

Assessment of thyroid function in children, adults and pregnant and lactating women after long-term salt iodisation measurements

Xiaohui Su¹, Mu Li², Lixiang Liu¹, Hongmei Shen¹, Patrick J. Kelly², Yanling Wang³, Zhihui Chen⁴, Jinbiao Wang⁵, Weidong Li⁶, Huixin Chen⁷, Bangzhong Xiao⁸, Yunfeng Han⁹, Shoujun Liu^{1*} and Peng Liu^{1*}

¹Key Lab of Etiology and Epidemiology, Education Bureau of Heilongjiang Province & Ministry of Health, Center for Endemic Disease Control, Chinese Center for Disease Control and Prevention, Harbin Medical University, No. 157 Baojian Road, Nangang District, Harbin 150081, People's Republic of China

²Sydney School of Public Health, China Studies Centre, The University of Sydney, Sydney 2006, Australia

³Center for Disease Control of Gansu Province, No. 93 Duanjiatan Road, Lanzhou 730020, People's Republic of China

⁴Center for Disease Control of Fujian Province, No. 76 Jintai Road, Fuzhou 350001, People's Republic of China

⁵Institute for Endemic Disease Control of Shandong Province, No. 11 Yandongxin Road, Lixia District, Jinan 250014, People's Republic of China

⁶Center for Disease Control of Anhui Province, Hefei Economic and Technological Development Zone (12560 Prosperous Avenue), Hefei 230061, People's Republic of China

⁷The Second Institute for Endemic Disease Control of Jilin Province, No. 23 Chongqing Road, Jilin 132001, People's Republic of China

⁸Center for Disease Control of Chongqing Municipality, No. 8 Changjiang II Road, Yuzhong District, Chongqing 400042, People's Republic of China

⁹Public Health School, Qiqihar Medical University, No. 333 Bukuibe Road, Jianhua District, Qiqihar 161006, People's Republic of China

(Submitted 24 August 2017 – Final revision received 5 January 2018 – Accepted 22 January 2018 – First published online 27 March 2018)

Abstract

Universal salt iodisation (USI) has been successfully implemented in China for more than 15 years. Recent evidence suggests that the definition of 'adequate iodine' (100–199 µg/l) be revised to 'sufficient iodine' (100–299 µg/l) based on the median urinary iodine concentration (MUI) in school-age children. The objective of this study was to determine the prevalence of thyroid dysfunction in populations after long-term salt iodisation and examine whether the definition of adequate iodine can be broadened to sufficient iodine based on the thyroid function in four population groups. A cross-sectional survey was conducted in six provinces in the northern, central and southern regions of China. Four population groups consisting of 657 children, 755 adults, 347 pregnant women and 348 lactating women were recruited. Three spot urinary samples were collected over a 10-d period and blood samples were collected on the 1st day. In the study, among the adults, pregnant women and lactating women, the prevalence rates of elevated thyroglobulin antibody and thyroid microsomal antibody levels were 12.4, 8.5 and 7.8%, and 12.1, 9.1 and 9.1%, respectively. Abnormally high thyroid dysfunction prevalence was not observed after more than 15 years of USI in China because the thyroid dysfunction rates were all <5%. The recommended range should be cautiously broadened from adequate iodine to sufficient iodine according to the MUI of school-age children considering the high levels of hormones and antibodies in the other populations. Adults, particularly pregnant women positive for thyroid antibodies, should be closely monitored.

Key words: Urinary iodine: Children: Adults: Pregnant women: Lactating women

In China, universal salt iodisation (USI) as a national strategy has been successfully implemented since 1995⁽¹⁾. As the implementation of USI, six national iodine deficiency disorder (IDD) surveys have been conducted, and the goitre rate decreased from 9.6% in 1997⁽²⁾ to 2.6% in 2014⁽³⁾. Thus, the

consumption of iodised salt is an effective means for reducing the prevalence of iodine deficiency goitre. Furthermore, the median urinary iodine concentration (MUI) of children was 197.9 µg/l in 2014, which lies within the range of 'adequate iodine' nutrition. In populations with long-standing iodine

Abbreviations: FT₃, free triiodothyronine; FT₄, free thyroxine; MUI, median urinary iodine concentration; Tg, thyroglobulin; TgAb, thyroglobulin antibody; TMAb, thyroid microsomal antibody; TPOAb, thyroid peroxidase antibody; TSH, thyroid-stimulating hormone; TT₃, total triiodothyronine; TT₄, total thyroxine; USI, universal salt iodisation.

* **Corresponding authors:** S. Liu, email liusj590406@163.com; P. Liu, email liup7878@163.com

deficiency, a rapid increase in iodine intake is associated with the risk of iodine-induced hyperthyroidism⁽⁴⁾. This adverse condition usually occurs 5–10 years after the introduction of iodised salt^(5,6). After that period, an MUI as high as 300 µg/l was not associated with thyroid dysfunction in populations consuming adequately iodised salt⁽⁴⁾. In Iran, consumption of iodised salt, containing 40 parts per million of iodine, did not cause an increase in the prevalence of thyroid dysfunction after 12 years of salt iodisation⁽⁷⁾. Two national studies from Poland have shown that a rapid rise in iodine intake 2 years after implementation of iodine prophylaxis among adults from areas with a high prevalence rate of iodine deficiency led to an increase in thyroid autoimmunity and the prevalence of hyperthyroidism⁽⁸⁾. However, investigations regarding the adverse effects of long-term USI programmes are rarely reported⁽⁹⁾, except for a few reports on goitre associated with excessive iodine intake in children⁽¹⁰⁾.

The MUI in children has been used as a proxy indicator of iodine nutrition status for all populations. A recent multinational study suggested that in school-age children, for the assessment of iodine nutrition, a single category of 'sufficient iodine' (MUI 100–299 µg/l, Zimmermann *et al.*) can be used to replace the current 'adequate iodine' (MUI 100–199 µg/l, WHO) and 'above requirement' (MUI 200–299 µg/l, WHO) statuses⁽¹¹⁾. However, this study was conducted only in children and was based on the children's thyroid function, without considering the potential effects on the thyroid function of other populations living in the same area.

The aims of this study were: (1) to assess the extent of thyroid dysfunction in Chinese children, adults, pregnant women and lactating women after 15 years of USI implementation, (2) to compare the prevalence of thyroid dysfunction in children with apparent optimal (or adequate) iodine and above requirement iodine statuses and (3) to verify whether the prevalence rates of thyroid dysfunction in adults, pregnant women and lactating women differ between areas of adequate iodine status and above requirement iodine status.

Methods

Sampling methods

A cross-sectional survey was conducted. The Yangtze River and Yellow River divide China into its southern, central and northern regions. From each region, two provinces representing urban and rural settings, respectively, were selected (southern: Fujian and Chongqing; central: Shandong and Anhui; and northern: Gansu and Jilin) (Table 1). In each province, one community (or township in a rural area) was chosen according to the economic level (medium level), coverage rate of iodised salt (>95%) and iodine concentration in drinking water (<10 µg/l). In each surveyed community, 100 school children aged 8–10 years (girls/boys, 1:1), 100 adults aged 18–45 years (women/men, 1:1), fifty pregnant women (evenly distributed according to trimester of pregnancy) and fifty lactating women were recruited from schools (children), households (adults) and clinics (pregnant women and lactating women). All participants had lived in the selected areas for more than 12 months, did not

have any self-reported thyroid diseases, and were not consuming antithyroid or thyroid hormone medicines before the investigation. The final sample size is presented in Table 1.

Sample collection and measurement

The participants' spot urinary samples were collected three times during a 10-d period. Venous blood samples were obtained from all participants on the 1st day of urinary sample collection. Serum thyroid function and antibody levels were determined at the special test centre of Tianjin Medical University General Hospital. Free triiodothyronine (FT₃), free thyroxine (FT₄), total triiodothyronine (TT₃), total thyroxine (TT₄) and thyroid-stimulating hormone (TSH) were measured using a chemiluminescent immunoassay (Bayer ADVIA Centaur System); thyroglobulin (Tg), thyroglobulin antibody (TgAb) and thyroid microsomal antibody (TMAB) were measured using the RIA method (China Institute of Atomic Energy). Urinary iodine concentration was measured by the participating provincial laboratories by using the acid digestion method (WS/T107-2006)^(12,13); and the internal quality control samples of urinary iodine were provided by the China National Iodine Deficiency Disorders Reference Laboratory, which is a member of the Programme for Ensuring the Quality of Iodine Procedures.

Diagnostic criteria

An iodine nutrition status of sufficient iodine in children is defined as MUI 100–299 µg/l according to Zimmermann *et al.*⁽¹¹⁾, adequate iodine is defined as MUI 100–199 µg/l, and above requirement is defined as MUI 200–299 µg/l according to the WHO guidelines⁽⁴⁾. Whether the adequate iodine and above requirement groups can be combined to form a sufficient iodine group depends on the differences in thyroid dysfunction in adults, pregnant women and lactating women between two areas with child iodine nutrition of adequate iodine and above requirement statuses. If no differences are observed, they can be combined. In the present study, the criteria for diagnosing serum thyroid dysfunction in children and pregnant women were the standard criteria established by Tianjin Medical University^(14–15); the criteria for adults and lactating women were established by the special test centre of Tianjin Medical University General Hospital. All reference values listed in Table 2 were established based on Chinese data as well as international criteria, and thyroid function references for pregnant women were specific to the trimester of pregnancy^(16,17). The diagnosis criteria for thyroid dysfunction included cut-offs for individual indicators and for proportions indicating high prevalence or public health significance. Regarding individual indicators, the normal reference values of FT₄ in whole blood were 13.4–20.6 pmol/l in children and 11.5–23.5 pmol/l in adults and lactating women; in the first, second and third trimesters of pregnancy, the normal reference values of FT₄ in whole blood were 11.8–21.0, 10.6–17.6 and 9.2–16.7 pmol/l, respectively. The normal reference values of TSH levels were 1.0–8.40 mIU/l in children; 0.3–5.0 mIU/l in adults and lactating women; and 0.03–4.51, 0.05–4.50 and 0.35–4.54 mIU/l in the first, second and third trimesters of pregnancy, respectively. The reference values for Tg status, TgAb levels and TMAB levels as

individual indicators were <25 ng/ml, <30% and <25%, respectively, in the four groups. The prevalence of thyroid dysfunction was used for determining effects of the USI programme on public health, and prevalence of ≥5% was defined as a public health problem⁽⁴⁾. The prevalence rates of thyroid dysfunction in adults, pregnant women and lactating women were compared between areas with child MUI in the adequate iodine and above requirement ranges to determine if it is appropriate to combine them into a single category.

Statistical analysis

The SPSS (version 20.0; Polar Engineering and Consulting) and WPS Excel 9.1 (Beijing and Zhuhai Kingsoft Software Company) software packages were used for data analysis. The sample size of each province was determined by the variation of the urinary iodine concentration; when the variation of MUI was 10%, the sample size was 200⁽¹⁸⁾. The prevalence rates of thyroid dysfunction, including subclinical hypothyroidism, overt hypothyroidism, subclinical hyperthyroidism, overt hyperthyroidism and elevated levels of Tg, TgAb and TMAB were separately calculated for the four population groups. Then, thyroid dysfunction prevalence and thyroid function results were compared between two provinces with MUI in the adequate iodine (child MUI at 100–199 µg/l) range and two provinces with MUI in the above requirement (child MUI at 200–299 µg/l) range for the four population groups. The median, upper and lower quartiles were calculated to describe the variables with a skewed distribution, such as the urinary iodine concentration and levels of TSH, Tg, TgAb and TMAB. Means and standard deviations were used to describe variables with a normal distribution, such as levels of FT₃, FT₄, TT₃ and TT₄. The χ² test was used to evaluate differences in thyroid abnormality prevalence. The Mann–Whitney *U* test and one-way ANOVA were used for comparisons of skewed and normally distributed variables, respectively. The mean difference and 95% CI were also calculated for each comparison pair. The results were considered statistically significant when *P* < 0.05 throughout the study.

Ethics committee approval

This study was conducted according to the guidelines established in the Declaration of Helsinki, and all procedures involving human volunteers were approved by the Ethics Committee of Harbin Medical University (no. HMUe09.n3). Written informed consent was obtained from the pregnant women, lactating women and adults, and permission was obtained from guardians of the children.

Results

Thyroid dysfunction in four populations

The basic information of each province and each population group is presented in Table 1. In total, 657 children, 755 adults, 347 pregnant women and 348 lactating women were recruited during the study. No abnormally high prevalence (>5%) of thyroid dysfunction (subclinical or overt hyper- or hypothyroidism) was observed in any of the population groups.

Table 1. Basic information of survey sites in six provinces

Provinces	Location	City/rural	Iodine level*	Median urinary iodine																							
				Children			Adults			Pregnant women			Lactating women														
				n	1st	2nd	3rd	Ave	QL–QU	n	1st	2nd	3rd	Ave	QL–QU	n	1st	2nd	3rd	Ave	QL–QU						
Fujian	South	City	Excessive	111	267.3	324.6	398.2	319.5	255.5–394.3	119	174.4	196.7	202.1	196.6	139.3–264.6	61	109.1	185.1	166.0	158.7	114.0–213.6	50	110.9	141.3	135.3	136.4	99.4–187.9
Chongqing	South	Rural	Adequate	100	223.0	152.4	176.2	197.3	143.6–254.1	100	275.2	202.3	210.2	233.8	184.0–281.7	50	207.1	139.4	187.2	151.5	112.4–190.7	50	176.1	118.8	121.6	151.3	111.4–213.1
Shandong	Central	City	Above requirement	108	261.6	257.2	314.5	291.6	237.4–348.7	188	307.2	270.9	343.7	332.0	255.6–387.3	76	201.6	205.8	289.1	220.7	169.4–334.7	65	235.4	190.2	269.4	244.0	171.1–308.8
Ahui	Central	Rural	Above requirement	127	291.6	329.5	295.5	284.3	194.1–401.8	132	325.6	381.1	368.7	338.6	276.2–442.8	50	223.1	171.9	233.1	203.7	144.5–284.0	68	194.9	251.4	163.8	212.0	148.2–308.4
Gansu	North	City	Excessive	100	358.6	300.7	349.5	332.1	284.1–388.2	104	189.0	250.0	216.5	218.8	182.3–272.3	52	266.6	318.5	250.6	274.7	203.8–315.8	59	239.5	190.8	167.5	217.9	165.9–270.8
Jilin	North	Rural	Adequate	111	186.9	218.7	196.4	192.2	164.9–238.7	112	262.2	269.2	279.5	266.0	222.9–323.4	58	193.4	170.8	197.3	199.6	145.2–244.4	56	193.0	225.9	262.9	223.8	161.0–271.0
Total				657	253.7	257.6	277.8	271.0	194.1–354.1	755	251.0	250.6	259.5	260.6	197.2–337.7	347	194.8	202.0	209.9	206.9	153.3–276.4	348	185.1	191.0	180.8	193.9	138.4–262.0

Ave, average of three times, 1st the first sample, 2nd the second sample, 3rd the third sample in 10 d; QL–QU, lower and upper quartiles. * Based on children's median urinary iodine for three times.

However, the elevated TgAb level prevalence rates in the adults, pregnant women and lactating women were 12.4, 8.5 and 7.8%, respectively, and the elevated TMAb level prevalence rates in these populations were 12.1, 9.1 and 9.1%, respectively (Table 2).

Comparison of thyroid dysfunction prevalence between regions with median urinary iodine concentration in the adequate iodine and above requirement ranges

To determine whether the prevalence of thyroid dysfunction differed between populations with MUI in the adequate and above requirement ranges, Jilin (192.2 µg/l) and Chongqing (197.3 µg/l) were designated as the adequate iodine group, whereas Anhui (284.3 µg/l) and Shandong (291.6 µg/l) were designated as the above requirement group. Results for Fujian (319.5 µg/l) and Gansu (332.1 µg/l) are presented in the online Supplementary Table S1 together with the interquartile range because MUI in the school-aged children from these provinces was >300 µg/l, which is beyond the range with which the study is concerned. For comparisons of the prevalence of thyroid dysfunction (including subclinical hypothyroidism; overt hypothyroidism; subclinical hyperthyroidism; overt hyperthyroidism; and elevated Tg, TgAb and TMAb levels; upper parts of Tables 3 and 4, online Supplementary Tables S2 and S3), the public health cut-off was set for reference as 5%⁽⁴⁾. The above requirement group did not exhibit a higher thyroid dysfunction rate in all four populations compared with the adequate iodine group. In the adults, the above requirement group had higher prevalence rates of elevated TgAb levels (>30%) and elevated TMAb levels (>20%) than the adequate iodine group did. However, among the pregnant women and lactating women, the above requirement group exhibited lower prevalence rates of elevated TgAb levels and elevated TMAb levels than the adequate iodine group did, although the differences were not statistically significant.

In comparisons of the mean or median thyroid function parameters and thyroid antibody levels (lower parts of Tables 3 and 4, online Supplementary Tables S2 and S3), the adequate iodine group was considered the control group and the above requirement group was considered the experimental group. If no difference was observed between the means or medians of the two groups, they could be combined to form a single sufficient iodine group. The major significant differences between the two groups were in the Tg, TgAb and TMAb levels. For the children and adults, the Tg level was lower in the above requirement group than in the adequate iodine group; however, the level was higher in the pregnant and lactating women in the above requirement group than in the adequate iodine group. In the children, the above requirement group had a lower TgAb level and a higher TMAb level than the adequate iodine group did. Among the adults, no significant differences in the levels of the two antibodies were observed between the two groups. Among the pregnant women and lactating women, the TgAb and TMAb levels were both lower in the above requirement group than in the adequate iodine group. For other parameters, minor statistically significant differences were observed in the TSH, FT₃, FT₄, TT₃ and TT₄ levels between the

Table 2. The thyroid abnormal of four populations in six provinces based on universal salt iodisation for more than 15 years (Percentages and numbers)

Categories	Indicators	Children			Adults			Pregnant women			Lactating women			
		Reference	n	%	Reference	n	%	Reference	n	%	Reference	n	%	
Sub hypothyroidism	TSH (mIU/l)	>8.4	631	2.4	>5.0	700	4.8	T1: TSH>4.51, FT ₄ 11.8–21.0	327	3.4	11	>5.0	329	4.3
	FT ₄ (pmol/l)	13.4–20.6	631	0.0	11.5–23.5	700	0.6	T2: TSH>4.50, FT ₄ 10.6–17.6	327	0.0	0	11.5–23.5	329	0.6
Overt hypothyroidism	TSH (mIU/l)	>8.4	631	0.0	>5.0	700	0.6	T3: TSH>4.54, FT ₄ 9.2–16.7	327	0.0	0	>5.0	329	0.6
	FT ₄ (pmol/l)	<13.4	631	2.2	<11.5	700	1.1	T1: TSH>4.51, FT ₄ <11.8	327	0.0	0	<11.5	329	0.6
Sub hyperthyroidism	TSH (mIU/l)	<1.0	631	2.2	<0.3	700	1.1	T2: TSH>4.50, FT ₄ <10.6	327	0.0	0	<0.3	329	2.1
	FT ₄ (pmol/l)	13.4–20.6	631	0.4	11.5–23.5	700	0.0	T3: TSH>4.54, FT ₄ <9.2	327	0.0	0	11.5–23.5	329	0.6
Overt hyperthyroidism	TSH (mIU/l)	<1.0	631	0.4	<0.3	700	0.0	T1: TSH<0.03, FT ₄ 11.8–21.0	327	0.0	0	<0.3	329	0.6
	FT ₄ (pmol/l)	>20.6	631	0.5	>23.5	700	0.0	T2: TSH<0.05, FT ₄ 10.6–17.6	327	0.0	0	>23.5	329	0.6
Elevated Tg	Tg (ng/ml)	>25	632	0.5	>25	696	3.0	T3: TSH<0.35, FT ₄ 9.2–16.7	326	1.5	5	>25	329	1.2
	TgAb (%)	>30	633	2.8	>30	700	12.4	T1: TSH<0.03, FT ₄ >21.0	328	8.5	28	>30	333	7.8
	TMAb (%)	>20	536	3.2	>20	596	12.1	T2: TSH<0.05, FT ₄ >17.6	276	9.1	25	>20	274	9.1
Elevated TMAb	TgAb (%)	>20	536	3.2	>20	596	12.1	T3: TSH<0.35, FT ₄ >16.7	276	9.1	25	>20	274	9.1
	TMAb (%)	>20	536	3.2	>20	596	12.1	T1: TSH<0.03, FT ₄ >21.0	276	9.1	25	>20	274	9.1
	TMAb (%)	>20	536	3.2	>20	596	12.1	T2: TSH<0.05, FT ₄ >17.6	276	9.1	25	>20	274	9.1

TSH, thyroid-stimulating hormone; FT₄, free thyroxine; Tg, thyroglobulin; TgAb, thyroglobulin antibody; TMAb, thyroid microsomal antibody.

Table 3. Thyroid dysfunction and thyroid function parameters of children and adults by different iodine status areas (Percentages and numbers; mean differences and 95 % confidence intervals; medians and lower and upper quartiles (QL–QU); mean values and standard deviations)

	Children						Adults							
	Jilin, Chongqing (MUI 100–199 µg/l) (n 211)		Anhui, Shandong (MUI 200–299 µg/l) (n 217)		P*	Mean difference	95% CI	Jilin, Chongqing (n 212)		Anhui, Shandong (n 274)		P*	Mean difference	95% CI
	%	n/N	%	n/N				%	n/N	%	n/N			
Sub hypothyroidism	1.91	4/209	1.84	4/217	0.96	0.07	– 1.18, – 0.17	2.84	6/211	4.04	11/272	0.48	– 1.20	– 4.44, 2.04
Overt hypothyroidism	0	0/209	0	0/217	–	–	–	0/211	1.47	4/272	0.08	– 1.47	– 2.90, 0.04	
Sub hyperthyroidism	2.87	6/209	1.38	3/217	0.68	1.49	– 2.92, 2.14	1.90	4/211	0.74	2/272	0.25	1.16	– 0.94, 3.26
Overt hyperthyroidism	0	0/209	0.92	2/217	0.98	– 0.92	– 6.97, 5.34	0	0/211	0	0/272	–	–	–
Elevated Tg >25 ng/ml	0.95	2/211	0.00	0/215	0.15	0.95	– 0.36, 2.26	3.30	7/212	3.66	10/273	0.83	– 0.36	– 3.64, 2.92
Elevated TgAb >30 %	3.79	8/211	3.72	8/215	0.97	– 0.07	– 3.54, 3.68	12.74	27/212	14.65	40/273	0.54	– 1.92	– 8.06, 4.23
Elevated TMAb >20 %	3.32	7/211	3.72	8/215	0.82	– 0.40	– 3.90, 3.10	12.74	27/212	13.55	37/273	0.79	– 0.82	– 6.87, 5.23
TSH (mIU/l)					0.38							0.03		
Median	2.91		2.79			0.17	– 0.15, 0.50	1.65		1.86			– 0.67	– 1.20, – 0.15
QL–QU	2.14–4.02		2.12–3.86					1.17–2.34		1.28–2.76				
Tg (ng/ml)					0.00							0.00		
Median	6.17		5.34			1.22	0.63, 1.82	8.12		5.56			1.53	– 1.11, 4.17
QL–QU	5.09–7.79		3.28–7.33					6.56–10.14		4.17–8.02				
TgAb (%)					0.00							0.68		
Median	2.86		1.74			1.27	– 0.79, 3.34	2.21		2.06			– 0.39	– 3.94, 3.17
QL–QU	2.10–3.47		1.17–2.79					1.43–3.29		1.41–4.08				
TMAb (%)					0.03							0.54		
Median	1.61		1.85			0.16	– 1.24, 1.56	2.12		2.08			– 0.46	– 2.85, 1.93
QL–QU	1.06–2.44		1.49–2.30					1.26–3.46		1.42–3.90				
FT ₃ (pmol/l)					0.05							0.34		
Mean	5.76		5.88			– 0.12	– 0.23, 0.00	4.87		4.94			– 0.06	– 0.20, – 0.07
SD	0.62		0.62					0.66		0.79				
FT ₄ (pmol/l)					0.28							0.01		
Mean	16.47		16.65			– 0.19	– 0.53, 0.15	15.94		16.62			– 0.67	– 1.14, – 0.20
SD	1.70		1.88					2.59		2.66				
TT ₃ (nmol/l)					0.00							0.00		
Mean	2.52		2.72			– 0.20	– 0.28, – 0.12	1.94		2.08			– 0.15	– 0.22, – 0.08
SD	0.40		0.43					0.34		0.43				
TT ₄ (nmol/l)					0.68							0.00		
Mean	112.83		113.55			– 0.72	– 4.19, 2.75	96.31		103.66			– 7.09	– 10.67, – 3.52
SD	17.56		18.89					16.57		20.32				

Thyroid function after salt iodisation

MUI, median urinary iodine concentration; Tg, thyroglobulin; TgAb, thyroglobulin antibody; TMAb, thyroid microsomal antibody; TSH, thyroid stimulating hormone; FT₃, free triiodothyronine; FT₄, free thyroxine; TT₃, total triiodothyronine; TT₄, total thyroxine.

*One-way ANOVA was used for FT₃, FT₄, TT₃ and TT₄; Mann–Whitney *U* test was adopted for TSH, Tg, TgAb and TMAb; χ^2 test was used for subclinical hypothyroidism, overt hypothyroidism, subclinical hyperthyroidism, overt hyperthyroidism, elevated Tg, Elevated TgAb and elevated TMAb. *P* < 0.05 was considered significant.

Table 4. Thyroid dysfunction and thyroid function parameters of pregnant women and lactating women by different iodine status areas (Percentages and numbers; mean differences and 95 % confidence intervals; medians and lower and upper quartiles (QL–QU); mean values and standard deviations)

	Pregnant women						Lactating women							
	Jilin, Chongqing† (n 107)		Anhui, Shandong‡ (n 121)		P*	Mean difference	95% CI	Jilin, Chongqing† (n 106)		Anhui, Shandong‡ (n 128)		P*	Mean difference	95% CI
	%	n/N	%	n/N				%	n/N	%	n/N			
Sub hypothyroidism	1.89	2/106	2.48	3/121	0.76	-0.59	-4.39, 3.20	3.88	4/103	3.94	5/127	0.98	-0.05	-5.09, 4.98
Overt hypothyroidism	0	0/106	0	0/121	-	-	-	0.97	1/103	0.79	1/127	0.88	0.18	-2.26, 2.62
Sub hyperthyroidism	0	0/106	0	0/121	-	-	-	1.94	2/103	3.15	4/127	0.57	-1.21	-5.25, 2.83
Overt hyperthyroidism	0	0/106	0	0/121	-	-	-	0	0/103	1.57	2/127	0.20	-1.57	-3.74, 0.59
Elevated Tg >25 ng/ml	0.93	1/107	0.83	1/121	0.94	0.10	-2.32, 2.52	2.83	3/106	0	0/128	0.06	2.83	-0.33, 5.99
Elevated TgAb >30 %	11.21	12/107	4.96	6/121	0.08	6.26	-0.86, 13.38	10.38	11/106	8.59	11/128	0.64	1.78	-5.78, 9.35
Elevated TMAb >20 %	12.15	13/107	4.96	6/121	0.05	7.19	-0.11, 14.49	11.32	12/106	9.38	12/128	0.63	1.95	-5.92, 9.81
TSH (mIU/l)					0.87	0.06	-0.23, 0.36					0.36	-0.06	-0.63, 0.51
Median	1.82		1.73					1.82		1.98				
QL–QU	1.12–2.45		1.19–2.56					1.29–2.65		1.39–2.85				
Tg (ng/ml)					0.00	-3.03	-3.40, -1.66					0.00	0.85	-1.72, 3.43
Median	3.11		6.18					4.04		5.46				
QL–QU	2.20–4.76		4.80–7.75					2.30–6.93		4.10–6.89				
TgAb (%)					0.04	4.50	1.03, 7.98					0.28	1.68	-2.23, 5.60
Median	2.32		1.91					2.02		1.82				
QL–QU	1.46–4.33		1.32–3.12					1.15–5.20		0.91–3.89				
TMAb (%)					0.01	2.86	0.49, 5.23					0.00	1.77	-0.97, 4.51
Median	2.34		1.94					2.68		1.95				
QL–QU	1.96–3.04		1.49–4.34					2.21–5.34		1.48–4.56				
FT ₃ (pmol/l)					0.00	-0.43	-0.59, -0.27					0.00	-0.38	-0.64, -0.13
Mean	3.84		4.27					4.61		5.00				
SD	0.50		0.69					0.72		1.18				
FT ₄ (pmol/l)					0.00	-1.75	-2.99, -0.63					0.06	-0.94	-1.90, 0.02
Mean	12.54		14.30					14.93		15.86				
SD	1.70		5.68					2.90		4.27				
TT ₃ (nmol/l)					0.94	-0.01	-0.16, 0.15					0.13	-0.10	-0.24, 0.03
Mean	2.70		2.71					1.90		2.00				
SD	0.48		0.67					0.46		0.56				
TT ₄ (nmol/l)					0.00	-11.97	-19.59, -4.36					0.00	-11.41	-16.99, -5.84
Mean	128.26		140.24					87.72		99.14				
SD	22.63		33.88					18.91		23.53				

Tg, thyroglobulin; TgAb, thyroglobulin antibody; TMAb, thyroid microsomal antibody; TSH, thyroid stimulating hormone; FT₃, free triiodothyronine; FT₄, free thyroxine; TT₃, total triiodothyronine; TT₄, total thyroxine.

* One-way ANOVA test was used for FT₃, FT₄, TT₃ and TT₄; Mann–Whitney U test was adopted for TSH, Tg, TgAb and TMAb; χ^2 test was used for subclinical hypothyroidism, overt hypothyroidism, subclinical hyperthyroidism, overt hyperthyroidism, elevated Tg, Elevated TgAb and elevated TMAb. $P < 0.05$ was considered significant.

† Adequate, Jilin and Chongqing.

‡ Above requirement, Anhui and Shandong.

two groups. Differences in the TSH levels between the groups were not consistent among the populations. In the children and pregnant women, the TSH levels were lower in the above requirement group than in the adequate iodine group; however, in the adults and lactating women, the TSH level was higher in the above requirement group than in the adequate iodine group. The FT₃, FT₄, TT₃ and TT₄ levels in the above requirement group were all higher than those in the adequate iodine group in the four populations.

Overall, among the four population groups, the above requirement group exhibited higher thyroid hormone levels (FT₃, FT₄, TT₃ and TT₄) than the adequate iodine group did; however, the thyroid dysfunction prevalence was similar between the two groups.

Discussion

Features of iodine nutrition indicators

All indicators for assessing iodine nutrition, including urinary iodine, thyroid function, thyroid volume and thyroid dysfunction rate, have three features, namely collectiveness, time and variance. The collectiveness feature determines whether an indicator can be analysed at the individual level or population level; for example, MUI is used to evaluate population iodine nutrition as a collective indicator. The time feature pertains to the duration needed to reflect a change after iodine intake modification. Urinary iodine concentration only reflects iodine intake over the past few days^(19,20), whereas the thyroid volume changes relatively slowly^(21,22), and each index of thyroid function requires different periods to respond to iodine deficiency; for example, T₄ might require 4 weeks, whereas T₃ might require 5 weeks⁽²³⁾. The variation feature concerns variation among measurements when the individual iodine nutrition status is stable; for example, the urinary iodine concentration could vary by >100 µg/l from morning to evening each day. Sometimes, problems arise in analyses of the relationship between two iodine nutrition indices, which could be attributed to differences in the collectiveness, time and variation features between two analysed indices. Analysing two indices with different collectiveness features would result in biological fallacy⁽²⁴⁾, and two indices with different time and variation features would possibly exhibit a low correlation coefficient^(25,26).

Thyroid dysfunction after universal salt iodisation

Undeniably, the use of iodised salt has improved iodine intake, as indicated by increased urinary iodine concentrations, a considerable reduction in the prevalence of goitre, and improvement of the population intelligence quotient (IQ)⁽²⁷⁾. In this study, the thyroid dysfunction prevalence was assessed after more than 15 years of USI in China. The prevalence of subclinical and overt hyper- and hypothyroidism was <5% in all population groups, suggesting that more than 15 years of USI has not increased thyroid dysfunction prevalence. This is crucial in assuring the safety of USI and ensuring that it does not cause any side effects on thyroid function. Similar results have been reported in other countries, such as India and Bangladesh^(28,29). Furthermore, a longitudinal study conducted before and after USI in

Switzerland showed that USI had no pathological side effects; similar results were observed in a study from Denmark^(30,31). Other studies have reported the existence of an increase in thyroid autoimmunity and hyperthyroidism in adults, but these conditions were transient⁽⁸⁾. A recent WHO systematic review published in 2014 demonstrated the benefit of salt iodisation, but it had little evidence of adverse effects of salt iodisation⁽³²⁾.

In this study, the prevalence of elevated TgAb and TMAb levels in the adult population was 12.4 and 12.1%, respectively. A high thyroid antibody positivity rate was reported in the normal adult population; specifically, in Xinjiang, China, the prevalence of TgAb positivity was 23.2%, and that of thyroid peroxidase antibody (TPOAb) was 16.6%⁽³³⁾. A study in Washington, DC, USA, reported that women with MUI 100.1 µg/l had a TPOAb positivity rate of 8% and TgAb positivity rate of 15%. Overall, 16% women tested positive for at least one thyroid antibody (TPOAb and/or TgAb)⁽³⁴⁾. In Saudi Arabia, 26% of people aged 13–60 years tested positive for TPOAb and TgAb⁽³⁵⁾.

Although the consequences of thyroid antibody positivity in the normal adult population are not clear, some studies have suggested potential adverse consequences in pregnant women. Studies have reported that pregnant women with TPOAb positivity during pregnancy had an increased risk of postpartum thyroiditis⁽³⁶⁾ and are possibly associated with anaemia and a high mean platelet count⁽³⁷⁾. In women without autoimmune disease or hereditary thrombophilia, thyroid autoantibodies might directly increase the risk of recurrent pregnancy loss and obstetric complications^(38,39). The prevalence of thyroid antibodies (TPOAb and TgAb) is also associated with a higher incidence of adverse pregnancy outcomes, such as miscarriage, premature delivery, abruption of the placenta, and postpartum thyroiditis⁽⁴⁰⁾. Thyroid autoimmunity independent of thyroid dysfunction could have significant adverse outcomes in the mother and fetus⁽⁴¹⁾. Although the aforementioned studies present the adverse results of thyroid antibody positivity in pregnant women, some of them did not eliminate the influence of preexisting overt or subclinical thyroid disease during pregnancy, and some did not describe the iodine nutrient status of the participants; both might be confounding factors. Hence, data regarding the adverse effect of thyroid antibody positivity on pregnancy outcomes in euthyroid women remain inadequate. In the current study, the prevalence of thyroid antibodies was similar to that in the aforementioned studies. Although the prevalence of elevated thyroid antibody levels in the above requirement group was higher than that in the adequate iodine group in adults, it was lower in the pregnant women and lactating women. If thyroid antibodies are determined to be associated with the iodine status, this finding indicates that in areas where children have an adequate iodine level, pregnant and lactating women might be deficient, and adults might be above requirement. However, this assumption requires additional research for confirmation.

Criteria for iodine sufficiency

To determine whether combining the criteria of the adequate iodine and above requirement categories based on MUI for children is appropriate, the differences in thyroid dysfunction between the two categories must be considered. In

comparisons of the thyroid dysfunction prevalence in all four population groups, no statistically significant differences were found between the two categories; hence, combining the adequate iodine and above requirement ranges as sufficient iodine for children's iodine nutrition based on MUI might not increase thyroid abnormality in children and adults, including pregnant women and lactating women. However, increases in antibody levels in adults and some thyroid hormone indices in other populations indicate some potential risks associated with changing the range of children's urinary iodine from adequate (100–199 µg/l) to sufficient (100–299 µg/l); thus, this decision must be made cautiously.

Strengths and limitations

The data of this study were obtained from six provinces covering three broad subnational regions, providing a satisfactory representation of the Chinese situation. For comparison between adequate iodine and above requirement, two provinces together achieved a sample size above 200 for children and adults, and above 100 each for pregnant and lactating women, which according to the reference, had a variation of MUI between 5 and 10%⁽¹⁸⁾. In most surveys, a single spot urine sample is collected from the participants. In this study, three urine samples were collected in a 10-d period to control for the day-to-day urinary iodine variation in an individual. The variation of MUI was decreased considerably; however, larger sample size would reduce the variation further. In this study, potential side effects on thyroid function were investigated after more than 15 years of USI in four populations of participants who reported being healthy. Those who had received diagnoses of thyroid disease were not included in the evaluation. Because of the limited volume of serum, some tests were not performed for all participants. Unlike a previous study which used children's thyroid function as the evaluation standard to justify the combination of urinary iodine ranges⁽⁴²⁾, the present study used thyroid dysfunction in four population groups living in the same area. Additional studies on this topic should also consider the goitre rate, thyroid volume, TSH of newborns and IQ of young children.

Conclusions

The Chinese IDD prevention and control programme has been deemed as one of the most successful programmes globally. More than 15 years after the USI programme was implemented in China, no increase in thyroid dysfunction prevalence was found in four populations. Changing the range of children's urinary iodine from adequate to sufficient might not increase the thyroid abnormality rate in children and adults, including pregnant women and lactating women; however, it might increase their thyroid hormone level. Therefore, the range should be cautiously changed. Furthermore, adults, particularly pregnant women, positive for thyroid antibodies should be closely monitored.

Acknowledgements

The authors appreciate all organisations and all team members of the Eleventh Five-year National Support Project for Science

and Technology and National nature science project; the Chongqing, Gansu, Anhui, and Fujian provincial Centres for Disease Control; the Institute for Endemic Disease Control in Shandong and Jilin; and the Institute of Endocrinology, Tianjin Medical University. The authors also appreciate the constructive suggestion concerning the manuscript from professor Cres. J. Eastman.

This study was funded by Eleventh Five-year National Support Project for Science and Technology(2006BAI06B05) and National Nature Fund (81773370). The sponsors had no role in study design, data collection and analysis, the decision to publish, or preparation of the manuscript.

X. S., H. S. and S. L. designed the research; Y. W., Z. C., J. W., W. L., H. C. and B. X. carried out the field survey; X. S., P. J. K. and Y. H. analysed the data; P. L., M. L. and P. J. K. wrote the paper; S. L. and P. L. have primary responsibility for final content. All authors have read and approved the final manuscript.

The authors declare that they have no financial relationships with any organisations that might have an interest in the submitted work and no other relationships or activities that could appear to have influenced the submitted work.

Supplementary material

For supplementary material/s referred to in this article, please visit <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0007114518000570>

References

1. Zhao JK & Haar F (2005) Progress in salt iodization and improved iodine nutrition in China, 1995–99. *Food Nutr Bull* **25**, 337–343.
2. Lv JG, Liu SJ, Sun SQ, *et al.* (2000) *China National Iodine Deficiency Disorders Surveillance Report 1997*, 1st version. Beijing: People's Medical Publishing House.
3. Center for Endemic Disease Control of China CDC (2014) *2014 China National Iodine Deficiency Disorders Surveillance*, 2017, 1st version. Beijing: People's Medical Publishing House.
4. World Health Organization, United Nations International Children's Emergency Fund & International Council for Control of Iodine Deficiency Disorders (2007) *Assessment of Iodine Deficiency Disorders and Monitoring their Elimination: A Guide for Programme Managers*, 3rd ed. Geneva: WHO.
5. Todd CH, Allain T, Gomo ZAR, *et al.* (1995) Increase in thyrotoxicosis associated with iodine supplements in Zimbabwe. *Lancet* **346**, 1563–1564.
6. Stanbury JB, Ermans AE, Bourdoux P, *et al.* (1998) Iodine-induced hyperthyroidism: occurrence and epidemiology. *Thyroid* **8**, 83–100.
7. Azizi F, Navai L & Fattahi F (2002) Goiter prevalence, urinary iodine excretion, thyroid function and anti-thyroid function and anti-thyroid antibodies after 12 years of salt iodization in Shahriar, Iran. *Int J Vitam Nutr Res* **72**, 291–295.
8. Gólkowski F, Buziak-Bereza M, Trofimiuk M, *et al.* (2007) Increased prevalence of hyperthyroidism as an early and transient side-effect of implementing iodine prophylaxis. *Public Health Nutr* **10**, 799–802.
9. Clar C, Wu T, Liu G, *et al.* (2002) Iodized salt for iodine deficiency disorders. A systematic review. *Endocrinol Metab Clin North Am* **31**, 681–698.
10. Chen W, Li X, Wu Y, *et al.* (2017) Associations between iodine intake, thyroid volume, and goiter rate in school-aged Chinese

- children from areas with high iodine drinking water concentrations. *Am J Clin Nutr* **105**, 228–233.
11. Zimmermann MB, Aeberli I, Andersson M, *et al.* (2013) Thyroglobulin is a sensitive measure of both deficient and excess iodine intakes in children and indicates no adverse effects on thyroid function in the UIC range of 100–299 µg/L: a UNICEF/ICCIDD study group report. *J Clin Endocrinol Metab* **98**, 1271–1280.
 12. Chinese Criteria Publishing House (2006) *Method for Determination of Iodine in Urine by As³⁺-Ce⁴⁺ Catalytic Spectrophotometry, WST 107-2006*. Beijing: China's Ministry of Health (in Chinese).
 13. Yan YQ & Chen ZP (1999) Some problems discussion and suggestion in the process of standardize urinary iodine determination method application. *Chin J Endemiol* **18**, 298–300.
 14. Lin LX, Sun YN, Li YM, *et al.* (2013) Reference range for thyroid function indices of 8-10 years old school children in certain regions of China. *Chin J Endocrinol Metab* **29**, 42–45.
 15. Kapelari K, Kirchlechner C, Högl W, *et al.* (2008) Pediatric reference intervals for thyroid hormone levels from birth to adulthood: a retrospective study. *BMC Endocr Disord* **8**, 15.
 16. Yan YQ, Dong ZL, Dong L, *et al.* (2008) Trimester-specific reference data of thyroid hormone for normal pregnancy. *Chin J Endocrinol Metab* **24**, 609–612 (in Chinese).
 17. Panesar NS, Li CY & Rogers MS (2001) Reference intervals for thyroid hormones in pregnant Chinese women. *Ann Clin Biochem* **38**, 329–332.
 18. Andersen S, Karmisholt J, Pedersen KM, *et al.* (2008) Reliability of studies of iodine intake and recommendations for number of samples in groups and in individuals. *Br J Nutr* **99**, 813–818.
 19. Nath SK, Moinier B, Thuillier F, *et al.* (1992) Urinary excretion of iodide and fluoride from supplemented food grade salt. *Int J Vitam Nutr Res* **62**, 66–72.
 20. Jahreis G, Hausmann W, Kiessling G, *et al.* (2001) Bioavailability of iodine from normal diets rich in dairy products – results of balance studies in women. *Exp Clin Endocrinol Diabetes* **109**, 163–116.
 21. Aghini-Lombardi F, Antonangeli L, Pinchera A, *et al.* (1997) Effect of iodized salt on thyroid volume of children living in an area previously characterized by moderate iodine deficiency. *J Clin Endocrinol Metab* **82**, 1136–1139.
 22. Zimmermann MB, Hess SY, Adou P, *et al.* (2003) Thyroid size and goiter prevalence after introduction of iodized salt: a 5-y prospective study in schoolchildren in Cote d'Ivoire. *Am J Clin Nutr* **77**, 663–667.
 23. Clifford DC, Bertram B, Mark RB, *et al.* (2003) Effects of kelp supplementation on thyroid function in euthyroid subjects. *Endocrine Pract* **9**, 363–369.
 24. Li G (2000) Biological fallacy. *Acad Emerg Med* **11**, 119–120.
 25. Shakya PR, Gelal B, Lal Das BK, *et al.* (2015) Urinary iodine excretion and thyroid function status in school age children of hilly and plain regions of Eastern Nepal. *BMC Res Notes* **26**, 374.
 26. Hwang S, Lee EY, Lee WK, *et al.* (2011) Correlation between iodine intake and thyroid function in subjects with normal thyroid function. *Biol Trace Elem Res* **143**, 1393–1397.
 27. Qian M, Wang D, Watkins WE, *et al.* (2005) The effects of iodine on intelligence in children: a meta-analysis of studies conducted in China. *Asia Pac J Clin Nutr* **14**, 32.
 28. Ranganathan S (1995) Iodized salt is safe. *Indian J Public Health* **39**, 164–171.
 29. Parveen S, Latif SA, Kamal MM, *et al.* (2007) Effects of long term iodized table salt consumption on serum T3, T4 and TSH in an iodine deficient area of Bangladesh. *Mymensingh Med J* **16**, 57–60.
 30. Als C, Haldimann M, Minder C, *et al.* (2004) Pilot study of urinary iodine concentration and of biochemical thyroid parameters before and after cautious public health intervention on salt iodide content: the Swiss longitudinal 1996–2000 iodine study. *Eur J Clin Nutr* **58**, 1201–1210.
 31. Krejbjerg A, Bjergved L, Pedersen IB, *et al.* (2015) Serum thyroglobulin before and after iodization of salt: an 11-year DanThyr follow-up study. *Eur J Endocrinol* **173**, 573–581.
 32. Aburto NJ, Abudou M, Candeias V, *et al.* (2014) Effect and safety of salt iodization to prevent iodine deficiency disorders: a systematic review with meta-analyses[J]. http://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/10665/148175/1/9789241508285_eng.pdf (accessed August 2017).
 33. Wang X, Osiman R, Ma F, *et al.* (2015) Changes of thyroid function, thyroid antibodies and urinary iodine among permanent residents of Urumqi in Xinjiang. *Zhonghua Liu Xing Bing Xue Za Zhi* **36**, 811–814.
 34. Stagnaro-Green A, Dogo-Isonaige E, Pearce EN, *et al.* (2015) Marginal iodine status and high rate of subclinical hypothyroidism in Washington DC women planning conception. *Thyroid* **25**, 1151–1154.
 35. Jammah AA, Alshehri AS, Alrakhis AA, *et al.* (2015) Characterization of thyroid function and antithyroid antibody tests among Saudis. *Saudi Med J* **36**, 692–697.
 36. Chen X, Jin B, Xia J, *et al.* (2016) Effects of thyroid peroxidase antibody on maternal and neonatal outcomes in pregnant women in an iodine-sufficient area in China. *Int J Endocrinol* **2016**, 6461380.
 37. Gur EB, Karadeniz M, Inceefe H, *et al.* (2015) Thyroid antibodies in euthyroid and subclinical hypothyroid pregnant women with autoimmune hypothyroidism: effects on hematological parameters and postpartum hemorrhage. *Ginekol Pol* **86**, 666–671.
 38. Mumusoglu S, Beksac MS, Ekiz A, *et al.* (2016) Does the presence of autoantibodies without autoimmune diseases and hereditary thrombophilia have an effect on recurrent pregnancy loss? *J Matern Fetal Neonatal Med* **29**, 2352–2357.
 39. van den Boogaard E, Vissenberg R, Land JA, *et al.* (2011) Significance of (sub) clinical thyroid dysfunction and thyroid autoimmunity before conception and in early pregnancy: a systematic review. *Hum Reprod Update* **17**, 605–619.
 40. Negro R, Formosa G, Mangueri T, *et al.* (2006) Levothyroxine treatment in euthyroid pregnant women with autoimmune thyroid disease: effects on obstetrical complications. *J Clin Endocrinol Metab* **91**, 2587–2591.
 41. Saki F, Dabbaghmanesh MH, Ghaemi SZ, *et al.* (2015) Thyroid autoimmunity in pregnancy and its influences on maternal and fetal outcome in Iran (a prospective study). *Endocr Res* **40**, 139–145.
 42. Jukić T, Zimmermann MB, Granić R, *et al.* (2015) Sufficient iodine intake in schoolchildren from the Zagreb area: assessment with dried blood spot thyroglobulin as a new functional biomarker for iodine deficiency. *Acta Clin Croat* **54**, 424–431.