

Social Philosophy & Policy

29-JUN-1994 BLDSC L523
SOCIAL PHILOSOPHY AND POLICY



8318.129000 VOL 11 PART 2

Property Rights

CONTENTS

DAVID FRIEDMAN	A Positive Account of Property Rights	1
RICHARD A. EPSTEIN	On the Optimal Mix of Private and Common Property	17
DAVID SCHMIDTZ	The Institution of Property	42
A. JOHN SIMMONS	Original-Acquisition Justifications of Private Property	63
JEREMY WALDRON	The Advantages and Difficulties of the Humean Theory of Property	85
JULES L. COLEMAN	Corrective Justice and Property Rights	124
GARY LAWSON	Proving Ownership	139
JAMES TULLY	Aboriginal Property and Western Theory: Recovering a Middle Ground	153
JONATHAN R. MACEY	Property Rights, Innovation, and Constitutional Structure	181
GERALD F. GAUS	Property, Rights, and Freedom	209
ALAN RYAN	Self-Ownership, Autonomy, and Property Rights	241
STEPHEN R. MUNZER	An Uneasy Case against Property Rights in Body Parts	259

Social Philosophy & Policy

ISSN 0265-0525

Editor: Ellen Frankel
Associate Editors: Fred D. Miller and Jeffrey Paul
Managing Editor: Harry Dolan
Social Philosophy and Policy Center

The editors note with deep regret the death of Aaron Wildavsky (on September 4, 1993) and Maurice Cranston (on November 5, 1993). This issue is dedicated to their memory.

Editorial Board

David Braybrooke
University of Texas, Austin

Baruch Brody
Rice University

James Buchanan
*Center for Study of Public Choice,
George Mason University*

Jules Coleman
Yale University

Jack Douglas
*University of California,
San Diego*

Richard Epstein
University of Chicago Law School

James Fishkin
University of Texas, Austin

Antony G.N. Flew
University of Reading (Emeritus)

Charles Fried
Harvard Law School

Martin Golding
Duke University

John Gray
Jesus College, Oxford University

Gilbert Harman
Princeton University

Seymour Martin Lipset
*George Mason University and
Hoover Institution, Stanford University*

Eric Mack
Tulane University

Harvey Mansfield, Jr.
Harvard University

Wallace I. Matson
University of California, Berkeley

Jan Narveson
University of Waterloo

Robert Nozick
Harvard University

Nicholas Rescher
University of Pittsburgh

David Sidorsky
Columbia University

Hillel Steiner
University of Manchester

James Q. Wilson
*University of California,
Los Angeles*

Leland B. Yeager
Auburn University

Social Philosophy & Policy is an interdisciplinary journal with an emphasis on the philosophical underpinnings of enduring social policy debates. Each issue is dedicated to a particular theme chosen by the editors, with the advice of the editorial board, designed to appeal to both academic specialists and a broader scholarly audience. While not primarily a journal of policy prescriptions, several contributions to each issue will typically connect theory with practice. The editors encourage and actively pursue diversity of viewpoints of contributors. Diversity is also encouraged by selecting authors from among different disciplines, especially philosophy, economics, political science, and the law. Readers' suggestions for future themes are always welcome, as are inquiries about the topics of issues already planned.

Editorial Office: Social Philosophy and Policy Center, Bowling Green State University, Bowling Green, OH 43403, USA.

Publishing, Subscription, and Advertising Information: See inside back cover.

Copyright © 1994 Social Philosophy and Policy Foundation

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying or otherwise, without permission in writing from *Social Philosophy & Policy*. Photocopying information for users in the USA: The Item-Fee Code for this publication (0265-0525/94 \$5.00+.00) indicates that copying for internal or personal use beyond that permitted by Sec. 107 or 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law is authorized for users duly registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) Transaction Reporting Service, provided that the appropriate remittance of \$5.00 per article is paid directly to: CCC, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. Specific written permission must be obtained from *Social Philosophy & Policy* for all other copying.

Printed in the United States of America

CONTRIBUTORS

David Friedman is currently Visiting Professor at Cornell Law School. He received his Ph.D. in 1971 from the University of Chicago, and has taught economics at Virginia Polytechnic Institute, the University of California at Irvine, the University of California at Los Angeles, Tulane University, and the University of Chicago. From 1986 to 1993, he was an Olin Fellow in law and economics at University of Chicago Law School. He is the author of *The Machinery of Freedom: Guide to a Radical Capitalism* (1971, 1978, 1989), *Price Theory: An Intermediate Text* (1986, 1990), and numerous articles.

Richard A. Epstein is James Parker Hall Distinguished Service Professor of Law at the University of Chicago. He is the author of *Takings: Private Property and the Power of Eminent Domain* (1985), *Forbidden Grounds: The Case against Employment Discrimination Laws* (1992), and *Bargaining with the State* (1993). He is an editor of the *Journal of Law and Economics* and a member of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences.

David Schmidtz is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Yale University. He is the author of *The Limits of Government: An Essay on the Public Goods Argument* (1991) and *Rational Choice and Moral Agency* (1994). He is a previous contributor to *Social Philosophy & Policy*, and his essays have also appeared in the *Journal of Philosophy* and *Ethics*.

A. John Simmons is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Virginia, where he has taught since 1976, specializing in political, moral, and legal philosophy. He received his Ph.D. in philosophy from Cornell University in 1977. His works include *Moral Principles and Political Obligations* (1979), *The Lockean Theory of Rights* (1992), *On the Edge of Anarchy* (1993), and many articles in philosophy, law, and politics journals and in philosophical encyclopedias. He is an editor of the journal *Philosophy & Public Affairs* and is currently writing a new book on political obligation.

Jeremy Waldron is Professor of Law and Associate Dean at Boalt Hall, and Chair of the Jurisprudence and Social Policy Program, University of California at Berkeley. He has taught at the University of Otago in New Zealand, at Oxford University, and at the University of Edinburgh, and he recently held a visiting appointment in the Ethics and Public Life Program at Cornell University. He has published numerous articles on rights, property, and liberalism, many of which have been collected in *Liberal Rights: Collected Papers 1981–91* (1993). He is the editor of *Theories of Rights* (1984) and *Nonsense upon Stilts: Bentham, Burke, and Marx on the Rights of Man* (1987), and the author of *The Right to Private Property* (1988) and *The*

CONTRIBUTORS

Law (1990). His current research is on the philosophical conceptualization of poverty, need, and homelessness.

Jules L. Coleman is John A. Garver Professor of Jurisprudence and Philosophy at Yale Law School. He is the author of numerous articles and several books, including *Markets, Morals, and the Law* (1988) and *Risks and Wrongs* (1992). He is presently completing an edited collection of five volumes of outstanding essays in legal philosophy to be published by Garland Press in a series edited by Robert Nozick. His current interests include problems relating metaphysical and epistemic objectivity to the nature of legal authority.

Gary Lawson is Associate Professor at Northwestern University School of Law, where he has taught since 1988. He has been a John M. Olin Research Fellow at Yale Law School, a law clerk to Justice Antonin Scalia, an Attorney-Adviser at the Office of Legal Counsel in the United States Department of Justice, and an attorney in private practice. He received his J.D. from Yale Law School in 1983.

James Tully is Professor of Philosophy at McGill University in Montreal, Quebec. He is the author of numerous publications on modern political philosophy and its complex history. He specializes in using studies of the history of political philosophy to throw critical light on assumptions and problems in contemporary political philosophy. Among his recent books are *An Approach to Political Philosophy: Locke in Contexts* (1993) and his critical edition of Samuel Pufendorf's *On the Duty of Man and Citizen* (1991). He is also the editor of *Philosophy in a Pluralistic Age: Critical Perspectives on the Philosophy of Charles Taylor* (1994).

Jonathan R. Macey is J. DuPratt White Professor of Law and Director of the John M. Olin Program in Law and Economics at Cornell University. A graduate of Harvard College and Yale Law School, he served as a law clerk to the Honorable Henry J. Friendly of the U.S. Court of Appeals for the Second Circuit. His research interests lie in the fields of public choice, law and economics, banking, and corporate and securities law. In addition to his teaching at Cornell, he has taught at the University of Chicago, Emory University School of Law, the Stockholm School of Economics, the University of Tokyo, the University of Toronto, and the University of Virginia.

Gerald F. Gaus is Professor of Philosophy and Political Science at the University of Minnesota, Duluth. He was formerly Research Fellow in Philosophy in the Research School of Social Sciences of the Australian National University, and has been Visiting Research Fellow at the University of New England and Visiting Scholar at the Social Philosophy and

CONTRIBUTORS

Policy Center. He is the author of *The Modern Liberal Theory of Man* (1983) and *Value and Justification* (1990), and the coeditor, with Stanley Benn, of *Public and Private in Social Life* (1983). He is currently completing a book entitled *Justificatory Liberalism*.

Alan Ryan is Professor of Politics at Princeton University. He was until 1988 Fellow and Tutor in Politics and Reader in Politics at New College, Oxford University. He is the author of *Property and Political Theory* (1984), *Property* (1987), and *Bertrand Russell: A Political Life* (1988), and has just finished a study of John Dewey's contribution to twentieth-century liberalism.

Stephen R. Munzer is Professor of Law at the University of California at Los Angeles. After graduating from the University of Kansas in 1966, he completed a B.Phil. in philosophy at Oxford University in 1969 and received a J.D. degree from Yale Law School in 1972, where he was executive editor of the *Yale Law Journal*. He has practiced law at Covington & Burling in Washington, D.C., taught philosophy at Rutgers University, and taught law at the University of Minnesota. He is the author of *A Theory of Property* (1990).