"TURNING ON THE LIGHTS": Brazilian Slavery Reconsidered One Hundred Years after Abolition

Robert M. Levine
University of Miami, Coral Gables

ONDA NEGRA, MEDO BRANCO: O NEGRO NO IMAGINARIO DAS ELITES, SECULO XIX. By CELIA MARIA MARINHO DE AZEVEDO. (Rio de Janeiro: Paz e Terra, 1987. Pp. 267.)

AO SUL DA HISTORIA: LAVRADORES POBRES NA CRISE DO TRABALHO ESCRAVO. By HEBE MARIA DA COSTA MATTOS GOMES DE CASTRO. (São Paulo: Brasiliense, 1987. Pp. 190.)

ESCRAVOS BRASILEIROS DO SECULO XIX NA FOTOGRAFIA DE CHRISTIANO JR. Organized by PAULO CESAR DE AZEVEDO and MAURICIO LISSOVSKY. (São Paulo: Ex Libris, 1988. Pp. 78.)

ESCRAVIDÃO NEGRA E HISTORIA DA IGREJA NA AMERICA LATINA E NO CARIBE. By COMISSÃO DE ESTUDOS DE HISTORIA DA IGREJA NA AMERICA LATINA (CEHILA). Translated by LUIZ CARLOS NISHIURA. (Petrópolis: Editora Vozes, 1987. Pp. 237.)

RACE, CLASS, AND POWER IN BRAZIL. Edited by PIERRE-MICHEL FONTAINE. (Los Angeles: Center for Afro-American Studies, University of California, Los Angeles, 1985. Pp. 160. $19.95 cloth, $11.95 paper.)

O NEGRO NA ICONOGRAFIA BRASILEIRA DO SECULO XIX: A VISÃO EUROPEIA. By CENTRO DE ESTUDOS DE DEMOGRAFIA HISTORICA DA AMERICA LATINA (CEDHAL). Coordinated by BORIS KOSSOY. (São Paulo: Universidade de São Paulo, Faculdade de Filosofia, Letras e Ciencias Humanas, 1988. Pp. 17.)

CRIME E ESCRAVIDÃO: TRABALHO, LUTA, RESISTENCIA NAS LAVOURAS PAULISTAS, 1830–1888. By MARIA HELENA P. T. MACHADO. (São Paulo: Editora Brasiliense, 1988. Pp. 135.)

FAMILIA E SOCIEDADE NA BAHIA DO SECULO XIX. By KATIA M. DE QUEIROS MATTOSO. Translated by JAMES AMADO. (São Paulo: Editora Corrupio, 1988. Pp. 212.)

TO BE A SLAVE IN BRAZIL, 1550–1888. By KATIA M. DE QUEIROS MATTOSO. Translated by ARTHUR GOLDHAMMER. (New Brunswick, N.J.: Rutgers University Press, 1986. Pp. 250. $35.00.)

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0023879100022901 Published online by Cambridge University Press

SOCIOLOGIA DO NEGRO BRASILEIRO. By CLOVIS MOURA. (São Paulo: Editorial Atica, 1988. Pp. 250.)
REBELLIÃO ESCRAVA NO BRASIL: A HISTORIA DO LEVANTE DOS MALES (1835). By JOÃO JOSE REIS. (São Paulo: Brasiliense, 1986, Pp. 293.)
RETRATO EM BRANCO E NEGRO: JORNÃES, ESCRAVOS E CIDADÃOS EM SÃO PAULO NO FINAL DO SECULO XIX. By LILIA MORITZ SCHWARCZ. (São Paulo: Companhia das Letras, 1987. Pp. 284.)
SUGAR PLANTATIONS IN THE FORMATION OF BRAZILIAN SOCIETY: BAHIA, 1550–1835. By STUART B. SCHWARTZ. (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1985. Pp. 613. $59.50 cloth, $22.95 paper.)
COMERCIO PROHIBIDO DE ESCRAVOS. By LUIS HENRIQUE DIAS TAVARES. (São Paulo: Editorial Atica, 1988. Pp. 158.)

Através de grossas portas,
Sentem-se luzas acesas.
Cecília Meireles

The commemoration of Brazil's centenary of abolition on 13 May 1988 has been accompanied by a predictable harvest of books, essays, conferences, and special events relating to the theme of slavery and its legacy. The centenary also has provided a public platform for arguing that abolition's benefits were juridical rather than social or economic. Brazilian blacks born in 1988 are 30 percent more likely to die before five years of age than non-blacks. Seventy percent remain illiterate. As adults, they will earn up to 40 percent less for the same job and will face a life expectancy thirteen years shorter than non-blacks.[1] Thus the abolition centenary has provided the most direct challenge to the official Brazilian ideology of racial democracy yet mounted, although by any standard, the assault has been timid and mostly limited to panel discussions, posters, and stories in newsmagazines.

Coming at a time of national restlessness over the uneven pace of democratization and deepening economic malaise, the debate has been underscored by frustration over broader social and racial issues.[2] To some extent, the gauntlet was initially thrown down outside Brazil, at conferences like UCLA's 1980 Afro-American Studies symposium entitled "Race and Class in Brazil," which occasioned the collection edited by Pierre-Michel Fontaine that is under review here. Like the Cubans, whose abolition centenary was marked in 1986 by conferences and a surfeit of publications in Cuba and Europe as well, Brazilian sponsors of commemorative activities have attempted to open them to the general public. But Cuba's centennial marked a culmination of interest in Afro-Cuban studies that had been launched in 1960 with the founding of the Biblioteca José Martí and the Seminario de Folklore and was com-

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0023879100022901 Published online by Cambridge University Press

plemented by the resurgence of the Instituto Nacional de Etnología y Folklore as the decade progressed.[3] In contrast, Brazilian interest in the African heritage remained limited to university circles and to small, marginalized radical groups demanding recognition of black culture and an end to racial discrimination.[4] The jury is still out on whether Brazilian public consciousness was raised to any meaningful degree by the centenary.

Brazil's observation of the centenary came about without central coordination or extensive preparation, although conference and publication projects received generous funding from governmental agencies and foundations. In addition to scholarly monographs, anthologies, published theses and dissertations, popular publications such as new "mini-books," audiocassettes, and even comic books with historical themes appeared almost daily in bookstores and street kiosks. Several Portuguese translations of books previously published abroad on slavery-related topics also surfaced, as did reprints of books long out-of-print such as C. F. Delden Laerne's classic study of coffee agriculture, *Brésil et Java*, and the 1930s correspondence between *négritude* scholars Edison Carneiro and Arthur Ramos.[5]

Perhaps because of the public dimension of the debate, Brazilian scholars have shown a tendency to dismiss earlier works as misuses or misinterpretations of history.[6] Few comparisons have been made of slavery from one place to another, and few comprehensive studies have been undertaken. One exception is the work of Ciro Flamarion S. Cardoso, who has used Polish scholar Tadeusz Lepkowski's work on coexisting slave and peasant labor in Caribbean plantation areas as a yardstick to consider the Brazilian case. Cardoso finds that Brazilian slaves did have some possibilities for autonomous activities, especially in furnishing vegetables for urban markets in and around Rio de Janeiro, and even in Pará after 1750.[7]

The most impressive of the new books is Stuart Schwartz's comprehensive history of Bahian plantation society, which mines a wealth of previously unused plantation and other primary documents. *Sugar Plantations in the Formation of Brazilian Society: Bahia, 1550–1835*, which won the 1985 Bolton Prize, traces the history of the sugar industry and its changing labor system through seventeen chapters on sugar production and plantation life and society. This work demonstrates that the world of rural agriculture was far more complex and nuanced than earlier studies had shown. Perhaps ironically, the demands of the system created the need for alternative and differentiated forms of labor that led in turn to productive relationships between free laborers and slaves working side by side.

Little attention has yet been focused on the African side of the slave culture, although some creative work by Luiz Mott, Laura de

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0023879100022901 Published online by Cambridge University Press

Mello e Souza, and others have provided exceptions.[8] Renewed interes in urban slavery has surged. Slaves dominated urban work force: through the middle of the nineteenth century, before the influx of Euro pean immigrants and displaced migrants from the rural Northeast Most city slaves were women, who performed every kind of labor fron childrearing and serving households to working in large factories (sucl as the Imperial Gunpowder Factory in Rio de Janeiro and the Ipanem: Ironworks).[9] Lélia Algranti's (1988) study of police efforts to contrc slave residents of the Imperial capital shows that surveillance extende not only to crimes against property and person but to offenses "agains the public order," namely gambling, fighting, begging, and even whis tling in the streets. Clearly, the police sought to preserve the subservi ence of the slave population.[10]

Many in the current school of research in Brazil use Marxist cate gories of analysis.[11] One finds obligatory citations of Marx, Lenin, Eng els, Gramsci, and Walter Benjamin as well as arguments examining th slave mode of production that fixate on slavery's role in primitive cap talistic accumulation. It was not the "philanthropic actions of sensitiv members of the dominant classes" that led to abolition, declared th late Peter Eisenberg, but "the class struggle, [as] affirmed by Marx an Engels at the outset of the Communist Manifesto."[12]

Eisenberg and his colleagues were responding at least in part t the fact that earlier conservative historians had either ignored the fat of individual slaves or accepted uncritically the thesis that Portugues slavery was somehow benevolent.[13] Clearly, the tendency of the recer literature has been to identify with the oppressed, emphasizing th survival of the slave heritage and the heroism of slaves as individua and as a community. Some critics have warned, however, that whe taken to extremes, this perspective overlooks the need to study th oppressors and to examine slavery in a broader context. Also, studie of isolated slave environments searching for sparks of resistance ma obscure the larger goal of understanding the "structure of domin tion."[14] Indeed, the recognition that resistance and protests by slav hastened abolition is not new, dating back to Emília Viotti da Costa seminal *Da Senzala à Colonia* (1966).[15] Nor can it be validly asserted th earlier scholarship ignored the issue of quality of life. It is a shame th the pioneering effort of the two Afro-Brazilian conferences of the 193 —in Recife and in Salvador—have been virtually forgotten. The sta police abruptly closed the 1934 Recife meeting after conservatives d nounced it as scandalous and threatening to public order. Both mee ings were actually multidisciplinary academic conferences with hig standards and a sincere commitment to study Afro-Brazilian culture.

Times have changed, if slowly. More than anything else, the ce

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0023879100022901 Published online by Cambridge University Press

tenary has provided a framework for challenging the comfortable and more or less official textbook assumption that the question of inhumanity to blacks ended in 1888. The direct relevance to current-day social concerns and the long-standing unwillingness (at least until the 1960s) of the historical establishment to avoid the subject together explain to some degree the volatility of the debate. Guilt also was expressed over the fact that the experts addressing mostly black audiences at gatherings throughout Brazil were—except for a few foreigners—overwhelmingly white.

Revisionists have condemned the abolitionists for lack of concern about the era following emancipation. The period of transition before final abolition, when slaves and nonslaves coexisted in the same social setting, has come under increased scrutiny. Some scholars have compared the lot of slaves to free laborers in urban settings. Clovis Moura's *Sociologia do Negro Brasileiro* examines Brazil's typographers' walkout in Rio de Janeiro in 1858 (Brazil's first strike) and points to the effort by the Fluminense Typographers' Association to gain the freedom of one of its members, a slave (pp. 246–47). Others have pointed out how closely slaves worked alongside free workers, showing that only when slavery neared its end did Brazilian society feel the need to tighten laws against vagrancy and take other steps to control undesirables. Not that everyday life during slavery was placid: research into criminal court records for the decades prior to abolition shows a steady pattern of violent acts against masters, including sabotage, robbery, and murder.[17] Nineteenth-century Brazilian society was plainly predisposed to accept the negative stereotype of former slaves and to fear them, preferring to substitute foreign immigrants for blacks and mulattos and to maintain the libel against "slave blood" even beyond abolition.[18] Newspapers exacerbated these prejudices, sometimes naively. Journalists praised individuals as "blacks with white souls" and "loyal friends of whites," but they also warned that blacks were "instinctively violent," possessing "latent degeneracies."[19]

Some new attention has been given to the slave trade. Pierre Verger's authoritative study, *Flux et reflux de la traite des Nègres entre le Golfe de Bénin et Bahia de Todos os Santos* (1968), has been translated in a new edition (1988).[20] Luis Henrique Dias Tavares's examination of the illegal phase of the slave trade, *Comércio Prohibido de Escravos*, carefully documents extensive activity by British shippers but also by North American, Dutch, and Brazilian capitalist interests.[21] The most comprehensive overview, however, is provided by Robert Conrad's lucid *World of Sorrow* (1986), which reminds readers that the internal slave trade was a predominant cause of change: the displacement of hundreds of thousands of black and mulatto workers from the north and far south "al-

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0023879100022901 Published online by Cambridge University Press

lowed a gradual awakening of antislavery sentiment in areas that lost slaves while it concentrated the support for slavery in those limited parts of the country where slaves were newly settled."[22]

Despite occasional calls for comparative studies of slavery, few scholars have compared the Brazilian experience with that in Spanish America, the Caribbean, or Africa. *Escravidão Negra e História da Igreja na América Latina e no Caribe*, CEHILA's published conference papers on the black presence, treats Puerto Rico, the Dutch Caribbean, Haiti, Jamaica, Chile, Guiana, and Mexico. Brazil, however, is omitted from the discussions entirely, although it is cited frequently in tables on the slave trade (pp. 35–42).

Consideration of the institution of slavery in Brazil extends beyond abolition itself, of course, through the decades following legal emancipation, when former slaves were forced to adapt to a socioeconomic system that considered them "irresponsible," "vagabonds," and even "useless."[23] Nor was the process of marginalization of former slaves steady or consistent. Planters, after all, turned their backs on freed and soon-to-be emancipated blacks by abruptly supporting schemes to import European agricultural workers.[24] But in many cases, immigrants were not available; in others, former slaves blended into the ranks of pre-abolition free laborers and managed to eke out a living as independent farmers or artisans in rural towns, neither proletarianized nor marginalized.

Labeling Brazilian slavery as more "benign" than the Dutch, English, or French variety has been a recurring theme based on the pioneering work of Gilberto Freyre in the 1930s and his foreign disciples, especially Frank Tannenbaum (1947).[25] In recent years, however, this perspective has been considered pernicious evidence of paternalistic racism. Viewing abolition as a patrimonial concession by the dominant elite without any attention to the role of blacks themselves as actors in the emancipation drama has yielded to more emphasis on slave resistance and rebellion.[26]

In turn, challenges have been issued to the assertion of the "São Paulo School" of historical sociologists in the 1960s (led by Florestan Fernandes, Fernando Henrique Cardoso, and Octávio Ianni) that abolition marked the end of a period of precapitalist economic activity and the transition to a rational market-based economy built on free labor.[27] But the urge to revise (and to disparage the findings of earlier scholars) has unfortunately led to generic condemnations that threaten to oversimplify. Herbert Klein's work examining plantations worked by slaves in locales ranging from South America throughout the entire Caribbean confirms that abolition induced planters to make major changes in the ways they produced their crops, although these changes varied from place to place and from crop to crop (Klein 1986).[28]

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0023879100022901 Published online by Cambridge University Press

Acutely conscious of the obstacles to meaningful upward mobility for emancipated slaves and their descendants, some revisionists have not only rejected any suggestion (stated or imagined) that former slaves were at fault for their plight but have dug deeper for data to refute the older view of slaves as usually docile until driven to rebellion. João José Reis and others have looked for the first time at police and judicial archives and have discovered in the major rebellions illustrations of dynamic and assertive slave culture.[29]

It is now known that major slave rebellions were much more numerous than previously acknowledged. Reis's *Rebelião Escrava no Brasil: A História do Levante dos Malês (1835)*, a careful study of the urban uprising in Salvador led by African-born Muslim Nagôs, shows that nearly seventy died and at least five hundred were tortured, executed, imprisoned, or deported. African-born slaves were especially subject to repression. Reis cites depositions taken from slave prisoners to show how the insurrectionists were angered by obstacles placed on opportunities to form stable family groups. He also demonstrates the terrible extent to which the rebellion brought about fierce repression and heightened vigilance throughout Brazil. As Stuart Schwartz notes, the long chain of slave revolts marking the passage of slavery into the nineteenth century "made the dangers and costs of slavery clearer than they ever had been."[30]

Decades later, terrified by the reports of crimes by blacks and news of slave revolts, the politician clients of Paulista planters in the 1870s hardened even further their stereotype of blacks as antisocial and prone to crime. This attitude made it easier to justify subsidies for white immigration from Europe to cities as well as rural areas and sowed the seeds for deep-seated racial prejudice against blacks in Brazilian society.[31] Thus the end of slavery brought blacks little but the right to sell their labor in the newly competitive marketplace.

Recent research on patterns of postemancipation life throughout the hemisphere has been summarized by Rebecca Scott's comprehensive review article in the *Journal of Social History* (1987) and her introduction to the special issue of the *Hispanic American Historical Review* (1988) devoted to Brazilian slavery. Her essays update Robert Conrad's thorough bibliography (1977), much of which is devoted to the abolitionist campaign, as well as Edyr Resende Fleischer's *Bibliografia Analítica do Negro Brasileiro* (1984), the third volume of a series initiated by Herbert Baldus in 1954.[32] But little discussion during the current centennial has focused on abolition or the abolitionists. With the pendulum swinging toward a focus on the lives and fate of the slaves, researchers have disparaged the once-revered abolitionists as Brazilians for whom "it was not convenient to think of the fate of freedmen after emancipation was achieved."[33] It is interesting to note that as early as 1983, research-

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0023879100022901 Published online by Cambridge University Press

ers at Recife's Instituto Joaquim Nabuco included such topics as slave diets and nutrition in a published bibliography (Fundação Joaquim Nabuco 1983) on sources for the study of abolition. These topics would not have been covered a decade earlier.

The best of the post-emancipation studies, Scott argues, reveal the "complexity of former slaves' initiatives in the context of the constraints placed upon them."[34] Hebe Castro's monograph on the Capivary region in Rio de Janeiro province, *Ao Sul da História: Lavradores Pobres na Crise do Trabalho Escravo*, is based on notarial records documenting land sales, property transfers, and related activities. Her study reveals that the rural poor were well integrated into the economic life of the coffee-growing Paraíba Valley and that slaveholding in the region was dispersed, varied, and as involved in small-scale agricultural activities as plantation production. Once freed, slaves were not ostracized or barred from acquiring land, nor was their physical mobility limited. In many cases, emancipated slaves adapted successfully by becoming small farmers despite continuing dependence on local landowners for credit and protection.

An outstanding glimpse of slaves in a broader social context is Kátia M. de Queirós Mattoso's *Família e Sociedade na Bahia do Século XIX*. She uses slave inventories and other data to show that slaves as well as *libertos* were more likely to live in an unmarried state and that, ironically, slaves as well as affluent whites tended to form endogamous familial unions. For both groups—even at the opposite ends of the social spectrum—the practice served as a kind of familial self-defense (pp. 115–16).

Mattoso provides a broader view for general audiences in *To Be a Slave in Brazil, 1550–1888*, originally published in French in 1979 and then in Portuguese in 1982. *To Be a Slave* examines slavery in the context of family and community life, religion, the process of manumission, and the larger socioeconomic system. It is rich in documentation—newspaper advertisements, auction records, aggregate population statistics, and information about disease, nutrition, and punishments. The book forcefully demonstrates that African culture did not die with abolition. Mattoso concludes: "The African heritage was too rich to be effaced, too deep to be forgotten. Africa was not lost. Like a growing plant it flourished anew—in solidarity among black men and women who shared the same miserable fate and in African religions that preserved the cultural heritage of the homeland—and solidarity and religion together preserved the characteristic qualities of the Brazilian slave: dignity, pride, and courage" (p. 212).

Studies of the aftermath of abolition in the United States and Cuba have examined in detail the relationships between former slaves and the newly restructured society, but comparable studies on Brazil

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0023879100022901 Published online by Cambridge University Press

have been slower in appearing.[35] Less attention has been given to the economic dynamics of the slave system and to the fact that rising internal prices for slaves after the cessation of the slave trade caused reallocation of agricultural and mining activities in which slaves were engaged.[36] Planters turned to free labor more and more in the lower-productivity portion of the export sector. But in the most prosperous regions of the Center-South, where the marginal value-product of labor was greatest, planters could still pay high prices, which preserved the traditional configuration of slave work.[37]

If any central theme can be said to summarize the current view of the abolition of slavery, it is that slave emancipation represented neither a moral triumph of righteousness nor the "relinquishing of explicit coercion and explicit protection for implicit coercion and no protection" in the postslavery world.[38] This generalization holds true not only for Brazil but for Cuba and in the United States as well. Historians now perceive slavery to have been a far more complex enterprise than they did earlier. Slaves, their masters, and all the other groupings (*emancipados*, immigrants, nonslaveholding elites, indentured laborers) are being approached more and more as vulnerable human beings who were treated in various ways but were all degraded in the end by a conscienceless system. A myth that has been shattered by recent scholarship is the legend of easy upward mobility, frequent manumission, and, for some slaves, relatively happy lives.[39] Another misconception is that the rural poor lived in isolation from the dominant society. By studying slave life in depth in dispersed locations throughout Brazil, scholars can attempt more accurate reconstructions of their lives.[40] Researchers must deal with the near paradox that Brazilian slavery, like that in the United States, was competitively effective under certain conditions but socioeconomically regressive.[41]

Some of the bolder studies tackle the question of what has come to be called the "sociology of the negro." Moura's *Sociologia de Negro Brasileiro* synthesizes more than twenty-five years of reworking subjects that range from the seventeenth-century runaway slave republic at Palmares to the black press in São Paulo. Moura argues that the slave mode of production transformed itself into what he calls "latent slaveocracy," in which the interplay between the interests of international capital and new forms of domestic economic production acted jointly to strangle any opportunities for economic independence. Moura contends that the black masses were systematically barred from opportunities for social development by the insidious realities of dependent capitalism and that they were rejected even by members of the tiny black middle class (p. 9).

This lamentable situation can only be understood, he argues further, through a "black" sociology because "white" social science conde-

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0023879100022901 Published online by Cambridge University Press

scends to blacks and marginalizes them on its periphery. Moura rejects mainstream analysis without quarter. In his view, Brazilian social thought, its literature, its cultural ethos at all levels are fatally impregnated by this alienated vision, whether paternalistic or, in his words, "pretentiously impartial."[42]

One of the by-products of the awakened interest in subjects relating to Brazilian slavery, abolition, and black culture in general has been a heightened awareness of visual evidence about slavery and (to a much lesser extent) about Afro-Brazilian culture.[43] Maria Luiza Tucci Carneiro, Boris Kossoy, and other historians at the University of São Paulo organized a show of drawings, lithographs, and nineteenth-century photographs examining the ways that Europeans visualized Brazilian blacks.[44] Also, books were scheduled to be published in 1988 on Carioca "funk" and blacks in Brazilian cinema.[45]

Surviving photographic images offer new opportunities to "see" historically mute men and women as they appeared during their lifetimes. These images have in some ways deeply altered understanding of the historical context of slavery and abolition and, therefore, of mid-nineteenth-century life. Even the most striking of the photographs, the slave portraits of José Christiano de Freitas Henriques Junior, were carefully posed against studio backdrops contrived to resemble street scenes. They illuminate the mentality of the times when they were produced. Slavery in urban Brazil by the middle 1860s was dwindling, from 41 percent of the entire Carioca population in 1850 to 23 percent in 1870 to 9 percent on the eve of emancipation in 1888. Healthy male slaves by 1862 had been taken from city work to the coffee plantations of the Paraíba Valley, a situation that explains the fact that the female slaves in the photographs were mostly a generation younger than the males, some of whom were crippled and presumably able to work only as itinerant peddlers for their masters.[46]

Maria Odila da Silva Dias points out in her article that the photographs of black women carrying baskets of fruit to sell in the streets, with infants strapped tightly to their backs, allude to the very low fertility index of urban slaves and the extremely high incidence of infant mortality. The slaves were losing their African appearance: even women marked with tribal scars wore European clothing not unlike that of poor Portuguese immigrants. Photographs of comely young women handsomely dressed show "the statistically less significant number of concubines, eventual candidates for manumission." The photographs were taken during a period of economic hardship, labor shortages, food scarcity, inflation, and rising demands for European immigration.[47] Much of this hardship is reflected in the poignant images affixed to pasteboard and sold abroad to collectors, photos that were not discovered by historians until a century after abolition.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0023879100022901 Published online by Cambridge University Press

New Directions?

The fragmented nature of research in Brazil on slavery and abolition and the lack of vehicles for structured debate over issues (such as a national historical or sociological journal) have hindered the emergence of clearly defined schools of interpretation. It is too early to say with any certitude that the course of black history in Brazil has followed an upward spiral or that heightened consciousness of the wretchedness and brutality of slavery or the tenacity of slaves who resisted will translate into specific steps to improve the lot of the descendants of the slaves in Brazil. It is lamentable that many of the eminent studies by foreign scholars on Afro-Brazilian life in the New World (such as Eugene Genovese, Leslie Rout, Mary Karasch, Stanley Stein, C. A. Boxer, Philip Curtin, and Stuart Schwartz) seem to have been consulted only rarely by the writers of theses and dissertations whose monographs on slavery have been rushed into print.[48]

Slaves comprised the majority of Brazil's population at the beginning of the nineteenth century and a major component of both urban and rural society in the decades that followed. Recent inquiries are shedding new light on what the slaves did, how they lived and died, what were their family and kinship patterns, how they were feared by white society, and what were their cultural, religious, and ethnic roots. It is noteworthy that many of the foreign scholars invited to the commemorative conferences were experts on slavery elsewhere. Measuring the Brazilian slave experience against that of the Caribbean, Mexico, the United States, and the rest of the hemisphere and examining the junctures where slave and nonslave societies intersected will likely provide fertile ground for deeper insights to come.

In his 1983 article in the *Revista de Antropologia*, João Baptista Borges Pereira showed that black culture in Brazil is both a stigma and a valued attribute.[49] To gain respect, he argues, black culture must return to its authentic African origins, despite the risk of reinforcing its exotic image. Black culture *is* Brazilian culture, he concludes, because "all Brazilian culture, thanks to the omniscience of the black cultural element, is black culture." Kabengele Munanga, of the National University of Zaire, reminded his Brazilian audience of the dangers latent in the fact that black Brazilians, alienated from white society, are grateful to paternalistic whites out of the belief that blacks do not merit kindness. Nothing will change until Brazilian society (including its tiny black elite) begins to sympathize with its "poor and marginalized" brethren.[50] The American-Ghanian Anani Dzidzienyo put it more tactfully at the conclusion of the UCLA symposium on race and power in Brazil: "We end where we begin, with the African connection and the Afro-Brazilian condition, having explored the ramifications of the concept and having

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0023879100022901 Published online by Cambridge University Press

even questioned its validity. There can be no doubt of its significance and the urgent need to conceptualize it dynamically and innovatively for more fruitful relations between Brazil and Africa in which the Afro-Brazilian becomes more than a symbol."[51]

This objective presumably remains a major goal of the debate stirred up by the centennial of Brazilian abolition.

NOTES

1. Black life expectancy in Brazil is fifty years, compared with sixty-three for non-blacks. See Fundação Instituto Brasileiro de Geografia e Estatística (IBGE) statistics cited in *Veja* (Rio de Janeiro), 11 May 1988, p. 22; K. Munanga (1978), 153; and Pereira (1983), 93–94.
2. See, for example, the remarks by José Jobson de Andrade Arruda, director of the Comissão Nacional de Pesquisa's social science division and chair of the history department of the University of São Paulo, in *Isto É* (São Paulo), 23 Mar. 1988, p. 4.
3. See Duany (1988). Cuban studies of slavery include Moreno Fraginals (1986); Academia de Ciencias de Cuba (1986); Proceedings of the meetings held at the Maison de l'Amérique Latine, Paris, in *Anuario de Estudios Americanos* (1986); and *L'Avenc* (1987). See also Scott (1988).
4. The two outspoken leaders of the movement were Abdias do Nascimento and Lelia González. See González (1982) and her contribution in Fontaine, *Race, Class, and Power*, 120–34; and Nascimento (1968, 1978).
5. *Brésil et Java* was reissued by the Fundação Casa Rui Barbosa in Rio de Janeiro in 1988; and *Cartas de Edison Carneiro a Arthur Ramos* by Editora Corrupio in São Paulo in December 1987.
6. This approach is not unique to Brazil, of course. See Bernstein (1988), especially p. 26, on interpretations of the French Revolution. On the Brazilian debate, see the interview with Emília Viotti da Costa (Villas-Boas 1988), especially p. 10.
7. Ciro Cardoso (1988). See Tadeusz Lepkowski, *Haiti*, vol. 1 (Havana: Casa de las Américas, 1968), especially pp. 59–60.
8. See Mott (1987), Mott, ed. (1988), and Mello e Souza (1987). Mott has been exploring syncretic religious practices among slave populations in the late colonial period.
9. Karasch (1986), 90.
10. Algranti (1988), 29–31.
11. This has been the case since the late 1950s. In the United States, Marxist scholarship has turned to criticize the writings of Marx and Engels on slavery, pointing out that Marx drew on the work of Frederick Law Olmstead (classic but now considered antiquated) and, in turn, on the work of John Elliot Cairnes. U.S. historians have used "softer" Marxist categories, for example, describing slavery as "seigneurial" rather than "feudal." See Engerman (1978), 149–50; and Elizabeth Kuznesof's review of Schwartz's *Sugar Plantations* in *Luso-Brazilian Review* 25, no. 1 (1988):147–52.
12. Preface to Azevedo, *Onda Negra, Medo Branco*, 15.
13. Conversation with Peter L. Eisenberg, in Campinas, 11 June 1986. For a review of the Brazilian conservative historical tradition, see two controversial studies by José Honório Rodrigues that were published posthumously (1988a, 1988b).
14. Emília Viotti da Costa, quoted by Villas-Boas (1988), 10.
15. See also Viotti da Costa (1977, 1982).
16. For example, panelists discussed the use of marijuana by poor blacks to dull hunger pangs. One of the organizers was Gilberto Freyre, who in those days was still identified with leftist causes. The Recife conference was entirely nonideological and very scholarly. The collected papers were ultimately published in two volumes, with prefaces by Roquette Pinto (Congresso Afro-Brasileiro 1935) and Arthur Ramos (Congresso Afro-Brasileiro 1937). The Salvador conference papers were published in 1940

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0023879100022901 Published online by Cambridge University Press

(Congresso Afro-Brasileiro da Bahia 1940). The Recife conference is discussed in Levine (1973).
17. See Maria Helena P. T. Machado (1988), especially pp. 55–123. See also Sebe Bom Meihy (1980).
18. See Azevedo, *Onda Negra, Medo Branco*, especially pp. 251–58.
19. See Schwarcz, *Retrato em Branco e Negro*, 255.
20. An earlier version, in English, was published by the Institute of African Studies of Ibadan University in Nigeria; see Verger (1964). Verger revisited Bahia in June 1988 to help open the Casa do Benin, a museum commemorating the fact that one-quarter of the slaves transported to Brazil sailed from Benin's port of Uidá.
21. Dias Tavares worked in London with Leslie Bethell, whose earlier work (1970) remains the major treatment of the subject.
22. Conrad (1986), 190–91.
23. See Toplin (1975), especially p. 261; Fernandes (1964), 16–18, 32, 49; *A Província de São Paulo*, 9 May 1888, p. 1; and Ianni (1962), 264–65.
24. See Andrews (1988).
25. See Tannenbaum (1947), which borrows heavily from Freyre's *Casa Grande e Senzala* (1933).
26. See, for example, Alves Filho (1987).
27. To suggest that the pioneering scholars who comprised the São Paulo school overlooked the plight of the former slave is entirely unreasonable. For example, see Ianni (1962), 284–85. Compare Batalha (1988), 68.
28. Klein (1986), 260–69.
29. Schwartz (1988), 9.
30. Schwartz, *Sugar Plantations*, 488.
31. See Azevedo, *Onda Negra, Medo Branco*, 255–58; and Schwarcz, *Retrato em Branco e Negro*. The new findings that blacks fought back against their oppressors have an ironic facet, however: we now have evidence that in some places slaves and former slaves murdered masters, sabotaged harvests, committed suicide rather than work, and consciously resisted the slave system.
32. See Scott (1987), 565–84; Conrad (1977); and Fleischer (1984).
33. Leonzo and Machado (1988), 2.
34. Scott (1988), 407.
35. For the United States, see Litwack (1979); Foner (1983); and Scott (1985). The best studies for Brazil are Eisenberg (1974) and Costa Mattos Gomes de Castro, *Ao Sul da História*, under review here.
36. For an important study of this subject, see Slenes (1985).
37. See Leff (1982), 52–53.
38. Scott (1988).
39. Hoetink (1967), 55, cited in Karasch (1987), 369.
40. See Ludwig (1985), 30–31; and Costa Mattos Gomes de Castro, *Ao Sul da História*.
41. Lewis Grey (1933), cited in Engerman (1978), 155. See also Moura, *Sociologia do Negro Brasileiro*, 9.
42. Moura, *Sociologia do Negro Brasileiro*. If a "black" conceptual framework remains the goal, it will have been constructed in the foreseeable future by whites. Virtually all the dozens of experts participating in the congresses and special meetings held throughout Brazil in 1988—foreigners and Brazilians alike—were white, although in many cases a good part of the audiences were composed of men and women of black or mixed racial heritage. The question of a specifically "black vision" of Brazilian culture is also discussed in Brookshaw (1986).
43. See Levine (1986), a videotaped documentary about the ways that nineteenth-century Latin American photographers viewed their world; see also Levine (1987, 1989); and E. Bradford Burns (1986).
44. Of the hundred drawings and photographs in the "Exposição" exhibit at the Universidade de São Paulo, sixty-eight represent an idealized vision that never probed to reveal actual living conditions. See Barreira (1988), 125.
45. See Vianna (1988); and João Carlos Rodrigues (1988).

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0023879100022901 Published online by Cambridge University Press

46. See Dias (1988), 29.
47. Ibid. See for example, photographs nos.1–3, 10–11, 14–16, 17–19, and 24–25 in Azevedo and Lissovsky's *Escravos Brasileiros*.
48. They also have overlooked work by such seminal Marxist historians as Herbert Aptheker, Lewis Hacker, and Michael Greenberg. For a thorough summary of Marxist theory on slavery, see Padgug (1976). A list of theses and dissertations in history published in Brazil is provided in Correa (1987). Mature scholars not only know the North American literature but have been influenced by the French Annales school, current research in methods in historical demography, and research in Eastern bloc countries.
49. Pereira (1983), 101.
50. Munanga (1978), 151–53.
51. Dzidzienyo, in Fontaine, *Race, Class, and Power*, 148.

REFERENCES

ACADEMIA DE CIENCIAS DE CUBA
1986 *La esclavitud en Cuba.* Havana: Editorial Academia.

ALENCASTRO, LUIZ FELIPE DE
1988 "História: Foco na Escravidão." *Veja e Leia*, 17 Feb. 1988, 72–75.

ALGRANTI, LELIA MEZAN
1988 "Slave Crimes: The Use of Police Power to Control the Slave Population of Rio de Janeiro." *Luso-Brazilian Review* 25, no. 1:27–48.

ALVES FILHO, IVAN
1987 *Memorial dos Palmares.* Rio de Janeiro: Xenon Editora e Produtora Cultural.

ANDREWS, GEORGE REID
1988 "Black Workers and White: São Paulo, 1888–1928." *Hispanic American Historical Review* 68, no. 3:491–524.

ANUARIO DE ESTUDIOS AMERICANOS
1986 Special issue, vol. 43. Seville.

BARREIRA, WAGNER
1988 "Doce Escravidão." *Veja* (São Paulo) 20, no. 24, 15 June 1988, p. 125.

BATALHA, CLAUDIO H. M.
1988 "Livre para Vegetar." *Senhor* (São Paulo), no. 377, 13 June 1988, p. 68.

BERNSTEIN, RICHARD
1988 "The French Revolution: Right or Wrong?" *New York Times Book Review*, 10 July 1988, pp. 1, 26–29.

BETHELL, LESLIE
1970 *The Abolition of the Brazilian Slave Trade: Britain, Brazil, and the Slave Trade Question, 1807–1869.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

BROOKSHAW, DAVID
1986 *Race and Color in Brazilian Literature.* Metuchen, N.J.: Scarecrow Press.

BURNS, E. BRADFORD
1986 *Eadweard Muybridge in Guatemala, 1875: The Photographer as Social Recorder.* Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press.

CARDOSO, CIRO FLAMARION S.
1988 "The Peasant Breach in the Slave System." *Luso-Brazilian Review* 25, no. 1:49–57.

CARDOSO, FERNANDO HENRIQUE
1962 *Capitalismo e Escravidão no Brasil Meridional.* 2nd ed. Rio de Janeiro: Paz e Terra.

CARNEIRO, EDISON
1987 *Cartas de Edison Carneiro à Artur Ramos.* São Paulo: Editora Corrupio.

COMMISSÃO INTERINSTITUCIONAL PARA OS CENTENARIOS DA ABOLIÇÃO E DA REPUBLICA
1988 *Boletim do Centenário* 4 (Rio de Janeiro).

CONGRESSO AFRO-BRASILEIRO
1935 *Estudos Afro-Brasileiros.* Rio de Janeiro: Editora Ariel.
1937 *Novos Estudos Afro-Brasileiros.* Rio de Janeiro: Civilização Brasileira.

CONGRESSO AFRO-BRASILEIRO DA BAHIA

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0023879100022901 Published online by Cambridge University Press

1940 *O Negro no Brasil.* Rio de Janeiro: Civilização Brasileira.

CONRAD, ROBERT E.

1977 *Brazilian Slavery: An Annotated Research Bibliography.* Boston: G. K. Hall.

1986 *World of Sorrow: The African Slave Trade to Brazil.* Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press.

CORREA, CARLOS HUMBERTO

1987 *Catálogo das Dissertações e Teses dos Cursos de Pós-Graduação em História.* Florianópolis: Editora da Universidade Federal de Santa Catarina.

COSTA, FRANCISCO

1988 "Pierre Verger," *Leia* (São Paulo), May 1988, p. 24.

DIAS, MARIA ODILA DA SILVA

1988 "A Cámara Clara," *Leia* (São Paulo), May 1988, p. 29.

DUANY, JORGE

1988 "After the Revolution: The Search for Roots in Afro-Cuban Culture." *LARR* 23, no. 1:244–55.

EISENBERG, PETER L.

1974 *The Sugar Industry in Pernambuco: Modernization without Change, 1840–1910.* Berkeley and London: University of California Press.

EISENBERG, PETER L., LELIA M. ALGRANTI, CELIA MARIA MARINHO DE AZEVEDO, SIDNEY CHALHOUB, SILVIA LARA, AND ROBERT W. SLENES, ORGANIZERS

1988 *Edições Comemorativas do Centenário da Abolição no Brasil.* São Paulo: n.p.

ENGERMAN, STANLEY L.

1978 "Marxist Economic Studies of the Slave South." *Marxist Perspectives* (Spring 1978):148–63.

FERNANDES, FLORESTAN

1964 *A Integração do Negro na Sociedade de Classes,* vol. 1. São Paulo: Dominicus.

FLEISCHER, EDYR RESENDE

1984 *Bibliografia Analítica do Negro Brasileiro.* Brasília: Fundação Nacional Pró-Memória.

FONER, ERIC

1983 *Nothing but Freedom: Emancipation and Its Legacy.* Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press.

FREYRE, GILBERTO

1933 *Casa Grande e Senzala.* Rio de Janeiro: José Olympio Editora.

FUNDAÇÃO JOAQUIM NABUCO

1983 *Subsídios para o Estudo da Abolição.* Recife: Editorial Massangana.

GONÇALVES NALDI, MILRED REGINA

1988 *A Condição Social do Negro na Transição Império-República.* São Paulo, n.p.

GONZALEZ, LELIA

1982 *Lugar do Negro.* With Carlos A. Hasenbalg. Rio de Janeiro: Marco Zero.

GREY, LEWIS

1933 *History of Agriculture in the Southern United States to 1860.* 2 vols. Washington, D.C: U.S. Department of Agriculture.

HOETINK, HARRY

1967 *The Two Variants in Caribbean Race Relations.* Translated by Eva M. Hooykas. New York: Oxford University Press.

IANNI, OCTAVIO

1962 *As Metamorfoses do Escravo.* São Paulo: DIFEL.

KARASCH, MARY C.

1986 "Anastácia and the Slave Women of Rio de Janeiro." In *Africans in Bondage,* edited by Paul E. Lovejoy, 79–106. Madison: University of Wisconsin, African Studies Program.

1987 *Slave Life in Rio de Janeiro.* Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press.

KLEIN, HERBERT S.

1986 *African Slavery in Latin America and the Caribbean.* New York: Oxford University Press.

LAERNE, C. F. DELDEN

1988 *Brésil et Java.* Rio de Janeiro: Casa Rui Barbosa.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0023879100022901 Published online by Cambridge University Press

LANNA, ANA LUCIA DUARTE, ET AL.
1988 *Abolição: Uma Bibliografia Comentada (1968–1987).* São Paulo: Universidade de São Paulo.
LARA, SILVIA HUNOLD
1988 *Inventário e Legislação sobre Escravos Africanos no Brasil.* São Paulo: n.p.
L'AVENC
1987 "L'abolicio de l'esclavitud a Cuba." *L'Avenc,* no. 101 (published in Catalan in Barcelona).
LEFF, NATHANIEL H.
1982 *Underdevelopment and Development in Brazil,* vol. 1, *Economic Structure and Change, 1822–1947.* Boston: Allen and Unwin.
LEONZO, NANCI, AND HUMBERTO F. MACHADO
1988 "O Pensamento Abolicionista: Reflexões Críticas." *Boletim do Centenário* 4:2 (Rio de Janeiro).
LEVINE, ROBERT M.
1973 "The First Afro-Brazilian Congress." *Race* (London), no. 15 (Nov.):185–94.
1986 *Imagens de Reinos.* Video documentary. Coral Gables, Fla.: University of Miami.
1987 *Windows on Latin America.* Coral Gables, Fla.: South Eastern Council on Latin American Studies (SECOLAS) and the University of Miami.
1989 *Images of History: Nineteenth- and Early-Twentieth-Century Latin American Photographs as Documents.* Durham, N.C., and London: Duke University Press, forthcoming.
LITWAK, LEON F.
1979 *Been in the Storm So Long: The Aftermath of Slavery.* New York: St. Martin's Press.
LUDWIG, ARMIN K.
1985 *Brazil: A Handbook of Historical Statistics.* Boston: G. K. Hall.
MELLO E SOUZA, LAURA DE
1987 *O Diabo na Terra da Santa Cruz.* São Paulo: Brasiliense.
MORENO FRAGINALS, MANUEL
1983 *La história como arma y otros estudios sobre esclavos, ingenios y plantaciones.* Barcelona: Crítica.
1986 "La esclavitud: a cien años del fin." *Revolución y Cultura* (Havana) 8:2–11
MOTT, LUIZ
1987 "Uma santa africana no Brasil colonial." *D. O. Leitura* (São Paulo) 6:62.
MOTT, LUIZ, ED.
1988 *Estudos sobre a História e a Actualidade do Negro na Bahia.* São Paulo: Brasiliense.
MUNANGA, KABENGELE
1978 "Preconceito de Cor; Diversos Formas, Um Mesmo Objetivo: Estados Unidos, Africa e Brasil." *Revista de Antropologia* (São Paulo) 21, no. 2:145–53.
NASCIMENTO, ABDIAS DO
1968 *O Negro Revoltado.* Rio de Janeiro: Editorial GRDD.
1978 *O Genocídio do Negro Brasileiro.* Rio de Janeiro: Paz e Terra.
NOBRE, DANIEL
1988 "Estudiosos 'repensam' escravidão." *Folha de São Paulo,* 18 Feb. 1988, p. A–31.
PADGUG, ROBERT A.
1976 "Problems in the Theory of Slavery and Slave Society." *Science and Society,* no. 40:3–27.
PEDRO, JOANA MARIA
1988 *Manifestações de Preconceito e Segregação Racial em Santa Catarina, 1850–1900.* São Paulo: n.p.
PEREIRA, JOÃO BAPTISTA BORGES
1983 "Negro e Cultura Negra no Brasil Atual." *Revista de Antropologia* (São Paulo) 26:93–106.
RODRIGUES, JOÃO CARLOS, COORD.
1988 *O Negro no Cinema Brasileiro.* Rio de Janeiro: Globo, Embrafilme.
RODRIGUES, JOSE HONORIO
1988a *A Historiografia Conservadora.* Rio de Janeiro: Companhia Editorial Nacional.
1988b *A Metafísica do Latifúndio: O Ultra-Reacionário Oliveira Viana.* Rió de Janeiro: Companhia Editora Nacional.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0023879100022901 Published online by Cambridge University Press

ROUT, LESLIE, JR.
1976 *The African Experience in Latin America.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
SCHWARTZ, STUART B.
1988 "Recent Trends in the Study of Slavery in Brazil." *Luso-Brazilian Review* 25, no. 1:1–25.
SCOTT, REBECCA J.
1985 *Slave Emancipation in Cuba: The Transition to Free Labor, 1860–1899.* Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press.
1987 "Comparing Emancipations: A Review Essay." *Journal of Social History* 20:565–84.
1988 "Exploring the Meaning of Freedom: Postemancipation Societies in Comparative Perspective." *Hispanic American Historical Review* 68, no. 3:407–28.
SEBE BOM MEIHY, JOSE CARLOS
1980 "Vale de Lágrimas: História da Pobreza em Taubate, 1889–1945." Thesis, University of São Paulo.
SLENES, ROBERT W.
1976 "The Demography and Economics of Brazilian Slavery, 1850–1888." Ph.D. diss., Stanford University.
1985 *Os Múltiplos de Porcos e Diamantes: A Economia Escravista de Minas Gerais no Século XIX.* Campinas: Universidade Estadual de Campinas.
TANNENBAUM, FRANK
1947 *Slave and Citizen in the New World.* Reprint. New York: Vintage Books, 1964.
TAVARES, REGINA MARCIA, AND MARGARITA BARRETO
1988 *Estudo e Documentação das Manifestações Afro-Brasileiras em Campinas no Ano do Centenário da Abolição.*
TOPLIN, ROBERT BRENT
1975 *The Abolition of Slavery in Brazil.* New York: Atheneum.
VAINFAS, RONALDO
1986 *Ideologia e Escravidão: Os Letrados e a Sociedade Escravista no Brasil Colonial.* Petrópolis: Editorial Vozes.
VERGER, PIERRE
1964 *Bahia and the West African Trade, 1549–1851.* Lagos: Ibadan University Press.
1968 *Flux et reflux de la traite des Nègres entre le Golfe de Bénin et Bahia de Todos os Santos du XVII au XIX siècle.* Paris: Mouton.
1988 *Fluxo e Refluxo do Tráfico de Escravos entre o Golfo de Benin e Bahia de Todos os Santos.* São Paulo: Editora Corrupio.
VIANNA, HERMANO
1988 *O Mundo Funk Carioca.* Rio de Janeiro: Zahar.
VILLAS-BOAS, LUCIANO
1988 "História Não É Só Memória." Interview with Emília Viotti da Costa. *Jornal do Brasil* (Rio de Janeiro), 18 June 1988, pp. 10–11.
VIOTTI DA COSTA, EMILIA
1966 *Da Senzala à Colonia.* São Paulo: DIFEL.
1977 *Da Monarchia à República: Momentos Decisivos.* São Paulo: Editora Grijalbo.
1982 *A Abolição.* São Paulo: Global.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0023879100022901 Published online by Cambridge University Press