

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XIX NUMBERS 1 & 2 1993

IMPLEMENTING U.S. HEALTH CARE REFORM

Symposium Authors:

Troyen A. Brennan

Raisa B. Deber

Barry R. Furrow

Lawrence O. Gostin

Timothy Stoltzfus Jost

Wendy E. Parmet

Uwe E. Reinhardt

Sandra J. Tanenbaum

**NOTE: COMMUNITY CARE, COMPETITION AND
COERCION: A LEGAL PERSPECTIVE ON
PRIVATIZED MENTAL HEALTH CARE**

Ronald L. Wisor, Jr.

PUBLISHED BY THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW, MEDICINE & ETHICS AND THE
BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW

The AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE is published in the Spring, Summer, Fall, and Winter by the American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics and the Boston University School of Law. All decisions concerning the content of the JOURNAL are made by a joint American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics/Boston University School of Law Editorial Policy Committee. Statements of fact and opinion are the responsibility of the authors alone, and are not necessarily endorsed by the editors, the Society, or the law school.

The Editors invite the submission of manuscripts on medicolegal topics. For details, see inside back cover. Editorial communications, including original manuscripts and requests for permission to reproduce JOURNAL material, should be addressed to Editor-in-Chief, AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE, 765 Commonwealth Ave., Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Editorial phone: (617) 353-2912.

Business correspondence, including subscription correspondence, should be addressed to the Membership Director, American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics, 765 Commonwealth Avenue, 16th Floor, Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Business phone: (617) 262-4990.

Subscriptions: \$70.00 per year for institutions, and \$60.00 for individuals (payment must be on personal check) who are not members of the American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics. Foreign subscribers should remit, for a year's subscription, an additional \$30.00 for foreign postage.

Missing copies of the JOURNAL will be sent free of charge to subscribers or members of the Society provided that notice of such claim is received at the Society's subscription office within one month of receipt of the next issue published. Requests made after this period will be billed at the regular issue price of \$20.00 (includes postage and handling).

Members of the American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics receive a free subscription to the JOURNAL as part of their dues (\$120.00 for 1993). Information concerning membership is available from the Membership Director, American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics, 765 Commonwealth Avenue, 16th Floor, Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Society phone: (617) 262-4990.

Articles in the JOURNAL are indexed in LEXIS, WESTLAW, Index to Legal Periodicals, Legal Contents, Index Medicus, Social Sciences Citation Index, Current Contents: Social and Behavioral Sciences, and Biosciences Information Service of Biological Abstracts.

Library of Congress Catalog Number: 75-645516 (Shelf No. K1.M445).
ISSN 0098-8588.

U.S. postage paid at Lincoln, Nebraska, in accordance with Permit No. 264 (Nonprofit Org.).

ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICERS OF BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW

JOHN R. SILBER, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., LL.D., (hon.), L.H.D., (hon.), *President*,

University Professor and Professor of Philosophy and Law

RONALD A. CASS, B.A., J.D., *Dean and Professor of Law*

JOSEPH BRODLEY, B.A., LL.B., *Senior Associate Dean for Research and Professor of Law*

ROBERT G. BONE, B.A., J.D. *Associate Dean and Professor of Law*

KENNETH W. SIMONS, B.A., J.D., *Associate Dean and Professor of Law*

CHRISTINE A. MARX, B.S., J.D., *Assistant Dean for Student Affairs*

OFFICERS OF THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW, MEDICINE & ETHICS

RUTH B. PURTILO, Ph.D., *President*

KAREN H. ROTHENBERG, J.D., MPA, *President-Elect*

MARGARET A. SOMERVILLE, AUA, LL.B., DCL, *Secretary*

SANDRA H. JOHNSON, J.D., LL.M., *Treasurer*

ELLIOT L. SAGALL, M.D., *Founder and First President*

CHRISTINE MITCHELL, R.N., M.S., M.T.S., *Immediate Past President*

LAWRENCE O. GOSTIN, J.D., *Executive Director*

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

BOARD of EDITORS

FACULTY EDITOR-IN-CHIEF
Frances H. Miller, J.D.
Boston University School of Law

**FACULTY EDITOR-IN-CHIEF
EMERITUS AND FOUNDER**
John A. Norris, J.D., M.B.A.

EXECUTIVE EDITOR
Lawrence O. Gostin, J.D.

DIRECTOR OF PUBLICATIONS
American Society of Law & Medicine
Merrill Kaitz

CIRCULATION MANAGER
Susan Reddy

EDITORS

Michael Baram, J.D.
Boston University Schools of Law
and Public Health

Charles H. Baron, LL.B., Ph.D.
Boston College Law School

Henry Beyer, J.D.
Boston University School of Law

William J. Curran, LL.M., S.M. Hyg.
Harvard University School of
Public Health

Lee J. Dunn, Jr., J.D., LL.M.
Dunn & Auton
Boston, Massachusetts

Richard F. Gibbs, M.D., J.D.
Harvard Medical School

Jay Alexander Gold, M.D., J.D., M.P.H.
American College of Legal Medicine

Clark C. Havighurst, J.D.
Duke University School of Law

Nathan Hershey, J.D.
University of Pittsburgh
Graduate School of Public Health

Bernard D. Hirsh, J.D.
Wildman, Harold Allen & Dickson
Chicago, Illinois

Edward E. Hollowell, J.D.
Hollowell & Silverstein
Raleigh, North Carolina

Richard G. Huber, J.D.
Boston College Law School

Sheila Jasanoff, J.D., Ph.D.
Director, Program on Science Technology
and Society
Cornell University

Jay Katz, M.D.
Yale University Law School

Renée M. Landers, J.D.
Boston College Law School

Sylvia A. Law, J.D.
New York University School of Law

**Aubrey Milunsky, MB.B.Ch., D.Sc.,
F.R.C.P., D.C.H.**
Boston University School of Medicine

Irwin N. Perr, M.D., J.D.
University of Medicine and Dentistry
of New Jersey

Harvey E. Pies, J.D., M.P.H.
Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Florida
Jacksonville, Florida

Elliot L. Sagall, M.D.
Founder, American Society of
Law & Medicine
Harvard Medical School

E. Donald Shapiro, J.D., LL.D.
New York Law School

Sidney Shindell, M.D., LL.B.
Medical College of Wisconsin

Robert B. Shira, D.D.S.
Special Assistant to the President
Tufts University

Arthur F. Southwick, J.D., M.B.A.
Grad. Sch. of Business Administration
University of Michigan

Paul R. Tremblay
Boston College Law School

David G. Warren, J.D.
Duke University

Cyril H. Wecht, M.D., J.D.
Director, Pittsburgh Institute of Legal
Medicine

James G. Zimmerly, M.D., J.D., M.P.H.
Armed Forces Institute of Pathology
Washington, D.C.

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

INTERNATIONAL BOARD of EDITORS

Dr. M.A.M. Wachter
Director
Institute of Bioethics
The Netherlands

Dr. S.S. Fluss
Chief, Health Legislation
World Health Organization
Switzerland

Prof. Dr. Erwin Deutsch
Institute for Pharmaceutical and
Medical Law
University of Gottingen
Federal Republic of Germany

Bernard M. Dickens, Ph.D., LL.D.
Professor
Faculty of Law & Faculty of Medicine
University of Toronto
Canada

Prof. Dr. H.J.J. Leenen
Instituut voor Sociale Geneeskunde
Universiteit van Amsterdam
The Netherlands

**The Honorable Justice
Michael D. Kirby**
President, Court of Appeal
Supreme Court of New South Wales
Australia

Koichi Bai
Professor of Law
Director of Institute of Medical
Humanities
School of Medicine
Kitasato University
Japan

Professor P D G Skegg
Faculty of Law
University of Otago
Dunedin
New Zealand

Prof. Dr. Iur. Dieter Giesen
Institute for International, Foreign
and Comparative Law
Director,
Working Centre for International
Studies in Medical Malpractice Law
The Free University of Berlin
Federal Republic of Germany

Professor Amos Shapira
Lubowski Professor of Law &
Biomedical Ethics
Faculty of Law
Tel Aviv University
Israel

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XIX NUMBERS 1 & 2 1993

BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW
STUDENT BOARD OF EDITORS
1992-1993

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF
Suzanne V. Cocca

EXECUTIVE EDITOR
Anne T. Zecha

MANAGING EDITORS
Amy Grossberg
Michelle E. Maerov

PROJECTS EDITOR
Vickie L. Henry

ARTICLES EDITORS
Matthew H. Bruck
Maria T. CeloCruz
Simon J.K. Miller
Ronald L. Wisor, Jr.

**ASLME DEVELOPMENTS
EDITOR**
Jennifer A. Kasmin

CASE & NOTE EDITORS

Richard E. Aubin
Lisa A. Bail
Andrew S. Brenner
Nancy D. Mahler

Matthew A. Miller
Deborah Schectman
Sean C. Sheely
Laurie J. Slosberg

SYMPOSIUM COORDINATORS

Maria T. CeloCruz
Suzanne V. Cocca
Nikki M. Constantine
David D. Dueno

Amy Grossberg
Michael D. Handler
Vickie L. Henry
Jesse R. Lee

Michelle E. Maerov
Lisa Paolillo
Ronald L. Wisor, Jr.
Anne T. Zecha

THIRD YEAR EDITORS

Dahlia A. Balsam
Lincoln D. Bandlow
Peter M. Dichiaro
Andrew Hanan
Deborah T. Hardy
Mary Beth Hewitt

Jason Kravitz
Susan Korenberg
Dominic Massa
Andrew L. Packard
Regan P. Remillard

Sarah E. Rosenblatt
Amy J. Rosengarten
Melissa L. Roy
Dolly Vance
Gabriel Zambrano
Hal S. Zemel

STAFF MEMBERS

David B. Allswang
Jeffrey B. Araten
Robert J. Blanch, Jr.
Laura C. Boujoff
Thomas B. Bralliar, Jr.
Lawrence R. Bressler
David R. Campbell
Nikki M. Constantine
Kathleen M. Crowley
Cedric DeLaCruz
William C. Dennis
Susan L. DiMaggio

Paula Domanski
David D. Dueno
Stephen R. Fish, Jr.
Rick J. Fucci
Eryn P. Gittleman
William J. Graham
Andrew A. Honegger
Melanie B. Jacobs
David A. Lane
Jesse R. Lee
Stacy B. Margolies
Julie E. Mathews

Arlene N. Meltzer
Lisa Paolillo
Anthony D. Pellegrini
Cheryl A. Posegay
Wendy J. Rothstein
Robert W. Russo
Brian Schulman
Jonathan P. Serbin
Rachel L. Singer
Stephanie N. Switzer
Terrence J. Talbot
Susan H. Upton

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XIX NUMBERS 1 & 2 1993

The American Journal of Law & Medicine is pleased to announce its 1993-1994 Student Board of Editors.

BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW STUDENT BOARD OF EDITORS 1993-1994

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

David D. Dueno

EXECUTIVE EDITOR

Laura C. Boujoff

MANAGING EDITORS

David A. Lane
Lisa Paolillo

PROJECTS EDITOR

Stacy B. Margolies

SYMPOSIUM EDITOR

Susan L. DiMaggio

ARTICLES EDITORS

Thomas B. Bralliar, Jr.
Jesse R. Lee
Jonathan P. Serbin
Stephanie N. Switzer

ASLME DEVELOPMENTS EDITOR

Nikki M. Constantine

CASE & NOTE EDITORS

David B. Allswang
David R. Campbell
Kathleen M. Crowley
William C. Dennis

Stephen R. Fish, Jr.
Melanie B. Jacobs
Anthony D. Pellegrini
Susan H. Upton

THIRD YEAR EDITORS

Jeffrey B. Araten
Robert J. Blanch, Jr.
Lawrence R. Bressler
Cedric DeLaCruz
Paula Domanski
Rick J. Fucci

Eryn P. Gittleman
William J. Graham
Andrew A. Honegger
Julie E. Mathews
Arlene N. Meltzer

Cheryl A. Posegay
Wendy J. Rothstein
Robert W. Russo
Brian Schulman
Rachel L. Singer
Terrence J. Talbot

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XIX NUMBERS 1 & 2 1993

Implementing U.S. Health Care Reform

ARTICLES

- FOREWORD: HEALTH CARE REFORM IN THE UNITED STATES—
THE PRESIDENTIAL TASK FORCE 1 Lawrence O. Gostin
- REFORMING THE HEALTH CARE SYSTEM: THE UNIVERSAL DILEMMA 21 Uwe E. Reinhardt
- AN ETHICAL PERSPECTIVE ON HEALTH CARE INSURANCE REFORM 37 Troyen A. Brennan
- CANADIAN MEDICARE: CAN IT WORK IN THE UNITED STATES? WILL IT SURVIVE IN CANADA? 75 Raisa B. Deber
- SELLING COST CONTAINMENT 95 Timothy Stoltzfus Jost
Sandra J. Tanenbaum
- REGULATION AND FEDERALISM: LEGAL IMPEDIMENTS TO STATE HEALTH CARE REFORM 121 Wendy E. Parmet

NOTES AND COMMENTS

- COMMUNITY CARE, COMPETITION AND COERCION: A LEGAL PERSPECTIVE ON PRIVATIZED MENTAL HEALTH CARE 145 Ronald L. Wisor, Jr.

MEDICOLEGAL REFERENCE LIBRARY

- GUEST BOOK REVIEW: *CYSTIC FIBROSIS AND DNA TESTS* 177 Barry R. Furrow

Copyright 1993 by the American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics, Inc. and the Boston University School of Law. Unless otherwise noted, the materials appearing herein may be copied for classroom use, provided that (1) the user notify the Editor-in-Chief of *American Journal of Law & Medicine* of having made such copies; (2) the author and *American Journal of Law & Medicine* are identified; and (3) the proper notice of copyright is affixed to each copy.