

OFFICIAL JOURNAL OF THE PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE ASSOCIATION

PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE

Volume 68 Number 3 September 2001



Journal of the Philosophy of Science Association

Philosophy of Science

Editorial Board:

Noretta Koertge, Editor-in-Chief
Michael Dickson, Michael Friedman,
and Elisabeth Lloyd, Associate Editors

William Bechtel
Ned Block
Michael Bradie
Robert Brandon
Lindley Darden
John Dupré
James Fetzer
Arthur Fine
Allan Franklin
Peter Gärdenfors
Ron Giere
Clark Glymour
Richard Grandy
Alan Hájek
Gary Hatfield
Geoffrey Hellman

Paul Hoyningen-Huene
Don Howard
David Hull
Paul Humphreys
Gürol Irzik
Jon Jarrett
James Joyce
Muhammad Ali Khalidi
Janet Kourany
Henry Kyburg
Isaac Levi
Helen Longino
Alan Musgrave
Karen Neander
Nancy Nersessian
Ilkka Niiniluoto

John Norton
David Papineau
Itamar Pitowski
Alexander Rosenberg
Michael Ruse
Rose-Mary Sargent
Teddy Seidenfeld
Lawrence Sklar
Brian Skyrms
Miriam Solomon
Kim Sterelny
Steven Stich
Frederick Suppe
Paul Teller
Soshichi Uchii
Bas van Fraassen
Alison Wylie

Assistant Editors: James Mattingly and Anne Mylott

Governing Board of the Association

John Earman, President
Elliott Sober, President-Elect
Richard Jeffrey, Past-President

Harold Brown	David Malament
Jeffrey Bub	Sandra Mitchell
Jeremy Butterfield	Margaret Morrison
Elisabeth Lloyd	James Woodward

Executive Secretary: George Gale

Philosophy of Science

Contents

- 279 *The Impact of Newton's Principia on the Philosophy of Science*
ERNAN McMULLIN
- 311 *Baconian Experimentalism: Comments on McMullin's History of the Philosophy of Science* ROSE-MARY SARGENT
- 319 *Commentary on Ernan McMullin, "The Impact of Newton's Principia on the Philosophy of Science"* JAMES R. VOELKEL
- 327 *Comments on Ernan McMullin's "The Impact of Newton's Principia on the Philosophy of Science"* GEORGE SMITH
- 339 *Response* ERNAN McMULLIN
- 346 *Predictive Similarity and the Success of Science: A Reply to Stanford* STATHIS PSILLOS
- 356 *Preference-Based Arguments for Probabilism* DAVID CHRISTENSEN
- 377 *Post-Structuralist Angst—Critical Notice: John Bickle, Psycho-neural Reduction: The New Wave* RONALD ENDICOTT
- 394 *Genetic Information: A Metaphor In Search of a Theory* PAUL GRIFFITHS

Philosophy of Science (ISSN 0031-8248) is published quarterly in March, June, September, and December by The University of Chicago Press, 1427 E. 60th Street, Chicago, IL 60637.

Periodicals postage paid at Chicago, IL and at additional mailing points.

Postmaster: Send address changes to: *Philosophy of Science*, The University of Chicago Press, P.O. Box 37005, Chicago, IL 60637.

Membership and Subscription Rates

For individuals in the U.S., Canada, Australia, Hong Kong, Japan, New Zealand, and Western Europe, the annual membership in the Philosophy of Science Association, which includes the journal and supplement, is graduated based on income: income below \$40,000 is \$57.00; \$40,000–\$49,999 is \$67.00; \$50,000–\$59,999 is \$77.00; and \$60,000–more is \$87.00. The student rate is \$25.00 (photocopy of valid ID must accompany subscription order). The institutional rate is \$102.00. Canadian residents and institutions add 7% GST. For individuals elsewhere, the rate is \$25.00 and the institutional rate is \$51.00. All institutions outside the U.S. Add \$6.00 for postage. Subscription inquiries should be addressed to: Philosophy of Science, The University of Chicago Press, P.O. Box 37005, Chicago, IL 60637, FAX (773) 753-0811, e-mail: subscriptions@journals.uchicago.edu

Volumes 1–55 available from Periodical Services Co., 11 Main Street, German-town, NY 12526, Phone (518) 537-4700 or FAX (518) 537-5899. Volumes in microfilm available from ProQuest Information and Learning, 300 N. Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor, MI 48106.

Editorial Correspondence

Send all editorial correspondence to *Philosophy of Science*, 123 Goodbody Hall, Indiana University, Bloomington, IN 47405-7005; e-mail: philsci@indiana.edu. Information regarding submission of manuscripts can be found on the inside back cover of every issue or on our website: <http://www.indiana.edu/~philsci>.

Copying Beyond Fair Use

The code on the first page of an article in this journal indicates the copyright owner's consent that copies of the article may be made beyond those permitted by Sections 107 or 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law provided that copies are made only for personal or internal use, or for the personal or internal use of specific clients, and provided that the copier pay the stated per-copy fee through the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC), 22 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. To request permission for other kinds of copying, such as copying for general distribution, for advertising or promotional purposes, for creating new collective works, or for resale, kindly write to Permissions Department, The University of Chicago Press, 1427 E. 60th Street, Chicago, IL 60637.

Articles appearing in *Philosophy of Science* are abstracted or indexed in *Arts and Humanities Citation Index*; *Biological Abstracts*; *Bulletin Signalétique 519*; *Current Contents/Arts and Humanities*; *Current Contents/Social and Behavioral Sciences*; *Current Index to Statistics*; *Humanities Index*; *Index to Book Reviews in the Humanities*; *Isis Critical Bibliography*; *Language & Language Behavior Abstracts*; *Mathematical Reviews*; *Philosopher's Index*; *Philosophie*; *Psychological Abstracts*; *Repertoire Bibliographique de la Philosophie*; *Social Sciences Citation Index*; *Sociological Abstracts*.

© 2001 by the Philosophy of Science Association. All rights reserved.

PSA MEETING 2002: CALL FOR PAPERS

The biennial meeting of the Philosophy of Science Association will be held in Milwaukee, WI on November 7–10. Full information is available at: <http://www.pitt.edu/~psa2002>. Please note the following important deadlines for submissions:

Symposium Proposals are due by November 1st, 2001.

Contributed Papers must be submitted by March 1st, 2002.

PSA ESSAY CONTESTS

Each year the Philosophy of Science Association holds two essay contests, one for graduate students and one for recent Ph.D.s. The financial support for these contests has been made possible by the generosity of past presidents of the PSA.

Graduate Student Contest for 2001. Essays may be on any topic in the philosophy of science and should be submitted to the Editor-in-Chief of *Philosophy of Science* before December 1st, 2001. The prize-winning essay will be published in *Philosophy of Science* and the author will receive \$250.

The essay must be accompanied by a letter from the graduate department certifying that the author is a student in good standing. Co-authored papers are not eligible. Previously published papers are not eligible unless they are scheduled to appear in *Philosophy of Science* during the calendar year 2001. Authors are encouraged to format their essays in accordance with the Instructions for Authors found on the *Philosophy of Science* web site (see <http://www.indiana.edu/~philsci/submit.html>). Authors' names will be removed and the essays will then be judged by a committee of three senior members of the PSA.

Recent Ph.D. Contest for 2001. A prize of \$250 will be awarded to the best article in *Philosophy of Science* written by someone who received the Ph.D. within the last five years. To be eligible for the contest, the paper must have a publication date during the year 2001. Papers in the four regular issues or the special September Proceedings Supplement qualify.

To have an article entered into the competition, the author must supply proof that the Ph.D. Degree was formally awarded between December 1st, 1996 and December 1st, 2001. The deadline for receipt of the affidavit in the Editorial Office is December 1st, 2001. A reprint of the article will then be automatically forwarded to the judges.

Philosophy of Science Information Online

The Philosophy of Science Association maintains a web site at
<http://scistud.umkc.edu/psa>

Many of the papers from the PSA 2000 Conference held in Vancouver are posted there. You may also wish to subscribe to the Electronic Newsletter by following the link to *E-list*.

The web site for the editorial offices of *Philosophy of Science*, including instructions on submitting articles, can be found at
<http://www.indiana.edu/~philsci>

You can join the PSA online, at the University of Chicago Press web site for *Philosophy of Science*
<http://www.journals.uchicago.edu/PHILSCI/home.html>

Some overseas subscribers will find the new rate structure to be quite favorable.

A joint directory of members of the Philosophy of Science Association and History of Science Society can be found at
<http://www.journals.uchicago.edu/HSS-PSA/>

To modify your own entry, please go to the *Update My Record* link.

Now philosophers of science have an on-line pre-print archive
<http://philsci-archive.pitt.edu>