" e "Catholica Lex": dal Teodosiano agli Editti su Calcedonia ..... David Hester
- Naf, Beat, *Senatorisches Standesbewußtsein im spätrömisches Zeit* ..... Harry Rosenberg
- Elsner, Jaś, *Art and the Roman Viewer: The Transformation of Art from the Pagan World to Christianity* ..... Frederick W. Norris
- Van Esbroeck, Michel, *Aux origines de la Dormition de la Vierge (Études historiques sur les traditions orientales)* ..... Bradley Nassif
- Connolly, Seán, trans., *Bede: On the Temple* ..... William A. Chaney
- V. Padberg, Lutz E., *Mission und Christianisierung. Form und Floren bei Angelsachsen und Franken im 7. und 8. Jahrhundert* ..... Harry Rosenberg

Dauids, Adelbert, ed., <i>The Empress Theophano: Byzantium and the West at the Turn of the First Millennium</i> .....	George T. Dennis
Zibawi, Mahmoud, <i>Eastern Christian Worlds</i> .....	Bradley Nassif
Dumville, David, <i>Liturgy and the Ecclesiastical History of Late Anglo-Saxon England: Four Studies</i> .....	Milton McC. Gatch
Archambault, Paul J., trans., <i>A Monk's Confession: The Memoirs of Guibert of Nogent</i> .....	John Coakley
Stiegman, Emero, <i>Bernard of Clairvaux: On Loving God, with an Analytical Commentary</i> .....	Kevin Madigan
Eleuteri, Paolo, and Antonio Rigo, <i>Eretici, Dissidenti, Musulmani ed Ebrei a Bisanzio: Una raccolta eresiologica del XII secolo</i> .....	Constantine N. Tsirpanlis
Potestà, Gian Luca, ed., <i>Joachim of Fiore: Dialogi de Prescientia Dei et Predestinatione Electorum</i> .....	Kevin Madigan
Golding, Brian, <i>Gilbert of Sempringham and the Gilbertine Order, c. 1130–1300</i> .....	A. Daniel Frankforter
Hinson, E. Glenn, <i>The Church Triumphant: A History of Christianity up to 1300</i> .....	Thomas F. X. Noble
McGrade, Arthur Stephen, ed., <i>William of Ockham: A Letter to the Friars Minor and Other Writings</i> .....	Robert C. Figueira
Clark, John P. H., ed., <i>The Cloud of Unknowing: An Introduction vol. 1, Introduction, vol. 3, Notes on Book of Privy Counselling, Bibliography</i> .....	Keith J. Egan
Smith, Susan L., <i>The Power of Women: A Topos in Medieval Art and Literature</i> .....	Ellen L. Babinsky
De la Selle, Xavier, <i>Le Service des âmes à la cour: confesseurs et aumôniers des rois de France du XIIIe au XVe siècle</i> .....	Kathryn A. Edwards
Cowan, Ian B., <i>The Medieval Church in Scotland</i> .....	Keith J. Egan
Jantzen, Grace M., <i>Power, Gender, and Mysticism</i> .....	Frank Tobin
Lepine, David, <i>A Brotherhood of Canons Seeking God</i> .....	John B. Wickstrom
Riess, Jonathan B., <i>The Renaissance Antichrist: Luca Signorelli's Orvieto Frescoes</i> .....	Meredith J. Gill
Packull, Werner O., <i>Hutterite Beginnings: Communitarian Experiments during the Reformation</i> .....	Cornelius J. Dyck
Lohse, Bernhard, <i>Luthers Theologie in ihrer historischen Entwicklung und in ihrem systematischen Zusammenhang</i> .....	Scott Hendrix
Donnelly, John Patrick, ed. and trans., <i>Philip Melancthon: Annotations on First Corinthians</i> .....	Timothy J. Wengert
Jones, Serene, <i>Calvin and the Rhetoric of Piety</i> .....	Randall C. Zachman
Nicollier-de Weck, Béatrice, <i>Hubert Languet (1518–1581): Un Réseau politique international de Melancthon à Guillaume d'Orange</i> .....	Daniel Augsburgser
Eire, Carlos M. N., <i>From Madrid to Purgatory: The Art and Craft of Dying in Sixteenth-Century Spain</i> .....	Gillian T. W. Ahlgren
Spitz, Lewis W., and Barbara Sher Tinsley, <i>Johann Sturm on Education: The Reformation and Humanist Learning</i> .....	Robert Rosin
Garrison, Janine, <i>A History of Sixteenth-Century France, 1483–1598: Renaissance, Reformation and Rebellion</i> .....	Richard M. Golden
Baumgartner, Frederic J., <i>France in the Sixteenth Century</i> .....	Kathryn A. Edwards
Gibbons, Mary Weitzel, <i>Giambologna: Narrator of the Catholic Reformation</i> .....	Gerald Christianson
Milton, Anthony, <i>Catholic and Reformed: The Roman and Protestant Churches in English Protestant Thought, 1600–1640</i> .....	Stephen Brachlow
Feldhay, Rivka, <i>Galileo and the Church: Political Inquisition or Critical Dialogue?</i> .....	Walter J. Wilkins
Ditchfield, Simon, <i>Liturgy, Sanctity and History in Tridentine Italy: Pietro Maria Campi and the Preservation of the Particular</i> .....	Anne Jacobson Schutte
Dyck, Cornelius J., ed. and trans., <i>Spiritual Life in Anabaptism</i> .....	Donald F. Durnbaugh

- Mungello, D. E., *The Forgotten Christians of Hangzhou* ..... Kathleen L. Lodwick
- Kennedy, Rick, ed., *Aristotelian and Cartesian Logic at Harvard: Morton's "Logick System" and Brattle's "Compendium of Logick"* ..... John Corrigan
- Reinhard, Wolfgang, and Heinz Schilling, eds., *Die katholische Konfessionalisierung: Wissenschaftliches Symposium der Gesellschaft zur Herausgabe des Corpus Catholicorum und des Vereins für Reformationsgeschichte* ..... John Jay Hughes
- Jones, Scott J., *John Wesley's Conception and Use of Scripture* ..... John C. English
- Vanysacker, Dries, *Cardinal Giuseppe Garampi (1725–1792): An Enlightened Ultramontane* ..... Richard F. Costigan, S. J.
- Stewart, Howard R., *A Dazzling Enigma: The Story of Morgan Edwards* ..... C. Allyn Russell
- Krumwiede, Hans-Walter, *Kirchengeschichte Niedersachsens, vol. 1, 8. Jahrhundert-1806* ..... Eric Lund
- McNally, Vincent J., *Reform, Revolution and Reaction: Archbishop John Thomas Troy and the Catholic Church in Ireland, 1787–1817* ..... R. Barry Levis
- Tracey, Gerald, ed., *The Letters and Diaries of John Henry Newman, vol. 7, Editing the British Critic, January 1839–December 1840* ..... John R. Griffin
- Hill, Marvin S., ed., *The Essential Joseph Smith* ..... Clyde R. Forsberg, Jr.
- Prince, Gregory A., *Power From on High: The Development of Mormon Priesthood* ..... Clyde R. Forsberg, Jr.
- Henery, Charles R., ed., *A Speaking Life: The Legacy of John Keble* ..... David A. Gustafson
- Reid, Jennifer, *Myth, Symbol and Colonial Encounter: British and Mi'kmaq in Acadia, 1700–1867* ..... John Webster Grant
- Smith, George D., ed., *An Intimate Chronicle: The Journals of William Clayton* ..... Klaus J. Hansen
- Selleck, Linda B., *Gentle Invaders: Quaker Women Educators and Racial Issues during the Civil War and Reconstruction* ..... Hugh Barbour
- Brooks, Chris, and Andrew Saint, eds., *The Victorian Church: Architecture and Society* ..... Peter W. Williams
- Westergren, Bruce N., ed., *From Historian to Dissident: The Book of John Whitmer* ..... Susan Curtis
- Gifford, Carolyn De Swarte, ed., *Writing Out My Heart: Selections from the Journal of Frances E. Willard, 1855–96* ..... Christopher H. Evans
- Hamilton, C. Mark, *Nineteenth Century Mormon Architecture and City Planning* ..... Thomas G. Alexander
- Watts, Michael R., *The Dissenters, vol. 2, The Expansion of Evangelical Nonconformity* ..... Keith J. Hardman
- Baylis, Robert, *My People: The History of Those Christians Sometimes Called Plymouth Brethren* ..... Robert H. Krapohl
- Hope, Nicholas, *German and Scandinavian Protestantism 1700–1918* ..... Trygve R. Skarsten
- Graham, Gael, *Gender, Culture and Christianity: American Protestant Mission Schools in China, 1880–1930* ..... Kathleen L. Lodwick
- Zeilstra, Jurjen A., *European Unity in Ecumenical Thinking 1937–1948* ..... David J. Diephouse
- Boudens, R., *Two Cardinals: J. H. Newman / D. J. Mercier* ..... John R. Griffin
- Ivereigh, Austin, *Catholicism and Politics in Argentina, 1810–1960* ..... Robert L. Breckenridge
- Schenkel, Albert F., *The Rich Man and the Kingdom: John D. Rockefeller, Jr., and the Protestant Establishment* ..... Eldon G. Ernst
- Numbers, Ronald L., ed., *Creationism in Twentieth-Century America: A Ten-Volume Anthology of Documents, 1903–1961* ..... R. Scott Appleby
- Armstrong, Philip, C.S.C., *A More Perfect Legacy* ..... F. Michael Perko
- Burkinshaw, Robert K., *Pilgrims in Lotus Land: Conservative Protestantism in British Columbia, 1917–1981* ..... William Vance Trollinger, Jr.

Maclear, J. F., ed., <i>Church and State in the Modern Age: A Documentary History</i> .....	Winnifred Fallers Sullivan
Pazos, Antón M., ed., <i>Un siglo de catolicismo social en Europa, 1891–1991</i> .....	William J. Callahan
Marthaler, Berard L., O.F.M. Conv., <i>The Catechism Yesterday and Today—The Evolution of a Genre</i> .....	Charles B. Paris
Fraser, Brian J., <i>Church, College, and Clergy: A History of Theological Education at Knox College, Toronto, 1844–1994</i> .....	Tom Faulkner
Larkin, Maurice, <i>Religion, Politics, and Preferment in France since 1890: La Belle Epoque and its Legacy</i> .....	Joseph F. Byrnes
Hughes, Richard T., ed., <i>The Primitive Church in the Modern World</i> .....	Conrad Cherry
Oates, Mary J., <i>The Catholic Philanthropic Tradition in America</i> .....	Thomas J. Shelley
Redekop, Calvin, Stephen C. Ainlay, and Robert Siemens, <i>Mennonite Entrepreneurs</i> .....	Donald F. Durnbaugh
Patterson, Beverly Bush, <i>The Sound of the Dove: Singing in Appalachian Primitive Baptist Churches</i> .....	Donald G. Mathews
Anderson, Jon W., and William B. Friend, eds., <i>The Culture of Bible Belt Catholics</i> .....	Michael J. McNally
Hall, David W., ed., <i>The Practice of Confessional Subscription</i> .....	Mark A. Noll
Moore, David George, <i>The Battle For Hell: A Survey and Evaluation of Evangelicals' Growing Attraction to the Doctrine of Annihilation</i> .....	Robert H. Krapohl
Barbour, Hugh, et al., eds., <i>Quaker Crosscurrents: Three Hundred Years of Friends in the New York Yearly Meetings</i> .....	Margaret Haviland
Cherry, Conrad, <i>Hurrying Toward Zion: Universities, Divinity Schools, and American Protestantism</i> .....	John Dillenberger
Rattue, James, <i>The Living Stream: Holy Wells in Historical Context</i> .....	William A. Chaney
Tangeman, Michael, <i>Mexico at the Crossroads: Politics, the Church and the Poor</i> .....	Robert J. Swain
Kimbrough, S. T., Jr., ed., <i>Methodism in Russia and the Baltic States: History and Renewal</i> .....	James A. Dwyer
Hosking, Geoffrey A., ed., <i>Church, Nation and State in Russia and Ukraine</i> .....	Constantine N. Tsirpanlis
Hamington, Maurice, <i>Hail Mary? The Struggle for Ultimate Womanhood in Catholicism</i> .....	Faith E. Rohrbough
White, James F., <i>Roman Catholic Worship: Trent to Today</i> .....	F. Michael Perko, S. J.
Coalter, Milton J., and Virgil Cruz, eds., <i>How Shall We Witness? Faithful Evangelism in a Reformed Tradition</i> .....	Keith J. Hardman
Bradley, James E., and Richard A. Muller, <i>Church History: An Introduction to Research, Reference Works and Methods</i> .....	Helmut T. Lehmann
Bauman, Michael, and Martin I. Klauber, eds., <i>Historians of the Christian Tradition: Their Methodology and Influence on Western Thought</i> .....	Henry Warner Bowden
Ebersole, Gary L., <i>Captured by Texts: Puritan to Postmodern Images of Indian Captivity</i> .....	Rodger M. Payne
Fackler, P. Mark, and Charles H. Lippy, eds., <i>Popular Religious Magazines of the United States</i> .....	Frederick K. Wentz
Fenn, Richard K., <i>The Persistence of Purgatory</i> .....	E. Brooks Holifield
Tergel, Alf, <i>Church and Society in the Modern Age</i> .....	Francis J. Murphy

450 **Reprints and Books Received**

451 **Society Notes**