

Book Reviews

objected to the operation being performed on him'. Hunt suggested that every surgeon committing dissection should give an undertaking to allow his body to be dissected after death." Without any reference to Richardson, Knott writes in 1985 that Hunt "spoke of the fear of dissection as one of the 'natural feelings of mankind', and cited the case of Dr William Hunter, the eminent eighteenth century anatomist, who although 'he had dissected so many himself, up to the very last moment of his life declared that he objected to the operation being performed on him'. Hunt suggested that all surgeons and anatomists should be made to donate their own bodies for dissection after death." There are dozens of similar "parallels". No matter how this may have come about, a handsome apology is due to Dr Richardson.

Roy Porter
Wellcome Institute

PIETER SPIERENBURG (editor), *The emergence of carceral institutions: prisons, galleys and lunatic asylums 1550–1900*, (*Centrum voor Maatschappij Geschiedenis*, 12), Rotterdam, Erasmus Universiteit, 1984, 8vo, pp. 187, [no price stated] (paperback).

This twelfth volume in the irregular series published by the Department of the History of Society of Erasmus University, Rotterdam, presents five substantial essays on the theme of "carceral institutions"—the means by which society excludes, by depriving them of liberty, those elements it identifies as unassimilable, or unacceptable. Some general conclusions are drawn out and given a theoretical framework in the editor's introduction, where he takes issue with the "modernization" concept familiar from the works of Foucault, Ignatieff, and others, claiming that this does not stand the test of empirical analysis, in Europe at least, any more than does its historiographical precursor and mirror-image with its naively optimistic stress on reform and progress. Instead, he advocates a "process-oriented approach to the history of repression and control".

Clearly, this endeavour involves more than a simple account of the development of prisons, and historians of various specialities can find much of interest here. The tone is less relentlessly sociological than might be feared at first sight, and different types of sources are used, placing the information in a human as well as a socio-political context. A short-title contents list is probably the best way to indicate the scope of this slim but useful volume: from 'The sociogenesis of confinement' via 'Galley and hard labour convicts in France' to 'The birth and reforms of prisons in France', and finally 'The asylum in Germany before 1860' and 'Lunacy reform in the Netherlands'. Readers would do well to stray from familiar territory; there are unexpected bonuses in little-explored areas such as the fate of convicts sentenced to the galleys, and the part played by organized religion in the movement to reform mental health care. Continuity of the perceived problem—deviants, it would seem, are always with us—and complexity of human motivations interacting with political considerations—are recurring motifs, as is the ultimate failure of quite genuinely well-intentioned reformers. Each author supplies detailed notes and/or bibliography which add to the value of the work.

More research is needed, the editor tells us (as editors are wont to do) before we can reach more definite conclusions. But even without those elusive objects, this publication is a good beginning.

Elizabeth A. Willis
Library, MRC Cyclotron Unit

S. E. D. SHORTT, *Victorian lunacy. Richard M. Bucke and the practice of late nineteenth-century psychiatry*, Cambridge University Press, 1986, 8vo, pp. xvi, 207, £25.00.

The Cambridge History of Medicine series is an admirable undertaking, and the title "Victorian lunacy" has a broad and exciting ring. Whether the life and work of Richard M.

Book Reviews

Bucke, at the London Asylum in Canada, embraces such an entity is more questionable. S.E.D. Shortt's monograph has certainly taken a bold leap, incorporating a general review of the development of Victorian medical psychology with a detailed analysis of data from an Ontario asylum and its keeper, but the result is top-heavy and awkward. The enterprise parallels one of Bucke's, his all-explanatory *Cosmic consciousness* (1901, many reprints, eight publishers, a German translation in 1975), which derived from a hero-worship of Walt Whitman, an ecstatic experience in an English hansom cab, and more than twenty years cloistered in an asylum superintendency.

Consisting of five chapters and over forty pages of annotation, the work reads more like five articles rather roughly stitched together. Chapter 1 is a brief biography rather too full of subjunctives, such as "Bucke might later have felt an affinity . . ." and unnecessary details of famous medical contemporaries. Chapter 3 is too broad in its sweep. Titled 'Toward a secular physiology of a mind', it attempts a complete picture of the nineteenth-century philosophy of mind, and is doomed to be obscure and colourless.

The final chapter explores Bucke's use of gynaecological surgery and finds it ineffective but fails to consider the wider surgical assault on mental patients. By contrast, the rich details of 'The human ecology of the London Asylum' (Ch. 2) and the useful discussions in 'The social genesis of etiological speculation' (ch. 4) are of surprising value. About one-fifth of attendants resign annually; the case notes are scant, sometimes reporting as alive those who have been dead for two years; chronicity abounds. Yet "degeneration theory . . . lifted alienists from the stigma of therapeutic defeat to the pedestal of social prophecy", and Shortt clarifies usefully this relationship between theory and practice.

Compared to the integrated detail of Michael MacDonald, Anne Digby, or Nancy Tomes, this is a slighter work because by reaching at grander themes it has made worryingly trivial mistakes. Who, for example, was Robert Gardiner Hall? Who was James Pritchard? What is a "medical mindset"? We are told of Bucke's "peculiar ways", "his loud laughter", "his fluctuations in mood", his search for a "less strenuous form of medical employment", the political placemanship that got him his job as superintendent. Such loopy incompetence may well have been typical of Victorian alienists, yet is never described as such and it is this failure to distinguish the second-rate from the mad, the relevant from the coincidental, that undermines this work.

The detailed analysis of Victorian psychiatry, both in the asylums and in its social context, goes on apace and provides an exciting research enterprise. Many of these themes are touched on by Shortt, and we urgently need a detailed analysis of the operative practices, for example, of these times. Likewise, the resort to cosmic and utopian notions, and their espousal by cranky physicians, would be in itself an interesting exploration. Victorian lunacy is much "more than interpretation", despite the author's assertion to the contrary.

T. H. Turner
St Bartholomew's Hospital

JOSEPH C. PORTER, *Paper medicine man. John Gregory Bourke and his American West*, Norman and London, University of Oklahoma Press, 1986, 8vo, pp. xviii, 362, illus., \$22.95.

Some readers of this journal will be familiar with J. G. Bourke's *Scatalogic rites of all nations* (1891) as a source for the therapeutic uses of excrement. A German translation (Leipzig 1913) was introduced by Freud. Others may know Bourke as the author of *The medicine men of the Apache* (1892) which was reissued in 1970. Few, one would guess, have any inkling of the story behind these books: the heroic, crowded, and all-too-short life of Captain John Gregory Bourke, US Army (1849–96). One of Bourke's greatest achievements, and perhaps the only one not frustrated by events, was that, in the midst of strenuous and ultimately fatal exertions, he kept a journal recording in rich detail his observations of the American Indians. His incessant writing caused one Indian to give him the sobriquet that forms the title of this volume—an appropriate one, for the 124 volumes of his diary, now at West Point, are the most important source for the book.