# Ecclesiastical Law Journal

PUBLISHED BY CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
ON BEHALF OF THE ECCLESIASTICAL LAW SOCIETY

## **Ecclesiastical Law Journal**

Editor Will Adam
Consultant Editor Mark Hill QC
Book Review Editor Charlotte Smith
Case Notes Editor David Willink
Parliament & Synod Editor Frank Cranmer

#### EDITORIAL BOARD

Garth Blake SC Professional Standards Commission, Anglican Church of Australia

Professor Ana María Celis Brunet Catholic University of Chile, Santiago

Professor Norman Doe Centre for Law and Religion, Cardiff University

Professor Silvio Ferrari University of Milan

The Right Worshipful Charles George QC Dean of the Arches, London

Professor Richard Helmholz University of Chicago

Sir John Laws Sometime Lord Justice of Appeal, London

Professor Douglas Laycock University of Virginia School of Law

Professor Ian Leigh Department of Law, Durham University

Professor David McClean QC Sometime Chancellor of the Diocese of Sheffield

Professor Javier Martínez-Torrón Complutense University, Madrid

Dr Robert Ombres OP Blackfriars Hall, University of Oxford

Professor Julian Rivers School of Law, University of Bristol

Professor Dr Gerhard Robbers University of Trier

Stephen Slack Registrar and Chief Legal Adviser to the General Synod

Professor Marco Ventura Catholic University of Leuven

Professor John Witte Jr Center for the Study of Law and Religion, Emory University, Atlanta

#### Subscriptions

The Ecclesiastical Law Journal (ISSN 0956-618X) provides authoritative coverage and incisive commentary upon the laws applicable to Anglican churches and other religions and faith communities from ecumenical, international, social, historical, theological and comparative perspectives. It is published three times a year in January, May and September. Three parts form a volume. The subscription price which includes delivery by air where appropriate (but excluding VAT) of volume 22, 2020, which includes print and online access, is  $f_{197}$ (US \$366 in USA, Canada and Mexico) for institutions and individual subscribers. Single parts are £76 (US \$140 in USA, Canada and Mexico) plus postage. EU subscribers (outside the UK) who are not registered for VAT should add VAT at their country's rate. VAT registered members should provide their VAT registration number. Japanese prices for institutions (including ASP delivery) are available from Kinokuniya Company Ltd, P.O. Box 55, Chitose, Tokyo 156, Japan.

Orders, which must be accompanied by payment, may be sent to a bookseller, subscription agent or direct to the publisher: Cambridge University Press, University , Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8Bs; or in the USA, Canada and Mexico: Cambridge University Press, One Liberty Plaza, New York, NY 100060.

#### Copying

This journal is registered with the Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, USA. Organizations in the USA who are also registered with the CCC may therefore copy material (beyond the limits permitted by sections 107 and 108 of US Copyright law) subject to payment to the CCC of the per copy fee of \$15.00. This consent does not extend to multiple copying for promotional or commercial purposes. Code 0956-618X /19. ISI Tear Sheet Service, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104, USA, is authorized to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only. Organizations authorized by the Copyright Licensing Agency may also copy material subject to the usual conditions. For all other use, permission should be sought from Cambridge or from the American Branch of Cambridge University Press.

© The Ecclesiastical Law Society 2019

Printed in the UK by Bell and Bain Ltd, Glasgow

### **Contents**

| EDITORIAL |
|-----------|
|-----------|

1 Will Adam

ARTICLES

2 The Welsh Church Act 1914: A Century of Constitutional Freedom for the Church in Wales?
Norman Doe

15 R v Dudley and Stephens: Degeneration, the Christian Mindset and Judicial Reasoning
Malcolm Woolrich

COMMENT

36 A Critique of the Decision in Conisbee that Vegetarianism Is Not 'A Belief' Frank Cranmer and Russell Sandberg

REDISCOVERING ANGLICAN PRIEST-JURISTS: II

49 Samuel Hallifax (1733–1790) Norman Doe

CONFERENCE REPORT

67 Colloquium of Anglican and Roman Catholic Canon Lawyers Jane Steen and Helen Costigane SHCJ

GOVERNMENT AND PARLIAMENTARY REPORT

70 Frank Cranmer

SYNOD REPORTS

- 76 General Synod of the Church of England Frank Cranmer
- 79 General Assembly of the Church of Scotland Jason Lingiah
- 83 Governing Body of the Church in Wales
  Matthew Chinery
- 87 General Synod of the Church of Ireland
  Cate Turner
- 90 General Synod of the Scottish Episcopal Church *John F Stuart*
- 94 General Synod of the Anglican Church of Canada Alan T Perry
- 98 General Synod of the Hong Kong Sheng Kung Hui *Alan T Perry*

#### BOOK REVIEWS

- 100 God and the Secular Legal System, by Rafael Domingo Review by Norman Doe
- Bonds of Wool: The Pallium and Papal Power in the Middle Ages, by Steven A Schoenig SJ Review by Sarah Foot
- 106 The Contested Place of Religion in Family Law, edited by Robin Fretwell Wilson Review by Russell Sandberg
- 109 Comparative Religious Law: Judaism, Christianity and Islam, by Norman Doe and Islamic International Law: Historical Foundations and Al-Shaybani's Siyar, by Khaled Ramadan Bashir Review by Nicholas Coulton
- 113 Leading Works in Law and Religion, edited by Russell Sandberg
  Review by Patrick Nash

CASE NOTES

116 Edited by David Willink