

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XX NUMBERS 1 & 2 1994

QUALITY OF CARE AND HEALTH REFORM: Complementary or Conflicting

Symposium Authors:

Kenneth S. Abraham
Robert A. Berenson
John D. Blum
Cynthia A. Loveland Cook
Ira Mark Ellman
Jay A. Freedman
Alice G. Gosfield
Mark A. Hall
Kathleen E. Hastings

Eleanor D. Kinney
Wendy K. Mariner
Maxwell J. Mehlman
E. Haavi Morreim
Marc A. Rodwin
William M. Sage
Paul C. Weiler
Susan M. Wolf

PUBLISHED BY THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW, MEDICINE & ETHICS AND THE
BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW

The AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE is published in the Spring, Summer, Fall, and Winter by the American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics and the Boston University School of Law. All decisions concerning the content of the JOURNAL are made by a joint American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics/Boston University School of Law Editorial Policy Committee. Statements of fact and opinion are the responsibility of the authors alone, and are not necessarily endorsed by the editors, the Society, or the law school.

The Editors invite the submission of manuscripts on medicolegal topics. For details, see inside back cover. Editorial communications, including original manuscripts and requests for permission to reproduce JOURNAL material, should be addressed to Editor-in-Chief, AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE, 765 Commonwealth Avenue, Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Editorial phone: (617) 353-2912.

Business correspondence, including subscription correspondence, should be addressed to the Membership Director, American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics, 765 Commonwealth Avenue, 16th Floor, Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Business phone: (617) 262-4990.

Subscriptions: \$70.00 per year for institutions, and \$60.00 for individuals (payment must be on personal check) who are not members of the American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics. Foreign subscribers should remit, for a year's subscription, an additional \$30.00 for foreign postage.

Missing copies of the JOURNAL will be sent free of charge to subscribers or members of the Society provided that notice of such claim is received at the Society's subscription office within one month of receipt of the next issue published. Requests made after this period will be billed at the regular issue price of \$20.00 (includes postage and handling).

Members of the American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics receive a free subscription to the JOURNAL as part of their dues (\$120.00 for 1994). Information concerning membership is available from the Membership Director, American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics, 765 Commonwealth Avenue, 16th Floor, Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Society phone: (617) 262-4990.

Articles in the JOURNAL are indexed in *LEXIS*, *WESTLAW*, *Index to Legal Periodicals*, *Legal Contents*, *Index Medicus*, *Social Sciences Citation Index*, *Current Contents: Social and Behavioral Sciences*, and *Biosciences Information Service of Biological Abstracts*.

Library of Congress Catalog Number: 75-645516 (Shelf No. K1.M445). ISSN 0098-8588.

U.S. postage paid at Lincoln, Nebraska, in accordance with Permit No. 264 (Nonprofit Org.).

ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICERS OF BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW

JOHN R. SILBER, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., LL.D. (hon.), L.H.D. (hon.), *President*,
University Professor and Professor of Philosophy and Law

RONALD A. CASS, B.A., J.D., *Dean and Professor of Law*

JOSEPH BRODLEY, B.A., LL.B., *Senior Associate Dean for Research and Professor of Law*

ROBERT G. BONE, B.A., J.D., *Associate Dean and Professor of Law*

KENNETH W. SIMONS, B.A., J.D., *Associate Dean and Professor of Law*

CHRISTINE A. MARX, B.S., J.D., *Assistant Dean for Student Affairs*

OFFICERS OF THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW, MEDICINE & ETHICS

KAREN H. ROTHENBERG, J.D., M.P.A., *President*

ROBERT J. LEVINE, M.D., *President-Elect*

STEVEN MILES, M.D., *Secretary*

SANDRA H. JOHNSON, J.D., LL.M., *Treasurer*

ELLIOT L. SAGALL, M.D., *Founder and First President*

RUTH B. PURTILO, Ph.D., *Immediate Past President*

LAWRENCE O. GOSTIN, J.D., *Executive Director*

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

BOARD of EDITORS

FACULTY EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

Frances H. Miller, J.D.
Boston University School of Law

FACULTY EDITOR-IN-CHIEF EMERITUS AND FOUNDER

John A. Norris, J.D., M.B.A.

EXECUTIVE EDITOR

Lawrence O. Gostin, J.D.

DIRECTOR OF PUBLICATIONS

American Society of Law, Medicine &
Ethics

Michael Vasko

CIRCULATION MANAGER

Susan Reddy

EDITORS

Michael Baram, J.D.
Boston University Schools of Law
and Public Health

Charles H. Baron, LL.B., Ph.D.
Boston College Law School

Henry Beyer, J.D.
Boston University School of Law

William J. Curran, LL.M., S.M. Hyg.
Harvard University School of
Public Health

Lee J. Dunn, Jr., J.D., LL.M.
Dunn & Auton
Boston, Massachusetts

Richard F. Gibbs, M.D., J.D.
Harvard Medical School

Jay Alexander Gold, M.D., J.D., M.P.H.
Wisconsin Peer Review Organization

Clark C. Havighurst, J.D.
Duke University School of Law

Nathan Hershey, J.D.
University of Pittsburgh
Graduate School of Public Health

Bernard D. Hirsh, J.D.
Wildman, Harold Allen & Dickson
Chicago, Illinois

Edward E. Hollowell, J.D.
Hollowell & Silverstein
Raleigh, North Carolina

Richard G. Huber, J.D.
Boston College Law School

Sheila Jasanoff, J.D., Ph.D.
Director, Program on Science Technology
and Society
Cornell University

Jay Katz, M.D.
Yale University Law School

Renée M. Landers, J.D.
Boston College Law School

Sylvia A. Law, J.D.
New York University School of Law

Aubrey Milunsky, MB.B.Ch., D.Sc.,
F.R.C.P., D.C.H.
Boston University School of Medicine

Irwin N. Perr, M.D., J.D.
University of Medicine and Dentistry
of New Jersey

Harvey E. Pies, J.D., M.P.H.
Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Florida
Jacksonville, Florida

Elliot L. Sagall, M.D.
Founder, American Society of
Law, Medicine & Ethics
Harvard Medical School

E. Donald Shapiro, J.D., LL.D.
New York Law School

Sidney Shindell, M.D., LL.B.
Medical College of Wisconsin

Robert B. Shira, D.D.S.
Special Assistant to the President
Tufts University

Arthur F. Southwick, J.D., M.B.A.
Grad. Sch. of Business Administration
University of Michigan

Paul R. Tremblay
Boston College Law School

David G. Warren, J.D.
Duke University

Cyril H. Wecht, M.D., J.D.
Director, Pittsburgh Institute of Legal
Medicine

James G. Zimmerly, M.D., J.D., M.P.H.
Armed Forces Institute of Pathology
Washington, D.C.

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

INTERNATIONAL BOARD of EDITORS

Dr. M.A.M. Wachter

Director
Institute of Bioethics
The Netherlands

Dr. S.S. Fluss

Chief, Health Legislation
World Health Organization
Switzerland

Prof. Dr. Erwin Deutsch

Institute for Pharmaceutical and
Medical Law
University of Gottingen
Germany

Bernard M. Dickens, Ph.D., LL.D.

Professor
Faculty of Law & Faculty of Medicine
University of Toronto
Canada

Prof. Dr. H.J.J. Leenen

Instituut voor Sociale Geneeskunde
Universiteit van Amsterdam
The Netherlands

The Honorable Justice

Michael D. Kirby
President, Court of Appeal
Supreme Court of New South Wales
Australia

Koichi Bai

Professor of Law
Director of Institute of Medical Humanities
School of Medicine
Kitasato University
Japan

Prof. P.D.G. Skegg

Faculty of Law
University of Otago
Dunedin
New Zealand

Prof. Dr. Iur. Dieter Giesen

Institute for International, Foreign
and Comparative Law
Director
Working Centre for International
Studies in Medical Malpractice Law
The Free University of Berlin
Germany

Prof. Amos Shapira

Lubowski Professor of Law &
Biomedical Ethics
Faculty of Law
Tel Aviv University
Israel

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XX NUMBERS 1 & 2 1994

BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW
STUDENT BOARD OF EDITORS
1993-1994

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF
David D. Dueno

SYMPOSIUM EDITOR
Susan L. DiMaggio

EXECUTIVE EDITOR
Laura C. Boujoff

MANAGING EDITORS
David A. Lane
Lisa Paolillo

PROJECTS EDITOR
Stacy B. Margolies

ARTICLES EDITORS
Thomas B. Bralliar, Jr.
Jesse R. Lee
Jonathan P. Serbin
Stephanie N. Switzer

**ASLME DEVELOPMENTS
EDITOR**
Nikki M. Constantine

CASE & NOTE EDITORS

David B. Allswang
David R. Campbell
Kathleen M. Crowley
William C. Dennis

Stephen R. Fish, Jr.
Melanie B. Jacobs
Anthony D. Pellegrini
Susan H. Upton

THIRD-YEAR EDITORS

Jeffrey B. Araten
Robert J. Blanch, Jr.
Lawrence R. Bressler
Cedric DeLaCruz
Paula Domanski
Rick J. Fucci

Eryn P. Gittleman
William J. Graham
Andrew A. Honegger
Julie E. Mathews
Arlene N. Meltzer

Cheryl A. Posegay
Wendy J. Rothstein
Robert W. Russo
Brian Schulman
Rachel L. Singer
Terrence J. Talbot

STAFF MEMBERS

Mark Appleberry
Klio Arvanitidis
Claire Breaux
Patricia Cashman
Derek Cohen
Ellen M. Crowley
Nicole E. Dale
David Feniger
Jessica Ferrell
Michael G. Frankel
Brian F. Freyermuth

Natascha S. George
Stacy Grossman
Allison R. Handel
Jeffrey M. Holoubek
Patrick R. Jones
Susan Lee
Nicholas J. Maglio
Daniel McCarthy
Michael Moore
David T. Morris
Erin Newman
Moy Ogilvie

Stephanie Pitcher
Andrea Platner
Andrew Seewald
Ross D. Silverman
Paul C. Smith
Michael D. Sweet
Jeffrey Trey
Ukwani O. Udo
Felecia Wein
Jody M. Weisberg
Aaron Wong

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XX NUMBERS 1 & 2 1994

The American Journal of Law & Medicine
is pleased to introduce its
Student Board of Editors
for the 1994-1995
academic year

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

Paul C. Smith

EXECUTIVE EDITOR

Felecia Wein

MANAGING EDITORS

Daniel McCarthy
David T. Morris

PROJECTS EDITOR

Ellen M. Crowley

SYMPOSIUM EDITOR

Andrew Seewald

ARTICLES EDITORS

Nicole E. Dale
Brian F. Freyermuth
Jeffrey M. Holoubek
Stephanie Pitcher

ASLME DEVELOPMENTS EDITOR

Jeffrey Trey

CASE & NOTE EDITORS

Derek A. Cohen
David Feniger
Natascha S. George
Patrick R. Jones

Susan Lee
Erin Newman
Ross D. Silverman
Jody M. Weisberg

THIRD-YEAR EDITORS

Mark Appleberry
Klio Arvanitidis
Claire Breaux
Patricia Cashman
Jessica Ferrell

Stacy Grossman
Allison R. Handel
Nicholas J. Maglio
Michael Moore

Moy Ogilvie
Andrea Platner
Michael D. Sweet
Ukweni O. Udo
Aaron Wong

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XX NUMBERS 1 & 2 1994

Quality of Care and Health Reform: Complementary or Conflicting

ARTICLES

- | | | |
|---|-----|--|
| ENTERPRISE LIABILITY FOR MEDICAL MALPRACTICE AND HEALTH CARE QUALITY IMPROVEMENT | 1 | William M. Sage
Kathleen E. Hastings
Robert A. Berenson |
| ENTERPRISE MEDICAL LIABILITY AND THE CHOICE OF THE RESPONSIBLE ENTERPRISE | 29 | Kenneth S. Abraham
Paul C. Weiler |
| OUTCOMES ASSESSMENT IN HEALTH CARE REFORM: PROMISE AND LIMITATIONS | 37 | Wendy K. Mariner |
| QUALITY IMPROVEMENT IN COMMUNITY-BASED, LONG-TERM CARE: THEORY AND REALITY | 59 | Eleanor D. Kinney
Jay A. Freedman
Cynthia A. Loveland Cook |
| REDEFINING QUALITY BY REASSIGNING RESPONSIBILITY | 79 | E. Haavi Morreim |
| QUALITY ASSESSMENT OF ETHICS IN HEALTH CARE: THE ACCOUNTABILITY REVOLUTION | 105 | Susan M. Wolf |
| BAD "BAD BABY" BILLS | 129 | Maxwell J. Mehlman |
| PATIENT ACCOUNTABILITY AND QUALITY OF CARE: LESSONS FROM MEDICAL CONSUMERISM AND THE PATIENTS' RIGHTS, WOMEN'S HEALTH AND DISABILITY RIGHTS MOVEMENTS | 147 | Marc A. Rodwin |
| VALUE PURCHASING IN MEDICARE LAW: PRECURSOR TO HEALTH REFORM | 169 | Alice G. Gosfield |
| REDEFINING THE TERMS OF HEALTH INSURANCE TO ACCOMMODATE VARYING CONSUMER RISK PREFERENCES | 187 | Ira Mark Ellman
Mark A. Hall |
| UNIVERSALITY, QUALITY & ECONOMICS: FINDING A BALANCE IN ONTARIO AND BRITISH COLUMBIA | 203 | John D. Blum |

Copyright 1994 by the American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics, Inc. and the Boston University School of Law. Unless otherwise noted, the materials appearing herein may be copied for classroom use, provided that (1) the user notify the Editor-in-Chief of *American Journal of Law & Medicine* of having made such copies; (2) the author and *American Journal of Law & Medicine* are identified; and (3) the proper notice of copyright is affixed to each copy.