

# ON MINIMAL DEGREES OF PERMUTATION REPRESENTATIONS OF ABELIAN QUOTIENTS OF FINITE GROUPS

CLARA FRANCHI

(Received 2 December 2010)

## Abstract

For a finite group  $G$ , we denote by  $\mu(G)$  the minimum degree of a faithful permutation representation of  $G$ . We prove that if  $G$  is a finite  $p$ -group with an abelian maximal subgroup, then  $\mu(G/G') \leq \mu(G)$ .

2010 *Mathematics subject classification*: primary 20B05.

*Keywords and phrases*: permutation representation, finite  $p$ -group.

## 1. Introduction

For a finite group  $G$ , the *minimal faithful permutation degree*  $\mu(G)$  is defined as the least positive integer  $n$  such that  $G$  is isomorphic to a subgroup of the symmetric group  $S_n$ . A faithful permutation representation of degree  $\mu(G)$  is called a *minimal (faithful) permutation representation* of  $G$ . By Cayley's theorem  $\mu(G) \leq |G|$ , and it is easy to see that equality holds if and only if  $G$  is cyclic of prime power order, a generalized quaternion 2-group or the Klein 4-group [7].

If  $H$  is a subgroup of  $G$ , then  $\mu(H) \leq \mu(G)$ , but the situation for quotient groups can be quite different. For example, Neumann pointed out in [11] that the direct product of  $m$  copies of the dihedral group of order 8 has a natural faithful representation of degree  $4m$  but it has an extraspecial quotient which has no faithful permutation representation of degree less than  $2^{m+1}$ . On the other hand, particular classes of quotients behave just like the subgroups. For example,  $\mu(G/N) \leq \mu(G)$  provided  $G/N$  has no nontrivial abelian normal subgroups (Kovács and Praeger [10]). Using this result, Holt and Walton [6] proved that there exists a constant  $c$  such that  $\mu(G/N) \leq c^{\mu(G)-1}$  for all finite groups  $G$  and all normal subgroups  $N$ . (The constant is approximately 5.34.)

If  $A = A_1 \times \cdots \times A_r$  is an abelian group, with each  $A_i$  cyclic of prime power order  $a_i$ , then  $\mu(A) = a_1 + \cdots + a_r$  ([14] and [12, Ch. II, Theorem 4]; see also [7, 8]). Thus, in particular,  $\mu(A/N) \leq \mu(A)$  for every subgroup  $N$  of  $A$ . According to [9], the question whether  $\mu(G/N) > \mu(G)$  can happen with  $G/N$  abelian, goes back at least to Easdown

and Praeger [3], the conjecture being that it cannot. In the last paragraph of Section 1 of [4], it was shown that a minimal counterexample  $G$  would have to have prime-power order and  $N$  would have to be the commutator subgroup  $G'$  (see also [2, 10]).

In this note, we carry on the analysis of a such a counterexample, showing that it cannot be a nonabelian finite  $p$ -group with an abelian maximal subgroup. Namely, we prove the following.

**THEOREM.** *Let  $G$  be a nonabelian finite  $p$ -group with an abelian maximal subgroup. Then  $\mu(G/G') \leq \mu(G)$ .*

Notation is standard. We refer to [1] for notation and terminology about permutation groups. If  $H$  is a subgroup of a group  $G$  we denote by  $\rho_H$  the standard representation of  $G$  on the right cosets of  $H$ . All groups considered are finite.

## 2. Proof of the theorem

Recall that if  $AB = A \times B$  is a direct product of groups  $A$  and  $B$ , a subgroup  $G$  of  $AB$  is called a *subdirect product* of  $A$  and  $B$  if  $AG = BG = AB$ .

**LEMMA 1.** *Let  $G$  be a subdirect product of two groups,  $A$  and  $B$ , such that  $G/G'$  is not a subdirect product of  $A/A'$  and  $B/B'$ , and set*

$$R = G'(B \cap G) \cap G'(A \cap G), \quad L = G'(A \cap G)(B \cap G).$$

*Then  $R/G'$  is isomorphic to a section of  $A'$  which is a central section of  $A$ , and if  $A$  is nilpotent then  $G/L$  is not cyclic.*

**PROOF.** Since  $G$  is a subdirect product of  $A$  and  $B$ , we have  $A \times B = AG = BG$  and  $A \cong G/(B \cap G)$ ,  $B \cong G/(A \cap G)$ . As  $G/G'$  is not a subdirect product of  $A/A'$  and  $B/B'$ , it is easy to see that  $R > G' > 1$ . Observe that  $A \cap G' = G'$  or  $B \cap G' = G'$  would imply that  $R = G'$ , which is a contradiction. Hence  $A \cap G' < G'$  and  $B \cap G' < G'$  and no generality is lost by assuming that  $A \cap G' = B \cap G' = 1$ . Then  $A \cap G$  and  $B \cap G$  lie in the centre  $Z(G)$  of  $G$  (because they are normal subgroups which avoid the derived group). Let  $\alpha : G \rightarrow A$  be the restriction to  $G$  of the projection of  $A \times B$  on the first component, that is  $(ab)\alpha = a$  whenever  $a \in A$ ,  $b \in B$ . Note that  $G\alpha = A$ ,  $\ker \alpha = B \cap G$ ,  $R\alpha = G'\alpha = A'$ , and of course  $(Z(G))\alpha \leq Z(A)$ . Now  $A \cap R = (A \cap R)\alpha \leq R\alpha = A'$  and  $A \cap R \leq A \cap G = (A \cap G)\alpha \leq (Z(G))\alpha \leq Z(A)$  show that  $A \cap R$  is a subgroup of  $A'$  which is central in  $A$ . Since  $G' \leq R \leq AG'$ , by Dedekind's law,  $R = (A \cap R)G'$ . As  $A \cap G' = 1$ , this yields  $R = (A \cap R) \times G'$ , whence  $R/G' \cong A \cap R$ . The first statement of the lemma is proved.

Observe next that the complete inverse image of  $A'(A \cap G)$  under  $\alpha$  is  $L$ , so  $G/L$  is isomorphic to the largest abelian quotient of  $A/(A \cap G)$ . Suppose that  $A$  is nilpotent. If  $A' \not\leq A \cap G$ , then  $A/(A \cap G)$  is a nonabelian nilpotent group. As such, it must have a noncyclic abelian quotient, therefore in this case  $G/L$  cannot be cyclic. If  $A' \leq A \cap G$ , that is, if  $G'\alpha \leq A \cap G$ , then  $G'$  lies in the complete inverse image of  $A \cap G$  under  $\alpha$ , so  $G' \leq (A \cap G)(B \cap G)$ . In this case  $L = (A \cap G)(B \cap G) \leq Z(G)$ , and as a central

quotient of a nonabelian group can never be cyclic, the desired conclusion is once more at hand. □

We quote in the following lemma a consequence of [7, Theorem 2] that will be useful in what follows. We denote by  $C_{p^\alpha}$  the cyclic group of order  $p^\alpha$ .

**LEMMA 2.** *Let  $U$  be an abelian group of exponent dividing  $p^n$ ,  $n > 1$ . If  $V$  is a subgroup or a quotient of  $U$  of order  $|U|/p$ , then  $\mu(U) \leq \mu(V) + p^n - p^{n-1}$ .*

**PROOF.** If  $U \cong V \times C_p$ , the claim holds because  $p^n - p^{n-1} \geq p$ . Otherwise, an unrefinable direct decomposition of  $U$  has the same number of cyclic direct summands as  $V$ , the difference being that a  $C_{p^m}$  in  $V$  is replaced by a  $C_{p^{m+1}}$  in  $U$ . (When  $V$  is a subgroup, this follows immediately from [9, Lemma 1]; when  $V$  is a factor group, it comes dually.) In this case,  $\mu(U) = \mu(V) - p^m + p^{m+1}$  and the claim holds because  $m + 1 \leq n$  and so  $p^{m+1} - p^m \leq p^n - p^{n-1}$ . □

Recall that a subgroup  $H$  of a group  $G$  is called *meet-irreducible* if it is not the intersection of two subgroups  $H_1, H_2$ , with  $H_i > H$  for  $i = 1, 2$ .

**LEMMA 3.** *Let  $P$  be a nonabelian  $p$ -group which is a transitive permutation group of degree  $p^n$  such that the stabilizer of a point is meet-irreducible. Suppose that  $P$  contains a nontransitive maximal abelian subgroup  $M$ . Then every section of  $P'$  which is central in  $P$  has order at most  $p$  and  $P/P'$  is isomorphic to one of the following groups, where  $\alpha \leq n - 2$ :*

- (i)  $C_{p^\alpha} \times C_p \times C_p$ ;
- (ii)  $C_{p^{\alpha+1}} \times C_p$ ;
- (iii)  $C_{p^\alpha} \times C_{p^2}$ .

*In particular  $\mu(P/P') \leq p^{n-1} + p$ .*

**PROOF.** Let  $S$  be the stabilizer of a point in  $P$ . Then  $S \leq M$ , since  $M$  is not transitive, and  $|M : S| = p^{n-1}$ . It follows that  $\{x^{p^{n-1}} \mid x \in M\}$  is a normal subgroup of  $P$  contained in  $S$ , so it must be 1 as  $S$  is core-free. Moreover, as  $S$  is meet-irreducible,  $M/S$  is a cyclic group. Thus, by a result of Ore on monomial representations [13, Ch. IV, Theorem 1],  $P$  embeds into the wreath product  $C_{p^{n-1}} \text{ wr } C_p$  in such a way that  $M$  embeds into the base subgroup  $B$ . Observe that  $B$  has the structure of an  $\mathcal{A}$ -module isomorphic to  $\mathcal{A}_{\mathcal{A}}$ , where  $\mathcal{A} = (\mathbb{Z}/p^{n-1}\mathbb{Z})C_p$ , and subgroups of  $B$  which are normalized by  $P$  are precisely the  $\mathcal{A}$ -submodules. In what follows we identify  $M$  with its image in  $\mathcal{A}_{\mathcal{A}}$  and denote by  $W$  the augmentation ideal of  $\mathcal{A}_{\mathcal{A}}$ .

Since  $P'$  is contained in  $M \cap W$  and since every section of  $M$  which is central in  $P$  is a trivial  $\mathcal{A}$ -module, the last sentence of [5, Lemma 1.2.1] gives that every section of  $P'$  that is central in  $P$  has order dividing  $p$ . To prove the second part of the claim, note that, by [5, Lemma 1.2.1] and using the same notation,  $P' = W_j$  for some  $j > 0$ . By [5, Proposition 1.2.2] (and using the same notation, except for replacing  $n$  by  $n - 1$ ) the largest trivial submodule of  $\mathcal{A}_{\mathcal{A}}/W_j$  is easily seen to be  $A(n - 1, j + 1)/W_j$  if  $W_j < W$  and  $\mathcal{A}_{\mathcal{A}}/W$  otherwise. Hence  $M/P'$  is a subgroup either of  $C_{p^{n-2}} \times C_p$  or of  $C_{p^{n-1}}$ .

Using that  $M/P'$  is a maximal subgroup of the noncyclic  $P/P'$  and by arguing as in the proof of Lemma 2, the second claim of the lemma follows.  $\square$

Recall that by [16],  $\mu(G) = \mu(H) + \mu(K)$  whenever  $G$  is a nilpotent group with a nontrivial direct factorization  $G = H \times K$ . In particular, whenever  $G$  is a subdirect product of two nilpotent groups  $A$  and  $B$ , we have  $\mu(G) \leq \mu(A) + \mu(B)$ . We will use this fact in the remainder of the article without making reference to it.

**LEMMA 4.** *Let  $G$  be a finite nilpotent group and suppose that  $\mu(H/H') \leq \mu(H)$  for each homomorphic image  $H$  of  $G$  such that  $\mu(H) < \mu(G)$ . If  $G$  has a minimal faithful representation with an abelian transitive constituent, then  $\mu(G/G') \leq \mu(G)$ .*

**PROOF.** Suppose that  $G$  has a minimal faithful representation on a set  $\Omega$  with an abelian transitive constituent  $A = G^\Delta$ , and set  $B = G^{\Omega \setminus \Delta}$ . Then  $\mu(G) = \mu(A) + \mu(B)$ . As  $G$  is a subdirect product of  $A$  and  $B$  and  $A$  is abelian,  $G' = 1 \times B'$ , so  $G/G'$  is a subdirect product of  $A$  and  $B/B'$ . Now  $B$  is a homomorphic image of  $G$  with  $\mu(B) < \mu(G)$ ; so by hypothesis  $\mu(B/B') \leq \mu(B)$ . Hence

$$\mu(G/G') \leq \mu(A) + \mu(B/B') \leq \mu(A) + \mu(B) = \mu(G),$$

as wanted.  $\square$

**PROOF OF THE THEOREM.** Let  $G$  be a finite  $p$ -group with an abelian maximal subgroup  $M$  and assume, for a proof by contradiction, that  $G$  is a counterexample of minimal degree. In particular,  $G$  is nonabelian. By [7, Lemma 1] there exists a faithful representation  $\rho$  of  $G$  on some set  $\Omega$  which not only has minimal degree but is such that each point stabilizer is meet-irreducible. Let  $\Delta$  be an orbit of maximal length  $p^n$  in such a representation  $\rho$ , and set  $\Gamma = \Omega \setminus \Delta$ ,  $A = G^\Delta$  and  $B = G^\Gamma$ . Then  $G$  is a subdirect product of  $A$  and  $B$ , and  $A$  is nonabelian by Lemma 4. As  $B$  has an abelian maximal subgroup as well, minimality of  $\mu(G)$  implies that

$$\mu(B/B') \leq \mu(B) = \mu(G) - p^n. \quad (1)$$

Let  $S$  be the point stabilizer in  $G$  of a point of  $\Delta$ . By our choice of  $\rho$ , this  $S$  is meet-irreducible. By Lemma 4,  $G$  has no abelian transitive constituent, and so  $n \geq 2$ . Finally note that the exponent of  $G$ , and hence of  $G/G'$ , is at most  $p^n$ .

Assume first that  $M$  is not transitive on  $\Delta$ . Then  $A$  satisfies the hypothesis of Lemma 3 and so each section of  $A'$  which is central in  $A$  has order at most  $p$  and

$$\mu(A/A') \leq p^{n-1} + p. \quad (2)$$

Thus if  $G/G'$  were a subdirect product of  $A/A'$  and  $B/B'$ , using (1) and (2) we would get

$$\mu(G/G') \leq \mu(A/A') + \mu(B/B') \leq p^{n-1} + p + \mu(G) - p^n \leq \mu(G),$$

contradicting that  $G$  is a counterexample. Therefore Lemma 1 applies, yielding that  $R/G'$  is isomorphic to a section of  $A'$  that is central in  $A$  and that  $G/L$  is not cyclic.

In particular  $G/R$ , which is easily seen to be a subdirect product of  $A/A'$  and  $B/B'$ , is not the whole direct product of these groups, so

$$\mu(G/R) \leq \mu(A/A') + \mu(B/B') - p. \tag{3}$$

Since sections of  $A'$  which are central in  $A$  have order dividing  $p$ , we have that  $|R/G'| = p$ . So, first by applying Lemma 2 with  $U = G/G'$  and  $V = G/R$  and then by using (3) and (2), we get

$$\begin{aligned} \mu(G/G') &\leq \mu(G/R) + p^n - p^{n-1} \leq \mu(A/A') + \mu(B/B') - p + p^n - p^{n-1} \\ &\leq p^{n-1} + p + \mu(G) - p^n - p + p^n - p^{n-1} = \mu(G), \end{aligned}$$

which is again a contradiction.

Hence  $M$  is transitive on  $\Delta$ . Then  $S$  is not contained in  $M$  and  $|M : M \cap S| = p^n$ . Since  $M$  is an abelian maximal subgroup of  $G$ , we have that  $G = SM$  and  $S \cap M$  is a normal subgroup of  $G$ . Now if the kernel of the action of  $G$  on  $\Delta$ ,  $\text{core}_G(S)$ , were bigger than  $S \cap M$ , then, by maximality of  $M$ , it would be  $\text{core}_G(S) = S$  and we would have that  $A = G/S \cong M/M \cap S$  is abelian, contradicting Lemma 4. Hence  $\text{core}_G(S) = S \cap M$  and  $A = G/S \cap M$ .

Suppose first that  $M/M \cap S$  is not cyclic. Then there exist two subgroups  $S_1, S_2$  such that  $S_1 \cap S_2 = M \cap S$  and  $S_1 S_2 = M$ . In particular, if  $|M : S_1| = p^k$ , then  $1 \leq k \leq n - 1$  and  $|M : S_2| = p^{n-k}$ . Consider the action of  $M$  on the set  $\Omega$  via  $\rho$  and let  $\{K_1, \dots, K_r\}$  be a set of representatives of the point stabilizers of this action, one for each orbit, where we assume  $K_1 = S \cap M$ . Let  $\sigma$  be the representation of  $M$  defined by setting  $\sigma = \rho_{S_1} + \rho_{S_2} + \sum_{i=2}^r \rho_{K_i}$ . Then  $\sigma$  is a faithful representation of  $M$  of degree  $\mu(G) - p^n + p^{n-k} + p^k$ , whence

$$\mu(M) \leq \mu(G) - p^n + p^{n-k} + p^k. \tag{4}$$

By Lemma 2, applied with  $U = G/G'$  and  $V = M/G'$ , we have that

$$\mu(G/G') \leq \mu(M/G') + p^n - p^{n-1}. \tag{5}$$

Observe that  $M$  abelian and  $G' > 1$  imply that

$$\mu(M/G') \leq \mu(M) - p. \tag{6}$$

Hence, using (5), (6) and (4),

$$\begin{aligned} \mu(G/G') &\leq \mu(M/G') + p^n - p^{n-1} \leq \mu(M) - p + p^n - p^{n-1} \\ &\leq \mu(G) - p^n + p^k + p^{n-k} - p + p^n - p^{n-1} \\ &= \mu(G) - (p^{n-k-1} - 1)(p^k - p) \leq \mu(G), \end{aligned}$$

which is a contradiction.

Therefore,  $M/M \cap S$  must be cyclic. Then,  $A = G/M \cap S$  is a nonabelian group with a cyclic maximal subgroup. The structure of nonabelian  $p$ -groups with a cyclic maximal subgroup is well known (see for example [15, 5.3.4]) and shows that  $A/A'$  is either  $C_{p^{n-1}} \times C_p$  or  $C_2 \times C_2$ . In either case  $\mu(A/A') \leq p^{n-1} + p$ , and one obtains a contradiction as in the case when  $M$  is not transitive on  $\Delta$ . This proves the theorem.  $\square$

### Acknowledgement

My interest in this problem dates from the summer of 2001, which I spent at the Australian National University studying with Professor László Kovács. After all these years, I wish to express again my deep gratitude for his help and kind assistance during my stay in Canberra.

### References

- [1] J. D. Dixon and B. Mortimer, *Permutation Groups* (Springer, New York, 1996).
- [2] D. Easdown, 'Minimal faithful permutation and transformation representations of groups and semigroups', *Contemp. Math.* **131** (1992), 75–84.
- [3] D. Easdown and C. E. Praeger, 'On the minimal faithful degree of a finite group', Research Report, School of Mathematics and Statistics, University of Western Australia, 1987.
- [4] D. Easdown and C. E. Praeger, 'On minimal faithful permutation representations of finite groups', *Bull. Aust. Math. Soc.* **38** (1988), 207–220.
- [5] D. L. Flannery, 'The finite irreducible linear 2-groups of degree 4', *Mem. Amer. Math. Soc.* **129**(613) (1997).
- [6] D. F. Holt and J. Walton, 'Representing the quotient group of a finite permutation group', *J. Algebra* **248** (2002), 307–333.
- [7] D. L. Johnson, 'Minimal permutation representations of finite groups', *Amer. J. Math.* **93** (1971), 857–866.
- [8] G. I. Karpilovsky, 'The least degree of a faithful representation of abelian groups', *Vestn. Khar'k. Univ.* **53** (1970), 107–115 (in Russian).
- [9] L. G. Kovács and C. E. Praeger, 'Finite permutation groups with large abelian quotients', *Pacific J. Math.* **136** (1989), 283–292.
- [10] L. G. Kovács and C. E. Praeger, 'On minimal faithful permutation representations of finite groups', *Bull. Aust. Math. Soc.* **62**(2) (2000), 311–317.
- [11] P. M. Neumann, 'Some algorithms for computing with finite permutation groups', in: *Proceedings of Groups–St. Andrews 1985*, London Mathematical Society Lecture Notes, 121 (eds. E. F. Robertson and C. M. Campbell) (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1987), pp. 59–92.
- [12] O. Ore, 'Contributions to the theory of groups of finite order', *Duke Math. J.* **5** (1939), 431–460.
- [13] O. Ore, 'Theory of monomial groups', *Trans. Amer. Math. Soc.* **51** (1942), 15–64.
- [14] A. Powsner, 'Über eine Substitutionsgruppe kleinster Grades, die einer gegebenen Abelschen Gruppe isomorph ist', *Commun. Inst. Sci. Math. et Mécan., Univ. Kharkoff et Soc. Math. Kharkoff*, IV. s. **14** (1937), 151–157 (translated from Russian); Autorreferat, *Zbl.* 0019.15506.
- [15] D. J. S. Robinson, *A Course in the Theory of Groups* (Springer, New York, 1982).
- [16] D. Wright, 'Degrees of minimal embeddings for some direct products', *Amer. J. Math.* **97** (1975), 897–903.

CLARA FRANCHI, Dipartimento di Matematica e Fisica 'Niccolò Tartaglia',  
 Università Cattolica del Sacro Cuore, Via Musei 41, 25121 Brescia, Italy  
 e-mail: [c.franchi@dmf.unicatt.it](mailto:c.franchi@dmf.unicatt.it)