

**Canadian**

**Revue**

**Journal of**

**Canadienne**

**LAW and  
SOCIETY**

**DROIT et  
SOCIÉTÉ**

**Volume 8 No. 1**

**Spring/printemps 1993**

**ISSN 0829-3201**

*Canadian Divorce before Reform: The Case of Prince Edward Island, 1946–1967*

Wendy J. Owen, J. M. Bumsted

*Mediation of Divorce in China*

Martha J. Bailey

*Un organisme parlementaire d'évaluation technologique au Canada?*

Christian Jolivet

*The Canadian Regulatory System and Corporatism: Empirical Findings and Analytical Implications*

David Johnson

**Exchanges/Débats**

*A Partial Rehabilitation of the Principle of Collective Punishment*

Irwin Lipnowski

*Collective Punishment: Criminological Assessment: A Reply to Lipnowski's*

"*Partial Rehabilitation of the Principle of Collective Punishment*"

Jean-Paul Brodeur

*A Reply to Professor Brodeur*

Irwin Lipnowski

*Do Women Judges Make a Difference? An Analysis by Appeal Court Data*

Peter McCormick, Twyla Job

*A Difference without a Distinction? A Comment on "Do Women Judges Make a Difference?"*

by Peter McCormick and Twyla Job

Joan Brockman

*Hypotheses, Statistics, and Women Judges: A Response*

Peter McCormick, Twyla Job

**Review Essays/Notes critiques**

*La Reconnaissance juridique des thérapies alternatives*

René Laperrière

*Constitutional Inadequacy*

Paul Romney

**Index**

*Reviews are listed on outside back cover/**Liste des recensions au verso*

# CANADIAN JOURNAL OF LAW AND SOCIETY

## REVUE CANADIENNE DROIT ET SOCIÉTÉ

### **Editor/Directrice**

Claude Thomasset  
Département des Sciences juridiques  
Université du Québec à Montréal

### **Administrative Assistant/ Assistante à la rédaction**

Jeanne Benoist  
Groupe de recherche Informatique et  
Droit (GRID)

### **Secretary/Secrétaire**

Michel Platt  
**Special contribution/Collaboration spéciale**  
Claire Vachon

### **Editorial Board/Comité de rédaction**

Marie-Andrée Bertrand  
École de Criminologie  
Université de Montréal

David Howes  
Department of Sociology and Anthropology  
Concordia University

Wesley Pue  
Faculty of Law  
University of British Columbia

Daniel Sansfaçon  
Département de Sexologie  
Université du Québec à Montréal

### **Advisory Board/Conseil Consultatif**

André-Jean Arnaud, C.N.R.S., France  
Nicholas K. Blomley, Geography, S.F.U.

Marc Galanter, Law, Wisconsin, U.S.A.  
Guy Goulard, Min. de la Justice, Ottawa

John Hagan, Law, Toronto  
Dorothy Hepworth, Min. de la Justice, Ottawa  
John Hogarth, Law, U.B.C.

Lou Knafla, History, Calgary  
Audrey Kobayashi, Geography, McGill  
Guy Rocher, C.R.D.P., Montréal  
Peter Russell, Political Science, Toronto  
Jennifer Smith, Political Science, Dalhousie  
David Sugarman, Law, Lancaster, Great Britain  
Neil Vidmar, Law, Duke University, U.S.A.

### **Founding Editor/Rédacteur Fondateur**

Rainer Knopff  
Department of Political Science  
University of Calgary

with the assistance of/avec la collaboration de  
Ann Griffiths

Manuscripts should be addressed to the attention of the Editor, at the following address:  
Les manuscrits doivent être envoyés à l'attention de la directrice de la **Revue** à l'adresse suivante:

**Département des Sciences Juridiques**  
**Université du Québec à Montréal**  
**C.P. 8888, succursale A**  
**Montréal, Québec, Canada, H3C 3P8**  
**Fax/Télécopieur: (514) 987-4784 / 987-6548**  
**Telephone/Téléphone: (514) 987-8397**

**Canadian  
Journal of  
Law and  
Society**

**Volume 8 No. 1**

**Revue  
canadienne  
droit et  
société**

**Spring/printemps 1993**

**Contents/Sommaire**

*Canadian Divorce before Reform:*

- The Case of Prince Edward Island, 1946–1967* ..... 1  
Wendy J. Owen, J. M. Bumsted

- Mediation of Divorce in China* ..... 45  
Martha J. Bailey

- Un organisme parlementaire d'évaluation technologique au Canada?* ..... 73  
Christian Jolivet

*The Canadian Regulatory System and Corporatism:*

- Empirical Findings and Analytical Implications* ..... 95  
David Johnson

**Exchanges/Débats**

- A Partial Rehabilitation of the Principle of Collective Punishment* ..... 121  
Irwin Lipnowski

- Collective Punishment: Criminological Assessment:  
A Reply to Lipnowski's "Partial Rehabilitation of the  
Principle of Collective Punishment"* ..... 127  
Jean-Paul Brodeur

- A Reply to Professor Brodeur* ..... 131  
Irwin Lipnowski

*Do Women Judges Make a Difference?*

- An Analysis by Appeal Court Data* ..... 135  
Peter McCormick, Twyla Job

- A Difference without a Distinction? A Comment on  
"Do Women Judges Make a Difference?"  
by Peter McCormick and Twyla Job* ..... 149  
Joan Brockman

- Hypotheses, Statistics, and Women Judges: A Response* ..... 165  
Peter McCormick, Twyla Job

**Review Essays/Notes critiques**

- La Reconnaissance juridique des thérapies alternatives* ..... 169  
René Laperrière

- Constitutional Inadequacy* ..... 183  
Paul Romney

<b>Reviews/Recensions:</b>	197
William Galston. <i>Liberal Purposes: Goods, Virtues, and Diversity in the Liberal State</i>	200
J. S. Andrews	
Augie Fleras and Jean Leonard Elliott. <i>The Challenge of Diversity: Multiculturalism in Canada</i>	205
Rita M. Bienvenue	
Franklin E. Zimring and Gordon Hawkins. <i>The Scale of Imprisonment</i>	207
Janet Chan	
Sandra Lee Bartky. <i>Femininity and Domination: Studies in the Phenomenology of Oppression</i>	211
F. C. DeCoste	
Carolyn A. Conley. <i>The Unwritten Law: Criminal Justice in Victorian Kent</i>	214
Simon Devereaux	
David Neal. <i>The Rule of Law in a Penal Colony: Law and Power in Early New South Wales</i>	218
Barrie Dyster	
Allen E. Buchanan and Dan W. Brock. <i>Deciding for Others: The Ethics of Surrogate Decision Making</i>	221
Joan M. Gilmour	
Mark Poster. <i>The Mode of Information: Poststructuralism and Social Context</i>	227
David Howes	
James Boyd White. <i>The Legal Imagination</i> , abridged edition	228
Tina Loo	
Richard Green. <i>Sexual Science and the Law</i>	233
Bruce MacDougall	
Andrew Heard. <i>Canadian Constitutional Conventions: The Marriage of Law and Politics</i>	
Leon E. Trakman. <i>Reasoning with the Charter</i>	239
J. P. McEvoy	
Elizabeth Villiers Gemmette, ed. <i>Law in Literature: Legal Themes in Short Stories</i>	243
Janice Dickin McGinnis	
Robert Doherty. <i>Disputed Waters: Native Americans and the Great Lakes Fishery</i>	246
Brad Morse	
Richard V. Ericson, Patricia M. Baranek and Janet B. L. Chang. <i>Representing Order: Crime, Law and Justice in the News Media</i>	250
Pat O'Malley	

Harold E. Pepinsky and Richard Quinney, eds.	
<i>Criminology as Peacemaking</i> .....	253
Pat O'Malley	
J. B. White. <i>Justice as Translation:</i>	
<i>An Essay in Cultural and Legal Criticism</i> .....	256
Daniel Sansfaçon	
Richard B. Sobol. <i>Bending the Law:</i>	
<i>The Story of the Dalkon Shield Bankruptcy</i> .....	261
Ed Schollenberg	
Kerry Abel and Jean Friesen, eds. <i>Aboriginal Resource Use in Canada: Historical and Legal Aspects</i> .....	263
Bruce Stadfeld	
Edward C. Page. <i>Localism and Centralism in Europe: The Political and Legal Bases of Local Self-Government</i> .....	267
Mary Stokes	
Lubomyr Luciuk and Stella Hryniuk, eds. <i>Canada's Ukrainians: Negotiating an Identity</i> and	
Bohdan S. Kordan and Peter Melnycky, eds. <i>In the Shadow of the Rockies: Diary of the Castle Mountain Internment Camp, 1915–1917</i> .....	270
Jonathan Swainger	
Karen Anderson. <i>Chain Her by One Foot: The Subjugation of Women in Seventeenth-Century New France</i> .....	275
Kathryn A. Young	
<b>Index</b> .....	279
<b>Notes aux auteurs</b> .....	287
<b>Notes to Authors</b> .....	288