

Israel Law Review

**Volume 36
Number 3
2002**

**Reprinted with the permission of the original publisher
by
Periodicals Service Company
Germantown, NY
2012**

Printed on acid-free paper.

**This reprint was reproduced from the
best original edition copy available.**

NOTE TO THE REPRINT EDITION:

**In some cases full page advertisements which do not add to
the scholarly value of this volume have been omitted.
As a result, some reprinted volumes may have irregular pagination.**

ISRAEL LAW REVIEW

Hebrew University  Faculty of Law

Special Issue: Refusals to Serve - Political Dissent in the Israel Defense Forces

Editors' Introduction

Case

H.C. 7622/02, *Zonshein v. Judge Advocate General*

Articles

Right and Left: Ideological Disobedience in Israel

Chaim Gans

Political Disobedience in the IDF: The Scope of the Legal Right of Soldiers to be Excused from Taking Part in Military Activities in the Occupied Territories

Barak Medina

The Fallacies of Objections to Selective Conscientious Objection

Amir Paz-Fuchs and Michael Sfar

Selective Conscientious Objection and International Human Rights

Leonard Hammer

Comments

Refusals: Neglected Aspects

Asa Kasher

Civil Disobedience and Conscientious Objection

Avi Sagi and Ron Shapira

Unconscionable Objection to Conscientious Objection:

Notes on Sagi and Shapira

Alon Harel

Some Arguments Against Conscientious Objection and Civil Disobedience Refuted

David Enoch

Rejoinder: Civil Disobedience and Conscientious Objection

Avi Sagi and Ron Shapira

Article Submissions

The *Israel Law Review*, established in 1966, is a peer-reviewed journal published by the Law Faculty of the Hebrew University of Jerusalem. We accept unsolicited articles for submission dealing with Israeli law, Israeli criminal justice, and cultural and interdisciplinary academic research on Israeli law. Exclusive submission is required. Please contact us for submission guidelines and format or visit our website at <http://mishpatim.mscc.huji.ac.il/ilr>.

Subscription

The *Israel Law Review* is printed three times annually. The domestic subscription rate is 175 New Israeli Sheqels. The foreign subscription rate is \$52 US, which includes airmail.

Disclaimer

All rights reserved. Permission to copy should be obtained through the Israel Law Review.

Copyright

All rights reserved. Permission to copy should be obtained through the Israel Law Review.

For more information, please contact us.

Israel Law Review

Faculty of Law
Hebrew University of Jerusalem
Mt. Scopus
91905 Jerusalem
ISRAEL

Tel: 972-2-588-2520
Fax: 972-2-588-2565
E-mail: msilr@mscc.huji.ac.il

ISSN 0021-2237
To be cited as: Is.L.R.

ISRAEL LAW REVIEW

VOLUME 36
NUMBER 3
2002



HEBREW UNIVERSITY OF JERUSALEM
FACULTY OF LAW
© Israel Law Review 2004

Israel Law Review

Editorial Board

Editors-in-Chief

Barak Medina

David Weisburd

Managing Editor

Michele Manspeizer

Copy Editor

Michele Manspeizer

Editorial Board

Mimi Ajzenstadt

Alon Harel

Guy Pessach

Yaron Ezrahi

Moshe Hirsch

Shmuel Shilo

Miri Gur-Arye

Daphna Lewinson-Zamir

Celia Wasserstein Fassberg

Book Review Editors

Mimi Ajzenstadt

Guy Pessach

Student Editors

Barak Ariel

Liron Hacoheh

Adi Libson

Rina Arnovitch

Hana Herbst

Mohammed Wattad

Anat Eban

Adi Leibovitch

Yossi Zvitia

International Academic Board

Michael Joachim Bonell, University of Rome, La Sapienza, Italy

Irwin Cotler, McGill University, Canada

Ruth Deech, Master of St. Anne's, University of Oxford, England

Françoise Dreyfus, University of Paris, Sorbonne, France

Bruce Elman, University of Alberta, Canada

Malcolm M. Feeley, University of California, Berkeley, U.S.A.

Marc Galanter, University of Wisconsin, U.S.A.

Antonio Gambaro, University of Milan, Italy

Shael Herman, Tulane University, U.S.A.

Jeffrey Jowell, University College London, England

Catherine MacKinnon, University of Michigan, U.S.A.

Basil S. Markesinis, University of Oxford, England

Judith Resnik, Yale University, U.S.A.

H. G. Schermers, Juridisch Studientrum "Hugo De Groot," Leiden, Holland

Alan Schwartz, Yale University, U.S.A.

Ernest Weinrib, University of Toronto, Canada

Manfred Weiss, Johann Goethe University of Frankfurt, Germany

Michael Zander, London School of Economics, England

Printed by Art Plus, Jerusalem

ISRAEL LAW REVIEW



**Special Issue: Refusals to Serve - Political Dissent in the
Israel Defense Forces**

CONTENTS

Editors' Introduction

Case

H.C. 7622/02, Zonshein v. Judge Advocate General 1

Articles

Right and Left: Ideological Disobedience
in Israel **Chaim Gans** 19

Political Disobedience in the IDF: The Scope of the Legal Right of
Soldiers to be Excused from Taking Part in Military
Activities in the Occupied Territories **Barak Medina** 73

The Fallacies of Objections to Selective Conscientious
Objection **Amir Paz-Fuchs**
..... **and Michael Sfar** 111

Selective Conscientious Objection and International
Human Rights **Leonard Hammer** 145

Comments

Refusals: Neglected Aspects **Asa Kasher** 171

Civil Disobedience and Conscientious Objection **Avi Sagi and**
..... **Ron Shapira** 181

Unconscionable Objection to Conscientious Objection:
Notes on Sagi and Shapira **Alon Harel** 219

Some Arguments Against Conscientious Objection and
Civil Disobedience Refuted **David Enoch** 227

Rejoinder: Civil Disobedience and Conscientious Objection
..... **Avi Sagi**
..... **and Ron Shapira** 255

Acknowledgements

The *Israel Law Review* gratefully acknowledges the very generous financial assistance provided by:

The P.E.F. Israel Endowment Funds, in memory of its founder and first president, Judge Julian W. Mack

A Permanent Endowment Fund established by Abraham D. Slavitt of Norwalk, Connecticut, U.S.A., in memory of his beloved wife, Jennie A. Slavitt

The *Israel Law Review* also gratefully acknowledges the financial assistance of the following institutions:

The Faculty of Law, The Hebrew University of Jerusalem

The Ministry of Justice of Israel

The Bernard Lazare Fund

The Nicholas Rosenbaum Endowment Fund

The S.A. Schonbrunn Research Endowment Fund

Th British Friends Legal Group