



figure out how to manage the unseemliness) is not prescribed, and the comedy of the moment depends largely on how performers manage that silence.

It is worth noting that the more rhetorical, contrastive and differentiated performance habits of 'Early Music' players were becoming mainstream at the same time that topic theory was taking off. One does not have to claim that one caused the other to see that the aural and the intellectual environments were in sync with each other. By the same token, Sutcliffe's convincing, meticulously documented and deeply felt reading of late eighteenth-century style as embodying and enacting the wonderful richness of human interaction could be an opening for all of us who write about music routinely to include performers in our descriptions of what music means and how it goes.

MARY HUNTER
mhunter@bowdoin.edu



Eighteenth-Century Music © The Author(s), 2021. Published by Cambridge University Press
 doi:10.1017/S1478570621000154

LEONARDO J. WAISMAN

UNA HISTORIA DE LA MÚSICA COLONIAL HISPANOAMERICANA

Buenos Aires: Gourmet Musical Ediciones, 2019

pp. 478, ISBN 978 9 873 82324 4

Writing a book that summarizes and synthesizes music history in colonial Spanish America is a vast and complicated task. There is too much literature to consult, and it is not always easily accessible. Paradoxically, many gaps persist for certain practices and musical styles, and for periods such as that before 1550. Probably for this reason, no one had previously tried to carry out this task, even though nearly seventy years had passed since the first serious studies on the subject were published. The above constitutes the basic premise from which I believe any review of Leonardo Waisman's latest book should start: not to excuse the problems the book may have, but to weigh them in their proper measure and, above all, prevent them from obscuring the book's undoubted successes and its importance for scholarship on colonial-era music.

In an unprecedented effort, Waisman synthesizes much of today's knowledge about music in Spanish America during the colonial period. He does so in three large blocks dedicated to the sixteenth, seventeenth and eighteenth centuries, although the first covers only the reign of Felipe II (1556–1598). As the author explains in his Introduction, the second of these blocks is the only one that was written expressly for this book, since the other two had already been published: the first, as part of the book *Políticas y prácticas musicales en el mundo de Felipe II* (Politics and Musical Practices in the World of Felipe II), edited by John Griffiths and Javier Suárez-Pajares (Madrid: ICCMU, 2004), and the third as a chapter in volume 4 of the *Historia de la música en España e Hispanoamérica*, edited by José Máximo Leza (Madrid: Fondo de Cultura Económica, 2014). Although most of the content remains unchanged, the author introduces some relevant updates. For example, the block dedicated to the sixteenth century includes new sections on Santiago de Cuba, Lima and other cities. While, on the one hand, this temporal subdivision makes some repetitions inevitable (see Juliana Pérez's review of this book in *Revista Musical Chilena* 73/232 (2019), 138–146), on the other hand, it clearly shows both the continuities and changes in Spanish-American musical culture over time.

In the first block, which consists of four chapters, the author studies what he calls the 'republic of Spaniards', or musical life in urban religious institutions (29). He mainly focuses on musical chapels and their masters, undoubtedly owing to the fact that previous scholarship has focused on this matter. However, Waisman strives to deal with the viceroalties' main urban centres (Mexico, Puebla and Lima) together with those less studied, such as Quito and Santiago del Estero. Next, he examines the 'republic of



Indians', that is, the musical life in the towns and the mission communities inhabited mostly by the Indigenous people (54). Despite this division, established during the government of Felipe II, the author concludes that there was, on the Indigenous side, a 'resistant appropriation', that is, a dual and complex attitude towards Spanish musical culture, which invites us to put aside any simplistic dichotomy between the two 'republics' (87). This block ends with a chapter on 'Other Urban Areas', devoted to public spaces, independent musicians and domestic music, among other topics.

The second block, dedicated to the seventeenth century, follows an inverse order, since it begins with a chapter on the 'republic of Indians'. The central theme here is the evangelization of Indigenous peoples through music, especially in Cusco and Paraguay's Jesuit reductions. In the latter, Jesuits widely cultivated and promoted notated music, and Indigenous people were treated better in these contexts than in the rest of colonial society. The following chapter deals with the 'republic of Spaniards', thus offering data on cathedrals and convents, many of them related to the chapels and their teachers. However, the final chapter is different, since it uses the score as a source and musical analysis as a method to offer an original and comprehensive view of seventeenth-century musical repertoires. Here the author shows an analytical acumen rarely seen in studies on the Spanish-American colonial era, which allows him to break down and understand the compositional strategies of various musicians, from Gaspar Fernández to Juan de Araujo.

The third and last block presents a structure similar to the previous ones, since it studies the Indian towns – albeit more briefly – and the main cities' religious institutions, now during the eighteenth century. However, it also includes a final chapter on other dimensions of urban musical life, such as the theatre and public spaces. This entire block exhibits a concern for the tension between tradition and modernity, especially in the second half of the century, given the confluence between the galant style and practices still rooted in the previous century.

The book concludes with two appendices, one on composers active in Spanish America and the other on musical instruments used in colonial times. Both appendices – but especially the first one, which contains a large amount of information – will be useful for students and professional researchers, despite some errors. For instance, it is stated that Francisco de Vidales was a chapel master at the Cathedral of Mexico between 1648 and 1654 when in reality the position was occupied by his uncle Fabián Pérez Ximeno (see Javier Marín's review of Waisman's book in *El Oído Pensante* 8/2 (2020), 207–217).

This book has many virtues. It is worth mentioning that an impressive number of bibliographic and primary sources are analysed, which allows the author to address a wide range of practices, venues and institutions. But Waisman does not limit himself to presenting the collected data in an orderly manner: he also explains and interprets them within the framework of a complex and intelligent historical account. Perhaps one of his most original contributions lies in his attention to repertory, genres and styles, given the scarce presence that musical analysis has had in colonial scholarship. Regarding the villancico, the author declares his reluctance to offer a 'coherent narrative' of its evolution (174). However, this is precisely what he does for this and other genres, and his periodization is of great interest. In short, around 1700, the compositional style responded to what the author calls the 'vocal baroque', that is, pieces for two or more choirs, with an accompaniment part, and written according to the theory of polyphonic tones (280). This style belonged to composers such as Juan de Araujo and Tomás de Torrejón y Velasco. After c1720, the 'concerted baroque' predominated. It was championed by Roque Ceruti, among others, and characterized by the appearance of obligatory parts for violins, an increase in pieces for solo voices or a single choir and a nearer approach to modern tonality. Simultaneously, the author borrows from Bernardo Illari the term 'criollismo' to designate the tendency of composers like Blas Tardío, *criollo* chapel master of the cathedral of Sucre (then called La Plata), to mix imported novelties with local elements. In the second half of the eighteenth century, the galant influence began, although its assimilation by Spanish-American composers also produced some differences. For example, while the pieces tended to modulate towards the dominant or the relative major after the beginning, as occurs in galant works, the new tonality never reached the status of a 'second home', except in works by Italian Ignacio Jerusalem, chapel master of Mexico Cathedral between 1750 and 1769. Even though this proposal will undoubtedly be revised and discussed in later studies, it is solidly grounded, providing a



good starting-point for paying greater attention to musical structure and style and their links with their sociocultural context.

These strengths notwithstanding, I think the book also exhibits some problems that are worth noting, even if they may be unavoidable in a work of this scope. One is the apparent disparity in structure and focus between the second block and the other two blocks. Undoubtedly, this derives from the different times at which they were written, and could be interpreted positively as a reflection of the musical diversity of the entire period under review, as well as a means for the author to ‘free himself from a totalizing and absolutist treatment’ (see Marín’s review, already cited, 208). Even so, at times, one has the impression of reading more than one book.

Another aspect that gives cause for reservation is the disparity in dealing with the various dimensions of musical life. Some of them – the emphasis on author–work pairing, the lack of attention to oral music and plainsong – could be explained by the scant previous research on these topics. But other omissions are more difficult to explain. Perhaps the most striking is the brevity of the section dedicated to Latin polyphony at the end of the second block (236–240), despite its prestige at that time and the fact that there is a large corpus of polyphonic sources from the seventeenth century preserved throughout colonial Latin America. Likewise, it seems dubious to consider the nunneries only or mostly inhabited by Spanish women as the most successful example of the colonial project, since such a project involved integrating Indigenous people, albeit in a sub-altern condition.

Of course, these possible problems do not overshadow the undoubted virtues and importance of this book for all those interested in the music of the colonial period. It is to be hoped that *Una historia de la música colonial hispanoamericana* will be reissued several times, and perhaps translated into English, given the interest in this subject in the English-speaking world. This would offer the opportunity to fill in some gaps and further enrich this already impressive text with new materials that, for whatever reason, may not have been included in this version.

ALEJANDRO VERA
averaa@uc.cl



RECORDINGS

Eighteenth-Century Music © The Author(s), 2021. Published by Cambridge University Press
 doi:10.1017/S1478570621000166

PIETER HELLENDAAAL (1721–1799)

‘CAMBRIDGE’ SONATAS

Johannes Pramsohler (violin) / Gulrim Choi (cello) / Philippe Grisvard (harpsichord)

Audax ADX13720, 2020: one disc, 69 minutes

The six sonatas for violin and continuo recorded here for the first time are preserved in a manuscript at the Fitzwilliam Museum, Cambridge, just a few hundred yards from the site of the house where their composer spent the last twenty years or so of his life – a convenient location, directly opposite the college chapel of Peterhouse, where Hellendaal was employed as organist. The Dutch violinist, born in Rotterdam, had already had a varied career before arriving in Cambridge in the early 1760s. Appointed organist of the Nicolaikerk in Utrecht before his eleventh birthday, he later relocated with his family to Amsterdam, from where an influential sponsor facilitated a period in Padua studying with the renowned virtuoso Giuseppe Tartini. For a couple of years around 1750 he sought to establish himself in the university town of Leiden, eventually leaving in 1751 to pursue a career as a virtuoso in London, where he was a popular figure at the main concert