

## REVIEWS



## BOOKS

*Eighteenth-Century Music* 6/1 © 2009 Cambridge University Press  
doi:10.1017/S1478570609001754 Printed in the United Kingdom

BIANCA MARIA ANTOLINI, CONSTANTINO MASTROPRIMIANO, EDS  
*MUZIO CLEMENTI: COMPOSITORE, (FORTE)PIANISTA, EDITORE. ATTI DEL CONVEGNO INTERNAZIONALE DI STUDI, PERUGIA, CONSERVATORIO DI MUSICA, 4–6 OTTOBRE 2002, IN COLLABORAZIONE CON LA SOCIETÀ ITALIANA DI MUSICOLOGIA*  
Lucca: Libreria Musicale Italiana, 2006  
Strumenti della Ricerca Musicale 9  
pp. x + 342, ISBN 978 88 7096 439 4

RICHARD BÖSEL, MASSIMILIANO SALA, EDS  
*MUZIO CLEMENTI: COSMOPOLITA DELLA MUSICA. ATTI DEL CONVEGNO INTERNAZIONALE IN OCCASIONE DEL 250<sup>o</sup> ANNIVERSARIO DELLA NASCITA (1752–2002), ROMA, 4–6 DICEMBRE 2002*  
Bologna: Ut Orpheus Edizioni, 2004  
Quaderni Clementiani 1  
pp. xi + 236, ISBN 978 88 8109 450 9

Muzio Clementi is a composer whose claim on our attention has not been guaranteed at all times and in all places. Nevertheless, the 1990s saw the inception of an edition of his complete works, the first of its kind, and in 2002 the two hundred and fiftieth anniversary of his birth provided a further boost to our interest in the composer, resulting in the publication of two important volumes: Anselm Gerhard's monograph *London und der Klassizismus in der Musik: Die Idee der 'absoluten Musik' und Muzio Clementis Klavierwerke* (Stuttgart: Metzler, 2002) (reviewed by Michael Spitzer in *Eighteenth-Century Music* 3/2 (2006), 330–336), and a collection of studies of various aspects of Clementi's life and works under the title *Muzio Clementi: Studies and Prospects* (Bologna: Ut Orpheus, 2002) (reviewed by Susan Wollenberg in *Eighteenth-Century Music* 2/1 (2005), 138–140), intended to complement the edition of the complete works. Last but not least, two conferences in Clementi's honour were held in Italy in October and December 2002, the first in Perugia, organized by the Conservatorio di Musica di Perugia, and the second in Rome (the composer's birthplace), organized by the Istituto Storico Austriaco in cooperation with the Società Italiana di Musicologia (hereafter, the two conferences may at times be referred to as *Perugia* and *Rome*).

Rather than attempting to focus on a single aspect of Clementi's life and work, both gatherings addressed a range of topics: the Perugia conference, with its subtitle 'Compositore, (forte)pianista, editore', emphasized Clementi's versatility, while the Roman conference, subtitled 'Cosmopolita della musica' (Musical Cosmopolitan), highlighted the composer's international career. The published proceedings provide a rare opportunity to compare two more or less simultaneous events that shared roughly the same goals (the 2002 *Studies and Prospects* volume is also mentioned in the present review wherever comparison is applicable). In the Perugia volume, Italian-language contributions dominate, with just a few in English, but in the Roman proceedings, the languages are more or less equally divided (as they are in *Studies and Prospects*). No single speaker/author has contributed to both volumes, but it is striking that nine of the thirteen speakers at the



Rome conference also offered pieces to *Studies and Prospects*, whereas at Perugia only one of the eleven speakers did so.

While the subtitles of the two conferences promise different perspectives on Clementi's life and work, the published volumes do not fully deliver. If the respective contributions are divided into four categories – 'biographical', 'analytical', 'diffusion/reception' and 'influence (from and on)' – it can be seen that both volumes have articles in all four groups (and the same is true of the twenty-five articles in *Studies and Prospects*). Both conferences, therefore, addressed the full range of subjects that obviously exist around Clementi; they simply presented them from different perspectives. In fact, the subtitles could easily be interchanged. Table 1 presents the contents of the two conference reports and of *Studies and Prospects* divided into the categories mentioned above ('biographical' itself is subdivided further). The contributions are identified by the author's surname together with a single keyword for the article described. (The choice of keywords and the classification of the articles may appear arbitrary, but the overall categorization, I believe, is sound.)

The Perugia report has no formal grouping of articles. While the order may not be accidental, it certainly does not reflect the subtitle of the book. Contributions about Clementi as publisher and as published composer open the volume and are followed by analytical studies, mostly of the piano works. The Rome report arranges the contributions into four categories, headed respectively 'Muzio Clementi nel 250° anniversario della nascita', 'Clementi: un romano a Londra', 'L'altro Clementi' and 'Clementi e la "Wiener Klassik"'. The four headings all precede studies of various kinds.

Biographical studies are relatively scarce in both reports. In the Rome volume, Eva Badura-Skoda sketches Clementi's personality, and Alberto Iesù summarizes what is known about the composer's musical education up to and including his move to England with Peter Beckford. David Rowland (*Rome*) describes the beginnings of Clementi's career as a music publisher in London in the 1790s, while David Wyn Jones (*Perugia*) presents a more general overview of his publishing activities. Clementi was not the sole publisher of his own music; many works were reprinted by other publishers, both during his lifetime and, especially, after his death. Bianca Maria Antolini (*Perugia*) discusses the diffusion of Clementi's works in the nineteenth-century music trade, and Rupert Ridgewell (*Perugia*) focuses on a twentieth-century collection that contains many of the composer's works, that of the late Alan Tyson. Roberto Illiano's essay (*Rome*) is a general and reasoned plea for musicologists to revise Tyson's *Thematic Catalogue of the Works of Muzio Clementi* (Tutzing: Schneider, 1967).

Analytical studies make up the largest group in both volumes, with six articles in the Perugia report and seven in the Roman. Further distinctions can also be made. Leon Plantinga deals with the composer's entire oeuvre in his essay about 'les trois styles' (early, middle and late). Some authors focus on specific genres: the accompanied keyboard sonata (Silvia Faregna, *Perugia*), chamber music (Dorothy de Val, *Rome*) and orchestral works (Massimiliano Sala, *Rome*). Others deal with specific analytical aspects, such as Adagio movements (Maria Grazia Sità, *Perugia*), recapitulations (Giorgio Sanguinetti, *Perugia*), counterpoint (Marino Pessina, *Perugia*) and canon (Rohan Stewart-MacDonald, *Rome*). Still others discuss specific works or groups of works, as, for example, Viennese sonatas (Otto Biba, *Rome*), *Gradus ad Parnassum* (Mastroprimiano, *Perugia*) and *Practical Harmony* (Andrea Coen, *Rome*). Galliano Ciliberti's essay on the Symphonies Op. 18 (*Perugia*) combines analytical aspects with aspects of diffusion.

One work by Clementi, the Sonata Op. 50 No. 3, 'Didone abbandonata', is discussed in both conference reports, by Alessandro Mastropietro (*Perugia*) and Anselm Gerhard (*Rome*). A comparison of these contributions is enlightening: they show both overlaps and differences. Each author looks for external correspondences for this sonata, a search guided by its 'programmatic' title. Mastropietro draws parallels with works by other composers that deal with the theme of the abandoned Dido, such as Tartini's sonata with the same nickname and Henry Purcell's *Dido and Aeneas*, and also with works by Clementi himself that display similar musical attributes, such as the Sonatas Op. 40 No. 2, Op. 47 No. 2 and Op. 50 No. 2. Mastropietro calls the 'Didone abbandonata' a 'sonata caratteristica' rather than programme music, and makes a comparison with Beethoven's Sonata Op. 81a, 'Les Adieux'. Gerhard, meanwhile, looks for parallels



Table 1 Contents, by theme, of the published proceedings of the Clementi conferences held in Perugia and Rome in 2002, and of *Muzio Clementi: Studies and Prospects* (2002)

Category	Perugia	Rome	<i>Studies and Prospects</i>
BIOGRAPHICAL			
General/various	Ridgewell (Tyson Collection)	Badura-Skoda (Personality) Illiano (Thematic catalogue)	Plantinga (General)
Specific		Iesuè (Musical education)	Badura-Skoda (Pianist) Iesuè (Youth) Dellaborra (Italy 1804–1808) McVeigh (London) Palmer (1827) Niedermüller (Vienna) Celestini (Switzerland) Ciliberti (Paris) Vincis (Paris)
Publisher and piano manufacturer	Jones (Publisher)	Rowland (Publisher)	De Val (Entrepreneur) Cooper (Beethoven contract) Rasch (Publisher) Delgampietro (Piano manufacturer)
ANALYTICAL			
	Sanguinetti (Recapitulations) Sità (Adagios) Pessina (Counterpoint) Mastroprimiano ( <i>Gradius</i> ) Mastropietro ('Didone') Faregna (Accompanied sonata) Ciliberti (Symphonies Op. 18)	Plantinga ('trois styles') Gerhard ('Didone') Coen ( <i>Practical Harmony</i> ) De Val (Chamber music) M. Sala (Orchestral works) Stewart-MacDonald (Canon) Biba (Viennese sonatas)	De Val (Piano music) L. Sala (Concerto) Rowland (Concertos) Illiano (Trios) Martinotti (Symphonies) M. Sala (Symphonies) Celestini (Early works) M. Sala (Introduction) Harrison (Op. 2)
DIFFUSION/ RECEPTION	Antolini (Diffusion)		Fornari (Schaul) Tiella (Ferrari)
INFLUENCE	Zaccagnini (Field)	Celestini (Haydn) L. Sala (Beethoven)	

in quite different directions. He turns to contemporary British paintings depicting classical themes, including the Dido story, by artists such as Turner (*Dido and Aeneas*, 1814; *Dido Building Carthage*, 1815). After a motivic analysis of Clementi's sonata, Gerhard directs his attention once more beyond the realm of music. In terms of atmosphere, he finds a parallel with Byron's *Child Harold's Pilgrimage* (1812–1818), and he plays with the idea of possible connections between Clementi's sonata and Rossini's cantata *Didone abbandonata*,



probably composed in 1811. But Gerhard also mentions Beethoven's 'Les Adieux' and Clementi's own Op. 40 No. 2, as does Mastropietro.

It is interesting to extend the comparison between the two sets of conference proceedings by bringing the contents of *Studies and Prospects* into the picture. This third volume, with its twenty-five contributions, contains more than the other two reports combined. But the same division between, on the one hand, biographical and analytical articles, and, on the other, articles dealing with diffusion/reception and influence can still be made. In *Studies and Prospects* the biographical section in particular is much better handled. But all three volumes contain a contribution on Clementi as a publisher, written by David Wyn Jones (*Perugia*), David Rowland (*Rome*) and Rudolf Rasch (*Studies*) respectively. When an author has written in more than one volume, the topic is usually different, albeit often related. In the *Studies and Prospects* some authors wrote two contributions.

Surveying Table 1, one cannot but come to the conclusion that Clementi was well served by musicologists during the two hundred and fiftieth anniversary year of his birth. Twenty-four authors, the majority from Italy or England, but many from elsewhere, wrote a total of fifty articles on the composer – more than a thousand pages in all. These articles discuss nearly everything that can be discussed concerning a composer from the classical period: biography, musical compositions, business activities, travels, meetings, publications, musical instruments, influence, reception and so on. With the three publications on one's bookshelf, one has a rather complete overview of the present state of knowledge concerning Clementi, especially if complemented by Gerhard's study and Rohan Stewart-MacDonald's *New Perspectives on the Keyboard Sonatas of Muzio Clementi* (Bologna: Ut Orpheus, 2006) – a further seven hundred pages. Not many composers outside the ranks of the great masters can claim such attention in such a short period of time. It must be said that Clementi himself, with his versatility and flexibility as a musician, a composer and a businessman of international renown – 'compositore, (forte)pianista, editore' as well as 'cosmopolita della musica' – has provided numerous incentives for the writing of articles, books and even dissertations on his life and works. He is certainly no *Clementi abbandonato*.

RUDOLF RASCH



*Eighteenth-Century Music* 6/1 © 2009 Cambridge University Press  
doi:10.1017/S1478570609001766 Printed in the United Kingdom

GABRIEL BANAT

*THE CHEVALIER DE SAINT-GEORGES: VIRTUOSO OF THE SWORD AND THE BOW*

Lives in Music 7

Hillsdale: Pendragon, 2006

pp. xxiii + 566, ISBN 978 1 57647 109 8

This ambitious study, by a professional violinist, charts the social, political and musical history of late eighteenth-century Paris by focusing on the life of the famous swordsman and violinist Joseph Bologne, Chevalier de Saint-Georges. Banat's earliest taste of Saint-Georges was the attractive *Symphonie concertante* in G major, Op. 13, the first of his works to be recorded and to appear in a modern edition. What evidently brought this biography into being was the author's delight in Saint-Georges's music, and his sense of affinity with the chevalier as a fellow victim of racial discrimination. The book builds on an article Banat wrote in 1990 for the *Black Music Research Journal* (volume 10/2, 177–212) and his entry on Saint-Georges in the second edition of *The New Grove*. The scope of this new study is vast, encompassing salon life, patronage, freemasonry, fencing and the French Revolution, but not all of Saint-Georges's music is discussed.