

THE  
BULLETIN  
OF  
SYMBOLIC LOGIC

EDITED BY

RICHARD A. SHORE, MANAGING EDITOR

ANDREAS R. BLASS      JOHN P. BURGESS      ALEXANDER S. KECHRIS

DANIEL LASCAR      PHILIP J. SCOTT

VOLUME 4 · NUMBER 3 · SEPTEMBER 1998  
ISSN 1079-8986

PUBLISHED QUARTERLY BY THE ASSOCIATION FOR SYMBOLIC LOGIC, INC. WITH  
SUPPORT FROM ICSU AND FROM INSTITUTIONAL AND CORPORATE MEMBERS

---

*Copyright ©1998 by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Inc. All rights reserved.  
Reproduction by photostat, photo-print, microfilm, or like process by permission only.*

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## ARTICLES

Developments in constructive nonstandard analysis, by ERIK PALMGREN . . .	233
Incompleteness, mechanism, and optimism, by STEWART SHAPIRO . . . . .	273
Truth definitions, Skolem functions and axiomatic set theory, by JAAKKO HINTIKKA . . . . .	303
<hr/>	
In Memoriam: Richard (Routley) Sylvan, 1935-1996, by ROBERT K. MEYER	338
Notices . . . . .	341

THE BULLETIN OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC (ISSN 1079-8986) is published quarterly, in the months of March, June, September, and December, by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Inc. at 1325 South Oak Street, Champaign, IL 61820-6903, U.S.A. Periodicals postage is paid at Champaign, IL and additional offices. The BULLETIN is distributed with THE JOURNAL OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC and the 1998 annual subscription price for the two journals is \$310. Postmaster: Send address changes to *The Bulletin of Symbolic Logic, Journals Division UIP, 1325 South Oak Street, Champaign, IL 61820-6903, U.S.A.* Business correspondence should be sent to the Secretary-Treasurer of the Association, C. Ward Henson (address on inside back cover).

The BULLETIN invites submission of *Articles* and *Communications*. Articles should be expository or survey papers of broad interest that are accessible to a wide audience of logicians. They may deal with any areas of logic including mathematical or philosophical logic, logic in computer science or linguistics, the history or philosophy of logic and applications of logic to other fields. *Communications* should be announcements of important new results and ideas in any aspect of logic. The *Communications* may be short papers in their final form or preliminary announcements (extended abstracts, position papers) of longer, full papers that will be published elsewhere. In any case, they should, in addition to a description of the new results or ideas, include enough history, background and explanation to make the significance of the work apparent to a wide audience. *Communications* will be quickly refereed and published within six months of the submission of final versions.

*Continued on inside back cover*

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1 03 02 01 00 99 98

THE  
BULLETIN  
OF  
SYMBOLIC LOGIC

EDITED BY

RICHARD A. SHORE, Managing Editor  
ANDREAS R. BLASS    JOHN P. BURGESS    ALEXANDER S. KECHRIS  
DANIEL LASCAR    PHILIP J. SCOTT

VOLUME 4  
1998

PUBLISHED QUARTERLY BY THE ASSOCIATION FOR SYMBOLIC LOGIC, INC.  
WITH SUPPORT FROM INSTITUTIONAL AND CORPORATE MEMBERS

---

The four numbers of Volume 4 were issued at the following dates:

Number 1, pages 1–336, March 6, 1998

Number 2, pages 337–752, June 4, 1998

Number 3, pages 753–1200, September 23, 1998

Number 4, pages 1201–1624, December 4, 1998

Numbers 1–4 of this volume are copyrighted ©1998 by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Inc. Reproduction of copyrighted numbers of the BULLETIN by photostat, photoprint, microfilm, or like process is forbidden, except by written permission, to be obtained from the Secretary of the Association, C. Ward Henson, Department of Mathematics, University of Illinois, 1409 W. Green St., Urbana, IL 61801.

The paper used in this BULLETIN is acid-free and falls within the guidelines established to ensure permanence and durability.

This BULLETIN has been registered with the Copyright Clearance Center, Inc. The appearance of a code at the bottom of the first page of an article indicates the copyright owner's consent for copying beyond that permitted by Sections 107 or 108 of the U. S. Copyright Law, provided that the per-copy fee stated in the code is paid directly to Copyright Clearance Center, Inc., 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. This consent does not extend to copying for general distribution, for advertising or promotion purposes, for creating new collective works, or for resale. Specific written permission for such copying must be obtained from the Association.

## CONTENTS OF VOLUME 4

### ARTICLES

ANDERSON, C. ANTHONY. Alonzo Church's contributions to philosophy and intensional logic .....	129
BARBA, JUAN. Construction of truth predicates: approximation versus revision .....	399
ENDERTON, H. B. Alonzo Church and the Reviews .....	172
GROHE, MARTIN. Finite variable logics in descriptive complexity theory .....	345
HINTIKKA, JAAKKO. Truth definitions, Skolem functions and axiomatic set theory .....	303
HODGES, WILFRID. An editor recalls some hopeless papers .....	1
KIM, BYUNGHAN and PILLAY, ANAND. From stability to simplicity .....	17
PALMGREN, ERIK. Developments in constructive nonstandard analysis .....	233
SHAPIRO, STEWART. Incompleteness, mechanism, and optimism .....	273
TIESZEN, RICHARD. Gödel's path from the incompleteness theorems (1931) to phenomenology (1961) .....	181

### COMMUNICATIONS

FARAH, ILIJAS. Completely additive liftings .....	37
GROSZEK, MARCIA J. and SLAMAN, THEODORE A. A basis theorem for perfect sets .....	204
NEGRI, SARA and VON PLATO, JAN. Cut elimination in the presence of axioms .....	418

### IN MEMORIAM

MEYER, ROBERT K. In Memoriam: Richard (Routley) Sylvan, 1935-1996 ...	338
---	-----

### MEETINGS OF THE ASSOCIATION

ASL Winter Meeting, Orlando, Florida, January 12–13, 1996 .....	436
European ASL Summer Meeting, Leeds, England, July 7–12, 1997 .....	55
ASL Winter Meeting, Baltimore, Maryland, January 9–10, 1998 .....	217
ASL Spring Meeting, Los Angeles, California, March 27–28, 1998 .....	210
ASL Spring Meeting, Toronto, Ontario, Canada, May 22–25, 1998 .....	443

### MEETINGS SPONSORED BY THE ASSOCIATION

Australasian Association for Logic 1997 Annual Conference .....	459
International Symposia on Theoretical Aspects of Computer Science: TACS '97, TACS '94, and TACS '91 .....	227
4th Workshop on Logic, Language, Information and Computation (WoLLIC '97) .....	225

Notices ..... Pages 118, 229, 341 and 511

The Constitution and By-Laws of the Association for Symbolic Logic ..... 124

List of Officers, Committees and Members of the  
Association for Symbolic Logic ..... 465