

VOLUME 30

NUMBER 2

APRIL 2021

CQ

---

*Cambridge*

---

*Quarterly of*

---

*Healthcare*

---

*Ethics*

---

*A Quarterly Journal Devoted to  
Engaging a World Community  
of Bioethicists*

**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

The logo features a large, stylized 'CQ' in a serif font, with the 'Q' having a tail that loops back under the 'C'. The letters are black and set against a white background.

**Cambridge**  
**Quarterly of**  
**Healthcare**  
**Ethics**

*A Quarterly  
Journal Devoted  
to Engaging a  
World Community  
of Bioethicists*

EDITORS

Thomasine Kushner, *University of California, Berkeley*  
Steve Heilig, *San Francisco Medical Society*

ASSOCIATE EDITORS

Matti Häyry, *Aalto University, Helsinki, Finland*  
Tuija Takala, *University of Helsinki, Finland*

David C. Thomasma, *Co-Editor, 1992–2002*

EDITORIAL BOARD

Akira Akabayashi, *Kyoto University, Japan*  
William Andereck, *California Pacific Medical Center, San Francisco, USA*  
Martin Buijsen, *Erasmus University, Rotterdam, The Netherlands*  
Arthur Caplan, *NYU Lagone Medical Center, New York, USA*  
Joseph J. Fins, *Weill Medical College of Cornell University, New York, USA*  
Leonard M. Fleck, *Center of Ethics and Humanities, Michigan State University, USA*  
Paul J. Ford, *Cleveland Clinic, USA*  
James Giordano, *Georgetown University Medical Center, USA*  
John Harris, *University of Manchester, United Kingdom*  
David Lawrence, *University of Edinburgh, United Kingdom*  
Gerrit K. Kimsma, *Vrije University of Amsterdam, The Netherlands*  
Guillermo Palchik, *California Pacific Medical Center, USA*  
Rosamond Rhodes, *Mount Sinai School of Medicine, New York, USA*  
Doris Schroeder, *University of Central Lancaster, United Kingdom*  
Pavel Tichschenko, *Institute of Philosophy, Academy of Science, Moscow, Russia*  
Mark R. Wicclair, *University of Pittsburg & West Virginia University, USA*

**The Cambridge Bioethics Education Working Groups: Connecting Bioethics Educators Around the World**

The purpose of the Cambridge Bioethics Education Working Groups is to encourage people and institutions to work together on developing bioethics education in their countries. These focus groups invite others to share their information and develop mutual projects to further how bioethics is taught in universities, hospitals, and for the general public.  
<https://www.cambridge.org/core/journals/cambridge-quarterly-of-healthcare-ethics/cambridge-bioethics-education-working-groups>

CLINICAL NEUROETHICS ADVISORY BOARD

EDITOR

Thomasine Kushner, *University of California, Berkeley*  
[kushnertk@gmail.com](mailto:kushnertk@gmail.com)

ASSOCIATE EDITOR

James Giordano, *Georgetown University Medical Center*

EDITORIAL BOARD

Yves Agid, *Institut du Cerveau et de la Moelle Epinière, France*  
Martin Buijsen, *Erasmus University, Rotterdam, The Netherlands*  
Benjamin Capps, *Dalhousie University, Canada*  
John Danaher, *National University of Ireland, Galway, Ireland*  
Joseph J. Fins, *Weill Medical College of Cornell University, New York, USA*  
Paul J. Ford, *Department of Bioethics, Cleveland Clinic, USA*  
Grant Gillett, *University of Otago Medical School, New Zealand*  
John Harris, *University of Manchester, England*  
Stephen Hauser, *University of California, San Francisco, USA*  
Göran Hermerén, *Lund University, Sweden*  
Judy Illes, *The University of British Columbia, Canada*  
Philipp Kellmeyer, *University of Freiburg Medical Center, Germany*  
Karola Kreitmair, *University of Wisconsin-Madison, USA*  
David Lawrence, *University of Edinburgh, United Kingdom*  
Guillermo Palchik, *California Pacific Medical Center, San Francisco, USA*

Neuroethics Network/Cambridge Consortium for Bioethics Education/International Bioethics Retreat  
<http://www.icmbioethics.com/cambridge-home.html>

# Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics

Volume 30, Number 2, April 2021

## CONTENTS

Contributors	207
<i>Special Section: Decisionmaking and Leadership in Crises and Beyond</i>	
Guest Editorial: Decisionmaking and Leadership in Crises and Beyond TUIJA TAKALA AND MATTI HÄYRY	210
Resuscitating Patient Rights during Pandemic: COVID-19 and the Risks of Resurgent Paternalism JOSEPH J. FINS	215
Return to Status Quo Ante: The Need for Robust and Reversible Pandemic Emergency Measures STEPHEN RAINY AND ALBERTO GIUBILINI	222
Solidarity in the Time of COVID-19? FLORID TOMASINI	234
Emergency Basic Income during the Pandemic JURGEN DE WISPELAERE AND LETICIA MORALES	248
The Cost of Coronavirus Obligations: Respecting the Letter and Spirit of Lockdown Regulations DAVID SHAW	255
Effective Contact Tracing for COVID-19 Using Mobile Phones: An Ethical Analysis of the Mandatory Use of the Aarogya Setu application in India SAURAV BASU	262
Against Personal Ventilator Reallocation JOEL MICHAEL REYNOLDS, LAURA GUIDRY-GRIMES, AND KATIE SAVIN	272
Heartbeats, Burdens, and Biofixtures KELSEY GIPE	285
A Future for Migrants with Acute Heart Problems Seeking Asylum? GÖRAN HERMEREN	297
A Problem of Self-Ownership for Reproductive Justice ELIZABETH LANPHIER	312
Stigmatization of Not-Knowing as a Public Health Tool JOHANN-CHRISTIAN PODER	328

Contents continued

*Contents continued*

Just Better Utilitarianism MATTI HÄYRY	343
Commentary: Liberal Utilitarianism—yes, but for whom? JOONA RÄSÄNEN	368
Commentary: From Justice to the Good? Liberal Utilitarianism, Climate Change and the Coronavirus Crisis HENRIK RYDENFELT	376

*Departments and Columns*

Dissecting Bioethics

Beliefs, Hopes, and Deal Breakers in Research Consent: Dissecting Mathews, Fins, and Racine on the Therapeutic Misconception KENNETH A. RICHMAN	384
--	-----

Organizational Ethics

Incorporating Stakeholder Perspectives on Scarce Resource Allocation: Lessons Learned from Policymaking in a Time of Crisis BETHANY BRUNO, HEATHER MCKEE HURWITZ, MARY BETH MERCER, HILARY MABEL, LAUREN SANKARY, GEORGINA MORLEY, PAUL J. FORD, CRISTIE COLE HORSBURGH, AND SUSANNAH L. ROSE	390
---	-----

*Addendum*

Against Personal Ventilator Reallocation—ADDENDUM JOEL MICHAEL REYNOLDS, LAURA GUIDRY-GRIMES, AND KATIE SAVIN	403
---	-----

EDITORIAL OFFICE: Editorial correspondence, including manuscript submission, should be addressed to Thomasine Kushner, PhD. To facilitate review, please submit manuscripts as electronic copy, preferably in MS Word, to [kushnertk@gmail.com](mailto:kushnertk@gmail.com). Books for review should be sent to Greg Loeben, 2532 N. 4th Street, #442 Flagstaff, AZ 86004. Books for review on neuroethics should be sent to Thomasine Kushner, 1001 Bridgeway #A1, Sausalito, CA 94965.

SUBSCRIPTION INFORMATION: *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* (ISSN 0963-1801) is published quarterly in January, April, July, and October by Cambridge University Press, One Liberty Plaza, Floor 20, New York, NY 10006/Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, UK. Annual subscription rates for volume 30 (2021) USA, Canada, and Mexico/Elsewhere: Institutional rates, print and online: \$714/£444; online only: \$567/£353; print only: \$708/£442. Individual rates, print only: \$148/£90; online only: \$118/£72. Single part: \$204/£127. Students and retirees: \$125/£79. American Society for Bioethics and Humanities members: \$105/£62. Prices include postage. Subscription offices: One Liberty Plaza, Floor 20, New York, NY 10006, USA; outside the USA, Canada, and Mexico: Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, UK. Claims for missing issues should be made immediately after receipt of the next issue. *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* and other Cambridge journals can be found at <http://journals.cambridge.org>.

*Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* is a partner journal of the American Society for Bioethics and Humanities.

Periodicals postage paid at New York, NY and additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER: Send address changes in the USA, Canada, and Mexico to *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics*, Cambridge University Press, One Liberty Plaza, Floor 20, New York, NY 10006, USA. Send address changes elsewhere to *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics*, Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, UK.

© Cambridge University Press 2021. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Policies, request forms, and contacts are available at: <http://www.cambridge.org/rights/permissions/permission.htm>

*Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* is indexed in Index Medicus and in the ASSIA, ISI, MEDLINE, Philosopher's Index, and Proquest databases.

Permission to copy (for users in the USA) is available from Copyright Clearance Center, <http://www.copyright.com>, email: [info@copyright.com](mailto:info@copyright.com).