

# THE BULLETIN OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC

## Edited by

Frank Wagner, *Managing Editor*

Laurent Bienvenu      James Cummings

Patricia Blanchette      Paola D'Aquino

Andrea Cantini      Leonid Libkin

Thierry Coquand

## Reviews Editors

Ernest Schimmerling, *Managing Editor for Reviews*

Mark van Atten      Steffen Lempp

Benno van den Berg      Bernard Linsky

Thomas Colcombet      Antonio Montalbán

Samuel Coskey      Rahim Moosa

Bradd Hart      Christian Retoré

## Thesis Abstracts Editor

Christian Rosendal

VOLUME 24 • 2018 • ISSN 1079-8986

Copyright © 2018 by the Association for Symbolic Logic. All rights reserved.  
Reproduction by photostat, photo-print, microfilm, or like process by permission only.



PUBLISHED BY CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS FOR  
AND ON BEHALF OF THE ASSOCIATION OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC.

## CONTENTS OF VOLUME 24

### ARTICLES

DOWNEY, ROD and GREENBERG, NOAM. A hierarchy of computably enumerable degrees ....	53
GREENBERG, NOAM. see DOWNEY, ROD	
GREENBERG, NOAM and see TURETSKY, DAN. Strong jump-traceability .....	147
KJOS-HANSEN, BJØRN. Permutations of the integers induce only the trivial automorphism of the Turing degrees.....	165
PISTONE, PAOLO. Polymorphism and the obstinate circularity of second order logic: A victims' tale .....	1
OLIVER, ALEX and SMILEY, TIMOTHY. Cantorian set theory .....	393
PLATO, JAN VON. Kurt Gödel's first steps in logic: Formal proofs in arithmetic and set theory through a system of natural deduction .....	319
TURETSKY, DAN. see GREENBERG, NOAM	
SANDQVIST, TOR. Preservation of structural properties in intuitionistic extensions of an inference relation .....	291
SMILEY, TIMOTHY. See OLIVER, ALEX	
WELCH, PHILIP D. The Ramified Analytical Hierarchy using extended logics.....	306

### COMMUNICATIONS

PALMGREN, ERIK. A constructive examination of a Russell-style ramified type theory .....	90
--	----

### IN MEMORIAM

In Memoriam: Mati Rubin, 1946–2017 .....	181
In Memoriam: Vladimir Voevodsky, 1966–2017 .....	186

### REVIEWS

CHERNIKOV, ARTEM. Model theory, Keisler measures and groups .....	336
CUMMINGS, JAMES. Alexander Razborov, <i>Flag algebras</i> .....	107
DIAS, RODRIGO R. B. Tsaban, <i>Algebra, Selections and Additive Ramsey Theory</i> .....	179
GAN, NATHANIEL. J. Azzouni, <i>Ontology without Borders</i> .....	177
HIRST, JEFFRY. L. J. Stillwell, <i>Reverse Mathematics: Proofs from the Inside Out</i> .....	176
KWIATKOWSKA, ALEKSANDRE. Andrew Marks and Spencer Unger, <i>Borel circle squaring</i> ....	452
RIZZA, DAVIDE. Ø. Linnebo, <i>Philosophy of Mathematics</i> .....	175

### THESIS ABSTRACTS

ABDUL-QUADER, ATHAR. <i>Interstructure Lattices and Types of Peano Arithmetic</i> , The Graduate Center, City University of New York, USA, 2017. Supervised by Roman Kossak .....	202
ADOLF, DOMINIK THOMAS. <i>On the Strength of PFA(<math>\aleph_2</math>) in Conjunction with a Precipitous Ideal on <math>\omega_1</math> and Namba-Like Forcings on Successors of Regular Cardinals</i> , WWU Muenster, 2013. Supervised by Ralf Schindler .....	456
AMEEN, ZANYAR ANWER. <i>Finitely Additive Measures on Topological Spaces and Boolean Algebras</i> , University of East Anglia, UK, 2015. Supervised by Mirna Dzamonja.....	199
ANTOS, CAROLIN. <i>Foundations of Higher-Order Forcing</i> , University of Vienna, 2015. Supervised by Sy-David Friedman .....	457
APPLEBY, JAMES FIROZE. <i>Choice Sequences and Knowledge States: Extending the Notion of Finite Information to Produce a Clearer Foundation for Intuitionistic Analysis</i> , Keele University, UK, 2017. Supervised by Peter Fletcher .....	196
BOBKOV, ANTON. <i>Computations of Vapnik–Chervonenkis Density in Various Model-Theoretic Structures</i> , University of California, Los Angeles, 2017. Supervised by Matthias Aschenbrenner .....	459

BONEY, WILL. <i>Advances in Classification Theory for Abstract Elementary Classes</i> , Carnegie Mellon University, 2014. Supervised by Rami Grossberg .....	454
CALDERONI, FILIPPO. <i>A Descriptive View of the Bi-embeddability Relation</i> , Universita degli Studi di Torino, Italy, 2018. Supervised by Luca Motto Ros .....	462
CARROY, RAPHAËL. <i>Functions of the first Baire class</i> , Université Paris 7 – Denis Diderot & Université de Lausanne, France, 2013. Supervised by Olivier Finkel and Jacques Duparc .....	462
CHEN, WILLIAM. <i>Some Results on Tight Stationarity</i> , University of California, Los Angeles, USA, 2016. Supervised by Itay Neeman .....	198
DEMEY, LORENZ. <i>Believing in Logic and Philosophy</i> , KU Leuven, Belgium, 2014. Supervised by Stefaan Cuypers .....	201
FREUND, ANTON. <i>Type-two well-ordering principles, admissible sets, and <math>\Pi_1^1</math>-comprehension</i> , University of Leeds, UK, 2018. Supervised by Michael Rathjen .....	460
FRITTAION, EMANUELE. <i>Reverse Mathematics and Partial Orders</i> , University of Udine, Italy, 2014. Supervised by Alberto Marcone .....	196
GOMES, EVANDRO LUIS. <i>Sobre a história da paraconsistência e a obra de da Costa: a instauração da Lógica Paraconsistente [On the history of paraconsistency and da Costa's work: the establishment of paraconsistent logic]. (December, 2013). 535p + appendixes. Philosophy Ph.D., Institute of Philosophy and Human Sciences and Centre for Logic, Epistemology and the History of Sciences, The University of Campinas, Campinas, São Paulo, Brazil, 2013. Supervised by Itala M. Loffredo D'Ottaviano .....</i>	464
HARRISON-TRAINOR, MATTHEW. <i>The Complexity of Countable Structures</i> , University of California, Berkeley, CA, USA, 2017. Supervised by Antonio Montalbán .....	465
IBARLUCÍA, TOMÁS. <i>Model Theory Methods for Topological Groups</i> , Université de Lyon, 2016. Supervised by Itai Ben Yaacov .....	455
KOULAKIS, MARIOS. <i>Coding into Inner Models at the Level of Strong Cardinals</i> , University of Münster, 2015. Supervised by Ralf Schindler .....	456
MONTOYA, DIANA CAROLINA. <i>Some Cardinal Invariants of the Generalized Baire Spaces</i> , Universitat Wien, Austria, 2017. Supervised by Sy-David Friedman .....	197
MULLER (formerly UHLENBROCK), SANDRA. <i>Pure and Hybrid Mice with Finitely Many Woodin Cardinals from Levels of Determinacy</i> , Westfälische Wilhelms-Universität Münster, Germany, 2016. Supervised by Ralf-Dieter Schindler.....	198
PAOLINI, GIANLUCA. <i>Independence in Model Theory and Team Semantics</i> , University of Helsinki, Finland, 2016. Supervised by Tapani Hyttinen and Juoko Väänänen .....	461
PAWLIUK, MICHAEL. <i>Amenability and Unique Ergodicity of the Automorphism Groups of All Countable Homogeneous Directed Graphs</i> , University of Toronto, Canada, 2015. Supervised by Vladimir Pestov and Stevo Todorćević .....	200
THAMRONGTHANYALAK, ATHIPAT. <i>Extensions and Smooth Approximations of Definable Functions in <math>O</math>-minimal Structures</i> , University of California, Los Angeles, 2013. Supervised by Matthias Aschenbrenner .....	459
TSERUNYAN, ANUSH. <i>Finite Generators for Countable Group Actions; Finite Index Pairs of Equivalence Relations; Complexity Measures for Recursive Programs</i> , University of California at Los Angeles, 2013. Supervised by Alexander S. Kechris and Itay Neeman .....	457
VASEY, SEBASTIEN. <i>Superstability and Categoricity in Abstract Elementary Classes</i> . Carnegie Mellon University, USA, 2017. Supervised by Rami Grossberg .....	193
VIGNATI, ALESSANDRO. <i>Logic and <math>C^*</math>-Algebras: Set Theoretical Dichotomies in the Theory of Continuous Quotients</i> , York University, Toronto, Canada, 2017. Supervised by Ilijas Farah.....	194
WALSBERG, ERIK. <i>Metric Geometry in a Tame Setting</i> , University of California, Los Angeles, 2015. Supervised by Matthias Aschenbrenner.....	460
WESOLEK, PHILLIP. <i>The Global Structure of Totally Disconnected Locally Compact Polish Groups</i> , The University of Illinois at Chicago, USA, 2014. Supervised by Christian Rosendal.....	200

ZAMORA, RAFAEL. <i>Separation Problems of Analytic Relations (Problèmes de séparation des relations analytiques)</i> , Université Pierre et Marie Curie, France, 2015. Supervised by Dominique Lecomte .....	202
ZIELINSKI, JOSEPH. <i>Compact Structures in Descriptive Classification Theory</i> , University of Illinois at Chicago, 2016. Supervised by Christian Rosendal .....	458

MEETINGS OF THE ASSOCIATION FOR SYMBOLIC LOGIC

2016–17 Winter Meeting of the Association for Symbolic Logic, Hyatt Regency Atlanta and Marriott Atlanta Marquis, Atlanta, GA, USA, January 6–7, 2017 .....	109
2017 North American Annual Meeting of the Association for Symbolic Logic, Boise State University Boise, ID, USA, March 20–23, 2017 .....	119
2017 Spring Meeting of the Association for Symbolic Logic, Westin Seattle, Seattle, Washington, USA, April 12–13, 2017 .....	204
2017 European Summer Meeting of the Association for Symbolic Logic Logic Colloquium '17, Stockholm, Sweden, August 14–20, 2017 .....	211
The 2017 Annual Conference of the Australasian Association for Logic, University of Adelaide, Australia, July 6–7, 2017 .....	278
17th Latin American Symposium on Mathematical Logic (SLALM 2017), Puebla, Puebla, México, June 26–30, 2017 .....	340
2018 Winter Meeting of The Association for Symbolic Logic, Savannah Convention Center, Savannah, Georgia, USA, January 3–6, 2018 .....	377
Eleventh Panhellenic Logic Symposium (PLS 11, 2017), Delphi, Greece, July 12–16, 2017 .....	384
24th Workshop on Logic, Language, Information, and Computation (WOLLIC 2017), London, UK, July 18–21, 2017 .....	386
Fifteenth Asian Logic Conference, An Official Meeting of the Association for Symbolic Logic, National Institute for Mathematical Sciences, Daejeon, South Korea, July 10–14, 2017 .....	467
2017–2018 Winter Meeting of the Association for Symbolic Logic, San Diego Convention Center and Marriott Marquis San Diego Marina, San Diego, CA, January 12–13, 2018 .....	484
2018 North American Annual Meeting of the Association for Symbolic Logic, Western Illinois University, Macomb, IL, USA, May 16–19, 2018 .....	493

MEETINGS SPONSORED BY THE ASSOCIATION FOR SYMBOLIC LOGIC

13th Computability in Europe Conference (CIE 2017) Unveiling Dynamics and Complexity, Co-Sponsored by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Turku, Finland, June 12–16, 2017 .....	526
VIII Conference and III School on Topology, Algebra, and Categories in Logic (TACL), 2017, Co-Sponsored by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Prague and Olomouc, Czech Republic, June 20–30, 2017 .....	527
Model Theory in Wrocław 2017, Co-Sponsored by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Wrocław, Poland, 30 June–2 July, 2017 .....	529
Model Theory, Co-Sponsored by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Będlewo, Poland, July 2–8, 2017 .....	530
29th European Summer School, In Logic, Language, and Information, (ESSLLI 2017), Co-Sponsored by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Toulouse, France, July 17–28, 2017 .....	532
Hilbert–Bernays Summer School on Logic and Computation 2017, Co-Sponsored by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Göttingen, Germany, July 23–29, 2017 .....	534
14th International Conference on Computability and Complexity in Analysis, Co-Sponsored by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Daejeon, Republic of Korea, July 24–27, 2017 .....	535

Model Theory of Operator Algebras: Workshop and Conference, Co-Sponsored by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Irvine, California, September 20–24, 2017 .....	536
Tableaux 2017 / Fricos 2017 / ITP 2017, Co-Sponsored by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Brasilia, Brazil, September 25–29, 2017.....	537
Trimester on Model Theory, Combinatorics, and Valued Fields, Co-Sponsored by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Institut Henri Poincaré, Paris, France, January 8–April 6, 2018.....	539
Logical Foundations of Computer Science 2018, Co-Sponsored by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Deerfield Beach, Florida, USA, January 8–11, 2018.....	543
Ouroboros: Workshop on Formal Criteria of Self-Reference in Mathematics and Philosophy, Co-Sponsored by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Bonn, Germany, February 16–18, 2018.....	544
Workshop on Computability Theory and Its Applications 2018, Co-Sponsored by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Waterloo, Canada, June 4–8, 2018 .....	546
The Tenth Scandinavian Logic Symposium (SLS 2018), Co-Sponsored by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Gothenburg, Sweden, June 11–13, 2018 .....	547
25th Workshop on Logic, Language, Information, and Computation (WOLLIC 2018), Co-Sponsored by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Bogotá, Colombia, July 24–27, 2018.....	548
CIE 2018: Sailing Routes in the World of Computation, Co-Sponsored by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Kiel, Germany, July 31–August 3, 2018.....	550
Association for Symbolic Logic, Council Members, Committees, and Representatives for 2018.....	551
Notices .....	141, 283, 388, 557

THE BULLETIN OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC (ISSN print: 1079–8986, ISSN online: 1943–5894) is published quarterly, in the months of March, June, September, and December, by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Inc., Department of Mathematics, University of Connecticut, 341 Mansfield Road, U-1009, Storrs, CT 06269-1009, USA. Periodicals postage is paid at Storrs CT and at additional mailing offices. The BULLETIN is distributed with THE JOURNAL OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC. The 2018 annual subscription price for the two journals, in either print or electronic form, is US\$884 or £555; the print/electronic bundle prices are \$985 or £619: <http://journals.cambridge.org/bsl> for more information. **Postmaster:** Send address changes to **Journals Customer Services Department, Cambridge University Press, One Liberty Plaza, New York, NY 10006, USA**. Business correspondence should be sent to the Secretary-Treasurers of the Association, Russell Miller and David Solomon (address below).

Subscription orders for the JOURNAL and BULLETIN, or REVIEW should be sent to [subscriptions\\_newyork@cambridge.org](mailto:subscriptions_newyork@cambridge.org). All orders must be accompanied by payment by check, credit card (Visa, MasterCard, JCB or American Express only), or debit card. To receive a replacement copy of the BULLETIN, please report damaged, defective or missing issues within nine months of the date of publication.

Volumes 1 through 19 of the BULLETIN are available online at JSTOR: volumes 1 through 23 via Cambridge University Press, <http://journals.cambridge.org/bsl> – access to the latter is free to members.

*Individual* membership in the Association is open to anyone interested in its work. Annual dues for members are US\$102, £78 sterling or €85 (\$51, £39 sterling or €43 for student, emeritus and unemployed members; see <http://www.aslonline.org/membership-individual.html> for more information, including conditions and privileges). Dues include subscriptions to the current volumes of the JOURNAL, the BULLETIN, and the REVIEW.

*Institutional* membership in the Association is available to any academic institution or department. Annual institutional membership dues for 2018 are US\$1200 (full) or \$760 (basic); privileges include choices of current subscriptions, back volumes, regular individual and student memberships.

Requests for information, applications for *new* membership, renewals of institutional membership, business correspondence, and notices or announcements for publication in the BULLETIN should be sent to **ASL, Department of Mathematics, University of Connecticut, 341 Mansfield Road, U-1009, Storrs, CT 06269-1009, USA**. The electronic mail address of the Association's business office is [asl@uconn.edu](mailto:asl@uconn.edu). Requests for back issues should be sent to **Cambridge University Press**, address above.

Individual membership *renewals*, notices of change of address, and dues payments, should be sent to **Association for Symbolic Logic, c/o Journals Customer Services Department, Cambridge University Press, One Liberty Plaza, New York, NY 10006, USA**, [USmemberservices@cambridge.org](mailto:USmemberservices@cambridge.org).

The paper used in the BULLETIN is acid-free and falls within the guidelines established to ensure permanence and stability.

The BULLETIN has been registered with the Copyright Clearance Center, Inc. The appearance of a code at the bottom of the first page of an article indicates the copyright owner's consent for copying beyond that permitted by Sections 107 or 108 of the US Copyright Law, provided that the per-copy fee stated in the code is paid directly to **Copyright Clearance Center Inc., 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, USA**. This consent does not extend to copying for general distribution, for advertising or promotion purposes, for creating new collective works, or for resale. Specific written permission for such copying must be obtained from the Association.

**Cambridge Core**

For further information about this journal  
please go to the journal web site at:  
[cambridge.org/bsl](https://doi.org/10.1017/bsl.2018.90)

**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS