

PHILOSOPHY  
OF  
SCIENCE

*Official Journal of the Philosophy of  
Science Association*



VOLUME 62, NUMBER 3

**September, 1995**

# PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE

(ISSN 0031-8248)

JOURNAL OF THE PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE ASSOCIATION

## EDITORIAL BOARD:

PHILIP KITCHER, *Editor-in-Chief*

PAUL CHURCHLAND, PATRICIA KITCHER, and PAUL TELLER, *Associate Editors*

PETER ACHINSTEIN	GARY GUTTING	JOHN NORTON
FRANK ARNTZENIUS	IAN HACKING	TOM NICKLES
PETER ASQUITH	BILL HARPER	ILKKA NIINILUOTO
JOHN BEATTY	GARY HATFIELD	ALEX ROSENBERG
WILLIAM BECHTEL	GEOFFREY HELLMAN	MICHAEL RUSE
JEFFREY BUB	DAVID HULL	KEN SCHAFFNER
RICHARD BURIAN	PAUL HUMPHREYS	DUDLEY SHAPER
ROBERT BUTTS	HENRY KYBURG	LARRY SKLAR
NANCY CARTWRIGHT	LARRY LAUDAN	BRIAN SKYRMS
LINDLEY DARDEN	JIM LENNOX	ELLIOTT SOBER
WILLIAM DEMOPOULOS	HELEN LONGINO	MIRIAM SOLOMON
JOHN EARMAN	PETER MACHAMER	STEPHEN STICH
ARTHUR FINE	PATRICK MAHER	FRED SUPPE
JERRY FODOR	DAVID MALAMENT	PAT SUPPES
MICHAEL FRIEDMAN	TIM MAUDLIN	BAS VAN FRAASSEN
RON GIERE	DEBORAH MAYO	C. KENNETH WATERS
CLARK GLYMOUR	SANDRA MITCHELL	LINDA WESSELS
RICHARD GRANDY	MARGARET MORRISON	JIM WOODWARD

### ASSISTANT EDITOR:

Stanley Walens

### EDITORIAL ASSISTANT:

Catherine M. Barrett

## GOVERNING BOARD OF THE ASSOCIATION

Abner Shimony, President (1996)

Michael Friedman, President-Elect (1996)

Ronald N. Giere, Past-President (1996)

John Beatty (1996)

Richard Grandy (1995)

Henry Kyburg (1995)

Helen Longino (1996)

Penelope Maddy (1995)

Jane Maienschein (1996)

Nancy Nersessian (1996)

Linda Wessels (1995)

### EXECUTIVE SECRETARY:

Peter D. Asquith

MADE AND PRINTED IN THE USA BY  
EDWARDS BROTHERS, INC., ANN ARBOR, MI

PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE is published quarterly by the Philosophy of Science Association, 503 South Kedzie Hall, Department of Philosophy, Michigan State University, East Lansing, Michigan 48824-1032. 1995 Subscription price \$65.00 U.S.A. (\$70.00 non-U.S.A.) per Volume. Single numbers \$20.00. 1995 Membership dues, which include subscription, are graduated based on income: income below \$40,000—\$55.00; \$40,000—\$49,999—\$65.00; \$50,000—\$59,999—\$75.00; \$60,000 or above—\$85.00. Subscription inquiries should be directed to the Executive Secretary. Second-class postage paid at East Lansing, Michigan and at additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to Philosophy of Science Association, 503 South Kedzie Hall, Department of Philosophy, Michigan State University, East Lansing, Michigan 48824-1032. © 1995 by the Philosophy of Science Association.

## CONTENTS\*

<b>A HEURISTIC FOR CONCEPTUAL CHANGE, FRANK ARNTZENIUS ..</b>	357
<b>TWO CHEERS FOR REDUCTIONISM: OR, THE DIM PROSPECTS FOR NON-REDUCTIVE MATERIALISM, ANDREW MELNYK.....</b>	370
<b>WISDOM UPDATED, ARTHUR FALK.....</b>	389
<b>S. S. STEVENS AND THE ORIGINS OF OPERATIONISM, GARY L. HARDCASTLE.....</b>	404
<b>HOLES AND DETERMINISM: ANOTHER LOOK, STEPHEN LEEDS ...</b>	425
<b>OBJECTIVITY IN EXPERIMENTAL INQUIRY: BREAKING DATA- TECHNIQUE CIRCLES, SYLVIA CULP.....</b>	438
<b>GROUND TRUTH AND VIRTUAL REALITY: HACKING VS. VAN FRAASSEN, WILLIAM SEAGER.....</b>	459
<b>DISCUSSION: WHY BOHM'S THEORY SOLVES THE MEASURE- MENT PROBLEM, TIM MAUDLIN.....</b>	479
<b>BOOK REVIEWS.....</b>	484
<i>Philosophical Problems of the Internal and External Worlds: Essays on the Philosophy of Adolf Grünbaum, John Earman, Allen I. Janis, Ger- ald J. Massey, and Nicholas Rescher—Massimo Pauri; The Golem: What Everyone Should Know About Science, Harry Collins and Trevor Pinch—David L. Hull.</i>	

\*The contents of PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE are utilized in compiling the following bibliographic sources: *Arts and Humanities Citation Index*; *Biological Abstracts*; *Bulletin Signaletique 519*; *Current Contents/Arts and Humanities*; *Current Contents/Social and Behavioral Sciences*; *Current Index to Statistics*; *Humanities Index*; *Index to Book Reviews in the Humanities*; *Isis Critical Bibliography*; *Language & Language Behavior Abstracts*; *Mathematical Reviews*; *Philosopher's Index*; *Philosophie*; *Psychological Abstracts*; *Repertoire Bibliographique de la Philosophie*; *Social Sciences Citation Index*; *Sociological Abstracts*.

## EDITORIAL STATEMENT

*Philosophy of Science* welcomes articles concerned with any philosophical issue about science from any perspective. Our aim is to publish work of the highest quality, representing as many aspects of contemporary philosophical discussion of science as possible.

In recent years, *Philosophy of Science* has been notable for its first-rate articles in some fields of philosophy of science. We hope to maintain strength in these areas. Other topics have been relatively neglected. However, simply because the journal has not published work on a particular issue in the past, it would be wrong to conclude that *Philosophy of Science* is inhospitable to discussions of that issue. Among areas in which excellent articles would be much appreciated are the following: philosophical studies of episodes in the history of science, investigations of scientific practice in areas that involve massive computation, studies of the history of the philosophy of science (including twentieth century figures), philosophical issues in cognitive science, analyses of the connections between philosophical questions and current work in history and sociology of science, philosophy of specific social sciences (for example, economics, linguistics or sociology), philosophy of experiment, studies of gender and science, and investigations of newly emerging mathematical sciences (chaos, neural computation).

We also hope to publish very brief discussion notes (1–2 journal pages) as “Short Commentaries.” The goal will be to facilitate rapid discussion and exchange of ideas, and we shall attempt to publish such notes very soon after the appearance of the article they discuss. Longer discussion notes will also be accepted, but will not be given any special priority for publication.

Occasionally, articles that impress the referees as especially likely to stimulate constructive discussion will be published as “target articles” (as in the format of such journals as *Brain and Behavioral Sciences*). These articles will appear with five or six brief commentaries together with a concise response from the original author.

The standard word limit for papers in *Philosophy of Science* will continue to be 9600 words. Under exceptional circumstances, we shall publish longer papers, but contributors should realize that papers over the limit will usually only be accepted on condition that they are cut so as to contain less than 9600 words. The default format for articles in *Philosophy of Science* will continue to be that described on the rear inside cover. Since we realize that this system of citations (with few footnotes) may be inappropriate for some types of essay—for example those with a significant historical component—alternative systems will be permitted when authors can make a convincing case.

We encourage members of the *Philosophy of Science Association* to submit their work to *Philosophy of Science*, and to help make the journal reflect the best current research in all areas of philosophy of science.