

Mid-century modernism
John Tuomey on Ronchamp
Mies's plinths

arq
architectural research quarterly

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS



Editor-in-Chief **Adam Sharr**
E. adam.sharr@ncl.ac.uk

Editor-at-Large **Richard Weston**
E. richard@richardwestonstudio.com

Editors **Samuel Austin**
E. samuel.austin@ncl.ac.uk

Martin Beattie
E. martin.beattie@ncl.ac.uk

Neil Burford
E. neil.burford@ncl.ac.uk

Rachel Cruise
E. r.b.cruise@lboro.ac.uk

Graham Farmer
E. graham.farmer@ncl.ac.uk

Zeynep Kezer
E. zeynep.kezer@ncl.ac.uk

Katie Lloyd Thomas
E. katie.lloyd-thomas@ncl.ac.uk

Juliet Odgers
E. juliet.odgers@ncl.ac.uk

Stephen Parnell
E. stephen.parnell@ncl.ac.uk

Editors **Ruth Lang**
Reviews + Insight E. r.lang2@ncl.ac.uk

Edward Wainwright
E. edward.wainwright@ncl.ac.uk

Editorial Assistant **Alex Blanchard**
E. arq@ncl.ac.uk

Art Editor + Design **Angela Ashton**
E. design@angelaashton.co.uk

Editorial Board **Simon Allford** Allford Hall Monaghan Morris, UK
Andrew Ballantyne Newcastle University, UK
Mark Burry Swinburne University, Australia
Carlos Eduardo Comas Universidade Federal do Rio Grande do Sul, Brazil
Richard Coyne The University of Edinburgh, UK
Peggy Deamer Yale University, USA
Susannah Hagan University of Westminster, UK
Francine Houben Mecanoo, Holland
Susanne Hofmann Die Baupiloten, TU Berlin, Germany
Louisa Hutton Sauerbruch Hutton, Germany
Mari Hvattum The Oslo School of Architecture and Design, Norway
Timothy W. Hyde MIT, USA
Momoyo Kaijima Atelier Bow-Wow, Japan
Silke Kapp Universidade Federal de Minas Gerais, Brazil
Ulrika Karlsson KTH, Sweden
David Leatherbarrow University of Pennsylvania, USA
Lesley Lokko University of Johannesburg, South Africa
Mary McLeod University of Columbia, USA
Steven A. Moore The University of Texas at Austin, USA
Michael Ostwald University of New South Wales, Australia
Simo Paavilinen Aalto University, Finland
Jane Rendell Bartlett School of Architecture, UCL, UK
Daniel Rosbottom TU Delft, Holland
Andreas Rumpfhuber Expanded Design, Austria
Simon Sadler University of California, Davis, USA
Flora Samuel University of Reading, UK
Jonathan Sergison Sergison Bates Architects, UK
Despina Stratigakos University at Buffalo, USA
Koen Steemers University of Cambridge, UK
John Tuomey O'Donnell + Tuomey, Ireland
Sarah Wigglesworth Sarah Wigglesworth Architects, UK
Jianfei Zhu The University of Melbourne, Australia

arq: Architectural Research Quarterly (issn 1359-1355) is published four times a year in March, June, September and December. Four parts form a volume. The subscription price which includes print and electronic access (but excluding vat) of volume 23 is £345.00 (US \$579.00 in USA, Canada and Mexico) for institutions; £59.00 (US \$91.00 in USA, Canada and Mexico) for individuals and £42.00 (US \$71.00 in USA, Canada and Mexico) for students, which includes print only, ordering direct from the publishers and certifying that the journal is for their personal use. Single parts are £99.00 net (US \$160.00 in USA, Canada and Mexico) plus postage. EU subscribers (outside the UK) who are not registered for vat should add vat at their country's rate. vat registered members should provide their vat registration number. Japanese prices for institutions (including ASP delivery) are available from Kinokuniya Company Ltd, P.O. Box 55, Chitose, Tokyo 156, Japan. Orders which must be accompanied by payment, may be sent to a bookseller, subscription agent or direct to the publisher: Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, UK; or in the USA, Canada and Mexico: Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, 1 Liberty Plaza, Floor 20, New York, NY 10006, USA. Copies of the journal for subscribers in the USA, Canada and Mexico are sent by air to New York to arrive with minimum delay.

Copying

The journal is registered with the Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, USA. Organizations in the USA who are also registered with C.C.C may therefore copy material (beyond the limits permitted by sections 107 and 108 of U.S. Copyright law) subject to payment to C.C.C. of the per-copy fee of \$16. This consent does not extend to multiple copying for promotional or commercial purposes. Code 1359-1355/2019/\$16.

ISI Tear Sheet Service, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104, USA, is authorized to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only.

Organizations authorized by the Copyright Licensing Agency may also copy material subject to the usual conditions.

For all other use, permission should be sought from Cambridge or from the American Branch of Cambridge University Press.

Information on **arq: Architectural Research Quarterly** and all other Cambridge journals can be accessed via <http://www.journals.cambridge.org/>

This journal issue has been printed on FSC-certified paper and cover board. FSC is an independent, non-governmental, not-for-profit organization established to promote the responsible management of the world's forests. Please see www.fsc.org for information.

© Cambridge University Press 2019

Printed in the UK by Bell & Bain Ltd, Glasgow

COVER
A collection of samples, fragments, and offcuts from material resellers based around the UK assembled by ROTOR for an exhibition at the Architectural Association in December 2018. See pp. 90–96.

leader	3	Taking measure of mid-century modernism
obituary	4	Florian Beigel: 1941–2018 Elizabeth B. Hatz
criticism	8	Bringing Heaven down to Earth: Reading the plan of Ronchamp John Tuomey reflects on how the plan of Le Corbusier’s Chapel at Ronchamp is open and incomplete, like a frayed edge which allows us to examine how carefully its fabric is woven.
theory	21	Von Ledoux bis Mies: The Modern plinth as isolating element Tahl Kaminer studies the function of the modern plinth, which posits the building as a singularity through elevation and isolation, consequently facilitating autonomous architecture.
history	33	Henry Klumb: Puerto Rico’s Critical Modernist César Cruz examines how the German-Puerto Rican architect Henry Klumb adapted aspects of modern architecture into a more humane, environmentally and culturally sensitive enterprise.
	47	A new materiality in praise of the ordinary, in Palestine-Israeli c.1940–1966 Daphna E. Half identifies and examines a new style in Israeli architecture, c.1940–1966, which was driven by a rationalist approach and a cultural appeal to modesty, frugality and ordinariness.
	63	Can’t Touch This Amy Clarke, Stuart King, Andrew Leach and Wouter Van Acker consider the on-going existence of southeast Queensland’s post-war fibro beach architecture, explored in terms of the nostalgic, preservationist impulses of recent initiatives including the <i>Fibro Coast</i> exhibition.
practice	73	Mediating production, teaching, and research: The role of University-run design institutes in Chinese architectural practice Guanghui Ding and Charlie Q.L. Xue explore the mediation between production, teaching and research in China’s university-run design institutes, transforming these activities into a sophisticated project in the context of a market economy.
review	87	John Ruskin and the Fabric of Architecture by Anuradha Chatterjee Reviewed by Timothy Brittain-Catlin
insight	90	Building and demolition waste in the UK ROTOR
subscribe		A subscription form, which may be copied, can be found on page 2 of this issue