

religious studies

an international journal for
the philosophy of religion

VOLUME 46 2010

Editor

PETER BYRNE
King's College London, University of London

Book reviews editor

CHRISTOPHER HAMILTON
King's College London, University of London

Editorial board

DAVID BASINGER Roberts Wesleyan College · USA
JOHN BISHOP University of Auckland · NEW ZEALAND
STEPHEN R. L. CLARK University of Liverpool · UK
NICHOLAS EVERITT University of East Anglia · UK
PETER FORREST University of New England · AUSTRALIA
JEROME GELLMAN Ben-Gurion University · ISRAEL
PAUL HELM University of London · UK
JEFFREY JAMES JORDAN University of Delaware · USA
BRIAN LEFTOW Oriel College Oxford · UK
ROBIN LE POIDEVIN University of Leeds · UK
TIMOTHY MAWSON St Peter's College Oxford · UK
WESLEY MORRISTON University of Colorado · USA
MARK NELSON Westmont College · USA
GRAHAM OPPY Monash University · AUSTRALIA
DAVID A. PAILIN University of Manchester · UK
TERENCE PENELHUM University of Calgary · CANADA
KATHERIN ROGERS University of Delaware · USA
MARCEL SAROT Utrecht University · THE NETHERLANDS
JOHN SCHELLENBERG Mount Saint Vincent University · CANADA
STEWART SUTHERLAND House of Lords · UK
RICHARD SWINBURNE Oriel College Oxford · UK
THOMAS TALBOTT Willamette University · USA
CHARLES TALIAFERRO St Olaf College · USA
MARK WYNN University of Exeter · UK



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

*Published by the Syndics of the Cambridge University Press
The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK
32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
C/ Orense, 4, planta 13, 28020 Madrid, Spain
Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa
<http://www.cambridge.org>*

© Cambridge University Press 2010

*Printed in the United Kingdom at the
University Press, Cambridge*

Index to volume 46

Articles

BOYD, GREGORY A. Two ancient (and modern) motivations for ascribing exhaustively definite foreknowledge to God: a historic overview and critical assessment [41]

Composition models of the incarnation: unity and unifying relations, by Anna Marmodoro & Jonathan Hill [469]

CORDRY, BENJAMIN S. A critique of religious factionalism [77]

CRISP, OLIVER D. Jonathan Edwards's ontology: a critique of Sang Hyun Lee's dispositional account of Edwardsian metaphysics [1]

Critique (A) of religious fictionalism, by Benjamin S. Cordry [77]

CROWE, BENJAMIN D. Religion and the 'sensitive branch' of human nature [251]

Defensibility (The) of Zoroastrian dualism, by John D. Kronen & Sandra Menssen [185]

Defining 'gratuitous evil': a response to Alan R. Rhoda, by William Hasker [303]

Divine omnipotence and moral perfection, by Andrew Loke [525]

Doctrine (The) of 'the resurrection of the same body' in early modern thought, by Lloyd Strickland [163]

DOLE, ANDREW On 'nothing to distinguish' Schleiermacher and Otto: reply to Smith [449]

ELLIS, FIONA God and other minds [331]

ESHLEMAN, ANDREW Religious fictionalism defended: reply to Cordry [91]

The ethics of belief and Christian faith as commitment to assumptions, by Rik Peels [97]

Evil-god challenge (The), by Stephen Law [353]

FAIRLAMB, HORACE Sanctifying evidentialism [61]

God and other minds, by Fiona Ellis [331]

God, compatibilism, and the authorship of sin, by PAUL HELM [115]

Gratuitous evil and divine providence, by Alan R. Rhoda [281]

- HASKER, WILLIAM Defining 'gratuitous evil': a response to Alan R. Rhoda [303]
- HASKER, WILLIAM Objections to Social Trinitarianism [421]
- HELM, PAUL God, compatibilism, and the authorship of sin [115]
- HILL, JONATHAN & ANNA MARMODORO Composition models of the incarnation: unity and unifying relations [469]
- HIMMA, KENNETH EINAR Plantinga's version of the free-will argument: the good and evil that free beings do [21]
- How to be an atheist and a sceptic too: response to McCreary, by J. L. Schellenberg [227]
- In defence of logical nominalism: reply to Leftow, by Richard Swinburne [311]
- Jonathan Edwards's ontology: a critique of Sang Hyun Lee's dispositional account of Edwardsian metaphysics, by Oliver D. Crisp [1]
- Kierkegaard on emotion: a critique of Furtak's *Wisdom in Love*, by Jamie Turnbull [489]
- KRONEN, JOHN D. & SANDRA MENSSEN The defensibility of Zoroastrian dualism [185]
- LAW, STEPHEN The evil-god challenge [353]
- LEFTOW, BRIAN Swinburne on divine necessity [141]
- LEFTOW, BRIAN Two Trinities: reply to Hasker [441]
- LONG, TODD R. A proper *de jure* objection to the epistemic rationality of religious belief [375]
- LOKE, ANDREW Divine omnipotence and moral perfection [525]
- MCCREARY, MARK L. Schellenberg on divine hiddenness and religious scepticism [207]
- MARMODORO, ANNA & JONATHAN HILL Composition models of the incarnation: unity and unifying relations [469]
- MENSSEN, SANDRA & JOHN D. KRONEN The defensibility of Zoroastrian dualism [185]
- Objections to Social Trinitarianism, by William Hasker [421]
- On 'nothing to distinguish' Schleiermacher and Otto: reply to Smith, by Andrew Dole [449]
- Ontological argument (The) and the motivational centres of lives, by Alexander R. Pruss [233]
- Partnership with God: a partial solution to the problem of petitionary prayer, by NICHOLAS D. SMITH & ANDREW YIP [395]
- PEELS, RIK The ethics of belief and Christian faith as commitment to assumptions [97]

- Plantinga's version of the free-will argument: the good and evil that free beings do, by Kenneth Einar Himma [21]
- Proper *de jure* objection (A) to the epistemic rationality of religious belief, by Todd R. Long [375]
- PRUSS, ALEXANDER R. The ontological argument and the motivational centres of lives [233]
- Reconciling reason and religion: a response to Peels, by Brian Zamulinski [109]
- Religion and the 'sensitive branch' of human nature, by Benjamin D. Crowe [251]
- Religious fictionalism defended: reply to Cordry, by Andrew Eshleman [91]
- RHODA, ALAN R. Gratuitous evil and divine providence [281]
- Sanctifying evidentialism, by Horace Fairlamb [61]
- Sceptical theism and divine lies, by Erik J. Wielenberg [509]
- SHELLENBERG, J. L. How to be an atheist and a sceptic too: response to McCreary [227]
- Schellenberg on divine hiddenness and religious scepticism, by Mark L. McCreary [207]
- SMITH, NICHOLAS D. & ANDREW YIP Partnership with God: a partial solution to the problem of petitionary prayer [395]
- STRICKLAND, LLOYD The doctrine of 'the resurrection of the same body' in early modern thought [163]
- SWINBURNE, RICHARD In defence of logical nominalism: reply to Leftow [311]
- Swinburne on divine necessity, by Brian Leftow [141]
- Two ancient (and modern) motivations for ascribing exhaustively definite foreknowledge to God: a historic overview and critical assessment, by Gregory A. Boyd [41]
- TURNBULL, JAMIE Kierkegaard on emotion: a critique of Furtak's *Wisdom in Love* [489]
- Two Trinities: reply to Hasker, by Brian Leftow [441]
- WIELENBERG, ERIK J. Sceptical theism and divine lies [509]
- YIP, ANDREW & NICHOLAS D. SMITH Partnership with God: a partial solution to the problem of petitionary prayer [395]
- ZAMULINSKI, BRIAN Reconciling reason and religion: a response to Peels [109]

Book reviews

Analytic Theology: New Essays in the Philosophy of Theology, OLIVER D. CRISP & MICHAEL C. REA (eds) (Kevin Timpe) [274]

COTTINGHAM, JOHN *Why Believe?* (Stephen Clark) [539]

CRISP, OLIVER D. & MICHAEL C. REA (eds) *Analytic Theology: New Essays in the Philosophy of Theology* (Kevin Timpe) [274]

Desire and Motivation in Indian Philosophy, by Christopher J. Framarin (Simon Brodbeck) [135]

End (The) of Philosophy of Religion, by Nick Trakakis (Jacob Holsinger Sherman) [415]

EVANS, C. STEPHEN *Kierkegaard: An Introduction* (Clare Carlisle) [270]

Faith and Place: An Essay in Embodied Epistemology, by Mark R. Wynn (Gordon Graham) [411]

FRAMARIN, CHRISTOPHER J. *Desire and Motivation in Indian Philosophy* (Simon Brodbeck) [135]

Freedom, Teleology, and Evil, by Stewart Goetz (Eric Reitan) [130]

GOETZ, STEWART *Freedom, Teleology, and Evil* (Eric Reitan) [130]

HOLDEN, THOMAS *Spectres of False Divinity: Hume's Moral Atheism* (Robert A. Larmer) [541]

Kierkegaard: An Introduction, by C. Stephen Evans (Clare Carlisle) [270]

Kierkegaard: Thinking Christianly in an Existential Mode by Sylvia Walsh (Clare Carlisle) [270]

MOORE, ANDREW & MICHAEL SCOTT (eds) *Realism and Religion: Philosophical and Theological Perspectives* (Victoria S. Harrison) [125]

REA, MICHAEL C. & OLIVER D. CRISP (eds) *Analytic Theology: New Essays in the Philosophy of Theology* (Kevin Timpe) [274]

Realism and Religion: Philosophical and Theological Perspectives, Andrew Moore & Michael Scott (eds) (Victoria S. Harrison) [125]

RYAN, CHRISTOPHER *Schopenhauer's Philosophy of Religion: The Death of God and the Oriental Renaissance* (Dale Jacquette) [545]

Schopenhauer's Philosophy of Religion: The Death of God and the Oriental Renaissance, by Christopher Ryan (Dale Jacquette) [545]

Spectres of False Divinity: Hume's Moral Atheism, by Thomas Holden
(Robert A. Larmer) [541]

SWINBURNE, RICHARD *Was Jesus God?* (Oliver Crisp) [265]

TRAKAKIS, NICK *The End of Philosophy of Religion* (Jacob Holsinger Sherman) [415]

WALSH, SYLVIA *Kierkegaard: Thinking Christianly in an Existential Mode*
(Clare Carlisle) [270]

Was Jesus God?, by Richard Swinburne (Oliver Crisp) [265]

Why Believe?, by John Cottingham (Stephen Clark) [539]

WYNN, MARK R. *Faith and Place: An Essay in Embodied Epistemology*
(Gordon Graham) [411]



Center for Philosophy of Religion Fellowships for 2011 - 2012

The Center for Philosophy of Religion at the University of Notre Dame announces up to five fellowships for the 2011 - 2012 academic year: the Alvin Plantinga Fellowship (\$60,000), awarded to a distinguished senior scholar; up to two Research Fellowships (\$40,000 - \$50,000, depending on rank); the Frederick J. Crosson Fellowship (\$45,000) reserved for foreign scholars and those outside the field of philosophy; and one Visiting Graduate Fellowship (\$20,000) awarded to a graduate student in philosophy who is working on a dissertation in the philosophy of religion and who would profit from spending a year at the Center. All Fellows will receive up to \$2,000 reimbursement for moving expenses, as well as up to \$2,000 for research-related expenses. The Plantinga Fellow and the Research Fellows may have the option of teaching one course in philosophy per semester as well. Those who do teach receive up to an additional \$7,500 annually. To apply, please submit the following materials electronically, if possible, to cpreligion@nd.edu, or by mail to Michael Rea, Director, Center for Philosophy of Religion, 418 Malloy Hall, University of Notre Dame, Notre Dame, IN 46556:

1. A complete curriculum vitae.
2. Three letters of recommendation.
3. A statement of no more than three pages (double-spaced) specifying the fellowship for which you are applying and describing the project on which you would like to work while at the Center.
4. A project abstract of no more than 150 words.
5. One published or unpublished paper.

Application Deadline: February 1, 2011

You may apply for more than one fellowship for which you are eligible.

E-mail: cpreligion@nd.edu

Website: <http://philreligion.nd.edu>

Templeton Research Fellowships on Evil and Skeptical Theism for 2011 – 2012

The Center for Philosophy of Religion at the University of Notre Dame announces up to four one-year residential Research Fellowships on the topic of 'Evil and Skeptical Theism', open rank, funded by the John Templeton Foundation. (Skeptical theism is an increasingly widely discussed strategy for responding to the problem of evil.) Fellows will be expected to spend the year in residence at the University of Notre Dame. Each successful applicant will receive a total fellowship award of \$55,000 to \$85,000. Stipend will depend on rank and circumstances of the applicant, and up to \$15,000 of each award may be received as reimbursement for travel, re-location, or research-related expenses.

In addition, there will be funding available to invite outside scholars of interest to the fellows for brief visits during the 2011 – 2012 academic year. There will also be funding available for a workshop on the theme of skeptical theism in late spring of 2012. (Details of the workshop are still to be determined. Applicants who are interested in helping to organize the workshop should indicate as much in their cover letter.)

For further details, including a brief characterization of skeptical theism and information about appropriate topics of research, please visit www.evilandtheodicy.com and follow the "Fellowships" and "Skeptical Theism" links.

To apply, please submit the following materials electronically, if possible, to cpreligion@nd.edu, or by mail to Michael Rea, Director, Center for Philosophy of Religion, 418 Malloy Hall, University of Notre Dame, Notre Dame, IN 46556:

- A complete curriculum vitae
- Three letters of recommendation
- A project abstract of no more than 150 words
- A project description of no more than 1200 words
- One published or unpublished paper

All application materials must be **received** by **January 15, 2011** to assure full consideration. Questions may be addressed to Michael Rea at cpreligion@nd.edu.

religious studies

an international journal for
the philosophy of religion

Editorial policy

Religious Studies is an international journal devoted to the problems of the philosophy of religion as these arise out of classical and contemporary discussions and from varied religious traditions. Space is devoted to articles, of which more than 25 are published each year, but the journal also contains a book review section, which may include review articles and shorter notes as well as normal-length reviews.

1. Submissions

Contributions should be submitted via e-mail attachment.

E-mail attachments should be sent to Professor Peter Byrne: religiousstudies@cambridge.org. They should be checked for viruses before dispatch and should be in RTF format.

Please note that Professor Robin Le Poidevin will be taking over the editorship of *Religious Studies* from January 2011, and that from November 2010 the journal will be adopting an electronic manuscript submission system. For further details, please visit the journal's website: www.journals.cambridge.org/res

No article will be accepted for publication without blind review. The text of submitted articles must be ready for this and must bear no trace of the author's identity. Articles that are not ready for blind review will be rejected.

Submission of a paper will be taken to imply that it is unpublished and is not being considered for publication elsewhere. Upon acceptance of a paper, the author will be asked to assign copyright (on certain conditions) to Cambridge University Press.

Contributors are responsible for obtaining permission to reproduce any material in which they do not hold copyright and for ensuring that the appropriate acknowledgements are included in their manuscript.

Books for review should be sent to Dr Christopher Hamilton at Department of Theology and Religious Studies, King's College London, Strand, London WC2R 2LS.

Books not selected for review will not be returned.

NB: *Religious Studies* does not accept unsolicited book reviews.

2. Manuscript preparation

Articles submitted to the journal should in general be between 3,000 and 10,000 words long, though articles outside these limits will be acceptable if there is some good reason for their exceptional length or brevity. Articles in two or more parts may occasionally be accepted provided each part is independently intelligible. They should be in English.

Each article should be submitted with an abstract of 100 words. Articles will not be published unless an abstract is provided.

When an article has been accepted for publication, the Editor will supply detailed advice on manuscript preparation, which must be strictly adhered to. Articles and book reviews will be checked and copy-edited for journal style and UK English.

3. Proofs

Contributors should keep one copy of the typescript for correcting proofs. First proofs may be read and corrected by contributors. They will be sent to contributors by e-mail as PDF files. Corrections will only be accepted if they are sent to the Editor without delay.

Typographical or factual errors only may be changed at proof stage. The publisher reserves the right to charge authors for correction of non-typographical errors.

4. Offprints

Offprints will not be supplied. Each Author will receive a pdf file containing their contribution to the journal, for their own use. Authors of Articles will also receive a copy of the journal.

© Cambridge University Press 2010

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, United Kingdom
32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013 2473, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain
Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

Printed in the United Kingdom by the University Press, Cambridge

religious studies

an international journal for
the philosophy of religion

articles

WILLIAM HASKER

Objections to Social Trinitarianism [421]

BRIAN LEFTOW

Two Trinities: reply to Hasker [441]

ANDREW DOLE

On 'nothing to distinguish' Schleiermacher
and Otto: reply to Smith [449]

ANNA MARMODORO & JONATHAN HILL

Composition models of the incarnation:
unity and unifying relations [469]

JAMIE TURNBULL

Kierkegaard on emotion: a critique of
Furtak's *Wisdom in Love* [489]

ERIK J. WIELENBERG

Sceptical theism and divine lies [509]

ANDREW LOKE

Divine omnipotence and moral
perfection [525]

book reviews

John Cottingham *Why Believe?*
(STEPHEN CLARK) [539]

Thomas Holden *Spectres of False Divinity:
Hume's Moral Atheism*

(ROBERT A. LARMER) [541]

Christopher Ryan *Schopenhauer's
Philosophy of Religion: The Death of God
and the Oriental Renaissance*

(DALE JACQUETTE) [545]

INDEX TO VOLUME 46 [iii]

Cambridge Journals Online

For further information about this journal
please go to the journal website at:
journals.cambridge.org/res



Mixed Sources

Product group from well-managed
forests and other controlled sources
www.fsc.org Cert no. SA-COC-1527
© 1996 Forest Stewardship Council

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS